

2019 BRICS Brasilia Summit Interim Compliance Report

15 November 2019 to 1 June 2020

Prepared by

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Angela Hou, Brittaney Warren and the University of Toronto BRICS
Research Group

and

Irina Popova, Andey Shelepov, Andrei Sakharov and Alexander Ignatov
and the Center for International Institutions Research
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,
Moscow

14 September 2020

Research Team

Dr. Marina Larionova, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Professor John Kirton, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Brittaney Warren, Compliance Specialist, BRICS Research Group

University of Toronto Research Team

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Chair of Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group
Angela Min Yi Hou, Editor-in-Chief, BRICS Research Group

Omar Abdellatif
Sheeriza Azeez
Tony (Tianyi) Chen
Abby Chu
Lucia Dhafana-Mabika
Joy Fan
Jiayi Guo
Syed Haider
Amira Higazy
Zarlasht Jamal
Wenny (Yiyao) Jin
Wing Ka
Areej Malik
Shamshir Malik
Sarah Nasir
Natasha Pirzada
Kelley Predergast
Evangeline Procopoudis
Daniel Scarpitti
Nicole Shi
Japish Singh
Samantha Tozzi
Ingril Wong
Chen Ou Yang
Lecheng Charlie Zeng

RANEPA Research Team

Irina Popova, Moscow Team Leader

Alexander Ignatov
Andrei Sakharov
Andrey Shelepov

Contents

Research Team	2
University of Toronto Research Team	2
RANEPa Research Team	2
Preface	4
Introduction and Summary	5
Methodology and Scoring System	5
The Breakdown of Commitments	5
Selection of Commitments	5
Compliance Scores	6
Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments across Issue Areas, 2009–2019	6
Table 2: 2019 BRICS Brasilia Summit Priority Commitments	7
Table 3: 2019 BRICS Brasilia Summit Interim Compliance Scores	7
1. Reform of the World Trade Organization	8
2. Reform of International Financial Institutions	21
3. Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework	26
4. Crime and Corruption: Asset Recovery	36
5. Digital Economy: Partnerships	46
6. International Taxation: Digital Economy	58
7. Macroeconomic Policy: Enterprise Financing	63
8. Financial Regulation: Currency Cooperation	70
9. Climate Change: Paris Agreement	74
10. Regional Security: Syria	79

Preface

The BRICS Research Group has been assessing progress made by the BRICS members in implementing commitments their leaders make at each summit since the Sanya 2011 meeting. These reports monitor each member's efforts to implement a carefully chosen selection of the many commitments produced at each summit. They are offered to the general public and to policy makers, academics, civil society, the media and interested citizens around the world in an effort to make the BRICS's work more transparent, accessible and effective, and to provide scientific data to enable the meaningful analysis of the causes of compliance and the impact of this important informal international institution. Previous reports are available at the BRICS Information Centre at <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/compliance> and at the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration available at <http://www.ranepa.ru/eng/ciir-ranepa/research-areas/brics/analytics>.

This current draft interim report analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 10 priority commitments selected from the 49 commitments made by the leaders at Brasilia on 13–14 November 2019. The report covers actions taken by the BRICS members to implement those commitments between 15 November 2019 and 1 June 2020.

The BRICS Research Group relies on publicly available information, documentation and media reports for its assessments. To ensure accuracy, comprehensiveness and integrity, we encourage comments from stakeholders. Indeed, scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available. All feedback remains anonymous. Responsibility for the contents of this report lies exclusively with the authors and analysts of the BRICS Research Group.

The final report will be released on the eve of the Johannesburg Summit.

John Kirton and Marina Larionova
Co-directors, BRICS Research Group

Introduction and Summary

The 2019 BRICS Brasilia Interim Compliance Report, prepared by the BRICS Research Group (based at Trinity College in the University of Toronto and the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration [RANEPA]), analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 10 priority commitments drawn from the total 49 commitments made by the leaders at the Brasilia Summit on 13–14 November 2019.

The interim report covers actions taken by the BRICS countries to implement the selected 10 commitments during the period from 15 November 2019 to 1 June 2020. A final report that assesses the full period between the 2019 and 2020 summits will be produced in time for the St. Petersburg Summit (when the dates become known), and thus will include actions taken after 1 June 2020. There is often a significant difference between the interim and final scores given the longer timeframe; moreover, the disruption of the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic will likely also have an impact on compliance in 2020.

Methodology and Scoring System

This report draws on the methodology developed by the G7 Research Group, which has been monitoring G7 compliance since 1996 and adopted for monitoring G20 performance since 2008.¹ The use of this time-tested methodology provides for cross-institutional, cross-member and cross-issue consistency and thus allows compatibility and comparability of the compliance performance by different summit institutions and establishes a foundation for evidence-based assessment of the effectiveness of these institutions.²

The methodology uses a scale from –1 (0%) to +1 (100%), where +1 (50%) indicates full compliance with the stated commitment, –1 indicates a failure to comply or action taken that is directly opposite to the stated goal of the commitment, and 0 indicates partial compliance or work in progress, such as initiatives that have been launched but are not yet near completion and whose final results can therefore not be assessed.³ Each member receives a score of –1, 0 or +1 for each commitment.

The Breakdown of Commitments

At Brasilia in 2019, the BRICS leaders focused on facilitating sustainable growth in digital era. The theme of the summit was “Economic Growth for an Innovative Future.” The topics discussed included strengthening cooperation in science, technology and innovation; enhancing cooperation on digital economy; invigorating cooperation on the fight against transnational crime, especially against organized crime, money laundering, and drug trafficking; and encouraging the rapprochement between the New Development Bank and the BRICS Business Council.

In the economic sphere, the leaders made several commitments for economic cooperation, with a focus on information and communications technologies, open trade, the digital economy, and micro, small and medium-sized enterprises. Several commitments were made on reforming international financial institutions (IFIs), including the World Trade Organization (WTO) and the International Monetary Fund (IMF). The leaders agreed to cooperate in areas such as IMF quota review, climate change, international currency, anti-corruption, biodiversity and international taxation.

Selection of Commitments

For each compliance cycle (that is, the period between summits), the research team selects commitments that reflect the breadth of the BRICS agenda and the priorities of the summit’s host, while balancing the

¹ The Compliance Coding Manual is available at <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/evaluations/index.html#method>.

² Informal summitry institutions are defined as international institutions with limited membership, relatively low bureaucracy and reliance on open, flexible and voluntary approaches. Regular meetings of the heads of states and governments who engage on a wide range of international, regional and domestic politics stand at the pinnacle of such international arrangements, which involve many actors operating according to established procedures on two levels: domestic and international. Commitments contained in the collectively agreed documents are not legally-binding but their implementation is stimulated by peer pressure. Among such bodies engaged in global and regional governance are G7/G8, G20, BRICS, APEC and others.

³ The formula to convert a score into a percentage is $P=50 \times (S+1)$, where P is the percentage and S is the score.

selection to allow for comparison with past and future summits.⁴ The selection also takes into account the breakdown of issue areas and the proportion of commitments in each one (see Table 1). The primary criteria for selecting a priority commitment for assessment are the comprehensiveness and relevance to the summit, the BRICS and the world. Selected commitments must meet secondary criteria such as measurability and ability to comply within a year. The tertiary criteria include significance, as identified by relevant stakeholders in the host country and scientific teams. Of the 49 commitments made at the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS Research Group has selected 10 priority commitments for its compliance assessment (see Table 2).

Compliance Scores

Compliance for the 2019 Brasilia Summit interim report is 56% (+0.12) (see Table 3). This is a lower average than the interim compliance of 76% with the commitments made at the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, which increased to 85% by the eve of the Brasilia Summit. Indeed, it is the lowest interim or final compliance score since 2011.

By country, China has the highest overall compliance average of 70%, followed by Russia at 65%, India at 60%, South Africa at 50% and Brazil at 35%.

By issue, compliance varied widely with the highest score of 90% for the commitment on reforming the WTO, followed by 80% on implementing the Paris Agreement. Three commitments achieved negative compliance scores (i.e., under 50%): on currency co-operation at 40%, on Syria at 20% and on IFI reform at 10%.

Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments across Issue Areas, 2009–2019

Issue Area	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Energy	5	9	1	2					6	2	2
Finance		3	1			6	6	5	9	5	1
Climate change		1	6	3	1	1	1	1	3		3
Macroeconomic policy		1	5	1	5	7	6	4	4	3	1
Trade		3	5	9	4	4	5	2	6	4	3
International cooperation	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7	21	18	8
Socioeconomic	1	1	3	2		7	5	2		2	
Development	1	5	1	3	10	4	4	2	11	6	2
Natural disasters	1	1	1								
Food and agriculture	3		1	1		1	17		5	3	
ICT			2			1	17	3	12	3	2
Science and education	1	1	1			2	5				
Health			1	1		1	6	2	6	1	
Human rights			1		1	2	5		2		1
Accountability			1								
Regional security	1		1	4	8	6	6	4	12	7	4
Terrorism			1	1	2	2	1	4	7	3	1
Culture		1				3	1	2	3		
Sport		1									
IFI reform	1	2	1	2	9	8	3	2	5	2	2
Non-proliferation					1			1	2		1
Crime and corruption						4	10	3	8	6	10
Environment						1	1	1	3	3	3
Tourism							1			1	
International taxation										4	5
Total	15	31	38	32	47	68	130	45	125	73	49

⁴ Guidelines for choosing priority commitments, as well as other applicable considerations, are available in the Compliance Coding Manual.

Table 2: 2019 BRICS Brasilia Summit Priority Commitments

	Issue Area	Commitment
1	Reform of the World Trade Organization	Our countries will work with all WTO [World Trade Organization] Members to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development
2	Reform of International Financial Institutions	We also support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members
3	Environment: Global biodiversity framework	We are committed to contributing to and supporting the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework
4	Crime and Corruption: Asset Recovery	We will maintain our ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings
5	Digital Economy: Partnerships	[We will continue to]... expand and intensify partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF)
6	International Taxation: Digital Economy	We remain committed to addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy
7	Macroeconomic Policy: Enterprise Financing	We will explore in appropriate fora ways to promote and facilitate investments in ... MSMEs [micro, small and medium-sized enterprises] ... which will help to promote economic growth, trade and job creation.
8	Financial Regulation: Currency Cooperation	We will continue to communicate on other possible areas of currency cooperation, consistent with each central bank's mandate
9	Climate change: Paris Agreement	We reiterate our commitment to the implementation of the Paris Agreement adopted under the principles of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), including the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities, in the light of different national circumstances.
10	Regional Security: Syria	We also reaffirm our commitment to advancing a Syrian-led and Syrian-owned, UN-facilitated political process in line with United Nations Security Council Resolution 2254

Table 3: 2019 BRICS Brasilia Summit Interim Compliance Scores

	Issue Areas	Brazil	Russia	India	China	South Africa	Average	
1	Reform of the World Trade Organization	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+0.80	90%
2	Reform of International Financial Institutions	-1	0	-1	-1	-1	-0.80	10%
3	Environment: Biodiversity Framework	0	0	+1	+1	0	+0.40	70%
4	Crime and Corruption: Asset Recovery	0	0	+1	+1	0	+0.40	70%
5	Digital Economy: Partnerships	0	0	0	0	0	0.00	50%
6	International Taxation: Digital Economy	0	0	+1	0	0	+0.20	60%
7	Macroeconomic Policy: Enterprise Financing	0	0	0	+1	+1	+0.40	70%
8	Financial Regulation: Currency Cooperation	-1	+1	0	0	-1	-0.20	40%
9	Climate Change: Paris Agreement	0	+1	0	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
10	Regional Security: Syria	-1	0	-1	0	-1	-0.60	20%
	Average	-0.30	+0.30	+0.20	+0.40	0.00	+0.12	56%
		35%	65%	60%	70%	50%	56%	

1. Reform of the World Trade Organization

“Our countries will work with all WTO [World Trade Organization] Members to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.”

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.80 (90%)		

Background

The future of the multilateral rules-based international trade order is becoming increasingly uncertain. The traditional vanguards of the international trading system centred on the World Trade Organization (WTO) no longer seem willing or capable of upholding the existing multilateral trade order. As outlined in China’s recently submitted proposal for WTO reform, the WTO is facing an “unprecedented existential crisis” and an urgent need for institutional reform.

The proposal succinctly comments that recent trends such as

rising unilateralist and protectionist practices have dealt blows to multilateralism and the system of free trade. The enduring blockage of the appointment process of Appellate Body members risks paralyzing the Appellate Body by the end of 2019, which will significantly affect the effective operation of the dispute settlement mechanism. The abuse of national security exception, unilateral measures inconsistent with the WTO rules, as well as misuse or abuse of existing trade remedy measures have severely damaged the rules-based, free and open international trade order. Moreover, such practices have adversely affected the interests of the WTO Members, especially the developing Members, and undermined the authority and efficacy of the WTO. As a consequence, the Organization is facing an unprecedented existential crisis ... It is against this backdrop that some WTO Members have recognized the urgency and necessity of WTO reform. The G20 Summit held in Buenos Aires in 2018 expressed support for necessary reform of the WTO so as to help the Organization to better play its role.⁵

In this context, BRICS members have taken on a leading role in advocating for a “rules-based, transparent, non-discriminatory, open, free and inclusive” international trade regime. The WTO was first referenced by BRICS summity in the context of Russia’s accession to the WTO in 2012.⁶ Adopted on 29 March 2012, the Delhi Declaration acknowledged Russia’s accession as a step towards a more representative WTO system.⁷ BRICS leaders also emphasized the importance of upholding a rule-based multilateral trading system and rolling back trade protectionism.

BRICS members have consistently reaffirmed its support for an “open, inclusive, non-discriminatory, transparent and rule-based multilateral trading system,” notably at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit,⁸ the 2015

⁵ China’s Proposal on WTO reform, World Trade Organization Documents (Geneva) 13 May 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/FE_Search/FE_S_S009-DP.aspx?CatalogueIdList=254127&CurrentCatalogueIdIndex=0.

⁶ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>.

⁷ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>.

⁸ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>.

Ufa Summit,⁹ the 2016 Goa Summit,¹⁰ and the 2017 Xiamen Summit.¹¹ Specifically, BRICS leaders have also advocated for the representation of developing members in the 2018 Johannesburg Declaration¹² and the most recent 2019 Brasilia Declaration.¹³

At the 2019 Brasilia summit, BRICS leaders reiterated their commitment to preserving and strengthening the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its centre. Specifically, the BRICS leaders called on all WTO members to avoid unilateral and protectionist measures.¹⁴ The BRICS added that the reform must preserve the fundamental principles of the WTO and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least-developed countries (LDCs).¹⁵ In the Brasilia Declaration, BRICS leaders also recognized the importance of WTO reform “to ensure the effectiveness and relevance of the organization and its capacity to better address current and future challenges.” This selected commitment responds to the aforementioned need for institutional reform in the WTO system.

Commitment Features

The overarching aim of this commitment is to accelerate WTO reform. The use of the words “all WTO members” suggests that BRICS leaders have committed to work with each other as well as with non-BRICS countries. Thus, taking actions with any WTO member within or outside BRICS membership counts towards compliance. “Advance” means to accelerate the growth or progress of or to bring or move forward.¹⁶ “Process” is understood to mean a series of actions or operations conducing to an end.¹⁷ “Necessary reform” refers to the institutional reform of the WTO that is necessary for its continued relevance in the existing international system.¹⁸

Taken together, the commitment can be disaggregated into two dimensions. The first dimension ensures that the process of WTO reform is balanced, open and transparent. The second dimension ensures that the substantial objective of WTO reform fosters inclusivity and development.

Part 1: Procedural Objectives of the Reform Process — Openness and Transparency

The first aspect of this commitment demands that the nature of WTO reform is balanced, open and transparent. Balance, openness and transparency are fundamental values of the international trade system. In the context of the WTO, “balance” refers to the weighing and balancing of a range of factors or interests. For example, Article XX of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade embodies the need to maintain a balance between the right of a member to invoke an exception and the rights of other members. Balance as an important principle has also been mobilized when assessing the necessity of protecting core priorities such as the environment or public morals, specifically as weighed against the challenged measure’s impact on international trade. “Balanced reform” has been further referenced in the

⁹ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 13 December 2019. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹⁰ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

¹¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>.

¹² BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>.

¹³ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁴ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁵ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁶ Advance, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/advance>.

¹⁷ Process, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/process>.

¹⁸ Azevedo: WTO reform is already happening, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 19 July 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news19_e/tnc_19jul19_e.htm.

context of accounting for the interests of both developed and developing countries. Thus, balance in the WTO requires consideration of different interests, values and rights at stake.¹⁹

Second, “openness” in the context of the WTO refers to open trade. This includes measures that lower trade barriers and encourage international trade. Open trade is one of the most fundamental principles of the current international trade regime. This general gesture towards openness must underpin any actions geared towards WTO reform.²⁰

Third, “transparency” is understood to mean free from pretense or deceit, easily detected or seen through, readily understood, and characterized by visibility or accessibility of information.²¹ In the context of the WTO, transparency means to make trade rules as clear and public (“transparent”) as possible. Thus, many WTO agreements require governments to disclose their policies and practices publicly and/or notify trade practices to the WTO. For example, the WTO examines national trade policies through its Trade Policy Review Mechanism.²²

Thus, actions that promote any of three objectives i.e. openness, balance, and transparency within the WTO system count towards compliance with the first part of this commitment.

Part 2: Substantive Objective of the Reform Process — Inclusivity and Development

The second aspect of this commitment stipulates that the objective of the WTO reform process is directed towards fostering inclusiveness and development. “Inclusivity” refers to the inclusion of interests of developed, developing and least developed countries alike. “Development” refers to the level of economic development of different countries. Promoting development has been a fundamental principle of the WTO, which has long recognized the link between trade and development and adopted special provisions for developing countries.²³

The WTO’s work on inclusivity and development has taken on several different forms. First, WTO agreements contain special provisions referred to as “special and differential treatment” provisions. Such provisions make exceptions for developing countries and least developed countries. In 2013, the Bali ministerial conference established a mechanism to review and analyze the implementation of special and differential treatment provisions. Second, WTO agreements include provisions aimed at increasing the trade opportunities of LDCs, allowing LDCs further flexibility in implementing WTO rules. The 2013 and 2015 ministerial conferences adopted several decisions that aimed to better integrate LDCs into the multilateral trade system. Several initiatives within the WTO also aim to build the trade capacity of developing countries. Third, the WTO system includes institutional bodies that work on trade and development. Notably, such institutions include the Committee on Trade and Development, the Sub-Committee on Least-Developed Countries, the Working Group on Trade Debt and Finance, and more.²⁴

Compliance with the second aspect of this commitment requires that actions taken by BRICS members should be geared towards one of the substantial issue areas related to the interests of developing countries and least developed countries. Taking actions that advance any of the listed objectives below can count towards compliance. However, this list is not exhaustive:

- Reviewing the special and differential provisions with a view to strengthening them and making them more effective and operational

¹⁹ WTO rules and environmental policies, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/envir_e/envt_rules_exceptions_e.htm.

²⁰ Principles of the trading system, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact2_e.htm.

²¹ Transparent, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/transparent>.

²² Principles of the trading system, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact2_e.htm.

²³ Trade and Development, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/devel_e/devel_e.htm.

²⁴ Trade and Development, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/devel_e/devel_e.htm.

- Considering ways in which developing countries, especially LDCs, may be assisted to make best use of special and differential treatment
- Strengthening the monitoring mechanism to review and analyze the implementation of special and differential treatment provisions
- Strengthening the role of the Committee on Trade and Development
- Reviewing and improving provisions on LDCs
- Implementing the Bali Package ministerial decisions and Nairobi Package ministerial decisions
- Reforming and/or strengthening WTO institutional bodies that focus on trade and development issues²⁵

Full compliance with this commitment entails actions that contribute to both procedural and substantial objectives, respectively referring to 1) balance, openness, transparency and 2) inclusivity and development. A BRICS member must cooperate with other WTO Members in both regards to score +1 for full compliance. If a BRICS member complies with one of the two components of this commitment, it will receive a score of 0 for partial compliance. If the BRICS member fails to work with its WTO counterparts to advance any procedural or substantial objectives of WTO reform, the BRICS member will receive a score of -1 for non-compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did NOT work with any members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to take actions that advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.
0	The BRICS member worked with WTO members to take actions that advance a process for necessary reform that contributes to the procedural objectives of balance, openness or transparency OR contributes to the substantial objectives of inclusivity and development.
+1	The BRICS member worked with WTO members to take actions that advance a process for necessary reform that contributes to the procedural objectives of balance, openness or transparency AND contributes to the substantial objectives of inclusivity and development.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with its commitment to work with all members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.

On 23 November 2019, at a meeting of G20 foreign ministers in Nagoya, Japan, the delegation of Brazil and other G20 counterparts reaffirmed the urgency of reforming the WTO.²⁶

On 18 December 2019, Brazil joined other WTO members in committing to continued efforts to resolve recent roadblocks in the Appellate Body and further ensure the effective functioning of the dispute settlement system. At this meeting of the Dispute Settlement Body, Brazil supported the European Union's statement on DS234 United States — Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset Act of 2000.²⁷ The statement delivered by the EU requested that the United States stop its transfer of anti-dumping and countervailing duties to its domestic industry. Moreover, Brazil presented an update on its

²⁵ Trade and Development, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 13 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/devel_e/devel_e.htm.

²⁶ WTO reform 'urgent,' G20 ministers agree at Nagoya meeting, The Japan Times (Nagoya) 23 November 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2019/11/23/business/economy-business/g20-foreign-ministers-talks-japan-south-korea/#.Xm7bUS3Myu4>.

²⁷ Dispute Settlement: Members urge continued engagement on resolving Appellate Body issues, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 18 December 2019. Access Date: 20 January 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news19_e/dsb_18dec19_e.htm.

implementation of WTO rulings in DS472 and DS497, Brazil — Certain Measures Concerning Taxation and Charges.²⁸

On 24 January 2020, Brazil joined the European Union and 15 other WTO members to form a multi-party interim appeal arrangement in light of the recent Appellate Body paralysis.²⁹ As a contingency measure pursuant to Article 25 of the Dispute Settlement Understanding, participating WTO members will use this interim arrangement as an “effective and binding dispute settlement process for potential trade disputes among them,” until the Appellate Body resumes its normal operations.³⁰

On 29 April 2020, at the meeting of the BRICS Contact Group on Trade and Economic Issues, Brazil presented measures to support its national economy and proposed joint strategic approaches to combat epidemics and their economic consequences.³¹ At the meeting, BRICS representatives expressed support for the multilateral trading system in the context of the pandemic and highlighted the importance of ensuring the transparency of all measures taken in connection to COVID-19.³² Additionally, representatives discussed the active participation of all BRICS countries in the WTO’s monitoring of economic measures relating to COVID-19.³³

On 14 May 2020, Brazil took part in the G20 trade and investment ministerial meeting. The ministers endorsed the G20 Actions to Support World Trade and Investment in Response to COVID-19 and emphasized “long-term actions [to] support the necessary reform of the WTO and the multilateral trading system.”³⁴

Brazil has actively worked with WTO members to advance a process for necessary reform that contributes to the procedural objectives of balance, openness or transparency at the WTO. However, Brazil has not taken actions to contribute to the substantial objectives of inclusivity and development in WTO reform, given that Brazil’s involvement has not specifically sought to enhance the trade capacity of developing countries.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Samantha Tozzi

Russia: +1

Russia fully complied with its commitment to work with all members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.

²⁸ Dispute Settlement: Members urge continued engagement on resolving Appellate Body issues, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 18 December 2019. Access Date: 20 January 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news19_e/dsb_18dec19_e.htm.

²⁹ EU and 16 WTO members agree to work together on an interim appeal arbitration arrangement, European Commission (Davos) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 22 March 2020. <https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2106>.

³⁰ EU and 16 WTO members agree to work together on an interim appeal arbitration arrangement, European Commission (Davos) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 22 March 2020. <https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2106>.

³¹ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

³² Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

³³ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

³⁴ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Ministerial Statement, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 5 June 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0514.html>.

On 18 November 2019, the Ministry of Economic Development published a news release summarizing Russia's contributions at the meeting of the WTO Committee on Technical Barriers to Trade, which took place on 13-15 November 2019.³⁵ At this meeting, Russia delivered a statement acknowledging the European Union's WTO-inconsistent classification of cobalt as a chemically hazardous substance. In addition, Russia commented on technical regulations that caused commercial damage to Russian exporters and responded to criticism of its cement certification rules, labelling systems, and technical regulations of the Eurasian Economic Union with regards to the safety of alcoholic beverages.³⁶

On 23 November 2019, at a meeting of G20 foreign ministers in Nagoya, Japan, the delegation of Russia and other G20 counterparts reaffirmed the urgency of reforming the WTO.³⁷

On 5 December 2019, Russia and China co-hosted a roundtable discussion in Moscow, focused on how WTO accessions can contribute to the discussion on the WTO reform. Over 100 representatives of accession candidates and WTO members attended the meeting. The participants discussed promotion of accessions to the WTO among the least developed countries.³⁸

On 24-25 February 2020, Russia participated in a meeting of the Agriculture Committee in Special Session.³⁹ Russia made a new submission on domestic support entitled "Formula for reduction of trade-distorting support" (JOB/AG/182). Russia further proposed that tariff rate quotas for shipments in transit should be administered transparently.

On 5 March 2020, Russia delivered a statement on the Appellate Body's decision in the dispute between Russia and Ukraine, "Russia – Measures affecting the importation of railway equipment and parts thereof."⁴⁰ Russia expressed disappointment with the Appellate Body's finding, and further noted that Russia has brought its measures into conformity with WTO rules. The statement further voices Russia's readiness to work with other WTO members and strengthen the Appellate Body.⁴¹

On 30 March 2020, Minister of Economic Development Maxim Reshetnikov participated in a remote meeting of G20 trade and investment ministers. The meeting discussed the impact of COVID-19 on global trade.⁴² The ministers agreed that emergency measures taken by G20 countries to combat the consequences of COVID-19 should be targeted, proportionate, transparent, temporary and consistent

³⁵ Россия указала на несоответствие нормам ВТО регулирования ЕС в отношении кобальта (Russia points to non-compliance with EU WTO regulations on cobalt), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 November 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/rossiya_ukazala_na_nesootvetstvie_normam_vto_regulirovaniya_es_v_otnoshenii_kobalta.html.

³⁶ Россия указала на несоответствие нормам ВТО регулирования ЕС в отношении кобальта (Russia points to non-compliance with EU WTO regulations on cobalt), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow). 18 November 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/rossiya_ukazala_na_nesootvetstvie_normam_vto_regulirovaniya_es_v_otnoshenii_kobalta.html.

³⁷ WTO reform 'urgent,' G20 ministers agree at Nagoya meeting, The Japan Times (Nagoya) 23 November 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2019/11/23/business/economy-business/g20-foreign-ministers-talks-japan-south-korea/#.Xm7bUS3Myu4>.

³⁸ Eighth China Round Table underlines contributions of accessions to WTO reform, WTO (Moscow) 05 December 2019. Access Date: 19 June 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news19_e/acc_05dec19_e.htm

³⁹ Eyeing MC12 for an outcome, agriculture negotiators focus on doable elements and processes, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 24 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news20_e/agri_24feb20_e.htm.

⁴⁰ DS499: Russia-Measures affecting the importation of railway equipment and parts thereof, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 4 February 2020. Access Date: 15 February 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/dispu_e/cases_e/ds499_e.htm#bkmk499abr.

⁴¹ Орган по разрешению споров ВТО не нашёл никаких существенных нарушений в ограничениях России на украинскую железнодорожную продукцию (WTO Dispute Resolution Authority Has Not Found Any Significant Violations in Russia's Restrictions on Ukrainian Rail Products), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 5 March 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/organ_po_razresheniyu_sporov_vto_ne_nashyol_nikakih_sushchestvennyh_narusheniy_v_ogranicheniyah_rossii_na_ukrainskuyu_zheleznodorozhnyuyu_produkciyu.html.

⁴² Максим Решетников обсудил с министрами торговли стран G20 совместные шаги по противодействию коронавирусу (Maxim Reshetnikov discussed joint steps to counter coronavirus with G20 trade ministers), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/maksim_reshetnikov_obsudil_s_ministrami_torgovli_stran_g20_sovmestnye_shagi_po_protivodeystviyu_koronavirusu.html.

with WTO rules.⁴³ In a joint statement, the ministers agreed to simplify access to essential products and targeted investment in a “free, fair, non-discriminatory, transparent, predictable and stable trade and investment environment” to restore economic activity.⁴⁴ Minister Reshetnikov further urged G20 countries to “do everything possible to restore normal operation and improve the WTO”.⁴⁵

On 29 April 2020, at the meeting of the BRICS Contact Group on Trade and Economic Issues, Russia presented measures to support its national economy and proposed joint strategic approaches to combat epidemics and their economic consequences.⁴⁶ At the meeting, BRICS representatives expressed support for the multilateral trading system in the context of the pandemic and highlighted the importance of ensuring the transparency of all measures taken in connection to COVID-19.⁴⁷ Additionally, representatives discussed the active participation of all BRICS countries in the WTO’s monitoring of economic measures relating to COVID-19.⁴⁸

On 5 May 2020, Russia participated in a joint statement issued by the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation trade ministers on best practices to combat the economic consequences of COVID-19 within the framework of WTO.⁴⁹

On 13 May 2020, Minister of Economic Development Maxim Reshenikov participated in the Second Extraordinary G20 Virtual Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting on COVID-19.⁵⁰ The ministers supported measures to mitigate the negative trade effects of the pandemic, including trade regulations,

⁴³ Максим Решетников обсудил с министрами торговли стран G20 совместные шаги по противодействию коронавирусу (Maxim Reshetnikov discussed joint steps to counter coronavirus with G20 trade ministers), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/maksim_reshetnikov_obsudil_s_ministrami_torgovli_stran_g20_sovmestnye_shagi_po_protivodeystviyu_koronavirusu.html.

⁴⁴ G20 Trade and Investment, G20 Saudi Arabia 2020 (Riyadh) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/file/e98f2a5e76b5f7b0086f334dc30df775/G20_Trade%26Investment_Ministrial_Statement_EN.pdf.

⁴⁵ Максим Решетников обсудил с министрами торговли стран G20 совместные шаги по противодействию коронавирусу (Maxim Reshetnikov discussed joint steps to counter coronavirus with G20 trade ministers), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/maksim_reshetnikov_obsudil_s_ministrami_torgovli_stran_g20_sovmestnye_shagi_po_protivodeystviyu_koronavirusu.html.

⁴⁶ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁴⁷ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁴⁸ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁴⁹ Министры торговли АТЭС договорились содействовать беспрепятственному перемещению товаров и услуг для борьбы с пандемией (APEC trade minister agreed to facilitate unimpeded movement of goods and services to fight pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 7 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/ministry_torgovli_ates_dogovorilis_sodeystvovat_besprepyatstvennomu_peremeshcheniyu_tovarov_i_uslug_dlya_borby_s_pandemiy.html.

⁵⁰ Решетников: торговые ограничения из-за пандемии нужно отменять, как только они утрачивают актуальность (Reshetnikov: trade restrictions due to a pandemic need to be lifted as soon as they lose relevance), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/reshetnikov_torgovye_ogranicheniya_iz_za_pandemii_nuzhno_otmenyat_kak_tolko_oni_utrachivayut_aktualnost.html.

trade facilitation, transparency, logistics systems, and support for micro, small and medium enterprises.⁵¹ Minister Reshetnikov stressed the importance of the WTO as a platform to facilitate the joint economic efforts of G20 countries, further highlighting the need to maintain the WTO's effectiveness through reform.⁵²

On 14 May 2020, Russia took part in the G20 trade and investment ministerial meeting. The ministers endorsed the G20 Actions to Support World Trade and Investment in Response to COVID-19 and emphasized “long-term actions [to] support the necessary reform of the WTO and the multilateral trading system.”⁵³

Russia actively engaged with WTO counterparts to ensure that the nature of WTO reform is transparent, open and balanced and made efforts towards enhancing inclusivity and development within the WTO framework.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Chen Ou Yang

India: +1

India fully complied with its commitment to work with all members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.

On 23 November 2019, at a meeting of G20 foreign ministers in Nagoya, Japan, the delegation of India and other G20 counterparts reaffirmed the urgency of reforming the WTO.⁵⁴

On 6 December 2019, India and South Africa circulated an internal memo in the WTO calling for support to lift a 20-year moratorium on a WTO ban on tariffs on digital trade.⁵⁵

On 16 January 2020, Minister of Railways and Commerce & Industry Piyush Goyal reaffirmed India's commitment to strengthening the WTO in his speech at the Raisina Dialogue.⁵⁶

On 23 January 2020, in response to comments by US President Donald Trump, India defended the principles of special and differential treatment for developing and least developed countries as essential tenets of the WTO.⁵⁷

⁵¹ Решетников: торговые ограничения из-за пандемии нужно отменять, как только они утрачивают актуальность (Reshetnikov: trade restrictions due to a pandemic need to be lifted as soon as they lose relevance), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/reshetnikov_torgovye_ogranicheniya_iz_za_pandemii_nuzhno_otmenyat_kak_tolko_oni_utrachivayut_aktualnost.html.

⁵² Решетников: торговые ограничения из-за пандемии нужно отменять, как только они утрачивают актуальность (Reshetnikov: trade restrictions due to a pandemic need to be lifted as soon as they lose relevance), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/reshetnikov_torgovye_ogranicheniya_iz_za_pandemii_nuzhno_otmenyat_kak_tolko_oni_utrachivayut_aktualnost.html.

⁵³ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Ministerial Statement, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 5 June 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0514.html>.

⁵⁴ WTO reform ‘urgent,’ G20 ministers agree at Nagoya meeting, The Japan Times (Nagoya) 23 November 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2019/11/23/business/economy-business/g20-foreign-ministers-talks-japan-south-korea/#.Xm7bUS3Myu4>.

⁵⁵ Trade war goes digital: countries eye tariffs on Internet economy, Reuters (Geneva) 6 December 2019. Access Date: 13 March 2020. <https://in.reuters.com/article/trade-wto-internet/trade-war-goes-digital-countries-eye-tariffs-on-internet-economy-idINKBN1YA1M2>.

⁵⁶ India strongly believes in multilateralism, strengthening WTO, says Piyush Goyal, Livemint (New Delhi) 16 January 2020. Access Date: 12 March 2020. <https://www.livemint.com/news/india/india-strongly-believes-in-multilateralism-strengthening-wto-says-piyush-goyal-11579185199546.html>.

⁵⁷ Reacting to Trump, India says special treatment for developing countries is essential principle of WTO, The Hindu Business Line (New Delhi) 23 January 2020. Access Date: 12 March 2020. <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/news/reacting-to-trump-india-says-special-treatment-for-developing-countries-is-essential-principle-of-wto/article30635731.ece>.

On 26 January 2020, Minister Piyush Goyal met with his counterparts from 35 other WTO members to discuss the priorities of WTO reform, which include developing the current WTO rules framework, improving the transparency of the implementation of WTO agreements, and the restoration of the Appellate Body and dispute settlement system.⁵⁸

On 28 January 2020, during an informal meeting at the World Economic Forum annual meeting in Davos, Minister Piyush Goyal expressed his support for the elimination of trade-distorting agricultural subsidies and ensuring the differential treatment enjoyed by developing countries.⁵⁹

On 5 March 2020, India announced that it will not cap input subsidies for irrigation, fertilizers and electricity. The government argued that such subsidies are essential to rural development and the livelihood of agricultural farmers. Moreover, more than 60 countries, including India and China, have called upon the WTO to address trade-distorting and product-specific subsidies employed by developed economies, specifically referring to Aggregate Measurement of Support offered by the United States, European Union and Canada.⁶⁰

On 14 March 2020, the Indian cabinet approved a new export program to replace its previous WTO-inconsistent Merchandise Exports from India Scheme (MEIS).⁶¹ This rectifies India's previously announced intention to continue the MEIS program until 31 March 2020, despite a WTO ruling in November that called for the cessation of MEIS and similar export promotion schemes.⁶²

On 15 March 2020, India and South Africa submitted a new proposal to the WTO against the proposed extension of the moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions. India and South Africa argued that an extension to the moratorium will result in losses in important tariff revenues for developing countries.⁶³

On 29 April 2020, at the meeting of the BRICS Contact Group on Trade and Economic Issues, India presented measures to support its national economy and proposed joint strategic approaches to combat epidemics and their economic consequences.⁶⁴ At the meeting, BRICS representatives expressed support for the multilateral trading system in the context of the pandemic and highlighted the importance of ensuring the transparency of all measures taken in connection to COVID-19.⁶⁵ Additionally,

⁵⁸ WTO Agenda set for June meet, The Telegraph (Kolkata) 26 January 2020. Access Date: 11 March 2020. <https://www.telegraphindia.com/business/wto-agenda-set-for-june-meet/cid/1739632>.

⁵⁹ India for elimination of trade-distorting subsidies on agriculture in WTO, Business Standard (New Delhi) 28 January 2020. Access Date: 12 March 2020. https://www.business-standard.com/article/pti-stories/india-for-elimination-of-trade-distorting-subsidies-on-agriculture-in-wto-120012801589_1.html.

⁶⁰ India refuses to cap farm input subsidies, The Economic Times (Mumbai) 5 March 2020. Access Date 14 March 2020. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/agriculture/india-refuses-to-cap-farm-input-subsidies/articleshow/74485419.cms?utm_source=contentofinterest&utm_medium=text&utm_campaign=cppst.

⁶¹ WTO-proof: Cabinet approves major export scheme to replace MEIS, Financial Express (Noida) 14 March 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://www.financialexpress.com/economy/wto-proof-cabinet-approves-major-export-scheme-to-replace-meis/1897405/>.

⁶² Govt to retain exports scheme till March after WTO asked for its scrapping, Business Standard (New Delhi) 3 January 2020. Access Date: 13 March 2020. https://www.business-standard.com/article/economy-policy/govt-to-retain-exports-scheme-till-march-after-wto-asked-for-its-scrapping-120010300341_1.html.

⁶³ Customs duty on e-transmissions: India, South Africa make new submission at WTO, Business Standard (New Delhi) 15 March 2020. Access Date 15 March 2020. <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/economy/customs-duty-on-e-transmissions-india-south-africa-make-new-submission-at-wto/article31074449.ece>.

⁶⁴ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa_uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁶⁵ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa_uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

representatives discussed the active participation of all BRICS countries in the WTO's monitoring of economic measures relating to COVID-19.⁶⁶

On 13 May 2020, India took a stand at the WTO in favour of postponing trade negotiations until the global pandemic is brought under control. India argued that poorer countries may not have the resources to actively participate in digital negotiations, and WTO members may wish to alter their negotiating stance as interests shift due to the ongoing negative effects of the pandemic on trade and business. India's position was supported by numerous developing and least developed countries.⁶⁷

On 14 May 2020, India took part in the G20 trade and investment ministerial meeting. The ministers endorsed the G20 Actions to Support World Trade and Investment in Response to COVID-19 and emphasized "long-term actions [to] support the necessary reform of the WTO and the multilateral trading system."⁶⁸

On 15 May 2020, India pushed back against calls by industrialised nations for the institutionalization of new binding trade liberalisation commitments. India's stance was supported by several developing and least developed countries who felt that it was imprudent to negotiate binding trade obligations amidst the uncertain circumstances created by the COVID-19 pandemic.⁶⁹

On 18 May 2020, G20 sherpa Suresh Prabhu appealed for bolstering multilateralism within the WTO to prepare for a post-COVID world order. Describing multilateralism as "under threat," Prabhu further underscored the need for the WTO to undertake reforms in the interest of all member States in an inclusive manner.⁷⁰

On 18 May 2020, along with other developing countries, India objected to the efforts made by several developed countries to introduce permanent tariff liberalisations during the COVID-19 crisis on commodities such as medical products. India defended its stance by terming the push for tariff liberalisation as a "thinly veiled bid" to exploit the global pandemic for market access gains.⁷¹

India has supported efforts for WTO reform by contributing to the procedural objectives of openness and transparency. India has also made efforts towards enhancing inclusivity and development in the WTO framework.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Japish Singh

⁶⁶ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁶⁷ Covid-19 impact: Poor nations back India's call to defer WTO talks, The Hindu Businessline (New Delhi) 13 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/economy/policy/covid-19-poor-nations-back-indias-call-for-deferment-of-wto-negotiations/article31573146.ece>.

⁶⁸ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Ministerial Statement, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 5 June 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0514.html>.

⁶⁹ India draws 5 markers at WTO; says no to using pandemic as portal for trade commitments, The Hindu Businessline (Geneva) 18 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/economy/india-draws-5-markers-at-wto-says-no-to-using-pandemic-as-portal-for-trade-commitments/article31612398.ece>.

⁷⁰ Multilateralism needs momentum in post Covid world order: Suresh Prabhu, The Economic Times (Mumbai) 18 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/multilateralism-needs-momentum-in-post-covid-world-order-suresh-prabhu/articleshow/75809437.cms>.

⁷¹ India opposes WTO members' push for permanent tariff cuts, The Economic Times (New Delhi) 18 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/india-opposes-wto-members-push-for-permanent-tariff-cuts/articleshow/75813917.cms>.

China: +1

China fully complied with its commitment to work with all members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.

On 18 November 2019, China renewed its contribution of USD500,000 to the WTO's Least-Developed Countries and Accessions Programme. Initiated in 2011 under the WTO's Aid for Trade Initiative, this program helps least-developed countries (LDCs) integrate into the global economy by providing technical assistance and capacity-building support, specifically by supporting the participation of LDCs in the WTO system and helping acceding LDCs in their membership negotiations.⁷²

On 23 November 2019, at a meeting of G20 foreign ministers in Nagoya, Japan, the delegation of China and other G20 counterparts reaffirmed the urgency of reforming the WTO.⁷³

On 4 December 2019, at the Eighth China Round Table on WTO Accessions, China's WTO Ambassador Zhang Xiangchen emphasized China's continued support for LDC accession to the WTO. Ambassador Zhang also reaffirmed China's support for necessary WTO reforms to enhance the organization's effectiveness and authority.⁷⁴

On 16 January 2020, China and the United States signed and released the Phase One China-US Economic and Trade Agreement.⁷⁵ In the text of the agreement, both parties reaffirmed the importance of adhering to WTO commitments and engaging cooperatively in international organizations.⁷⁶

On 24 January 2020, China joined the European Union and 15 other WTO members to form a multi-party interim appeal arrangement in light of the recent Appellate Body paralysis.⁷⁷ As a contingency measure pursuant to Article 25 of the Dispute Settlement Understanding, participating WTO members will use this interim arrangement as an "effective and binding dispute settlement process for potential trade disputes among them," until the Appellate Body resumes its normal operations.⁷⁸

On 29 February 2020, China's WTO Ambassador Zhang Xiangchen addressed the topic of WTO reform at a seminar in Pune, India. His address was titled "WTO Reform from the Perspective of Developing Countries." Specifically, Zhang encouraged developing countries to engage in discussions about WTO reform and set an agenda to design and advance desired reforms from the perspective of developing countries. In addition to calling for rulemaking in a balanced manner, Zhang emphasized that future negotiations regarding special and differential treatment should be objective and pragmatic. Lastly, Zhang stated that China will continue to support transparency in the WTO system as a developing country and urges its counterparts to "resist the pressure of protectionism [and] safeguard developing countries' legitimate right."⁷⁹

⁷² China contributes USD 500,000 to support least-developed countries and WTO accession, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 19 November 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres19_e/pr844_e.htm.

⁷³ WTO reform 'urgent,' G20 ministers agree at Nagoya meeting, The Japan Times (Nagoya) 23 November 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2019/11/23/business/economy-business/g20-foreign-ministers-talks-japan-south-korea/#.Xm7bUS3Myu4>.

⁷⁴ Eighth China round table underlines contributions of accessions to WTO reform, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 5 December 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news19_e/acc_05dec19_e.htm.

⁷⁵ Announcement on releasing the phase one China-US economic and trade agreement, Ministry of Commerce - People's Republic of China (Washington DC) 16 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/significantnews/202001/20200102930958.shtml>.

⁷⁶ Economic and Trade Agreement Between the Government of the People's Republic of China and the Government of the United States of America, Ministry of Commerce - People's Republic of China (Washington DC) 17 January 2020. Access Date: 22 March 2020. <http://images.mofcom.gov.cn/english/202001/20200116155105187.pdf>.

⁷⁷ EU and 16 WTO members agree to work together on an interim appeal arbitration arrangement, European Commission (Davos) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 22 March 2020. <https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2106>.

⁷⁸ EU and 16 WTO members agree to work together on an interim appeal arbitration arrangement, European Commission (Davos) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 22 March 2020. <https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2106>.

⁷⁹ WTO reform on the perspective of the developing countries, Ministry of Commerce - People's Republic of China (Pune) 29 February 2020. Access Date: 13 March 2020. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/counseloroffice/bilateralexchanges/202003/20200302942735.shtml>.

On 29 April 2020, at the meeting of the BRICS Contact Group on Trade and Economic Issues, China presented measures to support its national economy and proposed joint strategic approaches to combat epidemics and their economic consequences.⁸⁰ At the meeting, BRICS representatives expressed support for the multilateral trading system in the context of the pandemic and highlighted the importance of ensuring the transparency of all measures taken in connection to COVID-19.⁸¹ Additionally, representatives discussed the active participation of all BRICS countries in the WTO's monitoring of economic measures relating to COVID-19.⁸²

On 14 May 2020, China took part in the G20 trade and investment ministerial meeting. The ministers endorsed the G20 Actions to Support World Trade and Investment in Response to COVID-19 and emphasized “long-term actions [to] support the necessary reform of the WTO and the multilateral trading system.”⁸³

China has supported efforts for WTO reform by contributing to its procedural objectives. China has also made efforts towards enhancing inclusivity and development in the WTO framework by providing financial and technical assistance to developing countries and LDCs.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Wing Ka Tsang

South Africa: +1

South Africa fully complied with its commitment to work with all members of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to advance a process for necessary reform that is balanced, open, transparent and that promotes inclusivity and development.

On 23 November 2019, at a meeting of foreign ministers G20 in Nagoya, Japan, the delegation of South Africa and other G20 counterparts reaffirmed the urgency of reforming the WTO.⁸⁴

On 6 December 2019, South Africa and India circulated an internal WTO document supporting the end of a twenty-year moratorium on tariffs for digital trade. In the memo, South Africa and India stated that rising digitalization compelled “a rethink of the role of the temporary moratorium.”⁸⁵

On 15 March 2020, South Africa and India made a new submission at the WTO against the proposed extension of the moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions. South Africa and India

⁸⁰ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁸¹ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁸² Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁸³ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Ministerial Statement, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 5 June 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0514.html>.

⁸⁴ WTO reform ‘urgent,’ G20 ministers agree at Nagoya meeting, The Japan Times (Nagoya) 23 November 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2019/11/23/business/economy-business/g20-foreign-ministers-talks-japan-south-korea/#.Xm7bUS3Myu4>.

⁸⁵ Trade war goes digital: countries eye tariffs on Internet economy, Reuters (Geneva) 6 December 2019. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-trade-wto-internet/trade-war-goes-digital-countries-eye-tariffs-on-internet-economy-idUSKBN1YA1LU>.

submitted that this moratorium would lead to the “loss of use of tariff as a trade policy,” hindering the growth of many developing countries that will incur serious tariff loss.⁸⁶

On 29 April 2020, at the meeting of the BRICS Contact Group on Trade and Economic Issues, South Africa presented measures to support its national economy and proposed joint strategic approaches to combat epidemics and their economic consequences.⁸⁷ At the meeting, BRICS representatives expressed support for the multilateral trading system in the context of the pandemic and highlighted the importance of ensuring the transparency of all measures taken in connection to COVID-19.⁸⁸ Additionally, representatives discussed the active participation of all BRICS countries in the WTO’s monitoring of economic measures relating to COVID-19.⁸⁹

On 14 May 2020, South Africa took part in the G20 trade and investment ministerial meeting. The ministers endorsed the G20 Actions to Support World Trade and Investment in Response to COVID-19 and emphasized “long-term actions [to] support the necessary reform of the WTO and the multilateral trading system.”⁹⁰

South Africa has supported efforts for WTO reform by contributing to its procedural objectives. South Africa has also made efforts towards enhancing inclusivity and development in the WTO framework.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Abby Chu

⁸⁶ Customs duty on e-transmissions: India, South Africa make new submission at WTO, The Hindu Businessline (New Delhi) 15 March 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/economy/customs-duty-on-e-transmissions-india-south-africa-make-new-submission-at-wto/article31074449.ece>.

⁸⁷ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁸⁸ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁸⁹ Участники Контактной группы БРИКС обсудили совместные подходы к экономическому взаимодействию условиях пандемии (BRICS Contact Group participants discuss joint approaches to economic cooperation in a pandemic), Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. https://economy.gov.ru/material/news/ekonomika_bez_virusa/uchastniki_kontaktnoy_gruppy_briks_obsudili_sovmestnye_podhody_k_ekonomicheskomu_vzaimodeystviyu_v_usloviyah_pandemii.html.

⁹⁰ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Ministerial Statement, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 5 June 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0514.html>.

2. Reform of International Financial Institutions

“We also support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members.”

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia		0	
India	-1		
China	-1		
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.80 (10%)	

Background

The International Monetary Fund (IMF) consists of 189 member states whose collective objectives are to promote global monetary cooperation, high employment and sustainable growth, financial stability, international trade, and poverty eradication.⁹¹ The IMF was established in 1945 with the main goal of guaranteeing the stability of the international monetary system, which consists of the international payments and exchange rate system that allows countries to conduct transactions with each other. In 2012, the IMF’s mandate was updated to include all issues relating to macroeconomics and the financial sector as they relate to and impact global stability.⁹²

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment to an inclusive, rules-based, transparent, non-discriminatory and open multilateral trading system, with a specific focus on development. BRICS members acknowledged the increasing number of plurilateral, regional and bilateral trade agreements and stressed that such agreements should be characterized by the same principles of transparency, inclusiveness and compatibility. Such trade agreements should also work with the multilateral trading system to promote and reflect such values. Furthermore, BRICS members pledged to work with G20 members and promote important issues for emerging market and developing economies (EMDEs).⁹³

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS members reiterated the importance of concluding the 15th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including the quota formula, by the IMF’s 2019 Spring Meetings and no later than its 2019 Annual Meetings. BRICS members further stressed the significance of an open and resilient financial system to promote development and sustainable growth. In addition, BRICS members welcomed the Contingent Reserve Arrangement (CRA) System of Exchange in Macroeconomic Information and agreed to foster closer cooperation between the CRA and the IMF.⁹⁴

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS members once again reaffirmed their commitment at the Xiamen Summit, specifically pledging to conclude the 15th GRQ’s quota formula negotiations by the IMF’s 2019 Spring Meetings and no later than the 2019 Annual Meetings. This emphasis was made in conjunction with the BRICS leaders’ call for a strong Global Financial Safety Net supported by a quota-based, adequately-resourced IMF. BRICS members also highlighted the importance of IMF governance reform to support the voices and representation of the poorest IMF members. Further echoing the

⁹¹ About the IMF, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.). Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/About>

⁹² About the IMF, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.). Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/About>

⁹³ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁹⁴ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

Xiamen summit, BRICS members also reiterated their previous commitment to fostering cooperation between the IMF and CRA.⁹⁵

Commitment Features

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS members reaffirmed their “commitment to a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at the center of the global financial safety net.”⁹⁶ The commitment in question to “support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members” must be understood in this context. In this commitment, the word “support” qualifies this BRICS commitment as a “politically-binding criteria.”⁹⁷ “Support” is defined as an “action, or act of providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity.”⁹⁸

To understand representation in the IMF, one must examine the IMF’s quota-based financial and governance structure. Quotas reflect a member’s economic position. Quotas also determine its voting power, its share in a general allocation of special drawing rights, the maximum amount of financial resources obliged to the IMF from the member, and the financial resources it can obtain from the IMF.⁹⁹ The IMF’s current formula to determine the distribution of quotas is calculated as 50% gross domestic product, 30% economic openness, 15% economic variability, and 5% international reserves. Quota reviews are scheduled to occur every five years to ensure the proper representation of all regions and members.¹⁰⁰

The IMF’s 14th GRQ concluded in December 2010. This review resulted in the unprecedented doubling of overall quotas, simultaneously halving the new arrangements to borrow. The 14th GRQ also resulted in the redistribution of quota shares, which increased quota shares for EMDEs by roughly 6%. However, the quota formula in place in 2010 only allocated 60 per cent of the overall increase. At the conclusion of the 14th GRQ, the IMF Executive Board also decided to complete a review of the quota formula by January 2013 and conclude the 15th GRQ by January 2014. Neither deadline was met.¹⁰¹

In light of resolution No. 72-1, adopted by the IMF Board of Governors on 5 December 2016 to expedite the 15th GRQ, the IMF decided to pursue a realignment of its quota shares and more equitably reflect its Members’ relative positions in the world economy.¹⁰² This decision was made with the specific intent to protect the poorest IMF members.¹⁰³ The 15th GRQ was intended to be complete by the 2019 spring or annual meeting, the outcomes of which would include a new quota formula and a realignment of quotas shares in favour of EMDEs.¹⁰⁴

⁹⁵ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁹⁶ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasil.html>

⁹⁷ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, G7 and G20 Research Groups (Toronto) 2 May 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/compliance-coding-manual-2016.pdf>

⁹⁸ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, G7 and G20 Research Groups (Toronto) 2 May 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/compliance-coding-manual-2016.pdf>

⁹⁹ IMF Quotas, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 8 March 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/Sheets/2016/07/14/12/21/IMF-Quotas>

¹⁰⁰ Quota reform impasse likely as IMF faces legitimacy crisis, Bretton Woods Project (Washington D.C.) 30 July 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.brettonwoodsproject.org/2019/07/quota-reform-impasse-likely-as-imf-faces-legitimacy-crisis/>

¹⁰¹ The International Monetary Fund: 15th General Review of Quotas, European Parliament (Brussels) April 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/631059/IPOL_BRI\(2019\)631059_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/631059/IPOL_BRI(2019)631059_EN.pdf)

¹⁰² G20 International Financial Architecture Working Group 2019 Final Report to the Osaka Summit, Ministry of Finance of Japan. Access Date: 9 January 2019. https://www.mof.go.jp/english/international_policy/convention/g20/annex4_1.pdf

¹⁰³ IMF Quotas, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 8 March 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/Sheets/2016/07/14/12/21/IMF-Quotas>

¹⁰⁴ The International Monetary Fund: 15th General Review of Quotas, European Parliament (Brussels) April 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/631059/IPOL_BRI\(2019\)631059_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/631059/IPOL_BRI(2019)631059_EN.pdf)

On 18 October 2019, the IMF membership endorsed a package to guarantee adequate resources for the IMF and its continued quota and governance reforms.¹⁰⁵ Revising the IMF's quotas and continuing its governance reform, including a new quota formula, is extended from 2020 to no later than 15 December 2023.¹⁰⁶

Full compliance with this commitment requires BRICS members to work with the IMF in support of its actions on quota and governance reform under the 16th GRQ. Such support includes actions focusing on increasing the quota size of the IMF and realigning the quota shares of IMF members, specifically in favor of EMDEs. Furthermore, actions accounting for full compliance must also include working with the IMF on its governance reform.

If a BRICS member assisted the IMF on either quota reform or governance reform, it would only receive a partial compliance score of 0. By taking no actions to work with the IMF in support of representation for its poorest members, a BRICS member would receive a score of -1 for non-compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did NOT support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota or governance reform based on 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).
0	The BRICS member partially supported protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota OR governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.
+1	The BRICS member fully supported protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota AND governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.

Brazil: -1

Brazil failed to comply with its commitment to support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota and governance reform based on the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

Brazil did not taken sufficient actions to support protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota reform. In a similar fashion, it did not take actions to support governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.¹⁰⁷

Analyst: Amira Higazy

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with its commitment to support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota and governance reform based on the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

On 16 April 2020, Minister of Finance and Governor Alternate to IMF's Board of Governors Anton Siluanov issued a statement at the International Monetary and Financial Committee's 41st meeting,

¹⁰⁵ Press Release No. 19/379 IMF Membership Endorses Package on IMF Resources and Governance Reform, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 18 October 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2019/10/18/pr19379-imf-membership-endorses-package-on-imf-resources-and-governance-reform>

¹⁰⁶ Press Release No. 19/379 IMF Membership Endorses Package on IMF Resources and Governance Reform, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 18 October 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2019/10/18/pr19379-imf-membership-endorses-package-on-imf-resources-and-governance-reform>

¹⁰⁷ This finding of non-compliance was determined through a search of the following sites: <https://www.imf.org>, <https://interfax.com>, <https://nationalpost.com/>, <http://www.ptinews.com/>, <https://www.bnamericas.com/en>, <http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/>, <http://en.people.cn/>, <https://www.prnewswire.com/>, <http://www.brazil.gov.br/>.

supporting the prioritization and acceleration of the promised reform of IMF quota and governance under the 16th GRQ.¹⁰⁸

Russia partially supported its committed by vocalizing support for IMF reform on quota representation and governance based on the 16th GRQ. However, Russia did not take concrete actions to support the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.¹⁰⁹

Analyst: Wenny (Yiyao) Jin

India: -1

India failed to comply with its commitment to support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota and governance reform based on the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

India did not take sufficient actions to support protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota reform. In a similar fashion, it did not take actions to support governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.

Thus, India receives a score of -1.¹¹⁰

Analyst: Natasha Pirzada

China: -1

China failed to comply with its commitment to support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota and governance reform based on the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

China did not take sufficient actions to support protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota reform. In a similar fashion, it did not take actions to support governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.

Thus, China receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Nicole Shi

South Africa: -1

South Africa failed to comply with its commitment to support protecting the voice and representation of the poorest members of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota and governance reform based on the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

South Africa did not take sufficient actions to support protecting the voice and representation of the IMF's poorest members through actions assisting the IMF's work on quota reform. In a similar fashion, it did not take actions to support governance reform based on the 16th GRQ.

¹⁰⁸ IMFC Meetings, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 16 April 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. <https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/SPROLLS/imfc-meetings#sort=%40imfdate%20descending>

¹⁰⁹ This finding of non-compliance was determined through a deep search of the following sites: <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/01/17/pr2010-nab-and-quota-imf-executive-board-approves-package-resources-governance-reform>, <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/02/13/pr2050-imf-board-of-governors-approves-a-resolution-on-quota-reviews>, <https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/Policy-Papers/Issues/2020/02/13/Fifteenth-and-Sixteenth-General-Reviews-of-Quotas-Report-of-the-Executive-Board-to-the-Board-49049>, <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2020/04/23/pr20186-mauritania-imf-executive-board-approves-disbursement-to-address-covid-19>, <https://meetings.imf.org/en/2020/Spring/Statements>, <https://meetings.imf.org/en/Index>, <https://meetings.imf.org/en/2020/Spring/Schedule>, <http://government.ru/en/news/>, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-imf-worldbank/imf-gets-11-7-billion-in-pledges-to-aid-poor-countries-will-review-resources-idUSKCN21Y2CB>, <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-finance-0415.html>.

¹¹⁰ This finding of non-compliance was determined through a search of the following sites: <https://indianewengland.com>, <https://www.thehindu.com>, <https://www.orfonline.org>, <https://theprint.in>, <https://www.imf.org>.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Syed Haider

3. Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework

“We are committed to contributing to and supporting the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.”

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.40 (70%)		

Background

2020 marks the final year of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020 and its 20 global headline biodiversity targets collectively known as the Aichi Targets. On 30 November 2018, the Conference of the Parties (COP) to the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) adopted a decision on the comprehensive and participatory process for the preparation of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework. This framework is motivated by and serves as a stepping stone towards the 2050 Vision of “Living in Harmony with Nature.”¹¹¹ In October 2020, the COP to the CBD will convene its 15th meeting in Kunming, China, and adopt a new Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.¹¹²

In 1992, the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development was signed at the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development. The Rio Declaration reaffirmed the Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment in 1972. The goal of the Rio Declaration was to establish “a new and equitable global partnership through the creation of new levels of cooperation among States, key sectors of societies and people, working towards international agreements which respect the interests of all and protect the integrity of the global environment and developmental system, [and] recognizing the integral and interdependent nature of the Earth.”¹¹³

At the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit,¹¹⁴ the 2011 Sanya Summit,¹¹⁵ the 2012 New Delhi Summit,¹¹⁶ the 2014 Fortaleza Summit¹¹⁷ and the 2015 Ufa Summit,¹¹⁸ BRICS leaders acknowledged the importance of sustainable development through the implementation of the Rio Declaration and other multilateral agreements on the environment and biodiversity.¹¹⁹

¹¹¹ Decision adopted by the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity, Convention on Biological Diversity (Sharm El-Sheikh) 30 November 2018. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/decisions/cop-14/cop-14-dec-34-en.pdf>.

¹¹² Information Note: Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, Convention on Biological Diversity United Nations Environment Programme (Montreal) 22 May 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/notifications/2019/ntf-2019-049-post2020-en.pdf>.

¹¹³ Rio Declaration on Environment and Development 1992, United Nations (Rio de Janeiro) 14 June 1992. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <https://www.jus.uio.no/lm/environmental.development.rio.declaration.1992/portrait.a4.pdf>.

¹¹⁴ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>.

¹¹⁵ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>.

¹¹⁶ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>.

¹¹⁷ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>.

¹¹⁸ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 January 2020. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹¹⁹ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>.

On 22 April 2015, BRICS environment ministers held their first meeting in Moscow. They expressed their support for the creation of a platform “for sharing environmentally sound technologies...that can assist in addressing environmental challenges.”¹²⁰

On 15-16 September 2016, BRICS environment ministers met to discuss “air and water pollution, efficient management of waste and sustainable management of biodiversity.” Further, the ministers acknowledged the importance of BRICS participation in environmental cooperation initiatives.¹²¹ At the following 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and welcomed the G20 Action Plan on the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.¹²²

On 22-23 June 2017, BRICS environment ministers met in Tianjin, China, where they restated their commitment to implementing the Agenda 2030 for Sustainable Development and the Paris Agreement. The ministers also discussed the importance of signing a BRICS Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Cooperation and developing an environmental cooperation framework agreement in the future.¹²³

On 18 May 2018, BRICS environment ministers held their fourth meeting. The ministers once again reiterated their commitment to implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Paris Agreement. The ministers also acknowledged the progress made on the Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Cooperation.¹²⁴ At the following 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the SDGs. Furthermore, BRICS leaders pledged to “strengthen BRICS cooperation in energy, especially in transitioning to more environmentally sustainable energy systems supportive of the global sustainable development agenda, balanced economic growth and the collective socio-economic wellbeing of our citizens.”¹²⁵

On 15 August 2019, the BRICS environment ministers met in São Paulo for the fifth BRICS environment ministers meeting. The theme of the meeting was “contribution of urban environmental management to improving the quality of life in cities.” The ministers advanced dialogue on key themes, one of which was the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework. At this meeting, the BRICS environment ministers committed to contributing and supporting the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework and to the successful outcomes of COP 15. The BRICS ministers agreed to prioritize biodiversity conservation and develop a biodiversity cooperation mechanism.¹²⁶ This commitment to supporting the Global Biodiversity Framework was reiterated at the Brasilia leaders’ summit in November 2019.

On 22 May 2019, the Secretariat of the CBD released an information note regarding “Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.” This document will guide the compliance analysis and scoring metric of the present BRICS commitment, which entails a pledge to contribute to and support “the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.”

¹²⁰ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 January 2020. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹²¹ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

¹²² 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

¹²³ Third Meeting of BRICS Environment Ministers Tianjin Statement on Environment, BRICS Information Centre (Tianjin) 23 June 2017. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>.

¹²⁴ Joint Statement for the Fourth BRICS Ministers of Environment Meeting, BRICS Information Centre (Zimbabwe) 18 May 2018. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180518-environment.html>.

¹²⁵ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>.

¹²⁶ Joint Statement for the 5th BRICS Ministers of Environment Meeting, BRICS Information Center (Sao Paulo) 15 August 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/190815-environment.html>.

Commitment Features

Three keywords prescribe the purpose and actions underlying the present BRICS commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework: development, support, and contribute.

First, the commitment concerns the “development” of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework. Development refers to “the *process* of developing something new”¹²⁷ or “the process of creating a new product or method.”¹²⁸ The definition’s emphasis on process is a defining feature of this commitment, as global action towards biodiversity is in a period of transition from the previous decade to the post-2020 era. The process of creating a new Post-2020 Biodiversity Framework is the focus of this commitment.

The Information Note released by the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) on the Global Biodiversity Framework provides useful guidelines for how countries can contribute to and support the process of developing the post-2020 framework. In the Information Note, the section “Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework” intends to provide background information for the framework and outline opportunities for CBD parties, other governments, and all relevant organizations and stakeholders to participate in and contribute to the framework’s process.

Specifically, BRICS leaders committed to support and contribute to the aforementioned process. “Contribute” is understood to mean to “give or supply in common with others.”¹²⁹ Methods of contributing to the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework are outlined in the Information Note under a section entitled “Overview of opportunities to provide input to the process.”¹³⁰ Listed among these methods are:

- “Participation in global, regional and thematic consultations during 2019-2020”
- “Participation in the meetings of the Open-Ended Intersessional Working Group (OEWG) on the preparation of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.
- “Participation in meetings of the CBD subsidiary bodies (Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice (SBSTTA), Subsidiary Body on Implementation (SBI) and the Ad-hoc Open-ended Working Group on Article 8(j) and Related Provisions) and expert meetings.
- “Submission of views and/or substantive input/comments to the discussion documents on the post-2020 framework, as they are made available for consultation in the CBD post-2020 website. ...
- Participation in CBD COP-15, to be held in Kunming, China, in 2020”¹³¹

The third keyword of this commitment, “support,” refers to actions that “promote the interests or cause of,” “pay the costs of,” or “provide a basis for the existence or subsistence of.”¹³² The information note stipulates that “Support to the Post-2020 Process” can take the following forms and methods:

¹²⁷ Development, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/development>.

¹²⁸ Development, MacMillan Dictionary (London) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.macmillandictionary.com/dictionary/british/development>.

¹²⁹ Contribute, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/contribute>.

¹³⁰ Information Note: Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, Convention on Biological Diversity United Nations Environment Programme (Montreal) 22 May 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/notifications/2019/ntf-2019-049-post2020-en.pdf>.

¹³¹ Information Note: Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, Convention on Biological Diversity United Nations Environment Programme (Montreal) 22 May 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/notifications/2019/ntf-2019-049-post2020-en.pdf>. Note that several recommended processes listed in this section, which overlap significantly with the means of providing support, have been eliminated to demarcate the two kinds of actions more clearly.

¹³² Support, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/support>.

- “Financial support (meetings, events, workshops, projects, data/studies, communications, actions/campaigns, staff costs).
- “Technical and expert support to the Secretariat on specific topics (communications, social media, web support), including through secondments and partnerships.
- “Organization/hosting of consultations (global, regional, thematic) and other relevant events (may include dedicated post-2020 meetings or special consultation sessions at other meetings/events).”¹³³

In sum, although “contribution” refers to actions that are participatory in nature and taken in tandem with other countries, “support” refers to individual actions and initiatives that governments can provide with a greater degree of leadership. Thus, full compliance with this commitment requires a BRICS member to both contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework. If a BRICS member satisfies one of two elements in this commitment, i.e., either contributes to or supports the aforementioned development, said BRICS member will receive a partial compliance score of 0. By taking no actions that fall within the parameter of this commitment, a BRICS member will receive a score of –1 for non-compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

–1	The BRICS member did not contribute to nor support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.
0	The BRICS member took actions that contributed to OR supported the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.
+1	The BRICS member took actions that contributed to AND supported the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with its commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 20 November 2019, along with the governors of the states of the Legal Amazon, Minister of the Environment Ricardo Salles introduced a national plan to advance the Amazon’s sustainable development and prevent illegal deforestation.¹³⁴ They identified five major pillars: land regulation, ecological-economic zoning, payment for environmental services, bio-economy and zero tolerance against illegal deforestation.¹³⁵

On 24 January 2020, the Ministry of the Environment signed a contract with the National Bank for Social Economic Development to create the National Benefit Sharing Fund.¹³⁶ This fund will help Brazil meet its bio-economy goals, one of Brazil’s preventative strategies to counteract illegal deforestation. The

¹³³ Information Note: Ways and means to contribute to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, Convention on Biological Diversity United Nations Environment Programme (Montreal) 22 May 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/notifications/2019/ntf-2019-049-post2020-en.pdf>.

¹³⁴ Ministerio do Meio Ambiente e governadores da Amazonia legal lancam Pacto pelo Ambientalismo de Resultado, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 20 November 2019. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15661-minist%C3%A9rio-do-meio-ambiente-e-governadores-da-amaz%C3%B4nia-legal-lan%C3%A7am-pacto-pelo-ambientalismo-de-resultado.html>.

¹³⁵ Ministerio do Meio Ambiente e governadores da Amazonia legal lancam Pacto pelo Ambientalismo de Resultado, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 20 November 2019. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15661-minist%C3%A9rio-do-meio-ambiente-e-governadores-da-amaz%C3%B4nia-legal-lan%C3%A7am-pacto-pelo-ambientalismo-de-resultado.html>.

¹³⁶ Fundo Nacional de Reparticao de Beneficio ira fomentar a agenda da bioeconomia, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15688-fundo-nacional-de-reparti%C3%A7%C3%A3o-de-benef%C3%ADcios-ir%C3%A1-fomentar-a-agenda-da-bioeconomia.html>.

purpose of this fund is to support sustainable development. Companies that benefit from Brazil's genetic heritage will be expected to return one per cent of their annual revenue to the fund.¹³⁷

On 11 February 2020, President Jair Bolsonaro officially re-implemented the Amazon Council and transferred the responsibility of the council to the Vice President.¹³⁸ The goal of this council is to protect the Amazon rainforest through projects to promote preservation, protection, and sustainable development.¹³⁹

On 25 March 2020, the Ministry of the Environment received BRL500 million through the Green Climate Fund. The Ministry announced that it will use this funding for programs that conserve and recover the Amazon rainforest. A main component of this funding will be allocated as payments to environmental services that protect the forest.¹⁴⁰

On 7 May 2020, President Bolsonaro announced that Brazil will implement land regularization in regions of the Amazon and assign oversight authorities to each region to ensure and monitor compliance with relevant legislation.¹⁴¹

On 4 June 2020, the Ministry of the Environment pledged to invest BRL500 million in remunerating projects and activities in the Amazon that promote biodiversity, protect the environment, and advance sustainable development.¹⁴²

Brazil has demonstrated its support for the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework through domestic actions focusing on the bio-economy and deforestation. However, Brazil did not demonstrate contribution to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, as Brazil did not take participatory actions in existing global efforts.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Areej Malik

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with its commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 25 December 2019, the Ministry of Economic Development approved a national plan to combat climate change. The plan aims to adapt the economy and the population to climate change and includes institutional, organizational and methodological measures aimed at the formation of a state-wide

¹³⁷ Fundo Nacional de Reparticao de Beneficio ira fomentar a agenda da bioeconomia, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15688-fundo-nacional-de-reparti%C3%A7%C3%A3o-de-benef%C3%ADcios-ir%C3%A1-fomentar-a-agenda-da-bioeconomia.html>.

¹³⁸ Bolsonaro assina Decreto de criaçã do Conselho Nacional da Amazônia Legal, Presidencia da Republica (Brasilia) 11 February 2020. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/acompanhe-o-planalto/noticias/2020/02/bolsonaro-assina-decreto-de-criacao-do-conselho-nacional-da-amazonia-legal>.

¹³⁹ Bolsonaro assina Decreto de criaçã do Conselho Nacional da Amazônia Legal, Presidencia da Republica (Brasilia) 11 February 2020. Access Date: 17 February 2020. <https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/acompanhe-o-planalto/noticias/2020/02/bolsonaro-assina-decreto-de-criacao-do-conselho-nacional-da-amazonia-legal>.

¹⁴⁰ MMA assina recebimento de 96 milhões de dólares para proteger a Amazônia, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 26 March 2020. Access Date: 4 June 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15738-mma-assina-recebimento-de-96-milh%C3%B5es-de-d%C3%B3lares-para-protger-a-amaz%C3%B4nia.html>.

¹⁴¹ MP da Regularização Fundiária colabora com a fiscalização de terras da Amazônia, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 7 May 2020. Access Date: 4 June 2020. <https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/acompanhe-o-planalto/noticias/2020/05/mp-da-regularizacao-fundiaria-colabora-com-a-fiscalizacao-de-terras-da-amazonia>.

¹⁴² MMA lança maior programa do mundo para impulsionar remuneração de quem protege as florestas, Ministerio do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 4 June 2020. Access Date: 4 June 2020. <https://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/15758-mma-lan%C3%A7a-maior-programa-do-mundo-para-impulsionar-remunera%C3%A7%C3%A3o-de-quem-protge-as-florestas.html>.

approach to climate change adaptation.¹⁴³ Several elements of this plan aim to increase the preservation of biodiversity.¹⁴⁴

On 27 January 2020, as a part of the implementation of the Action Plan to combat illegal logging and trafficking of wood, the Ministry of Natural Resources developed a draft federal law entitled “On Amending the Forest Code of the Russian Federation in part to improve the legal regulation of timber harvesting.”¹⁴⁵ This legislation will crack down on illegal logging and prevent deforestation.¹⁴⁶

On 27 February 2020, the Ministry of Natural Resources announced that it will be establishing “traps” for microplastics in protected areas.¹⁴⁷ Most microplastics are transferred through air or water and these traps will help remove microplastics from protected areas such as wildlife reserves.¹⁴⁸

On 10 March 2020, the Ministry of Natural Resources hosted a meeting on the conservation and restoration of rare and endangered wildlife.¹⁴⁹ This meeting focused on the monitoring of the saiga population in Russia.¹⁵⁰ Saigas are an integral animal in Russia’s plans to preserve biodiversity. The meeting further discussed updates of the guidelines and methods used to count the saiga population.¹⁵¹

On 12 March 2020, Deputy Minister of Natural Resources and Ecology Elena Panova chaired a meeting that established nurseries and reintroduction centers for rare and endangered wildlife in Russia.¹⁵² This meeting also concluded in a building approval for the Far Eastern leopard breeding and reintroduction center in the Lazovsky Reserve.¹⁵³

¹⁴³ Russia Plans to ‘Adapt’ to Climate Change, Moscow Times (Moscow) 10 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. <https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/01/06/russia-plans-to-adapt-to-climate-change-a68814.html>.

¹⁴⁴ Russia Plans to ‘Adapt’ to Climate Change, Moscow Times (Moscow) 10 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. <https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/01/06/russia-plans-to-adapt-to-climate-change-a68814.html>.

¹⁴⁵ “Black Lumberjacks” at gunpoint. The Ministry of Natural Resources of Russia has developed a bill to amend the Forest Code of the Russian Federation, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 27 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/chyernye_lesoruby_pod_pritselom_minprirody_rossii_razrabotan_zakonoproekt_o_vn_esenii_izmeneniy_v_les/.

¹⁴⁶ “Black Lumberjacks” at gunpoint. The Ministry of Natural Resources of Russia has developed a bill to amend the Forest Code of the Russian Federation, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 27 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/chyernye_lesoruby_pod_pritselom_minprirody_rossii_razrabotan_zakonoproekt_o_vn_esenii_izmeneniy_v_les/.

¹⁴⁷ In the Katunsky reserve will monitor the behavior of microplastics in nature, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 27 February 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/v_katunskom_zapovednike_budut_otslezhivat_povedenie_mikroplastika_v_prirode/.

¹⁴⁸ In the Katunsky reserve will monitor the behavior of microplastics in nature, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 27 February 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/v_katunskom_zapovednike_budut_otslezhivat_povedenie_mikroplastika_v_prirode/.

¹⁴⁹ Ministry of Natural Resources will develop guidelines for monitoring and recording saiga abundance, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 10 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/minprirody_razrabotaet_metodicheskie_rekomendatsii_po_monitoringu_i_uchetu_chis_lennosti_saygaka/.

¹⁵⁰ Ministry of Natural Resources will develop guidelines for monitoring and recording saiga abundance, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 10 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/minprirody_razrabotaet_metodicheskie_rekomendatsii_po_monitoringu_i_uchetu_chis_lennosti_saygaka/.

¹⁵¹ Ministry of Natural Resources will develop guidelines for monitoring and recording saiga abundance, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 10 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/minprirody_razrabotaet_metodicheskie_rekomendatsii_po_monitoringu_i_uchetu_chis_lennosti_saygaka/.

¹⁵² Far Eastern leopard breeding and reintroduction center will appear in Lazovsky Reserve, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 12 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/v_lazovskom_zapovednike_poyavitsya_tsentr_razvedeniya_i_reintroduktsii_dalnevostochnogo_leoparda/.

¹⁵³ Far Eastern leopard breeding and reintroduction center will appear in Lazovsky Reserve, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 12 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/v_lazovskom_zapovednike_poyavitsya_tsentr_razvedeniya_i_reintroduktsii_dalnevostochnogo_leoparda/.

On 13 March 2020, the Ministry of Natural Resources began preparing for the release of Asiatic leopards into the wild by moving them to a recovery centre.¹⁵⁴ The ministry is aiming to release the leopards into the wild in mid-summer.¹⁵⁵

On 19 May 2020, the Ministry of Agriculture approved the criteria and procedure regarding the preparation of the biological justification for the establishment of fishery protected areas. This initiative seeks to prevent the degradation of water ecosystems while ensuring sustainable socio-economic development in the region. The protected area will preserve the feeding and migration sites of Kaluga, Amur sturgeon and Pacific salmon.¹⁵⁶

Russia has demonstrated its support for the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework through domestic actions addressing deforestation and wildlife conservation. However, Russia did not demonstrate contribution to the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework, as it did not take participatory actions in existing global efforts.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Daniel Scarpitti

India: +1

India fully complied with its commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 5 February 2020, the government introduced a ten-year comprehensive plan for the conservation of migratory birds and their habitats. In its draft document, the ministry listed 15 major programs, ranging from conserving avian habitats in urban areas to the conservation of migratory birds. The programs will be implemented over the short term (four years), medium term (four to seven years) and long term (7–10 years). There is a total of 870 protected areas, many of which have been designated “Important Bird & Biodiversity Areas.”¹⁵⁷

On 19 February 2020, in a radio address to the country, Prime Minister Narendra Modi described the biodiversity of India as a “unique treasure” for humankind and urged preservation and conservation efforts. He stated, “recently, biologists discovered a new species of fish whose habitat is within the caves of Meghalaya. It is believed that this fish is the largest among aquatic species found under the surface of caves.”¹⁵⁸

On 24 February 2020, India hosted the 13th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS COP13) in Gandhinagar.¹⁵⁹ The conference concluded with “the adoption of a number of significant resolutions and decisions to address

¹⁵⁴ In the Caucasus, they are preparing for release into the natural habitat of the Asian leopards, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 13 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/na_kavkaze_gotovyat_k_vypusku_v_estestvennyu_sredu_obitaniya_peredneaziatskikh_leopardov/.

¹⁵⁵ In the Caucasus, they are preparing for release into the natural habitat of the Asian leopards, Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 13 March 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/na_kavkaze_gotovyat_k_vypusku_v_estestvennyu_sredu_obitaniya_peredneaziatskikh_leopardov/.

¹⁵⁶ Fishery Protected Areas May Appear in Russia in the Near Future, The World Wildlife Fund (Moscow) 19 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://wwf.ru/en/resources/news/morya/rybokhozyaystvennye-zapovednye-zony-mogut-poyavitsya-v-rossii-uzhe-v-blizhayshee-vremya/>.

¹⁵⁷ Govt proposes 10-year comprehensive plan for conservation of birds, their habitats, The Economic Times (India) 5 February 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/environment/flora-fauna/govt-proposes-10-year-comprehensive-plan-for-conservation-of-birds-their-habitats/articleshow/73942840.cms>.

¹⁵⁸ Preserve, conserve India's biodiversity, says PM Modi in Mann ki Baat, The Economic Times. 23 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/preserve-conserve-indias-biodiversity-says-pm-modi-in-mann-ki-baat/articleshow/74264530.cms>.

¹⁵⁹ CMS COP13 concludes in India with major new actions for migratory species, UN Environment (Geneva) 24 February 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/press-release/cms-cop13-concludes-india-major-new-actions-migratory-species>.

the conservation needs and threats facing migratory species around the globe.”¹⁶⁰ Ten new species were added to CMS Appendices at COP13 and seven species were added to Appendix I (strictest protection).¹⁶¹ Seven Migratory Species Champions were acknowledged for their generous contributions to the CMS initiatives: Germany, India, Italy, Monaco, Norway, the European Commission, and Abu Dhabi.¹⁶²

On 22 May 2020, on the occasion of the International Day for Biological Diversity 2020, the Minister of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Shri Prakash Javadekar announced five key initiatives for the conservation of biodiversity.¹⁶³ Minister Javadekar launched the National Biodiversity Authority (NBA) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Biodiversity Samrakshan Internship Programme, which will select 20 postgraduate students over the course of one year.¹⁶⁴

On 22 May 2020, the Ministry of Environment, Forestry and Climate Change launch the UNEP Campaign on Illegal Trafficking of Endangered Species, ‘Not all Animals Migrate by Choice,’ in light of the COVID-19 pandemic.¹⁶⁵ The campaign is designed to “address environmental challenges, raise awareness, and advocate solutions.”¹⁶⁶

India has demonstrated its support for the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework through actions on wildlife conservation. India has also demonstrated its contribution to the Post-2020 Framework through its hosting of and participation in the global CMS COP13 process, as well as its involvement in UN-related biodiversity initiatives.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Shamsbir Malik

China: +1

China fully complied with its commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 22 November 2019, the Ministry of Science and Technology released the 2019 Annual Report on Remote Sensing Monitoring of Global Ecological Environment. The remote sensing monitoring system aims to promote the construction of global ecological civilization and is a part of China’s efforts under

¹⁶⁰ CMS COP13 concludes in India with major new actions for migratory species, UN Environment (Geneva) 24 February 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/press-release/cms-cop13-concludes-india-major-new-actions-migratory-species>.

¹⁶¹ CMS COP13 concludes in India with major new actions for migratory species, UN Environment (Geneva) 24 February 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/press-release/cms-cop13-concludes-india-major-new-actions-migratory-species>.

¹⁶² CMS COP13 concludes in India with major new actions for migratory species, UN Environment (Geneva) 24 February 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <https://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/press-release/cms-cop13-concludes-india-major-new-actions-migratory-species>.

¹⁶³ India will share its best practices and experiences in conserving biodiversity with the rest of the world: Union Environment Minister, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (Delhi) 22 May 2020. Access Date 28 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1626054>

¹⁶⁴ India will share its best practices and experiences in conserving biodiversity with the rest of the world: Union Environment Minister, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (Delhi) 22 May 2020. Access Date 28 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1626054>

¹⁶⁵ India will share its best practices and experiences in conserving biodiversity with the rest of the world: Union Environment Minister, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (Delhi) 22 May 2020. Access Date 28 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1626054>

¹⁶⁶ India will share its best practices and experiences in conserving biodiversity with the rest of the world: Union Environment Minister, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (Delhi) 22 May 2020. Access Date 28 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1626054>

the framework of the inter-ministerial coordination mechanism of the GEO (Group on Earth Observations).¹⁶⁷

On 4 December 2019, the South China Botanical Garden of the Chinese Academy of Science, a state-owned institute for plant and ecological research, pledged to increase support for biodiversity protection in the Amazon rainforest. The South China Botanical Garden promised to hold training sessions every two years to share Chinese experiences with developing countries, including those in the Amazon region.¹⁶⁸

On 26 December 2019, the Ministry of Ecological Environment held a press conference outlining the overall requirements and major tasks of environmental governance in 2020. The Ministry's spokesperson Liu Youbin announced that the ministry signed a memorandum to deepen cooperation in the field of ecological protection and supervision with the Chinese Academy of Sciences. Both sides will jointly carry out the national biodiversity survey and promote the upcoming Convention on Biological Diversity in Kunming.¹⁶⁹

On 12-13 January 2020, the Ministry of Ecological Environment held a national conference in Beijing on the issue of China's ecological environment protection. The conference recognized the importance of ecosystem restoration. The conference committed that in 2020, China will make every effort to promote the success of the 15th Conference of the Parties (COP) to the Convention on Biological Diversity, which will be held in Kunming.¹⁷⁰

China has demonstrated its support for the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework through actions on monitoring and training for biodiversity protection. Furthermore, China demonstrated contribution to the Post-2020 Framework through participating in existing global efforts and events related to the COP-15 process.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Jiayi Guo

South Africa: 0

South Africa partially complied with its commitment to contribute to and support the development of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 10 December 2019, the government shut down Bloemfontein Zoo. The zoo was found to "have violated the National Environmental Biodiversity Act of 2004," and thus did not comply to South Africa's commitment to sustain and enhance natural flora and fauna within the country.¹⁷¹

South Africa demonstrated support through its domestic actions to enforce biodiversity legislation. However, South Africa did not demonstrate contribution to this commitment, as the government of South Africa did not take participatory actions in existing global efforts.

¹⁶⁷ The Ministry of Science and Technology issues 2019's Annual Report on Remote Sensing Monitoring of Global Ecological Environment, The State Council the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 27 November 2019. Access Date: 19 February 2020. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2019-11/27/content_5456081.htm.

¹⁶⁸ Chinese Institute Promises Support to Biodiversity Conservation in Amazon, The Xinhua Net (Guangzhou) 4 December 2019. Access Date: 19 February 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-12/04/c_138605628.htm.

¹⁶⁹ The Ministry of Ecological Environment Introduced the Deepening of the Reform of "Management Service" in the Field of Ecological Environment and the Progress of Promoting High-Quality Development, The State Council the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 27 December 2019. Access Date: 19 February 2020. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2019-12/27/content_5464464.htm.

¹⁷⁰ National Ecological Environment Protection Conference Held in Beijing, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 14 January 2020. Access Date: 19 February 2020. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2020-01/14/content_5468911.htm

¹⁷¹ Free State Environmental Affairs on the closure of Manguang Zoo, South African Government (South Africa) 18 December 2019. Access Date: 10 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/closure-mangaung-zoo-18-dec-2019-0000>.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Evangeline Procopondis

4. Crime and Corruption: Asset Recovery

“We will maintain our ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.”

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average Score	+0.40 (70%)		

Background

Corruption is a grave global challenge. From an economic standpoint, corruption undermines economic growth, development, and good governance. From a social perspective, corruption erodes governing institutions and public services. The United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) serves as “a global framework for international cooperation” to address this issue.¹⁷² In the present commitment, BRICS leaders collectively commit to continuing their endeavors in anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.¹⁷³

Anti-corruption first emerged on the horizon of BRICS governance at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit in Brazil, where BRICS leaders recognized the negative impact of corruption on poverty reduction, economic growth and financial stability. BRICS leaders declared their collective commitment to “combat[ing] domestic and foreign bribery, and strengthen[ing] international cooperation, including law enforcement cooperation” to address domestic and foreign bribery, “in accordance with multilaterally established principles and norms, especially the UN Convention against Corruption.”¹⁷⁴

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders noted that corruption challenges and undermines legal systems, negatively impacts sustainable development, and facilitates other types of crime.¹⁷⁵ To this end, BRICS reaffirmed its commitment to multilateral approaches in line with the principles of UNCAC and other international norms, such as mutual legal assistance.¹⁷⁶ Most importantly, the Ufa Summit marks the creation of the BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption Cooperation.¹⁷⁷ The Working Group was established to facilitate further intra-BRICS coordination and encourage stronger global commitment to preventing and combating corruption based on international legal instruments.

At the following summits in 2016 and 2017, BRICS leaders reaffirmed the importance of the Working Group for Anti-Corruption Cooperation and made specific reference to asset recovery.^{178,179} The 2016 Goa Declaration acknowledged that illicit financial and money flows and wrongfully-acquired wealth held

¹⁷² Corruption Perceptions Index 2016, Transparency International (Berlin) 25 January 2017. Access Date: 10 December 2019. https://www.transparency.org/news/feature/corruption_perceptions_index_2016.

¹⁷³ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁷⁴ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>.

¹⁷⁵ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2019. http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹⁷⁶ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2019. http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹⁷⁷ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2019. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

¹⁷⁸ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

¹⁷⁹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>.

in foreign jurisdictions pose a global challenge to economic growth and sustainable development. Subsequently, at the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders highlighted the significance of anti-corruption in the context of sustainable development.¹⁸⁰

Adopted on 26 July 2018, the Johannesburg Declaration stipulates a commitment by BRICS leaders to “cooperate in anti-corruption law enforcement, extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders and repatriation in matters relating to assets recovery and other related criminal and non-criminal matters involving corruption.”¹⁸¹ BRICS leaders acknowledged the long-term impacts of corruption, such as the weakening of legal systems and discouragement of foreign and local investments.¹⁸² At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders also committed to “experience-sharing and exchange” for the collective implementation of UNCAC and anti-corruption cooperation.

At the most recent 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders further pledged to enhance anti-corruption cooperation through exchanges in “multilateral frameworks such as UNCAC and the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group.”¹⁸³ This commitment also highlights the importance of “jointly denying safe havens to economic and corruption offenders and to facilitate the repatriation of proceeds of crime.”¹⁸⁴ Specifically, BRICS leaders emphasized the ensuing BRICS Meeting on Asset Recovery and its importance for “experience-sharing and case-cooperation on asset recovery.”¹⁸⁵

Commitment Features

In the BRICS Brasilia Declaration adopted on 14 November 2019, BRICS leaders committed to maintaining “ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.”¹⁸⁶

The word “will” qualifies this commitment as a “politically-binding criteria.”¹⁸⁷ “Maintain” is understood to mean to “continue to have, to keep in existence, or not allow to become less.”¹⁸⁸ This term establishes the threshold of action for compliance with this commitment.¹⁸⁹ Thus, this commitment reflects a continuation of existing efforts in two regards: 1) anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and 2) returning of assets, the latter of which necessarily includes civil and administrative proceedings for asset return.

In the first component of the commitment, “anti-corruption” is understood to mean any measures designed to “eradicate or prevent dishonest or fraudulent conduct, especially in a political context.”¹⁹⁰ Correspondingly, corruption offenses include criminal activities such as “bribery; embezzlement, misappropriation, diversion of property; trading in influence using an undue advantage of public

¹⁸⁰ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>.

¹⁸¹ Declaration of the 4th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting, South African Government (Johannesburg) 15 September 2018. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/declaration-4th-brics-communication-ministers-meeting-adopted-ministers-communications-15>.

¹⁸² BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>.

¹⁸³ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁸⁴ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁸⁵ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁸⁶ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>.

¹⁸⁷ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, G7 and G20 Research Groups (Toronto) 6 August 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2019.pdf.

¹⁸⁸ Maintain, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/maintain>.

¹⁸⁹ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, G7 and G20 Research Groups (Toronto) 6 August 2019. Access Date: 10 December 2019. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2019.pdf.

¹⁹⁰ Anti-Corruption, English Oxford Living Dictionaries (Oxford) n.d. Access Date: 2 March 2019. <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/anti-corruption>.

authority; abuse of functions; illicit enrichment; laundering of proceeds of crime; concealment; or obstruction of justice.”¹⁹¹

In light of this understanding, examples of anti-corruption cooperation include but are not limited to measures establishing channels of communication, facilitating the secure and rapid exchange of information, conducting joint inquiries of suspects, movement of proceeds of crime or property, signing bilateral agreements to ensure effective coordination, or any collaborative activities for investigatory, identification and administrative purposes.¹⁹² Therefore, to fulfill this component of the commitment, the BRICS member must cooperate with other BRICS member(s) to uphold existing channels of anti-corruption law enforcement.

In the second component of the commitment, the “returning of assets” is defined by the UNCAC as the recovery of proceeds of corruption to their countries of origin.¹⁹³ Thus, BRICS members must engage in efforts to repatriate the proceeds of corruption hidden or left in foreign jurisdictions. Such assets may include financial resources held in bank accounts, real estate, vehicles, arts and artifacts, precious metals and more.

Asset recovery is often contingent on cross-border cooperation, to which BRICS leaders have pledged engagement through civil and administrative proceedings. Alongside criminal proceedings, “civil and administrative proceedings” in asset recovery refer to two types of legal liability to punish “acts perpetrated against the public administration.”¹⁹⁴ Moreover, the UNCAC and Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development’s Anti-Bribery Convention have also discussed civil and administrative penalties to the private sector for non-compliance with corruption prevention measures.¹⁹⁵ To this end, BRICS members can cooperate by assisting each other in anti-corruption investigations, sharing relevant experience, and facilitating proceedings in civil and administrative matters. Critically, pursuant to the wording of the commitment, BRICS members must maintain efforts in civil and administrative cooperation as a necessary element of its compliance with the second component of this commitment in relation to asset recovery.

To demonstrate full compliance and merit a score of +1, the BRICS member must fulfill both aspects of this commitment by maintaining its efforts in 1) anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and 2) returning of assets, including civil and administrative proceedings. Partial compliance, or a score of 0, is reflected by the BRICS member’s actions in one or two of the aforementioned fields. Non-compliance, or a score of -1, will be scored if the BRICS member fails to maintain action in either regard.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does NOT maintain its ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation OR returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.
0	The BRICS member maintains its ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation OR returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.
+1	The BRICS member maintains its ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation AND returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.

¹⁹¹ United Nations Convention Against Corruption, United Nations Office on Drug and Crime (Vienna) 31 October 2003. Access Date: 10 December 2019. https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/Publications/Convention/08-50026_E.pdf.

¹⁹² United Nations Convention Against Corruption, United Nations Office on Drug and Crime (Vienna) 31 October 2003. Access Date: 10 December 2019. https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/Publications/Convention/08-50026_E.pdf.

¹⁹³ Asset Recovery, United Nations Office on Drug and Crime (Vienna) n.d. Access Date: 10 December 2019. <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/asset-recovery.html>.

¹⁹⁴ Use of civil and administrative proceedings against corruption, including international cooperation, UNCAC (Vienna) 1 September 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2019.

<https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/WorkingGroups/workinggroup2/2015-September-3-4/V1506218e.pdf>.

¹⁹⁵ Use of civil and administrative proceedings against corruption, including international cooperation, UNCAC (Vienna) 1 September 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2019.

<https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/WorkingGroups/workinggroup2/2015-September-3-4/V1506218e.pdf>.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with its commitment to maintain its ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and the returning of assets, including civil and administrative proceedings.

On 18 December 2019, Brazilian federal police announced the 70th stage of Operation Car Wash with raids on the Brazilian offices of the Danish shipping company A.P. Moller-Maersk, and two local shipbrokers, Ferchem and Tide Maritime. Operation Car Wash is an investigation into the corruption of Brazil's national oil company, Petrobras. The 70th phase of the investigation implicated hundreds of Brazilian officials and executives.¹⁹⁶

On 18 December 2019, Brazilian authorities raided the homes and addresses linked to Fabrício Queiroz and his associates. Queiroz was the friend of Brazil's President Jair Bolsonaro's and the raid was part of an embezzlement and money-laundering inquiry linked to Bolsonaro's son, Flávio Bolsonaro who was suspected of overseeing a corruption racket.¹⁹⁷

On 25 December 2019, President Bolsonaro signed an anti-crime package into law. This package "toughens laws to tackle corruption, organized crime, and violent crime practised by criminal gangs."¹⁹⁸

On 16 January 2020, President Bolsonaro met with Angolan Foreign Affairs Minister Manuel Augusto to encourage the fight against corruption in Angola. Bolsonaro stated Brazil will collaborate and give all necessary support to Angola's fight against corruption and impunity in the south-west African country.¹⁹⁹

On 25 January 2020, India and Brazil signed an Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement during President Bolsonaro's visit to New Delhi.²⁰⁰ Article 10.1 of the agreement commits both countries to "adopt measures and make efforts to prevent and fight corruption, money laundering and terrorism financing ... in accordance with its laws and regulations."²⁰¹

Brazil maintained its ongoing domestic efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement and has also taken actions on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation with other BRICS member. However, it did not take actions on the returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Sheeriza Azeez

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with its commitment to maintain its ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and the returning of assets, including civil and administrative proceedings.

¹⁹⁶ Brazil probe into Petrobras widened to Maersk shipping contracts, CNBC (New Jersey) 18 December 2019. Access Date: 6 February 2020. <https://www.cnbc.com/2019/12/18/reuters-america-update-2-brazil-probe-into-petrobras-widened-to-maersk-shipping-contracts.html>.

¹⁹⁷ Brazil: homes of Bolsonaro associates raided in sweeping anti-corruption operation, The Guardian (London) 18 December 2019. Access Date: 6 February 2020. <https://amp.theguardian.com/world/2019/dec/18/bolsonaro-brazil-corruption-raids-investigation-flavio-bolsonaro>.

¹⁹⁸ Bolsonaro signs anti-crime bill aimed at corruption and violence, Aljazeera (Doha) 25 December 2019. Access Date: 5 February 2020. <https://www.aljazeera.com/amp/ajimpact/bolsonaro-signs-anti-crime-bill-aimed-corruption-murder-191225171704780.html>.

¹⁹⁹ Brazilian President encourages fight against corruption in Angola, Agência Angola Press (Luanda) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 13 March 2020. http://www.angop.ao/angola/en_us/noticias/politica/2020/0/4/Brazilian-President-encourages-fight-against-corruption-Angola,7c1cfeaa-3896-42b8-9f37-463cf8b6cb5b.html.

²⁰⁰ Brazil and India sign Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement, Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 25 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/en/press-releases/21268-brazil-and-india-sign-investment-cooperation-and-facilitation-agreement>.

²⁰¹ Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement between the Federative Republic of Brazil and the Republic of India, Indian Department of Economic Affairs (New Delhi) 25 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. https://www.dea.gov.in/sites/default/files/Investment%20Cooperation%20and%20Facilitation%20Treaty%20with%20Brazil%20-%20English_0.pdf.

On 25 November 2019, the Federation Council approved the Amending Article 28.7 of the Code of Administrative Offenses of the Russian Federation.²⁰² The legislative change allows an extension of up to 12 months to an investigation term in cases of bribery where international judicial assistance is required. The goal of the legislative change is to facilitate the persecution of foreign companies for illegal remunerations.²⁰³

On 3 December 2019, the representatives of the member countries of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) agreed on the Agreement on Anti-Corruption Cooperation. The Executive Committee of the CIS held a meeting in Minsk, Belarus, where the parties decided to place the draft before the scheduled meeting of the Heads of member states.²⁰⁴

From 16 to 20 December 2019, the Russian delegation took part in the 8th Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption in Abu Dhabi, UAE, along with the counterparts from Brazil, India, China and South Africa. The parties discussed the issues related assets recovery, prevention, international cooperation on the issue and technical assistance.²⁰⁵

On 25 December 2019, the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation held a working session on cooperation with the civil society. V. Fedorov, the Deputy Minister of Justice, chaired the meeting. The participants discussed the results of comparative analysis on effectiveness of regional anti-corruption programs.²⁰⁶

Russia took domestic actions on anti-corruption law enforcement. Russia also took actions on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings. However, these actions are not directed on deepening ties with other BRICS members.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Zarlasht Jamal

India: +1

India fully complied with its commitment to cooperate in international anti-corruption efforts by taking measures on anti-corruption law enforcement; extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders; and repatriation in matters relating to assets recovery and other related criminal and non-criminal matters involving corruption.

On 13 January 2020, India's Supreme Court directed the Enforcement Directorate to seize local assets of the JPMorgan Bank in India, in relation to the bank's involvement in transactions violating the Indian laws of Foreign exchange and direct investment.²⁰⁷

On 19 January 2020, the Indian Tax Department detected INR10 billion worth undisclosed foreign assets in a campaign against the Bharat Hotels group.²⁰⁸ The Department announced in a statement that it is

²⁰² The possibility of extending the investigation of cases of illegal remuneration on behalf of a legal entity, Administration of the President of Russia (Moscow) 2 December 2019. Access Date: 8 February 2020. <http://kremlin.ru/acts/news/62183>.

²⁰³ Compliance in Russia: Takeaways from 2019, Noerr (Munich) 12 December 2019. Access Date: 8 February 2020. <https://www.noerr.com/en/newsroom/news/compliance-in-russia-takeaways-from-2019>.

²⁰⁴ CIS Experts Reached an Agreement on Anti-Corruption Cooperation, CIS Executive Committee (Minsk) 03 December 2019. Access Date: 19 June 2020. <http://cis.minsk.by/news/12636/eksperty-sng-soglasovali-proekt-soglasenia-o-sotrudnicestve-v-protivodejstvii-korrupcii>

²⁰⁵ Eighth session of the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Access Date: 19 June 2020. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/COSP/session8.html>

²⁰⁶ The Anti-Corruption Working Group under the President of the Russian Federation Held a Meeting on Cooperation with the Civil Society, Ministry of Justice of Russia (Moscow) 25 December 2019. Access Date: 19 June 2020. <http://minjust.gov.ru/novosti/sostoyalos-zasedanie-rabochej-gruppy-prezidiuma-soveta-pri-prezidente-rossiyskoy-federacii-3>

²⁰⁷ India's Supreme Court asks crime fighting agency to seize local assets of JPMorgan: report, Reuters (Mumbai) 13 January 2020. Access Date: 20 May 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-india-court-jpmorgan/indias-supreme-court-asks-crime-fighting-agency-to-seize-local-assets-of-jpmorgan-report-idUSKBN1ZC1RQ>.

²⁰⁸ I-T raids on Lalit hotels group uncover foreign assets worth Rs 1000 crore, India Today (New Delhi) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/i-t-raids-on-lalit-hotels-group-uncover-foreign-assets-worth-rs-1000-crore-1639909-2020-01-24>.

monitoring businesses with undisclosed foreign assets, as part of the Indian government's campaign to combat undisclosed foreign assets and black money.²⁰⁹

On 17 January 2020, the Enforcement Directorate released a statement on the recovery of incriminating documents concerning illegal accusation of property by Indian nationals in Dubai during a research operation conducted by the governmental agency.²¹⁰

On 25 January 2020, India and Brazil signed an Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement, during the visit of the Brazilian President Jair Bolsonaro to New Delhi.²¹¹ Article 10.1 of the agreement commits both countries to “adopt measures and make efforts to prevent and fight corruption, money laundering and terrorism financing ... in accordance with its laws and regulations.”²¹²

On 2 February 2020, the Enforcement Directorate launched their campaign to combat black money deposited overseas through identifying, tracking and monitoring immovable assets illegally purchased by Indian citizens.²¹³

On 11 February 2020, the Indian State Minister of Finance, Anurag Thakur announced that as of 31 December 2019, the Income Tax Department has issued notices in 422 cases for foreign undisclosed assets with a total worth of INR126 billion.²¹⁴ Thakur expressed that the issued notices are part of the government's efforts to recover undisclosed black money from abroad.²¹⁵

On 18 February 2020, the Indian Anti-Corruption Bureau conducted surprise inspection visits to the town planning offices in 13 municipal agencies within the state of Andhra Pradesh.²¹⁶ The campaign resulted in the seizure of INR241,000 unaccounted cash and the detection of irregularities such as the releasing of bills without permission, the illegal engagement of private individuals in conducting official work, and an extensive delay in the process of issuing occupancy certificates and official legal documents to citizens.²¹⁷

On 8 March 2020, the Indian Central Bureau of Investigation in cooperation with the Enforcement Directorate, Indian Ministry of Finance and the Reserve Bank of India registered a money-laundering and financial corruption case against the Yes Bank co-founder Rana Kapoor, DoIT Urban Ventures and the

²⁰⁹ I-T raids on Lalit hotels group uncover foreign assets worth Rs 1000 crore, India Today (New Delhi) 24 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/i-t-raids-on-lalit-hotels-group-uncover-foreign-assets-worth-rs-1000-crore-1639909-2020-01-24>.

²¹⁰ ED launches crackdown on black money stashed overseas, properties under scanner too, India Today (Mumbai) 2 February 2020. Access Date: 4 February 2020. <https://www.google.com/amp/s/www.indiatoday.in/amp/india/story/ed-launches-crackdown-on-black-money-stashed-overseas-properties-under-scanner-too-1642624-2020-02-02>.

²¹¹ Brazil and India sign Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement, Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 25 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/en/press-releases/21268-brazil-and-india-sign-investment-cooperation-and-facilitation-agreement>.

²¹² Investment Cooperation and Facilitation Agreement between the Federative Republic of Brazil and the Republic of India, Indian Department of Economic Affairs (New Delhi) 25 January 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. https://www.dea.gov.in/sites/default/files/Investment%20Cooperation%20and%20Facilitation%20Treaty%20with%20Brazil%20-%20English_0.pdf.

²¹³ ED launches crackdown on black money stashed overseas, properties under scanner too, India Today (Mumbai) 2 February 2020. Access Date: 4 February 2020. <https://www.google.com/amp/s/www.indiatoday.in/amp/india/story/ed-launches-crackdown-on-black-money-stashed-overseas-properties-under-scanner-too-1642624-2020-02-02>.

²¹⁴ Income Tax dept issues notices in 422 cases for undisclosed foreign assets, The Economic Times (New Delhi) 11 February 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/income-tax-dept-issues-notices-in-422-cases-for-undisclosed-foreign-assets/articleshow/74087126.cms?from=mdr>.

²¹⁵ Income Tax dept issues notices in 422 cases for undisclosed foreign assets, The Economic Times (New Delhi) 11 February 2020. Access Date: 8 May 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/income-tax-dept-issues-notices-in-422-cases-for-undisclosed-foreign-assets/articleshow/74087126.cms?from=mdr>.

²¹⁶ Anti-Corruption Bureau raids town planning offices, The New Indian Express (Vijayawada) 19 February 2020. Access Date: 13 February 2020. <https://www.newindianexpress.com/cities/vijayawada/2020/feb/19/acb-raids-town-planning-offices-2105511.html>.

²¹⁷ Anti-Corruption Bureau raids town planning offices, The New Indian Express (Vijayawada) 19 February 2020. Access Date: 13 February 2020. <https://www.newindianexpress.com/cities/vijayawada/2020/feb/19/acb-raids-town-planning-offices-2105511.html>.

Dewan Housing Finance Corporation Limited (DHFL).²¹⁸ The Enforcement Directorate placed Kaapor under arrest, while the Central Bureau of Investigation took hold of the DHFL.²¹⁹ The Reserve Bank of India implemented an embargo on the capital of the Yes bank, limiting withdrawals to INR50,000 per account and dissolved the bank's board of private sector lenders.²²⁰

India took domestic actions at anti-corruption law enforcement and has also taken action to maintain its ongoing efforts along with other BRICS members on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation. India also took actions on the returning of assets.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Omar Abdellatif

China: +1

China fully complied with its commitment to maintaining ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.

On 25 November 2019, the National Cultural Heritage Administration reported that Turkey returned two illegally taken cultural relics to China. This was the first successful repatriation case of cultural relics between China and Turkey since the bilateral government agreement fighting the illegal exports and imports of cultural relics. The artifacts were discovered by the Turkish government in December 2018.²²¹

On 4 December 2019, Head of the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection Zhao Leji met with a delegation from the Russian Communist Party led by its leader Gennedy Zyuganov. Leji expressed that the Chinese Communist Party hopes to increase exchanges with the Russian Communist Party in anti-corruption and is willing to work with Russia to enhance cooperation and mutual trust.²²²

On 16 December 2019, Vice Foreign Minister Luo Zhaohui led the Chinese delegation at the 8th session of the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption in Abu Dhabi. Zhaohui commented that all countries should support the role of the Convention in international anti-corruption governance, emphasizing zero tolerance against corruption. Zhaohui also met with Executive Director of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Yury Fedotov to discuss international anti-corruption cooperation.²²³

On 17 January 2020, China and Romania signed a bilateral agreement in Bucharest to prevent the theft, illegal excavation and illicit imports and exports of cultural property. The agreement aims to prevent the illegal flow of cultural artefacts and is hoped to positively influence the international community's efforts in protecting human cultural heritage.²²⁴

On 12 February 2020, Chinese envoy to the United Nations Wang Qun asked for the international community to cooperate respond to the threat of terrorism at the Joint Regional High-level Conference

²¹⁸ Yes Bank: CBI books Rana Kapoor in cheating, criminal conspiracy, corruption case, India Today (New Delhi) 8 March 2020. Access Date: 10 March 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/yes-bank-cbi-books-rana-kapoor-cheating-criminal-conspiracy-corruption-case-1653732-2020-03-08>.

²¹⁹ Yes Bank: CBI books Rana Kapoor in cheating, criminal conspiracy, corruption case, India Today (New Delhi) 8 March 2020. Access Date: 10 March 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/yes-bank-cbi-books-rana-kapoor-cheating-criminal-conspiracy-corruption-case-1653732-2020-03-08>.

²²⁰ Yes Bank: CBI books Rana Kapoor in cheating, criminal conspiracy, corruption case, India Today (New Delhi) 8 March 2020. Access Date: 10 March 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/yes-bank-cbi-books-rana-kapoor-cheating-criminal-conspiracy-corruption-case-1653732-2020-03-08>.

²²¹ Turkey returns two cultural artifacts to China, China Daily (Beijing) 26 November 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/201911/26/WS5ddcbcd5a310cf3e3557a151_1.html.

²²² Senior CPC official meets Russian Communist delegation, Xinhua (Beijing) 4 December 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-12/04/c_138605903.htm.

²²³ Vice Foreign Minister Luo Zhaohui Leads a Delegation to the Eighth Session of the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention Against Corruption, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Beijing) 17 December 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/t1725959.shtml.

²²⁴ China, Romania sign agreement on cultural property protection, Xinhua (Bucharest) 18 January 2020. Access Date: 8 February 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-01/18/c_138714078.htm.

on “Foreign Terrorist Fighters — Addressing Current Challenges” in Vienna. Qun suggested strengthening cooperation in border control and law enforcement, combat terrorist activities via the internet and repatriate terrorists to their countries of origin through universal standards, maintaining high pressure and taking severe measures.²²⁵

China took actions on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation with other BRICS members. China also took actions on the returning of assets.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Ingrid Wong

South Africa: 0

South Africa partially complied with its commitment to maintain ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation or returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings.

On 21 November 2019, representative from the ruling African National Congress Bongani Bongo appeared in court on corruption and bribery charges in attempts to disrupt a parliamentary inquiry into corruption at the state power utility Eskom.²²⁶

On 27 November 2019, the parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services recommended that Nomgcobo Jiba and Lawrence Mrwebi not be rehired in their previous roles by the National Assembly. Jiba and Mrwebi were former National Prosecuting Authority (NPA) high officers who were determined “to have engaged in activities that undermined the rule of law, that grossly impeded the functioning of the NPA and that were responsible for destroying public trust in an institution intended to be a pillar of the criminal justice system.”²²⁷

On 9 December 2019, South African Minister for Public Service and Administration announced that South Africa is committed to fighting corruption. He noted the need to support coordination between government, business and civil society in the fight against corruption.²²⁸

On 18 December 2019, a South African delegation attended the Eighth Session of the Conference of the State Parties to the UNCAC in Abu Dhabi. The Minister of Justice and Correctional Services, Mr. Lamola, stressed South Africa’s commitment to fight corruption and strengthen international cooperation and coordination.²²⁹

On 16 January 2020, the North West government confirmed they had fired its head of health Thabo Lekalakala after a disciplinary hearing found Lekalakala guilty of fraud, corruption and contravention of the Public Finance Management Act. Lekalakala was “accused of entering into fraudulent contracts with Gupta-linked company Mediosa.”²³⁰

²²⁵ Chinese envoy calls for sense of community to fight terrorism, Xinhua (Vienna) 12 February 2020. Access Date: 8 March 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-02/12/c_138777637.htm.

²²⁶ Former Zuma minister appears in court on charges of corruption, TimesLIVE (Johannesburg) 21 November 2019. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/nov/21/former-zuma-minister-appears-in-court-on-charges-of-corruption>.

²²⁷ Jiba and Mrwebi Will Not Be Returning to NLA, Corruption Watch (Johannesburg) 29 November 2019. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.corruptionwatch.org.za/jiba-and-mrwebi-will-not-be-returning-to-mpa/>.

²²⁸ Minister Senzo Mchunu: Commemoration of International Anti-Corruption Day, South Africa Government (Pretoria) 9 December 2019. Access Date: 27 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/keynote-address-9-dec-2019-0000>.

²²⁹ Excerpts of the submissions made by Minister RO Lamola, MP, at the Eighth Session of the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption, Department of Justice and Constitutional Development, (Pretoria) 18 December 2019, Access Date: 21 May 2020. https://www.justice.gov.za/m_statements/2019/20191219-UNCAC.html.

²³⁰ North West health department head fired over Gupta-linked payments, TimesLIVE (Johannesburg) 16 January 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2020-01-16-north-west-health-department-head-fired-over-gupta-linked-payments/>.

On 29 January 2020, immigration official Sam Langa of the Department of Home Affairs was arrested on charges of corruption and extortion.²³¹

On 3 February 2020, Kapi Petersen, a Gauteng businessman, was arrested at OR Tambo International Airport for “fraud, theft, forgery, and uttering involving an alleged tender investment scam” worth approximately ZAR186 million.²³²

On 4 February 2020, an arrest warrant was issued by a South African judge, requested by the NPA, for former president Jacob Zuma for failing to appear in court for the corruption case against him. The warrant would not come into effect until the case resumed on 6 May. Zuma avoided court once again by claiming illness and went to Cuba for treatment. The Justice Department of South Africa said the two countries have negotiated but not signed an extradition agreement.²³³

On 5 February 2020, former South African Airways board chair Dudu Myeni and former chief executive Musa Zwane were incriminated in a ZAR1.3 billion contract for aircraft parts during testimony at the Zondo commission on the matter. Myeni stands accused of delaying, and obstructing key initiatives to turn around operational fortunes at the national airline, breaking the law and flouting basic governance principles in the process.²³⁴

In the February 2020 National Budget, the Treasury availed an additional ZAR2.4 billion to the National Prosecuting Authority and the Special Investigating Unit, as the government intensifies the fight against crime and corruption. Funds would facilitate hiring of 800 investigators and 277 prosecutors to clear the backlog of cases.²³⁵

On 13 February 2020, in the State of Nation Address, President Cyril Ramaphosa promised to fight corruption and strengthen the rule of law. He condemned those who solicit, pay bribes or engage in corrupt acts, and encouraged a culture of reporting or shunning crime altogether.²³⁶

On 10 March 2020, the Trade and Industry portfolio committee-initiated investigations into allegations of fraud, nepotism and corruption in the National Lotteries Commission, relating to its proactive funding. The committee will investigate, report its findings, and recommend measures to be taken.²³⁷

On 28 May 2020, the government announced at the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security cluster briefing that it is adopting zero tolerance on COVID-19 related corruption and vowed to bring any lawbreakers to book. The cluster, having received several corruption related tip-offs, undertook to prosecute all charged.²³⁸

South Africa took domestic actions at anti-corruption law enforcement and took actions on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation. However, South Africa did not take actions on the returning of assets.

²³¹ Arrest made but more work needed at DHA, Corruption News (Johannesburg) 29 January 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.corruptionwatch.org.za/arrests-made-but-more-work-needed-at-dha/>.

²³² Gauteng businessman arrested for alleged R186m investment scam, TimesLIVE (Johannesburg) 7 February 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2020-02-07-gauteng-businessman-arrested-for-alleged-r186m-investment-scam/>.

²³³ South African Court Issues Warrant for Jacob Zuma’s Arrest, The New York Times (Johannesburg) 4 February 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/02/04/world/africa/south-africa-jacob-zuma-warrant.html>.

²³⁴ Dudu Myeni and ex-SAA boss Musa Zane implicated in R.3bn tender, TimesLIVE (Johannesburg) 5 February 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.timeslive.co.za/politics/2020-02-05-dudu-myeni-and-ex-saa-boss-musa-zwane-implicated-in-r13bn-tender/>.

²³⁵ Funds to fix crime and corruption, South African Government News Agency (Pretoria) 26 February 2020. Access Date: 21 May 2020. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/funds-fix-crime-and-corruption>.

²³⁶ Corruption, eNCA (Pretoria) 14 February 2020. Access Date: 26 May 2020. <https://www.enca.com/news/key-quotes-ramaphosas-2020-sona>.

²³⁷ Parliament welcomes investigation into allegations of fraud and corruption within National Lotteries Commission, South African Government (Pretoria) 11 March 2020. Access Date: 27 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/trade-and-industry-11-mar-2020-0000>.

²³⁸ COVID-19 relief looters to face the music, government vows, SA Government News Agency (Pretoria) 28 May 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/covid-19-relief-looters-face-music-government-vows>.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Lucia Dhafana-Mabika

5. Digital Economy: Partnerships

“[We will continue to]... expand and intensify partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).”

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average Score	+0 (50%)		

Background

E-commerce and digital communication were first addressed by BRICS leaders at the 2015 Ufa Summit. Through the Ufa Declaration, BRICS leaders recognized the importance of a “secure and open digital and Internet space” and committed to “expanding universal access to all forms of digital communication.”²³⁹ With regards to e-commerce, BRICS leaders welcomed the Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation as a platform to “promote current and future initiatives with an aim to build a closer economic partnership in this sphere,” with an emphasis on finding ways to strengthen intra-BRICS e-commerce cooperation.²⁴⁰ This sentiment was echoed at the 2016 Goa Summit.²⁴¹

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders discussed the digital economy for the first time and pledged to develop a thriving digital economy “that will foster global economic development and benefit everyone.”²⁴²

In November 2017, the Working Group for Research on the Competition Issues in the Digital Markets was created by the “Memorandum of Understanding on cooperation in the field of competition law and policy of the BRICS countries.”²⁴³ The Working Group’s objectives are to conduct research and share information and experience with regards to the digital economy.²⁴⁴

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders established the BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution (PartNIR). PartNIR aims to deepen “BRICS cooperation in digitalisation, industrialisation, innovation, inclusiveness and investment, to maximise the opportunities and address the challenges arising from the 4th Industrial Revolution.”²⁴⁵ BRICS leaders also created the Digital Economy Working Group within the framework of BRICS Business Council, and further signed the Memorandum of

²³⁹ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 January 2020. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

²⁴⁰ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 10 January 2020. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html.

²⁴¹ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

²⁴² BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>.

²⁴³ Memorandum of Understanding on cooperation in the field of competition law and policy of the BRICS countries, VI BRICS ICC (Moscow) 19 May 2016. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <https://brics-icc-2019.org/en/legal-and-regulatory-framework>

²⁴⁴ The Working Group for Research on the Competition Issues in the Digital Markets, VI BRICS ICC 2019 (Brasilia). Access Date: 10 January 2020. <https://brics-icc-2019.org/en/digital-markets>.

²⁴⁵ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

Understanding on Collaborative Research on Distributed Ledger and Blockchain Technology in the Context of the Development of the Digital Economy.²⁴⁶

On 14 August 2019, under the Brazilian presidency, the BRICS communications ministers met in Brasilia to discuss enhancing cooperation on the digital economy. At this meeting, the ministers recognized the role of digital technologies in the development of the digital economy. The digital economy provides the tools to modernize and improve the efficiency of public administration, raise competitiveness and productivity in the private sector, and leverage empowerment and digital inclusion for socio-economic development.²⁴⁷ In addition, BRICS communications ministers reiterated their commitment to the goals of the G20 Ministerial Statement on Trade and Digital Economy, which focuses on the “Sustainable Development Goals; micro, small and medium-sized enterprises; global connectivity and human-centered future society.”²⁴⁸

On 14 November 2019, BRICS leaders reaffirmed that they would continue to strengthen joint activities mentioned at the communications ministers’ meeting and create new opportunities for cooperation. In this context, the BRICS leaders made the commitment at hand to expand and intensify existing partnerships, specifically taking steps to set up the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).²⁴⁹

Commitment Features

The present commitment comprises of two elements. First, the BRICS leaders committed to expanding and intensifying existing partnerships. Second, the BRICS leaders committed to taking necessary steps for setting up the DBTF.

Part 1: Expand and intensify partnerships already in progress

“Expand” is understood to mean actions that “increase the extent, number, volume, or cope of” something.²⁵⁰ “Intensify” refers to actions “to increase the density,” “strengthen,” or “make more intense or more intensive.”²⁵¹

“Partnerships already in progress” refer to existing cooperation with other actors, such as other countries, government branches, or domestic actors, that revolves around the digital economy. These partnerships and avenues of cooperation have been laid out in the Declaration of the Fifth Meeting of the BRICS communications ministers. Such initiatives include cooperation in the following areas:

- “Digital connectivity: increasing connectivity and broadband access to digital technologies, as key enablers of the digital economy, inclusive growth and sustainable development;
- “Digital innovation: promoting the development and application of new and emerging technologies and services through the implementation of scientific and technological projects, and creating an enabling environment for innovation;
- “Security in the digital economy: enhancing robust security frameworks in digital economy to ensure that the benefits arising from it are widely shared;

²⁴⁶ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 10 January 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

²⁴⁷ Declaration of the 5th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting – Brasilia, Brazil, 14 August 2019, Itamaraty (Brasilia) 14 August 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019.

http://brics2019.itamaraty.gov.br/images/documentos/Declaration_of_the_5th.pdf

²⁴⁸ Declaration of the 5th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting – Brasilia, Brazil, 14 August 2019, Itamaraty (Brasilia) 14 August 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019.

http://brics2019.itamaraty.gov.br/images/documentos/Declaration_of_the_5th.pdf

²⁴⁹ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

²⁵⁰ Expand, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/expand>

²⁵¹ Intensify, Merriam-Webster (Springfield) Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/intensify>

- “Human capacity development: leveraging digital technologies in education, promoting digital literacy in society, and preparing for employment opportunities of the future and emerging technologies by providing new skills;
- “Digital transformation: digital transformation should be underpinned by promoting integration of innovative technologies throughout all sectors of economy, including the traditional industry. Furthermore, create an opportunity for innovation across all industries, digitalization and building intelligence into processes that enables manufacturers to become more efficient and data-driven;
- “Digital inclusion: digital technologies should be deployed to ensure the inclusion of uncovered areas and digitally deprived segments of society such as youth, women and persons with disabilities;
- “Digital governance: share experiences and best practices in digital governance such as unique digital identification systems, systems for big data management and smart cities and communities and pursue common projects among countries.”²⁵²

In this context, with reference to existing partnerships, actions that expand and intensify can be considered as synonyms and are mutually reinforcing. Therefore, any action that expands and intensifies existing partnerships in the aforementioned areas will collectively count towards compliance with the first part of this commitment.

Part 2: Taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force

“Necessary steps” refer to steps that are “absolutely needed” for the establishment of the DBTF. Details about this task force are provided by the Fourth Meeting of BRICS communications ministers. At the meeting, the ministers resolved to set up the DBTF under the Working Group of ICT Cooperation. Specifically, the ministers strived for full participation in the work of the Partnership on New Industrial Revolution and alignment of the ICT sector work-stream program. The DBTF “will focus on promoting the deployment of ICT infrastructure, enhancing digital transformation, and facilitating adoption of innovation technologies so as to improve BRICS Members readiness for the Fourth Industrial Revolution.”²⁵³

Given the structure, mission and purpose of the DBTF, the necessary steps for setting up this task force will include actions that further its listed purposes. They include:

- Promoting the deployment of ICT infrastructure
- Enhancing digital transformation
- Facilitating adoption of innovation technologies.

It is important to note that actions supporting any of the aforementioned purposes must be taken with the specific goal of the DBTF’s institutional development. As such, general actions in intra-BRICS cooperation on information and communications technologies, digital transformation and innovative technology development will not count towards compliance with this commitment, unless such actions specifically mention the goal of setting up the DBTF.

Thus, full compliance with this commitment requires a BRICS member to both 1) expand and intensify relevant partnerships already in progress and 2) take necessary steps towards setting up the DBTF. If the BRICS member complies with one of the two components of this commitment, it will receive a score of 0 for partial compliance. If the BRICS member fails to expand and intensify existing partnerships relating to the digital economy, which by necessary implication reflects a failure to take necessary steps towards the DBTF, the BRICS member will receive a score of -1 for non-compliance.

²⁵² Declaration of the 5th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 14 August 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2019. http://brics2019.itaraty.gov.br/images/documentos/Declaration_of_the_5th.pdf

²⁵³ Declaration of the 4th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting, South African Government (Johannesburg) 15 September 2018. Access Date: 13 December 2019. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/declaration-4th-brics-communication-ministers-meeting-adopted-ministers-communications-15>.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not take any actions to expand or intensify partnerships in the digital economy.
0	The BRICS member expanded and intensified existing partnerships in the digital economy BUT did not specifically take necessary steps to set up the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF). OR The BRICS member ONLY took necessary steps to set up the DBTF but did not take actions to expand and intensify existing partnerships in the digital economy.
+1	The BRICS member expanded and intensified existing partnerships in the digital economy AND specifically took necessary steps to set up the DBTF.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with its commitment to expand and intensify digital economy partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).

On 5 February 2020, President Jair Bolsonaro enacted Federal Decree No. 10.222 approving the National Cybersecurity Strategy, to provide guidelines for Brazilian society. It is aimed at strengthening the country's performance and increasing its resilience.²⁵⁴

On 19 February 2020, the Central Bank of Brazil announced the Brazilian Instant Payment Scheme, which all financial institutions licensed by the bank will be required to participate in.²⁵⁵ The goal is to increase flexibility, convenience and competition. It will create a database of user information through a proxy identifier database.²⁵⁶

On 2 March 2020, Brazil completed its public consultation for artificial intelligence (AI) strategy that allowed firms to contribute to various aspects of AI innovation strategy for future policy. The goal is to collect information on how to enhance the use and development of technology.²⁵⁷

On 6 March 2020, Minister of Education Abraham Weintraub suggested using blockchain to stop the falsification of diplomas, the solution would allow universities to provide digital certificates and help streamline existing processes.²⁵⁸

On 14 April 2020, the Ministry of Economy revealed in a publication that an emergency benefit would be provided in the wake of the economic effects of COVID-19.²⁵⁹ Brazilians are able to receive this benefit

²⁵⁴ Decreto Nº 10.222, de 5 de Fevereiro de 2020, Governo de Brasil (Brasília) 5 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <http://www.in.gov.br/web/dou/-/decreto-n-10.222-de-5-de-fevereiro-de-2020-241828419>.

²⁵⁵ Agenda BC#: BCB takes steps to make instant payments available to population and launches its brand PIX, Banco Central do Brazil (Brasília) 19 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.bcb.gov.br/en/pressdetail/2313/nota>.

²⁵⁶ Agenda BC#: BCB takes steps to make instant payments available to population and launches its brand PIX, Banco Central do Brazil (Brasília) 19 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.bcb.gov.br/en/pressdetail/2313/nota>.

²⁵⁷ Estratégia Brasileira de Inteligência Artificial, Secretaria de Telecomunicações (Brasília) 2 March 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <http://www.participa.br/profile/estrategia-brasileira-de-inteligencia-artificial>.

²⁵⁸ Ministerio de Educación de Brasil propone emitir diplomas universitarios con blockchain, CriptoNoticias (Caracas) 6 March 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.cryptonoticias.com/gobierno/ministerio-educacion-brasil-diplomas-universitarios-blockchain/>.

²⁵⁹ Government launches Emergency Program to Maintain Employment to Address Economic Effects of Covid-19, Ministério da Economia (Brasília) 14 April 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/publicacoes/publicacoes-em-outros-idiomas/covid-19/government-launches-emergency-program-to-maintain-employment-to-address-economic-effects-of-covid-19>.

through their mobile devices with Caixa Econômica Federal, a government-owned bank.²⁶⁰ This action will create financial inclusion using technology.²⁶¹

On 30 April 2020, the Digital Governance Committee released the Information Technology Master Plan for 2020 to 2022.²⁶² The plan aims to begin mass digital identification, consolidating over 1,500 government websites, and wider cloud adoption. It also will support at least six research projects for new technologies.²⁶³

On 30 April 2020, the Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies attended the virtual Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, discussing the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 pandemic. The ministers discussed communication infrastructure and network connectivity, exchange of data, research and development of digital technologies for health, and the use of digital technologies and solutions.²⁶⁴

Brazil expanded existing digital economy partnerships but did not take actions to set up the DBTF .

Thus, Brazil is given a score of 0.

Analyst: Joy Fan

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with its commitment to expand and intensify digital economy partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).

On 5 December 2019, Chair of the State Duma Committee on Education and Science Viacheslav Nikonov emphasized the significance of the impact of the internet on “public life and public consciousness.” Nikonov announced that the committee would establish broadband internet networks “at every educational institution so that all children have computer literacy,” with the technology of computer and digital network educating enough professional students.²⁶⁵

On 24 December 2019, the Government of Russia and the Ministry of Communication announced that it has successfully completed a security test of country-wide internet digital network without connecting with the global Internet. The details of the test remained unclear, but it was announced that the result was being presented to President Vladimir Putin.²⁶⁶

²⁶⁰ Benefício Emergencial de Preservação do Emprego e da Renda – BEm, Caixa (Brasília) 14 April 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <http://www.caixa.gov.br/beneficios-trabalhador/beneficio-emergencial/paginas/default.aspx>.

²⁶¹ The Brazil Tech and Innovation Roundup: Largest-Ever Financial Inclusion Scheme Begins, Sao Paulo Launches Surveillance To Slow Coronavirus Spread, IFood Joins Forces With DeliveryHero, Forbes Media LLC (Jersey City) 10 April 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/angelicamarideoliveira/2020/04/10/the-brazil-tech-and-innovation-roundup-largest-ever-financial-inclusion-scheme-begins-so-paulo-launches-surveillance-to-slow-coronavirus-spread-ifood-joins-forces-with-deliveryhero/#3c04200073bd>.

²⁶² Plano Diretor de Tecnologia da Informação - PDTI/ME 2020 – 2022, Ministério da Economia (Brasília) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/publicacoes/arquivos/pdti-me-v1-2.pdf/view>.

²⁶³ The Brazil Tech and innovation Round-Up: Tech Sector Develops Immunity Passport, Government Digital Strategy Launched, Data Protection Regulations Postponed, Forbes Media LLC (Jersey City) 1 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/angelicamarideoliveira/2020/05/01/the-brazil-tech-and-innovation-round-up-tech-sector-develops-immunity-passport-government-digital-strategy-launched-data-protection-regulations-postponed/#6ea15b042881>.

²⁶⁴ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, G20 Saudi Arabia (Riyadh) 30 April 2020. Access Date 7 June 2020. https://g20.org/en/media/Documents/G20%20DETF%20COVID-19%20Ministerial%20Statement_EN.pdf.

²⁶⁵ Viacheslav Nikonov met with the Iranian delegation, State Duma (Moscow) 9 December 2019. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <http://duma.gov.ru/en/news/47222/>.

²⁶⁶ Russia 'successfully tests' its unplugged internet, BBC (London) 24 December 2019. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://www.bbc.com/news/technology-50902496>.

On 16 January 2020, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin announced priorities for the term of his administration, including setting up better digital platform of governance, implementing modern IT technologies, and developing a national digital economy program.²⁶⁷

On 27 January 2020, Presidential Aide and State Council Secretary Igor Levitin set up a meeting of the State Council working group on Media, Communications and Digital Economy, with officials including the head of the working group and Moscow Region Governor Andrei Vorobyov. Vorobyov reiterated “the importance of increasing the Russian regions’ role in implementing the Digital Economy in the Russian Federation national programme,” and mentioned “the key role of digitalisation in streamlining business processes and improving living standards.” The meeting also included discussion on “the concept of a State Council meeting on enhancing the role of the Russian regions in implementing the national programme, Digital Economy of the Russian Federation.”⁴

On 31 January 2020, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin attended the Eurasian Intergovernmental Council meeting with prime minister from four other Eurasian states, including Armenia, Belarus, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Moldova. Minister Mishustin announced policy goals of the development of Russia digital economy and Russia’s cooperation with Eurasian countries on the topic, including promoting “the digital transformation of [Eurasian] economies,” and a plan “developed for building an ecosystem of digital transit corridors.”⁵

On 1 February 2019, Deputy Chairman of the Security Council Dmitry Medvedev proposed that the members of Eurasian Economic Union should design a roadmap towards digital sovereignty and the implementation of digital economy. This proposal includes establishing integrated platforms for education, science, culture and commerce. Medvedev stressed that private businesses are to play a crucial role in promoting the development of the digital economy among the members of Eurasian Economic Union.²⁶⁸

On 18 February 2020, First Deputy Minister of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media Oleg Pak attended the Meeting of the State Council working group on media, communications and the digital economy, and informed the preparedness on the report about Implementing the Digital Economy of the Russian Federation National Programme. Pak reported that the preparation and progress made would be continued.²⁶⁹

On 23 March 2020, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin expressed that the Russian Government will provide free access to digital platforms for citizens in helping them to cope with COVID-19 Pandemic. The agreement within this service has been reached between the government and Russian internet servers.²⁷⁰

On 30 April 2020, the Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies attended the virtual Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, discussing the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 pandemic. The ministers discussed communication infrastructure and network connectivity, exchange of data, research and development of digital technologies for health, use of digital technologies and solutions, etc.²⁷¹

²⁶⁷ Russia’s New Prime Minister Sets Course for Digital Economy, COINTELEGRAPH (New York) 16 January 2020. Access Date: 7 February 2020. <https://cointelgraph.com/news/russias-new-prime-minister-sets-course-for-digital-economy>.

⁴ State Council working group meeting on Media, Communications and Digital Economy, President of Russia (Moscow) 27 January 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/administration/62674>.

⁵ Eurasian Intergovernmental Council meeting, The Russian Government (Almaty) 31 January 2020. Access Date: 14 March 2020. <http://government.ru/en/news/38886/>.

²⁶⁸ Dmitry Medvedev takes part in Digital Agenda in the Era of Globalisation 2.0: Eurasian Ecosystem for Innovation (Almaty) 1 February 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <http://government.ru/en/news/35588/>.

²⁶⁹ Meeting of the State Council working group on media, communications and the digital economy (Moscow) 18 February 2020. Access Date: 4 May 2020. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/administration/62815>.

²⁷⁰ Meeting with deputy prime ministers (Moscow) 23 March 2020. Access Date: 3 May 2020. <http://government.ru/en/news/39242/>.

²⁷¹ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, G20 Saudi Arabia (Riyadh) 30 April 2020. Access Date 7 June 2020. https://g20.org/en/media/Documents/G20%20DETFF%20COVID-19%20Ministerial%20Statement_EN.pdf.

Russia expanded and intensified existing international partnerships in the digital economy sector, but no actions to set up the DBTF were undertaken.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Zeng Lecheng

India: 0

India partially complied with its commitment to expand and intensify digital economy partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).

On 13 December 2019, the Press Information Bureau Delhi announced that the Ministry of Statistics and Program Implementation and Common Service Centre, under the Ministry of Electronics and IT [Information Technology], carried out the Seventh Economic Census. For the first time, the entire census was conducted on a digital platform to ensure high accuracy and data security.²⁷²

On 16 December 2019, the Joint Working Group on ICT [Information and Communications Technologies] met in Beijing for its second session where China's involvement in India's IT industry was discussed. China expressed interest in collaboration with India in areas of emerging technologies such as cloud computing, AI, Internet of Things and big data. The Indian delegation also visited MEGVII Technology and Xiaomi Corporation in Beijing to explore possibilities that would foster ICT cooperation with China.²⁷³

On 20 December 2019, Minister for Law and Justice and Communications, Electronics and Information Technology Ravi Shankar Prasad announced that sensitive data would not leave the country without consumers' consent. He said that there was a data protection law currently under consideration by the committee.²⁷⁴

On 26 December 2019, Minister Prasad announced that wi-fi services being provided through BharatNet in villages across India will be free of charge till March 2020 in order to "promote utilization of BharatNet services." He said that India's target is to reach 250,000-gram panchayats.²⁷⁵

On 28 December 2019, India's Union Finance Minister Nirmala Sitharaman announced that from 1 January 2020, the government would waive the merchant discount rate in order to promote digital transactions by making them cheaper on the RuPay and BHIM networks.²⁷⁶

On 28 December 2019, **eBक्रय**, a common e-auction platform was launched by the Finance Minister. It would enable banks to transparently auction attached assets online. The platform has property search features, navigational links to public-sector banks' e-auction sites, single-window access to information, photographs and videos of uploaded properties, and provides a comparison of similar properties.²⁷⁷

²⁷² Economic Census Flagged off in Delhi, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 13 December 2019. Access Date: 17 March 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1596374>.

²⁷³ Ministry of Electronic and Information Technology Major Achievements Month of December 2019, Ministry of Electronic and Information (New Delhi) 13 February 2020. Access Date: 18 March 2020. https://meity.gov.in/writereaddata/files/major_achievements_month_of_december_2019.pdf.

²⁷⁴ No sensitive data will be shared without consent: Ravi Shankar Prasad, Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry (New Delhi) 20 December 2019. Access Date: 19 March 2020. <http://www.ficci.in/pressrelease-page.asp?nid=3583>.

²⁷⁵ Govt to provide free Wifi services through BharatNet in villages across India till March 2020: Ravi Shankar Prasad, First Post (Mumbai) 26 December 2019. Access Date: 18 March 2020. <https://www.firstpost.com/business/govt-to-provide-free-wifi-services-through-bharatnet-in-villages-across-india-till-march-2020-ravi-shankar-prasad-7826421.html>.

²⁷⁶ Digital payments: Who cares about MDR, India Today (New Delhi) 28 February 2020. Access Date: March 19 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/magazine/up-front/story/20200309-digital-payments-who-cares-about-mdr-1650540-2020-02-28>.

²⁷⁷ Finance Minister launches eBक्रय for online auction of assets attached by banks, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 28 December 2019. Access Date: 17 March 2019. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1597870>.

On 18 January 2020, the Center of Excellence in Blockchain Technology, set up by the National Informatics Centre, was inaugurated by Minister Prasad. The centre was set up with the aim to provide blockchain as a service and enhance transparency, traceability and trust in e-governance systems.²⁷⁸

On 1 February 2020, India presented the 2020-2021 budget, that proposed INR60 billion for the Bharatnet program, which would provide digital connectivity to all public institutions at gram panchayat level and INR80 billion, over a period of five years, to the National Mission on Quantum Technologies and Applications.²⁷⁹

On 7 February 2020, the 23rd Edition of National Conference on e-Governance encouraged improvement in delivery of public services by promoting the use of digital platforms, particularly for the health, agriculture and land sectors. Successful e-governance solutions that use emerging technologies like Artificial Intelligence and Quantum Computing were also discussed.²⁸⁰

On 12 February 2020, the National Workshop on e-Office brought together representatives of state governments with the objective of creating a nation-wide momentum for the creation of e-Office across the State Secretariats.²⁸¹

On 26 February 2020, Minister Prasad announced that the government will start the process of revamping the Information Technology Act of 2000. He said that an expert committee comprising of members from the government and the industry will be set up to discuss the new IT act.²⁸²

On 2 April 2020, the Government of India launched a mobile app called AarogyaSetu. The app was developed in a public-private partnership and aims to enable Indians to assess the risk of them catching COVID-19 based on their interaction with others. The app makes use of cutting-edge Bluetooth technology, algorithms and artificial intelligence to help the government combat the spread of the virus.²⁸³

On 3 April 2020, the Minister of State Electronics and Information Technology, Communications and Human Resource Development Shri Sanjay Dhotre launched Hack the Crisis – India. The online hackathon was launched to help find working solutions to overcome the COVID-19 pandemic.²⁸⁴

On 16 April 2020, India announced the decision to provide a four-month rental waiver to the small IT units in the Software Technology Parks of India. Around 200 IT units operating from 60 Software Technology Parks of India will receive a waiver.²⁸⁵

On 24 April 2020, the Ministry of Panchayati Raj launched the eGramSwaraj web-based portal as part of the Digital India program. eGramSwaraj aims to help digitize villages by promoting e-governance of the

²⁷⁸ Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad to inaugurate 'Centre of Excellence in Blockchain Technology' in Bengaluru tomorrow, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 17 January 2020. Access Date: 17 March 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1599681>.

²⁷⁹ Budget 2020-2021, Union Budget (New Delhi) 21 February 2020. Access Date: 20 March 2020. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/Budget_Speech.pdf.

²⁸⁰ The 23rd Edition of National Conference on e-Governance inaugurated in Mumbai today, Press Information Bureau (Mumbai) 7 February 2020. Access Date: 17 March 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1602494>.

²⁸¹ Dr Jitendra Singh to launch CPGRAMS Reforms at a National Workshop on e-Office in Delhi, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 11 February 2020. Access Date: 18 March 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1602787#.XkKc-GVdU5d.twitter>.

²⁸² Centre to revamp IT Act, The Hindu (New Delhi) 26 February 2020. Access Date: 18 March 2020. <https://www.thehindu.com/business/Industry/centre-to-revamp-it-act/article30925140.ece>.

²⁸³ AarogyaSetu: A multi-dimensional bridge, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 2 April 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1610301>.

²⁸⁴ Shri Sanjay Dhotre launched Hack the Crisis – India, an Online Hackathon to find working solutions for overcoming COVID 19 pandemic, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 3 April 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1610780>.

²⁸⁵ Government of India Gives 4 Months' Rental Waiver to the IT Companies Operating from Software Technology Parks of India (STPI) Centers, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 16 April 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1615052>.

Panchayats. The portal will help improve transparency in three areas: decentralized planning, progress reporting, and work-based accounting.²⁸⁶

On 28 April 2020, the Unique Identification Authority of India permitted 20,000 Common Service Centres, which operate as banking correspondents, to start the Aadhaar updation facility. This facility will help rural citizens get Aadhaar services without having to physically visit Aadhaar centers.²⁸⁷

On 30 April 2020, the Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies attended the virtual Extraordinary G20 digital economy ministerial meeting, discussing the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 pandemic. The ministers discussed communication infrastructure and network connectivity, exchange of data, research and development of digital technologies for health, use of digital technologies and solutions, etc.²⁸⁸

On 10 May 2020, the President of the Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry announced the launch of India's first international virtual exhibition and conference called "Virtual Healthcare and Hygiene Expo 2020." The chamber will invite buyers from more than 120 countries to digitally participate in the conference.²⁸⁹

On 26 May 2020, the Aarogya Setu app was made open source in accordance with India's policy on Open Source Software. This was done to ensure transparency, security and privacy. By making the code open source, the government of India hopes to collaborate with developers to make Aarogya Setu more secure.²⁹⁰

India took actions to expand existing digital economy partnerships. However, India failed to take action on the DBTF.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Sarab Nasir

China: 0

China partially complied with its commitment to expand and intensify digital economy partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).

On 16 December 2019, the Joint Working Group on ICT [Information and Communications Technologies] met in Beijing for its second session where China's involvement in India's IT [information technology] industry was discussed. China expressed interest in collaboration with India in areas of emerging technologies such as cloud computing, artificial intelligence (AI), Internet of Things and big data. The Indian delegation also visited MEGVII Technology and Xiaomi Corporation in Beijing to explore possibilities that would foster ICT cooperation with China.²⁹¹

On 3 January 2020, the China Council for BRICS Think-tank Cooperation hosted the third annual council meeting as well as the second WanShou International Seminar in Beijing. During the summit, Huang Yiyang, Deputy Director-General of the Department of International Economic Affairs of the

²⁸⁶ Government of India launches eGramSwaraj app to help Villages go Digital, Analytics India Magazine (Bengaluru) 24 April 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <https://analyticsindiamag.com/government-of-india-launches-egramswaraj-app-to-help-villages-go-digital/>.

²⁸⁷ UIDAI allows Aadhaar updation facility through CSCs, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 28 April 2020. Access Date: 2 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1618913>.

²⁸⁸ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, G20 Saudi Arabia (Riyadh) 30 April 2020. Access Date 7 June 2020. https://g20.org/en/media/Documents/G20%20DEF%20COVID-19%20Ministerial%20Statement_EN.pdf.

²⁸⁹ FICCI launches first international 'Virtual Healthcare and Hygiene Expo 2020,' FICCI (New Delhi) 10 May 2020. Access Date: 20 May 2020. <http://www.ficci.in/pressrelease-page.asp?nid=3700>.

²⁹⁰ Aarogya Setu is now open source, Press Information Bureau (Delhi) 26 May 2020. Access Date: 27 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1626979>.

²⁹¹ Ministry of Electronic and Information Technology Major Achievements Month of December 2019, Ministry of Electronic and Information (New Delhi) 13 February 2020. Access Date: 18 March 2020. https://meity.gov.in/writereaddata/files/major_achievements_month_of_december_2019.pdf.

Foreign Ministry and Chinese Deputy Coordinator for BRICS Affairs, emphasized the importance of BRICS mechanism in sustaining multilateral international development.²⁹²

On 20 January 2020, China's Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs and the Office of the Central Cyberspace Affairs Commission unveiled the plan for digitalization of its agricultural development and rural governance, amid the country's steps toward rural vitalization.²⁹³

On 4 February 2020, Hong Qi, chair of China Minsheng Bank, stated that the full adoption of digital technologies such as blockchain would be expected to fuel the digital transformation and upgrade China's agriculture, manufacturing, finance, and other services in the upcoming ten years.²⁹⁴

On 4 March 2020, the Standing Committee of the Political Bureau of the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China announced at the meeting that "new infrastructure," which would include facilities and projects such as 5G, extra-high-voltage power transmission, inter-city rail transit, vehicle charging facilities, artificial intelligence (AI), industrial internet, and internet of things and big data centre, would be the focus of the country.²⁹⁵

On 28 April 2020, Wang Yi, State councillor and the Foreign Minister of the People's Republic of China, attended the extraordinary meeting of BRICS ministers of foreign affairs responding to the COVID-19 outbreak. During the video conference, Minister Wang urged all members to uphold multiculturalism and global governance, come together in the spirit of partnership, uphold unity and coordination in order to forge synergy, and further strengthen BRICS cooperation. Minister Wang stated China's willingness to cooperate with other nations in the fight against the pandemic and reemphasized the importance of paying attention to the new booming forms of business such as teleworking and online shopping as well as the crucial need to devise new models of cooperation such as the BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution (PartNIR).²⁹⁶

On 30 April 2020, the Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies attended the virtual Extraordinary G20 digital economy ministerial meeting, discussing the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 pandemic. The ministers discussed communication infrastructure and network connectivity, exchange of data, research and development of digital technologies for health, use of digital technologies and solutions, etc.²⁹⁷

On 11 May 2020, the Communist Party of China Central Committee and the State Council issued a guideline to accelerate the improvement of its socialist market economy in the new era. In this document, the government called for the acceleration in the developments of crucial digital and data markets and seeks to promote the construction of digital governance, strengthen the orderly exchange of data, and protect individual privacy according to the law.²⁹⁸

On 20 May 2020, Ku Wen, the spokesperson of the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology of the People's Republic of China and the chief of the Development of Information and Communication Bureau, stated that the Ministry had issued several documents which aim to promote the rapid

²⁹² Third China Council for BRICS Think-tank Cooperation annual council meeting was held in Beijing, Xinhua News (Beijing) 4 January 2020. Access Date: 3 March 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/world/2020-01/04/c_1210424394.htm.

²⁹³ China issues plan for digital agricultural, rural development, Xinhua News (Beijing) 20 January 2020. Access Date: 13 February 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-01/20/c_138720773.htm.

²⁹⁴ Digital transformation is a top priority for China: Blockchain is being integrated into sectors including banking, agriculture and manufacturing, Asia Times (Hong Kong) 4 February 2020. Access Date: 14 February 2020. <https://www.asiatimes.com/2020/02/article/digital-transformation-is-top-priority-for-china/>

²⁹⁵ China speeds up construction of "new infrastructure," People's Daily (Beijing) 14 March 2020. Access Date: 15 March 2020. <https://www.newsghana.com.gh/china-speeds-up-construction-of-new-infrastructure/>.

²⁹⁶ Wang Yi's speech at the extraordinary meeting of BRICS ministers of foreign affairs, China Daily (Beijing) 29 April 2020. Access Date 1 May 2020. <https://language.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202004/29/WS5ea91445a310a8b241152a38.html>.

²⁹⁷ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, G20 Saudi Arabia (Riyadh) 30 April 2020. Access Date 7 June 2020. https://g20.org/en/media/Documents/G20%20DETF%20COVID-19%20Ministerial%20Statement_EN.pdf.

²⁹⁸ The CPC Central Committee and the State Council: A guideline to accelerate the improvement of its socialist market economy in the new era, Xinhua News (Beijing) 18 May 2020. Access Date: 30 May 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/2020-05/18/c_1126001431.htm.

development of the 5G technology, further advancement in the comprehensive development of the Internet of things, and rapid construction of digital infrastructure.²⁹⁹

On 24 May 2020, Minister Wang Yi answered international and domestic reporters' questions as a part of the press conference for the Third Session of the 13th National People's Congress. Wang has stated that China's diplomacy would not be paused by the pandemic, but rather it would move forward in the form of "Cloud diplomacy" through utilizing channels such as phone, messages, and video. China's Foreign Minister has held video conferences with their counterparts from members in several international organizations and forums, including the foreign ministers of the BRICS members. In addition, Wang reemphasized China's willingness to cooperate and correspond with other countries such as Russia and members of the Association of South East Asian Nations in the rapid development of the E-commerce, biomedicine, and cloud economy sectors. China would promote the construction of "digital silk road" in the future and create more growing points and sources of energy for recovery and developments of the world economy.³⁰⁰

On 24 May 2020, the phrase "new infrastructure," which refers to the construction of physical infrastructure as well as the surrounding constructions for the bases of digitalization and intellectualization, was written into the annual government work report for the first time. The report noted that people have already experienced the crucial roles of the new infrastructure, such as the 5G and the AI technology, in maintaining social functions throughout the pandemic control period. Representatives also stated in the later interview that new infrastructure would inject digital power into industries' developments, and further help to explore the full potential of economic growth.³⁰¹

On 26 May 2020, Yi Gang, Governor of the People's Bank of China, said that there was no timetable for the launch of the digital currency despite progress in digital currency research and development process and pilot testing. According to Governor Yi, although the central bank had begun studies on digital currency since 2014 and have basically completed the top-level design, standard-setting, research and development of the digital currency and electronic payment functions, there is no timetable set for the official launch of digital currency. Nevertheless, China has already carried out a real-world test of an official digital currency in four cities in April.³⁰²

China took actions to expand existing digital economy partnerships but did not take necessary actions for the early setting-up of the DBTF.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Tian Yi (Tony) Chen

South Africa: 0

South Africa partially complied with its commitment to expand and intensify digital economy partnerships already in progress including taking necessary steps for early setting up of the Digital BRICS Task Force (DBTF).

²⁹⁹ Accelerating the development of the digital infrastructure constructions, promoting economic growth, The State Council Information Office of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 May 2020. Access Date: 30 May 2020.

<http://www.scio.gov.cn/xwfbh/xwfbh/wqfbh/42311/43082/zy43086/Document/1680730/1680730.htm>.

³⁰⁰ State councillor and the Foreign Minister Wang Yi answered questions from domestic and international reporters, The State Council Information Office of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 24 May 2020. Access Date: 30 May 2020.

<http://www.scio.gov.cn/ztk/dtzt/42313/43090/43093/Document/1681094/1681094.htm>.

³⁰¹ First-time being introduced to the annual government work report, "new infrastructure" injects digital power into industrial developments, people.cn (Beijing) 24 May 2020. Access Date: 31 May 2020.

<http://finance.people.com.cn/n1/2020/0524/c1004-31721568.html>.

³⁰² No timetable to launch digital currency: China central bank governor, Xinhua News (Beijing) 26 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-05/26/c_139089590.htm.

China's digital currency takes shape amid COVID-19, benefits for foreigners, CGTN (Beijing) 27 May 2020. Access Date: 1 June 2020. <https://news.cgtn.com/news/2020-05-26/China-s-digital-currency-takes-shape-benefits-for-foreigners-QO3Dpvs1i/index.html>.

On 19 December 2019, Minister of Communications and Digital Technologies Stella Ndabene-Abrahams spoke on leading the Fourth Industrial Revolution in order to establish technologies for an “inclusive and human-centric future” to bring together those with and without digital technologies.³⁰³ Minister Ndabene-Abrahams proposed a licensing of an International Mobile Telecommunications Spectrum, the delivery of a broadcasting digital migration, an audit of the current government spending and interventions on information technology (IT), a data policy with a further analysis of the Smart Communities Framework, a pilot program for students to be trained in data science and related fields, and institutional reforms regarding certification from the state law advisor and Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation on creating a state IT company as well as the formation of a state digital infrastructure company.³⁰⁴

On 23 and 24 January 2020, the Ministry of Communications and Digital Technologies conducted an oversight to examine the Gauteng facilities for over 500 students regarding the Fourth Industrial Revolution Skills Programme which began in June 2019. The previous 2018 program examined various teaching and education programs on data science, cloud computing, digital content production, 3D printing, drone piloting, cybersecurity and software development.³⁰⁵

On 5 February 2020, at the Meeting of the Industrial Parks Revitalisation Programme Working Group the Deputy Minister discussed how the industrial parks revitalisation programme will embrace infrastructure renewals and this will include master planning, investment promotion, development of small, micro, medium enterprises with digital hubs, technology, as well as research, development and innovation.³⁰⁶

On 13 February 2020, Cyril Ramaphosa, President of South Africa, in his 2020 State of the Nation Address stated that the digital economy will be promoted by the availability of high demand spectrum broadband access.³⁰⁷ The Independent Communications Authority of South Africa and the Wireless Open Access Network will end licensing of high demand spectrum by December 2020.

On 30 April 2020, Minister Ndabene-Abrahams attended the virtual Extraordinary G20 digital economy ministerial meeting, discussing the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 pandemic. The ministers discussed communication infrastructure and network connectivity, exchange of data, research and development of digital technologies for health, and the use of digital technologies and solutions.³⁰⁸

South Africa took actions to expand existing digital economy partnerships but did not take necessary actions for the early setting-up of the DBTF.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Kelley Prendergast

³⁰³ Minister Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams: Department’s State of readiness to lead 4IR. South African Government (Johannesburg) 19 December 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-stella-ndabeni-abrahams-department%E2%80%99s-state-readiness-lead-4ir-19-dec-2019-0000>.

³⁰⁴ Minister Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams: Department’s State of readiness to lead 4IR. South African Government (Johannesburg) 19 December 2019. Access Date: 9 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-stella-ndabeni-abrahams-department%E2%80%99s-state-readiness-lead-4ir-19-dec-2019-0000>.

³⁰⁵ Minister Stella Ndabeni engages 4IR Skills Programme students in Gauteng, 23 to 24 Jan. South African Government (Johannesburg) 22 January 2020. Access Date: 9 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-stella-ndabeni-22-jan-2020-0000>.

³⁰⁶ Speech Delivered by Deputy Minister Nomalungelo Gina at the Meeting of the Industrial Parks Revitalisation Programme Working Group. South African Government (Johannesburg) 5 February 2020. Access Date: 13 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/speech-delivered-deputy-minister-nomalungelo-gina-meeting-industrial-parks-revitalisation>.

³⁰⁷ President Cyril Ramaphosa: 2020 State of the Nation Address. South African Government (Johannesburg) 13 February 2020. Access Date: 20 February 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-2020-state-nation-address-13-feb-2020-0000>.

³⁰⁸ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting, G20 Saudi Arabia (Riyadh) 30 April 2020. Access Date 7 June 2020. https://g20.org/en/media/Documents/G20%20DETF%20COVID-19%20Ministerial%20Statement_EN.pdf.

6. International Taxation: Digital Economy

We remain committed to addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.20 (60%)		

Background

The first time that BRICS countries committed to “enhance cooperation in the international forums targeting tax base erosion and information exchange for tax purposes” was in their 2014 Fortaleza Declaration.³⁰⁹ At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the leaders reaffirmed their intention to address tax issues and made commitments on tackling base erosion, assisting developing countries to strengthen tax administration capacity, and ensuring tax transparency and exchange of information for taxation purposes.³¹⁰ Commitments on similar priorities in the international tax agenda were made at the Goa, Hangzhou and Johannesburg summits.³¹¹

In 2019 in Brasilia BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment on prevention of base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS), exchange of tax information and needs-based capacity building for developing countries. They also pledged to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.³¹²

Commitment Features

This commitment refers to BEPS Action 1 “Tax Challenges Arising from Digitalisation.” It is the top priority for the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)/G20 Inclusive Framework. BRICS members participate as G20 Inclusive Framework members. In May 2019, the Inclusive Framework issued the Programme of Work to Develop a Consensus Solution to the Tax Challenges Arising from the Digitalisation of the Economy.³¹³ It explores technical design implementation issues that must be refined to develop a comprehensive and consensus-based solution. It includes concrete proposals for the two challenges facing the international income tax in the digital economy: changing the allocation of taxing rights through a coherent and concurrent review of the profit allocation and nexus rules (Pillar 1) and remaining BEPS issues and minimum taxation (Pillar 2).³¹⁴

³⁰⁹ Fortaleza Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

³¹⁰ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 9 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

³¹¹ Goa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

³¹² 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

³¹³ Programme of Work to Develop a Consensus Solution to the Tax Challenges Arising from the Digitalisation of the Economy, OECD (Paris) 29 May 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/programme-of-work-to-develop-a-consensus-solution-to-the-tax-challenges-arising-from-the-digitalisation-of-the-economy.pdf>

³¹⁴ Programme of Work to Develop a Consensus Solution to the Tax Challenges Arising from the Digitalisation of the Economy, OECD (Paris) 29 May 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/programme-of-work-to-develop-a-consensus-solution-to-the-tax-challenges-arising-from-the-digitalisation-of-the-economy.pdf>

Compliance requires BRICS members' to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy. The commitment has three aspects: changes in internal tax policy, coordination among BRICS members and cooperation with other international actors and fora.

Domestic measures

First part of the commitment requires taking domestic measures to address the challenges of BEPS in line with recommendations on Action 1 that have already been finalized by the OECD. In particular, it refers to the area of value-added taxes (VAT) and goods and services taxes (GST). Relevant recommendations have been integrated into the 2016 International VAT Guidelines,³¹⁵ and complemented by the 2017 report on Mechanisms for the Effective Collection of VAT/GST where the supplier is not located in the jurisdiction of taxation³¹⁶ and the 2019 report on The Role of Digital Platforms in the Collection of VAT/GST on Online Sales,³¹⁷ which provide guidance on implementation to jurisdictions.

BRICS members should also address the issue in partnership with other BRICS countries (hosting tax seminars, exchanging of best practice, conducting joint research etc.) and in other international fora and with other actors, especially in G20 Inclusive Framework on BEPS.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not make any progress in addressing tax challenges arising from digitalization
0	The BRICS member makes progress in addressing tax challenges arising from digitalization through domestic policy OR through international cooperation
+1	The BRICS member makes progress in addressing tax challenges arising from digitalization through domestic policy AND through international cooperation

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with the commitment on addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.

No domestic actions on taxation of digital economy taken during the compliance period were registered yet. But some actions were taken prior to the compliance period (they do not affect the score).

On 1 April 2018, the value-added tax (Imposto sobre Circulação de Mercadorias e Serviços) on digital goods, such as apps, e-books, software and games, became effective. The tax is paid in the state where the download or streaming is conducted and where the purchasing consumer is located. Rules apply only to residents. In addition, not all the states have opted to taxing software.³¹⁸ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

On 27-28 May 2020, BRICS tax authorities meeting was held in a format of a video conference. As part of the discussion on taxation of the digital economy, the parties touched upon the distribution of residual profits of international groups of companies and taxation of revenues from electronic services. BRICS experts expressed their views on the prospects and potential perimeter of a mandatory mechanism for the prevention and resolution of tax disputes that may arise in the case of the so-called unified approach, a multilateral global project on taxation of profits of digital companies, developed under the auspices of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.³¹⁹

³¹⁵ International VAT/GST Guidelines, OECD (Paris) 2017. Access date: 15 May 2020.

<https://read.oecd.org/10.1787/9789264271401-en?format=pdf>

³¹⁶ Mechanisms for the Effective Collection of VAT/GST When the Supplier Is Not Located In the Jurisdiction of Taxation, OECD (Paris) 2017. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.oecd.org/tax/tax-policy/mechanisms-for-the-effective-collection-of-VAT-GST.pdf>

³¹⁷ The Role of Digital Platforms in the Collection of VAT/GST on Online Sales, OECD (Paris) March 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/consumption/the-role-of-digital-platforms-in-the-collection-of-vat-gst-on-online-sales.pdf>

³¹⁸ Taxation of the digitalized economy, KPMG (New York) 20 December 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://tax.kpmg.us/content/dam/tax/en/pdfs/2019/digitalized-economy-taxation-developments-summary.pdf>

³¹⁹ The Russian Federal Tax Service held consultations with experts from tax administrations of BRICS countries, Federal Tax Service of Russia 29 May 2020. Access date: 1 June 2020. https://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/inttax/9809930/

Brazil did not take any domestic measures to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy during the compliance period but participated in BRICS tax authorities cooperation.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with the commitment on addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.

No domestic actions on taxation of digital economy taken during the compliance period were registered yet. But some actions were taken prior to the compliance period (they do not affect the score).

From 1 January 2017, Russia requires non-resident vendors of digital services to consumers in Russia to register for and collect value-added taxes (VAT).³²⁰ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

From 1 January 2019, new VAT requirements for business-to-business services became effective in Russia. Foreign suppliers needed to register for VAT by 15 February 2019 if supplying e-services to companies registered with the Russian tax authorities, including branches of foreign companies. The rule changes also provide that Russian businesses receiving e-services from foreign suppliers are allowed to deduct the input VAT on the supplies, provided that they maintain documentation proving that payment was made, as well as documentation specifying the VAT amount and taxpayer identification of the foreign supplier (foreign suppliers are to issue invoices specifying VAT amount).³²¹ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

On 3 October 2019, the Ministry of Finance acknowledged that several countries have already introduced new digital taxation measures that will be considered as Russia is exploring new approaches to taxing digital companies.³²²

On 27-28 May 2020, BRICS tax authorities meeting was held in a format of a video conference. As part of the discussion on taxation of the digital economy, the parties touched upon the distribution of residual profits of international groups of companies and taxation of revenues from electronic services. BRICS experts expressed their views on the prospects and potential perimeter of a mandatory mechanism for the prevention and resolution of tax disputes that may arise in the case of the so-called unified approach — a multilateral global project on taxation of profits of digital companies, developed under the auspices of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.³²³

Russia did not take any domestic measures to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy during the compliance period but participated in BRICS tax authorities cooperation.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

India: +1

India fully complied with the commitment on addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.

³²⁰ Russian VAT Rules for E-Services, KPMG (Moscow) 2018. Access date: 15 May 2020.

<https://assets.kpmg/content/dam/kpmg/ru/pdf/2018/06/ru-en-russian-vat-rules-for-e-services.pdf>

³²¹ Update - Russian VAT on Foreign Suppliers B2B E-Services from 2019, Orbitax (San Francisco) 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/Update---Russian-VAT-on-Foreig-31785>

³²² Russia Examines New Ways to Tax Digital Companies, Tax Notes (Falls Church) 7 October 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.taxnotes.com/featured-news/russia-examines-new-ways-tax-digital-companies/2019/10/07/2b0kd>

³²³ The Russian Federal Tax Service held consultations with experts from tax administrations of BRICS countries, Federal Tax Service of Russia 29 May 2020. Access date: 1 June 2020. https://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/inttax/9809930/

On 1 April 2020, so-called equalization levy was introduced in India. This approach to taxation of digital economy is one of the three options included into the possible ways to reform digital taxation according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). The tax is 2% and it is imposed on 1) online sale of goods owned by the e-commerce operator, 2) online provision of services provided by the ecommerce operator, 3) online sale of goods or provision of goods facilitated by the e-commerce operator (i.e., when the operator provides a platform for others to supply goods or provide services), 4) any combination of the above.³²⁴

On 1 April 2020, the Finance act for 2020 was released and it provided for: (i) a deferral of the definition of significant economic presence to April 1, 2022, with the expectation that the OECD will soon reach a consensus and provide an updated workplan for the digital economy; (ii) the expansion of source rules to include income from advertisements that target Indian customers, income from the sale of data collected from India, and income from sale of goods and services using such data collected from India, which will take effect from 1 April 2021, although for attribution in relation to significant economic presence, the amendment will take effect from 1 April 2022.³²⁵

On 27-28 May 2020, BRICS tax authorities meeting was held in a format of a video conference. As part of the discussion on taxation of the digital economy, the parties touched upon the distribution of residual profits of international groups of companies and taxation of revenues from electronic services. BRICS experts expressed their views on the prospects and potential perimeter of a mandatory mechanism for the prevention and resolution of tax disputes that may arise in the case of the so-called unified approach – a multilateral global project on taxation of profits of digital companies, developed under the auspices of the OECD.³²⁶

India implemented several domestic measures to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy and actively participates in the OECD process.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

China: 0

China partially complied with the commitment on addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.

No domestic actions on taxation of digital economy taken during the compliance period were registered yet. But some actions were taken prior to the compliance period (they do not affect the score).

Since 8 April 2016, imported retail goods purchased in cross-border e-commerce transactions are subject to import tariff duties, as well as value-added tax and consumption tax. This rule does not impact non-residents. China is combining duties, VAT, and consumption tax in one tax on ecommerce purchases.³²⁷ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

On 27-28 May 2020, BRICS tax authorities meeting was held in a format of a video conference. As part of the discussion on taxation of the digital economy, the parties touched upon the distribution of residual profits of international groups of companies and taxation of revenues from electronic services. BRICS experts expressed their views on the prospects and potential perimeter of a mandatory mechanism for the prevention and resolution of tax disputes that may arise in the case of the so-called unified approach — a

³²⁴ India Issues Notification that New Digital Services Equalization Levy in Force, Orbitax (San Francisco). Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/India-Issues-Notification-that-18553>

³²⁵ Indian Finance Bill 2020, Government of India (Delhi) 1 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/Finance_Bill.pdf

³²⁶ The Russian Federal Tax Service held consultations with experts from tax administrations of BRICS countries, Federal Tax Service of Russia 29 May 2020. Access date: 1 June 2020. https://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/inttax/9809930/

³²⁷ China's New Import Tax Polices for Cross-border E-commerce worth the attention of the whole industry, KPMG (Hong Kong) 14 March 2016. <https://assets.kpmg/content/dam/kpmg/pdf/2016/04/china-tax-alert-14-cross-border-ecommerce.pdf>

multilateral global project on taxation of profits of digital companies, developed under the auspices of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.³²⁸

China did not take any domestic measures to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy during the compliance period but participated in BRICS tax authorities cooperation.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

South Africa: 0

South Africa partially complied with the commitment on addressing the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy.

No domestic actions on taxation of digital economy taken during the compliance period were registered yet. But some actions were taken prior to the compliance period (they do not affect the score).

Effective 1 June 2014, South Africa requires non-resident vendors of digital services to customers (business to consumer [B2C] and business to business [B2B]) in South Africa to register for and collect value-added tax (VAT).³²⁹ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

Effective 1 April 2019, South Africa expands the scope of digital services, increases the VAT registration threshold for non-residents, and implements intermediary (e.g., platform) rules from (i.e., ZAR 50,000 to ZAR 1 million). Following these changes, Saudi Arabia is closer to guidance issued by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), but because it still applies digital services rules to B2B supplies, it is not in complete agreement with the guidance.³³⁰ This action was taken prior to the compliance period and does not affect the score.

On 27-28 May 2020, BRICS tax authorities meeting was held in a format of a video conference. As part of the discussion on taxation of the digital economy, the parties touched upon the distribution of residual profits of international groups of companies and taxation of revenues from electronic services. BRICS experts expressed their views on the prospects and potential perimeter of a mandatory mechanism for the prevention and resolution of tax disputes that may arise in the case of the so-called unified approach — a multilateral global project on taxation of profits of digital companies, developed under the auspices of the OECD.³³¹

South Africa did not take any domestic measures to address the tax challenges of the digitalization of the economy during the compliance period but participated in BRICS tax authorities cooperation.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

³²⁸ The Russian Federal Tax Service held consultations with experts from tax administrations of BRICS countries, Federal Tax Service of Russia 29 May 2020. Access date: 1 June 2020. https://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/inttax/9809930/

³²⁹ Final Electronic Services Regulation published, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 28 March 2014. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/final-electronic-services-regulation-published>

³³⁰ South Africa: New VAT registration requirements, non-resident suppliers of e-services, KPMG (Washington) 11 March 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://home.kpmg/xx/en/home/insights/2019/03/tnf-south-africa-new-vat-registration-requirements-non-resident-suppliers-e-services.html>

³³¹ The Russian Federal Tax Service held consultations with experts from tax administrations of BRICS countries, Federal Tax Service of Russia 29 May 2020. Access date: 1 June 2020. https://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/inttax/9809930/

7. Macroeconomic Policy: Enterprise Financing

We will explore in appropriate fora ways to promote and facilitate investments in ... MSMEs ...which will help to promote economic growth, trade and job creation.

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.40 (70%)		

Background

Cooperation in the field of macroeconomic policy is one of the key spheres of BRICS agenda. During the first summits leaders called upon all states to “strengthen macroeconomic cooperation, jointly secure world economic recovery and achieve a strong, sustainable and balanced growth.”³³²

In 2013 BRICS leaders paid special attention to small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) and their role in the economic development. Leaders recognized the fundamental role played by SMEs in the economies of BRICS countries. BRICS pledged to “explore opportunities for cooperating in the field of SMEs” and emphasized the need for “promoting dialogue among the respective Ministries and Agencies in charge of the theme, particularly with a view to promoting their international exchange and cooperation and fostering innovation, research and development.”³³³ This commitment was reaffirmed in Fortaleza in 2014.³³⁴

In 2015 in Ufa and in 2016 in Goa leaders supported the efforts aimed at establishing and enhancing the cooperation mechanisms in the area of SME support.³³⁵ Also in Goa leaders agreed that micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) provide major employment opportunities, at comparatively lower capital cost, and create self-employment opportunities in rural and underdeveloped areas and thus help assure equitable wealth distribution nationally and globally. They commended organization of the second BRICS round table on MSMEs by India with a focus on technical and business alliances in MSMEs and agreed to work for greater integration of MSMEs in regional and global value chains.³³⁶

In 2017 at Xiamen BRICS reaffirmed the commitment to BRICS industrial cooperation, including on “industrial capacities and policies, new industrial infrastructure and standards, and among small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs), so as to jointly seize the opportunities brought about by the new industrial revolution and expedite our respective industrialization processes.”³³⁷

³³² Second Summit: Joint Statement, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 16 April 2010. Access date: 15 May 2020.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency1/Second%20Summit%202010.pdf>

³³³ Fifth BRICS Summit eThekweni Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/130327-statement.pdf>

³³⁴ Fortaleza Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

³³⁵ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 9 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020.

http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

³³⁶ Goa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

³³⁷ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access date: 13 May 2020.

<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

In 2018 BRICS leaders promised to encourage measures that support greater participation, value addition and upward mobility in Global Value Chains for firms, particularly in industry and agriculture, especially MSMEs, including through the preservation of policy space to promote industrial development.³³⁸

In 2019 in Brasilia BRICS committed to exploring ways “to promote and facilitate investments in productive sectors, ecommerce, MSMEs, infrastructure and connectivity, which will help to promote economic growth, trade and job creation.”³³⁹

Commitment Features

The BRICS leaders made a commitment to explore in appropriate forums ways to promote and facilitate investments in MSMEs. Promoting SME financing can be done inside the country by adopting measures in the framework of national macroeconomic policy as well as in partnership with other countries and especially BRICS members. Thus, this commitment has two aspects: internal macroeconomic policy and international cooperation.

Internal Measures

Measures of national macroeconomic policy devoted to SME financing promotion include allocating of budget resources, launching different programs and plans aimed at SME support, launching awards for successful SMEs, exploring new sources of SME financing, reforming the legal basis among others.

International Cooperation

This part of the commitment implies cooperation with other countries in different international forums and on the bilateral basis. BRICS members should exchange national SME support practices, consider new joint mechanisms that might expand SME funding possibilities, and facilitate SME integration in the value chains.

To fully comply with the commitment BRICS member should both take appropriate national policy measures and cooperate with other countries as well as international institutions.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member takes no action on promotion and facilitation of investments in micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).
0	The BRICS member takes action on promotion and facilitation of investments in MSMEs EITHER through internal policy OR through international cooperation.
1	The BRICS member takes action on promotion and facilitation of investments in MSMEs BOTH through internal policy AND through international cooperation.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with the commitment on facilitating investments in micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 26 November 2019, Brazilian Micro and Small Business Support Service (Sebrae) and Banco do Brasil signed an agreement to contribute to the generation of sustainable business, between individual microentrepreneurs, microenterprises and small companies. The partnership between the two institutions will also improve the entrepreneur’s qualification for credit purposes and support the expansion of Empresa Simples de Crédito, which already total more than 500 businesses in the country.³⁴⁰

In March 2020, Apex-Brasil created a page that brings together online courses and webinars on the effects of the pandemic on the internationalization scene and content to help in the future resumption of

³³⁸ 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. https://www.ranepa.ru/eng/images/CiIR/BRICS/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

³³⁹ 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

³⁴⁰ Sebrae e Banco do Brasil assinam acordo de cooperação para beneficiar pequenos negócios, National Association of Entities Promoting Innovative Enterprises (Brasilia) 27 November 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://anprotec.org.br/site/2019/11/sebrae-e-banco-do-brasil-assinam-acordo-de-cooperacao-para-beneficiar-pequenos-negocios/>

business. The available courses can be searched in four categories on the themes of internationalization, commercial intelligence, export and investment attraction.³⁴¹

On 16 March 2020, the government announced two measures to reduce the economic effects related to the COVID-19 pandemic in micro and small companies. The actions were defined to safeguard jobs and pay salaries. The first measure deals with the postponement of the payment of the Simples Nacional tax, for a period of three months, which will correspond to a temporary waiver of BRL2.2 billion from the government. The measure will benefit approximately 4.9 million companies, which are opting for the tax regime. The payment of taxes will be postponed to the second half of this year. The second is the release of BRL5 billion by the Income Generation Program (Proger), maintained with funds from the Workers' Support Fund (FAT). The amount will be passed on to public banks so that they grant loans aimed at working capital of micro and small companies.³⁴²

On 23 March 2020, the Banco do Brasil started to release credit operations to guarantee the financial liquidity of micro and small companies in this period of the coronavirus pandemic. These customers will be able to extend the next two installments due, which will be migrated to the end of the payment schedule of their debts.³⁴³

On 25 March 2020, it was announced that Brazilian Industrial Research and Innovation Company (EMBRAPII) and the Cornet Network (Collective Research Network) are receiving proposals for research, development and innovation projects from startups, small and medium-sized Brazilian companies to be carried out in partnership with the industry member countries participating in the network. The projects financed by Cornet have an average value of BRL600,000. The network maintains a partnership with 11 partner countries around the world. In addition to Brazil, the following are connected to the network: Germany, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Poland, Japan, Holland, Switzerland, Czech Republic and Peru.³⁴⁴

On 20 April 2020, Caixa Econômica Federal and Sebrae announced a partnership to offer BRL7.5 billion in credit to individual microentrepreneurs, micro and small companies. The measure is an aid to these companies amid the pandemic of the new coronavirus, which paralyzed services and businesses.³⁴⁵

Brazil took several domestic measures to facilitate investment into MSMEs and support them during the COVID-19 outbreak, but no international actions were registered.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with the commitment on facilitating investments in micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

In March, the Russian Export Center created an operations headquarters to support exporters experiencing difficulties due to the global trade crisis amid the coronavirus pandemic. Its purpose was to establish sustainable channels of interaction with federal and regional authorities, business associations

³⁴¹Participe Das Atividades De Capacitação Em Internacionalização, Apex-Brazil March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <http://www.apexbrasil.com.br/participe-das-atividades-de-capacitacao-em-internacionalizacao>

³⁴²Governo anuncia medidas de ajuda econômica para micro e pequenas empresas, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 18 March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/financas-impostos-e-gestao-publica/2020/03/governo-anuncia-medidas-de-ajuda-economica-para-micro-e-pequenas-empresas>

³⁴³BB libera operacoes de credito para micro e pequenas empresas, Agencia Brasil (Brasilia) 24 March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/economia/noticia/2020-03/bb-libera-operacoes-de-credito-para-micro-e-pequenas-empresas>

³⁴⁴Empresas Brasileiras Podem Se Cadastrar Para Parceria Internacional Em PD&I, Brazilian Industrial Research and Innovation Company (Brasilia) 25 March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://embrapii.org.br/empresas-brasileiras-podem-se-cadastrar-para-parceria-internacional-em-pdi/>

³⁴⁵Caixa oferece R\$ 7,5 bi para micro e pequena empresa com taxa até 40% menor, Economia (São Paulo) 20 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://economia.uol.com.br/noticias/redacao/2020/04/20/caixa-e-sebrae-anunciam-credito-especial-a-micro-e-pequenas-empresas.htm>

and regional export support centres in order to create a consolidated position on the necessary measures to support exporters, as well as provide information and advisory services to Russian exporters in order to reduce their costs and facilitate identification and use of emerging commercial opportunities in export markets.³⁴⁶

On 20 March 2020, the Central Bank of Russia gave credit institutions the opportunity, until September 30, 2020, not to increase reserves for possible losses on loans to small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) if the financial situation of the borrower worsened due to the spread of COVID-19.³⁴⁷

On 20 March 2020, the Central Bank of Russia is expanding its refinancing program for loans to SMEs. In addition to an instrument aimed at limiting interest rates on loans to borrowers, a new instrument is introduced with a refinancing limit of RUB500 billion in order to maintain lending to SMEs.³⁴⁸

On 15 April 2020, President Vladimir Putin announced additional support measures for SMEs. SMEs were given preferential loans for working capital replenishment within the Central Bank's key interest rate (6%), loans for salaries and gratuitous compensation for lost earnings.³⁴⁹

Russia took several domestic measures to facilitate investment into MSMEs and support them during the COVID-19 outbreak, but no international actions were registered.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

India: 0

India partially complied with the commitment on facilitating investments in small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).

On 16 December 2019, Minister for Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises and Road Transport & Highways Nitin Gadkari approved the changes in the Interest Subvention Scheme for MSMEs, in a meeting held here today to review the functioning of the scheme. The improvements are set to provide momentum giving fillip to the MSME sector. The Interest Subvention Scheme for MSMEs was launched by the Prime Minister Narendra Modi in November 2018. The modifications in operational guidelines carried out are based on suggestions made by various stakeholders, including banks and lending institutions who had brought to light operational difficulties which were hindering a smooth rollout of the scheme.³⁵⁰

On 17-29 February 2020, Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises conducted a National Level Awareness Programme. Its main objective is to spread awareness about the schemes and activities undertaken by the Ministry and its attached organizations — Office of Development Commissioner (MSME), Khadi and Village Industries Commission, Coir Board, National Small Industries Corporation Limited, National Institute of MSME, MSME Technology Centres, and Mahatma Gandhi Institute of

³⁴⁶Russian CCI and REC strengthen cooperation to support export-oriented companies during the pandemic, Russian Trade and Industry Chamber (Moscow) 23 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://tpprf.ru/ru/vneshnie-svyazy/vneshnie-svyazy-news/357834/>

³⁴⁷The Bank of Russia approved measures to support citizens, the economy and the financial sector in the context of the coronavirus pandemic, Bank of Russia (Moscow) 20 March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. https://www.cbr.ru/press/pr/?file=20032020_133645if2020-03-20T13_36_08.htm

³⁴⁸The Bank of Russia approved measures to support citizens, the economy and the financial sector in the context of the coronavirus pandemic, Bank of Russia (Moscow) 20 March 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. https://www.cbr.ru/press/pr/?file=20032020_133645if2020-03-20T13_36_08.htm

³⁴⁹"Do not accumulate debts": Putin announced the second package of state support to business, Gazeta (Moscow) 15 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gazeta.ru/business/2020/04/15/13049761.shtml>

³⁵⁰Amendments approved in interest subvention scheme for MSMEs Changes set to give Fillip to the MSME Sector, Public Information Bureau of Indian Government (Delhi) 16 December 2019. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1596621>

Rural Industrialization. Through the awareness program, an attempt is being made by the Ministry of MSME to encourage students and youth to take up entrepreneurship as their career.³⁵¹

On 30 April 2020, Minister Gadkari launched a Bank of Schemes, Ideas, Innovation and Research portal on MSMEs. The portal gives access to all schemes of union, state and union territory governments. It has the provision for uploading ideas, innovations and research in the sector.³⁵²

India took several domestic measures to facilitate investment into MSMEs and support them during the COVID-19 outbreak, but no international actions were registered.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

China: +1

China fully complied with the commitment on facilitating investments in micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 5 February 2020, the Chinese government announced 16 preferential policies to sustain the production and operation of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), including policies on taxation, finance, social security, subsidies and rent reduction.³⁵³

On 25 February 2020, the Chinese government unveiled a string of measures to support SMEs. For eligible SMEs, financial institutions will be encouraged to provisionally defer their principal loan repayments. Their interest payments can be deferred to 30 June, with penalty interest payments exempted. In order to support individual businesses to resume production and operation, the meeting proposed to exempt value-added tax for small-scale taxpayers in Hubei province and cut the tax from 3% to 1% for those outside Hubei from 1 March 2020 to 31 May 2020, reduce their contributions for endowment insurance, unemployment insurance and work injury insurance, guide banks to issue low-cost loans to individual business operators, trim electricity charges by five percent for industrial and commercial companies not from high energy-consuming industries, and encourage local governments to cut or waive land use tax as an incentive for property owners to cut rents for individual business tenants.³⁵⁴

On 26 February 2020, the State Council ordered large state-owned banks to increase lending to small businesses by at least 30% in the first half of 2020. China's three government-run policy banks were also told to lend CNY350 billion (USD49.7 billion) to small businesses at preferential rates.³⁵⁵

On 14 April 2020, China and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) vowed to strengthen cooperation in fighting the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak by sharing information and best practice in time and reduce impact of the epidemic on socio-economic development of affected countries. The communiqué said that support will be given to enterprises affected by the epidemic, especially

³⁵¹ Ministry of MSME conducting a National Level Awareness Programme (NLAP) 2020 across the Country, Public Information Bureau of Indian Government (Delhi) 21 February 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1603956>

³⁵² Shri Gadkari launches Bank of Schemes, Ideas, Innovation & Research Portal on MSMEs, Public Information Bureau of Indian Government (Delhi) 30 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1619559>

³⁵³ China's Latest Regional Measures to Support SMEs during the Coronavirus Outbreak, China Briefing (Beijing) 11 February 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.china-briefing.com/news/chinas-latest-regional-measures-to-support-smes-during-coronavirus-outbreak/>

³⁵⁴ China's Support Policies for Businesses Under COVID-19: A Comprehensive List, China Briefing (Beijing) 11 May 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.china-briefing.com/news/china-covid-19-policy-tracker-benefiting-business-enterprises-comprehensive-updated-list/>

³⁵⁵ Coronavirus: China grants banks extra funding to spur loans to hard hit small businesses, South China Morning Post (Hong Kong) 26 February 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.scmp.com/economy/china-economy/article/3052474/coronavirus-china-grants-banks-extra-funding-spur-loans-hard>

MSMEs, including through promotion of digital economy to facilitate economic activity during epidemics and make full use of the ASEAN-China Year of Digital Economy Cooperation.³⁵⁶

China took several domestic measures to facilitate investment into MSMEs and support them during the COVID-19 outbreak and also participated in ASEAN+3 format.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

South Africa: +1

China fully complied with the commitment on facilitating investments in micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 12 January 2020, in the joint communiqué issued on the occasion of the visit of Prime Minister Abiy Ahmed Ali of Ethiopia to South Africa, the two countries agreed to enhance bilateral investments and affirmed their commitment to expanding cooperation in trade and investment between business entities in South Africa and Ethiopia, as well as agreeing to cooperate in the field of small and medium enterprises (SMEs) due to their important role in job creation. There was also agreement to strengthen cooperation in the area of mining, deep mining and mineral beneficiation, to strengthen agricultural cooperation so as to enhance food security, and to work towards addressing skills development through the exchange of best practices, among others.³⁵⁷

On 11 February 2020, the Department of Tourism in collaboration with Limpopo Department of Economic Development, and Tourism, and Waterberg District Municipality will be hosting a tourism information sharing session in Modimolle for MSMEs. Session gave entrepreneurs insights into how to access the Department's Tourism Incentive Programmes such as the International Market Access Support Programme, the Green Tourism Incentive Programme and the Transformation Fund. MSMEs seeking targeted business support services interacted with officials about the Tourism Enterprise Development and Incubator Programme, and learned how to tap into the resources offered through the Industrial Development Corporation, Small Enterprise Finance Agency and National Empowerment Fund.³⁵⁸

On 26 February 2020, the state budget was released. The budget allocated ZAR6.5 billion for small business incentive programs of which ZAR2.2 billion will be transferred to the Small Enterprise Development Agency.³⁵⁹

On 7 April 2020, the Tourism Relief Fund opened for applications. Established as an intervention to mitigate the impact of COVID-19 on the tourism sector, the ZAR200 million Tourism Relief Fund provides once-off capped grant assistance to MSMEs to ensure sustainability during and post the implementation of government measures to curb the spread of COVID-19 in South Africa.³⁶⁰

On 20 April 2020, the government introduced a number of interventions aimed at assisting businesses in general, and youth-owned enterprises in particular during the COVID-19 lockdown period. These interventions include the Debt Relief Fund and the SMME [Small, Micro and Medium-Sized Enterprises]

³⁵⁶ Full text of Joint Statement of Special ASEAN Plus Three Summit on COVID-19, People.cn (Hanoi) 15 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <http://en.people.cn/n3/2020/0415/c90000-9679607.html>

³⁵⁷ Joint Communiqué following State Visit by Prime Minister Abiy Ahmed Ali to SA, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 12 January 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/joint-communiqué-occasion-official-visit-prime-minister-abiy-ahmed-ali-ethiopia-south>

³⁵⁸ Tourism hosts Tourism Information Sharing Session in Modimolle for Small Micro and Medium Enterprises, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 11 February 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/tourism-hosts-tourism-information-sharing-session-modimolle-small-micro-and-medium>

³⁵⁹ Minister Tito Mboweni: 2020 Budget Speech, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 26 February 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/BudgetSpeech2020>

³⁶⁰ Tourism invites eligible companies to apply for the Coronavirus COVID-19 Tourism Relief Fund, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 7 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/tourism-invites-eligible-companies-apply-coronavirus-covid-19-tourism-relief-fund-7-apr>

Support Intervention by the Department of Small Business Development. The National Youth Development Agency opened the Youth Micro Enterprises Relief Fund aimed at assisting youth enterprises who might not qualify for other funds. This fund will respond to challenges facing youth owned businesses such as inability to pay employees and lack of income, including waiting periods for other funding mechanisms.³⁶¹

On 21 April 2020, President Cyril Ramaphosa announced additional measures to overcome the crisis. Additional amount of ZAR2 billion were made available to assist SMEs and entrepreneurial shop owners and other small businesses.³⁶²

South Africa took several domestic measures to facilitate investment into MSMEs and support them during the COVID-19 outbreak, and also agreed to expand cooperation in trade and investment between business entities in South Africa and Ethiopia, as well as cooperate in the field of SMEs.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

³⁶¹ National Youth Development Agency opens the Youth Micro Enterprises Relief Fund (YMERF) to assist youth during Coronavirus COVID-19 lockdown, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 20 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/national-youth-development-agency-opens-youth-micro-enterprises-relief-fund-ymerf-assist>

³⁶² President Cyril Ramaphosa: Additional Coronavirus COVID-19 economic and social relief measures, , Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 21 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-additional-coronavirus-covid-19-economic-and-social-relief>

8. Financial Regulation: Currency Cooperation

We will continue to communicate on other possible areas of currency cooperation, consistent with each central bank's mandate

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia			+1
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.20 (40%)	

Background

Currency cooperation and settlements in national currencies, including in mutual trade, is one of the top priorities for the BRICS in the economic sphere. At the Brasilia Summit in 2010, the leaders emphasized the importance of currency cooperation for enhancing mutual trade and investment: “In order to facilitate trade and investment, we will study feasibilities of monetary cooperation, including local currency trade settlement arrangement between our countries.”³⁶³ However, no practical steps have been taken in this area. At the Ufa Summit in 2015, the commitment was reiterated in almost the same form: “We acknowledge the potential for expanding the use of our national currencies in transactions between the BRICS countries. We ask the relevant authorities of the BRICS countries to continue discussion on the feasibility of a wider use of national currencies in mutual trade.”³⁶⁴ Following this mandate to the ministers, at the 2017 Xiamen summit the BRICS leaders agreed “to communicate closely to enhance currency cooperation, consistent with each central bank’s legal mandate, including through currency swap, local currency settlement, and local currency direct investment, where appropriate, and to explore more modalities of currency cooperation.”³⁶⁵ Besides, they agreed to “to promote the development of BRICS Local Currency Bond Markets and jointly establish a BRICS Local Currency Bond Fund, as a means of contribution to the capital sustainability of financing in BRICS countries, boosting the development of BRICS domestic and regional bond markets, including by increasing foreign private sector participation, and enhancing financial resilience of BRICS countries.”³⁶⁶ Similar commitments were included in the 2018 BRICS Johannesburg Declaration.³⁶⁷ In the 2019 BRICS Brasilia Declaration, the commitments on the BRICS Local Currency Bond Fund and other areas of currency cooperation were for the first time linked together and included in the same paragraph.

Commitment Features

Given the clear focus of this commitment on “other possible areas of currency cooperation” (apart from developing local bond markets), this commitment provides for measures to stimulate the use of the BRICS members’ national currencies, primarily in mutual trade. Partial compliance requires the recognition by BRICS member countries of the need to enhance settlements in national currencies in foreign trade and relevant statements by officials in the absence of specific measures taken in this area.

³⁶³ Second Summit: Joint Statement, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 16 April 2010. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency1/Second%20Summit%202010.pdf>

³⁶⁴ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 9 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

³⁶⁵ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwxo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

³⁶⁶ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwxo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

³⁶⁷ 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. https://www.ranepa.ru/eng/images/CIIR/BRICS/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

Full compliance requires cooperation with the BRICS partners to move towards the wider use of national currencies both at the level of discussing prospects and concluding relevant agreements.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not take measures for wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations
0	The BRICS member collaborated with partners to achieve the goal of wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations at the level of joint discussions, but did not conclude any relevant agreements
+1	The BRICS member collaborated with partners to achieve the goal of wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations at the level of joint discussions and concluded relevant agreements

Brazil: -1

Brazil did not comply with the commitment on financial regulation.

No evidence of Brazilian measures aimed at wider use of its national currency in international economic operations was found during the compliance period.³⁶⁸

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepor

Russia: +1

Russia fully complied with the commitment on financial regulation.

On 14 November 2019, Indian media reported on the talks between India, Russia and China on designing an alternative to the US-dominated SWIFT (Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication) payment mechanism. The aim was to smoothen trade with countries facing American sanctions. In the framework of the new system, Russia's System for Transfer of Financial Messages is expected to be linked with China's Cross-Border Interbank Payment System. India, which does not have a domestic financial messaging system, will be linked to the Central Bank of Russia's platform with a service that is under development. According to the same sources, the establishment of the payment mechanism is part of a broader set of actions to develop trade among the BRICS members in national currencies.³⁶⁹

On 1 January 2020, amendments to the law "On currency regulation and currency control" related to the liberalization of restrictions for international trade settlements entered into force. The law lifted the requirements for residents to repatriate export revenues in Russian currency regarding non-resource commodities and provided for a gradual removal of that requirement regarding the export of raw commodities starting 1 January 2020. The removal of the repatriation requirement would enable currency residents to terminate their obligations on such contracts using any permitted method, even by offsetting counter claims, which was impossible under the majority of contracts earlier. The amendment may particularly contribute to the expansion of the use of the Russian ruble in international trade settlements.³⁷⁰

On 15 January 2020, Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov gave an interview to the Times of India. He said that Russia continued its policy aimed at gradual de-dollarization of the economy. Together with its main partners, including India, Russia worked on developing economic and legal mechanisms to reduce the negative impact of restrictions on bilateral trade and investment ties. Expanding settlements in national

³⁶⁸ No information on currency cooperation were found on official websites of Brazilian Ministry of Finance, government and central bank as well as in open sources.

³⁶⁹ India-Russia-China explore alternative to SWIFT payment mechanism, The Economic Times 14 November 2019. Access date: 10 May 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/india-russia-china-explore-alternative-to-swift-payment-mechanism/articleshow/72048472.cms>.

³⁷⁰ Law on liberalization of currency control comes into force, TASS 1 January 2020. Access date: 10 May 2020. <https://tass.com/economy/1105297>.

currencies is one of the priorities in this regard. Relevant intergovernmental agreements on settlements and payments were concluded with China and Turkey in June and October 2019. Among the BRICS members, agreements were reached on the mutual opening by the central banks of relevant correspondent accounts.³⁷¹

Russia collaborated with partners to achieve the goal of wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations at the level of joint discussions and concluded relevant agreements.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

India: 0

India partially complied with the commitment on financial regulation.

On 14 November 2019, Indian media reported on the talks between India, Russia and China on designing an alternative to the US-dominated SWIFT (Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication) payment mechanism. The aim was to smoothen trade with countries facing American sanctions. In the framework of the new system, Russia's System for Transfer of Financial Messages is expected to be linked with China's Cross-Border Interbank Payment System. India, which does not have a domestic financial messaging system, will be linked to the Central Bank of Russia's platform with a service that is under development. According to the same sources, the establishment of the payment mechanism is part of a broader actions to develop trade among the BRICS members in national currencies.³⁷²

On 15 January 2020, Russian Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov gave an interview to the Times of India. He said that Russia continued its policy aimed at gradual de-dollarization of the economy. Together with its main partners, including India, Russia worked on developing economic and legal mechanisms to reduce the negative impact of restrictions on bilateral trade and investment ties. Expanding settlements in national currencies is one of the priorities in this regard. Relevant intergovernmental agreements on settlements and payments were concluded with China and Turkey in June and October 2019. Among BRICS members, agreements were reached on the mutual opening by the central banks of relevant correspondent accounts.³⁷³

India collaborated with partners to achieve the goal of wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations at the level of joint discussions, but has not concluded any relevant agreements.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

China: 0

China partially complied with the commitment on financial regulation.

On 14 November 2019, Indian media reported on the talks between India, Russia and China on designing an alternative to the US-dominated SWIFT (Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication) payment mechanism. In the framework of the new system, Russia's System for Transfer of Financial Messages is expected to be linked with China's Cross-Border Interbank Payment System. India, which does not have a domestic financial messaging system, will be linked to the Central

³⁷¹ Interview of Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov with the Times of India newspaper, published on January 15, 2020, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation 15 January 2020. Access date: 10 May 2020. https://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/cKNonkJE02Bw/content/id/3994333.

³⁷² India-Russia-China explore alternative to SWIFT payment mechanism, The Economic Times 14 November 2019. Access date: 10 May 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/india-russia-china-explore-alternative-to-swift-payment-mechanism/articleshow/72048472.cms>.

³⁷³ Interview of Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov with the Times of India newspaper, published on January 15, 2020, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation 15 January 2020. Access date: 10 May 2020. https://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/cKNonkJE02Bw/content/id/3994333.

Bank of Russia's platform with a service that is under development. According to the same sources, the establishment of the payment mechanism is part of a broader actions to develop trade among the BRICS members in national currencies.³⁷⁴

China collaborated with partners to achieve the goal of wider use of national currencies in mutual economic operations at the level of joint discussions, but has not concluded any relevant agreements. Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrey Sheleпов

South Africa: -1

South Africa did not comply with the commitment on financial regulation.

No evidence of South African measures aimed at wider use of its national currency in international economic operations was found during the compliance period.³⁷⁵

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Andrey Sheleпов

³⁷⁴ India-Russia-China explore alternative to SWIFT payment mechanism, The Economic Times 14 November 2019. Access date: 10 May 2020. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/india-russia-china-explore-alternative-to-swift-payment-mechanism/articleshow/72048472.cms>.

³⁷⁵ No information on currency cooperation were found on official websites of the South African National Treasury, government and South African Reserve Bank as well as in open sources.

9. Climate Change: Paris Agreement

We reiterate our commitment to the implementation of the Paris Agreement adopted under the principles of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), including the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities, in the light of different national circumstances.

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia			+1
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average		+0.60 (80%)	

Background

The BRICS first committed to fight climate change at the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, where the leaders pledged to “support international cooperation in the field of energy efficiency” and expressed readiness to engage in “a constructive dialogue on how to deal with climate change based on the principle of common but differentiated responsibility, given the need to combine measures to protect the climate with steps to fulfill our socio-economic development tasks.”²³⁶ Since then the BRICS members have maintained climate change as an integral agenda item, committing to support international efforts to combat its effects and immediate causes.

The Paris Agreement, signed in 2015 stipulates three major goals: a) holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursuing efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels, recognizing that this would significantly reduce the risks and impacts of climate change; b) increasing the ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change and foster climate resilience and low greenhouse gas emissions development, in a manner that does not threaten food production; and c) making finance flows consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate-resilient development.³⁷⁶

The concept of common but differentiated responsibilities first manifested in the Rio Declaration at the first Rio Earth Summit in 1992 as Principle 7, which states: “In view of the different contributions to global environmental degradation, States have common but differentiated responsibilities. The developed countries acknowledge the responsibility that they bear in the international pursuit of sustainable development in view of the pressures their societies place on the global environment and of the technologies and financial resources they command.” Similar language exists in the Framework Convention on Climate Change; parties should act to protect the climate system “on the basis of equality and in accordance with their common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities.”³⁷⁷

Thus, the common-but-differentiated principle stipulates that although all countries are equally responsible for creating the global public good, each has a different set of capabilities that can be applied to this end.

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the BRICS members to both take action aimed at the implementation of the Paris Agreement.

³⁷⁶ Paris Agreement, United Nations (New York) 2015. Access date: 24 December 2019. https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english_paris_agreement.pdf.

³⁷⁷ Rio Declaration on Environment and Development 1992, United Nations 1992. Access date: 24 December 2019. <https://www.jus.uio.no/lm/environmental.development.rio.declaration.1992/portrait.a4.pdf/>

Thus, to fully comply with the commitment the BRICS member must take action on all the three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement, that is: to take action aimed at greenhouse gases emissions reduction; to support climate adaptation and resilience; to mobilize climate finance from a wide variety of sources.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member takes no action on any of the three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement.
0	The BRICS member takes action on less than three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement.
1	The BRICS member takes action on all the three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement.

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with the commitment on the Paris Agreement implementation.

Brazil has taken actions to meet two major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

On 21 November 2019, the Brazilian Ministry of Mines and Energy published a decree regulating the decarbonization credit for tracking and compliance with carbon emissions targets, as well as certificates reflecting the energy efficiency and carbon intensity of biofuels. The credit is a part of the *RenovaBio*, the National Policy for Biofuels approved in 2017. *RenovaBio* is designed to introduce market mechanisms to recognize the capacity of each biofuel to reduce emissions individually per production unit.³⁷⁸

On 28 November 2019, President Jair Bolsonaro issued a decree regulating the functioning of the Climate Fund Program. The fund had been inoperative throughout 2019, due to the lack of the management committee appointment. The decree attempts to remedy this by introducing the new committee composition scheme which favors the representation and participation of the private sector and civil society.³⁷⁹ The Climate Fund's purpose is to provide finance to support projects or studies that aim to mitigate climate change.³⁸⁰

Brazil took actions to reduce greenhouse gases emissions and mobilize climate finance. However, no actions climate adaptation and resilience were registered.

Thus, Brazil is awarded a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

Russia: +1

Russia fully complied with the commitment on the Paris Agreement implementation.

Russia has taken actions to meet all three major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

On 24 December 2019, the Government of Russia approved the decree on compensation measures for the emitter companies, which fail to meet their emission quotas. The decree aims to improve the quality of atmospheric air in some of the country's largest industrial centers.³⁸¹

³⁷⁸ MME avança na sustentabilidade e regulamenta o Crédito de Descarbonização – CBIO, Brazilian Ministry of Mines and Energy 21 November 2019. Access date: 4 May 2020. http://www.mme.gov.br/web/guest/todas-as-noticias/-/asset_publisher/pdAS9lcdBICN/content/mme-avanca-na-sustentabilidade-e-regulamenta-o-credito-de-descarbonizacao-cb-2?inheritRedirect=false&redirect=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.mme.gov.br%2Fweb%2Fguest%2Ftodas-as-noticias%3Fp_p_id%3D101_INSTANCE_pdAS9lcdBICN%26p_p_lifecycle%3D0%26p_p_state%3Dnormal%26p_p_mode%3Dview%26p_p_col_id%3Dcolumn-1%26p_p_col_count%3D1

³⁷⁹ Decreto Nº 10.143, de 28 de Novembro de 2019, Brazilian President 28 November 2019. Access date: 4 May 2020. http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2019-2022/2019/decreto/D10143.htm.

³⁸⁰ Fundo Clima, BNDES The Brazilian Development Bank. Access date: 4 May 2020.

<https://www.bndes.gov.br/wps/portal/site/home/financiamento/produto/fundo-clima>.

³⁸¹ Requirements for compensation measures in the framework of the experiment on emission quotas in large industrial centers approved, Government of Russia 30 December 2019. Access date: 30 April 2020. <http://government.ru/docs/38712/>.

On 24 December 2019, the Government of Russia issued a decree on the creation of the Federal Atmospheric Air Quality Monitoring Information System in several large industrial cities. The system is a part of the 2020-2024 experiment on the introduction of emission quotas for industrial emitters.³⁸²

On 25 December 2019, the Government of Russia approved the National Plan of Action on the First Stage of Adaptation to Climate Change until 2022. The plan provides for a set of economic and social policy actions to increase the resilience of Russia's population, infrastructure, nature and economy to climate change.³⁸³ The government directed the ministries to adopt the plans for their respective sectors by 3 September 2021 and to provide annual progress updates.³⁸⁴

On 27 March 2020, Russia ratified the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol, providing for gradual reduction of production and consumption of hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs), which accelerate the depletion of the ozone layer. Russia plans to reduce HFCs consumption by 5% starting from 2020, by 35% from 2025, by 70% from 2029, by 80% from 2034, and by 85% indefinitely from 2036.³⁸⁵

On 31 March 2020, the Government of Russia amended the State Program "Protection of Environment," increasing the financing for 2020 from RUB79.92 billion (USD1.06 billion) to RUB81.38 billion (USD1.08 billion). The State Program includes targets on emissions reduction³⁸⁶

Russia took actions to meet all three major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

India: 0

India partially complied with the commitment on the Paris Agreement implementation.

India took actions to meet two major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

On 1 February 2020, the 2020-2021 Union Budget was unveiled in a speech by Nirmala Sitharaman, Minister of Finance. In her speech, Minister Sitharaman noted the Indian efforts to meet the Nationally Determined Contribution under the Paris Agreement and outlined plans to advise the closure of old thermal power plants with high carbon emission levels. She also stated that the Indian government proposed to encourage individual States to develop plans for incentivizing lower air pollution in large population centres.³⁸⁷

The new Union budget also increases the federal government spending on renewable energy schemes, such as Wind Power with INR12.99 billion (USD170 million), and Solar Power with INR21.5 billion (USD280 million) allocated for 2020-2021.³⁸⁸

During the monitoring period India has taken actions to reduce greenhouse gases emissions and mobilize climate finance. However, no actions climate adaptation and resilience were registered.

³⁸² Decision on the creation of the Federal Atmospheric Air Quality Monitoring Information System made, Government of Russia 30 December 2019. Access date: 30 April 2020. <http://government.ru/docs/38713/>.

³⁸³ The National Plan of Action on the First Stage of Adaptation to Climate Change until 2022 is approved, Government of Russia 4 January 2020. Access date: 30 April 2020. <http://government.ru/docs/38739/>.

³⁸⁴ Russian Government decree of 25 December 2019, Government of Russia 25 December 2019. Access date: 30 April 2020. <http://static.government.ru/media/files/OTrFMr1Z1sORh5Nix4gLUsdgGHyWIAqy.pdf>.

³⁸⁵ Russia ratified the amendment to the Montreal Protocol, Government of Russia 27 March 2020. Access date: 30 April 2020. <http://government.ru/news/39294/>.

³⁸⁶ State Program "Protection of the Environment" with amendments, Government of Russia 31 March 2020. Access date: 30 April 2020. http://www.mnr.gov.ru/docs/gosudarstvennyy_programmy/gosudarstvennaya_programma_rossiyskoy_federatsii_okhrana_okruzhayushchey_sredy_s_izmeneniyami/.

³⁸⁷ Budget 2020-2021 Speech of Nirmala Sitharaman, Indian Ministry of Finance 1 February 2020. Access date: 2 May 2020. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/budget_speech.docx.

³⁸⁸ Outlay on Major Schemes, Indian Government 1 February 2020. Access date: 2 May 2020. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/Budget_at_Glance/bag7.pdf.

Thus, India is awarded a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

China: +1

China fully complied with the commitment on the Paris Agreement implementation.

China took actions to meet all three major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

On 21 November 2019, the Chinese National Development and Reform Commission published the plan of the demonstration zone for eco-friendly and integrated development of the Yangtze River Delta. The plan aims to raise high water quality, provide reforestation, promote eco-tourism, as well as improve regional infrastructure and reduce industrial facilities' impact on environmental systems.³⁸⁹

On 26 December 2019, the Chinese government announced its plans to launch the National Green Development Fund in 2020. China plans to “give full play to the role of green finance and green credit, including environmental protection credit,” according to Xu Bijiu, director general of the general office at the Ministry of Ecology and Environment. The plan also provides for the efforts to increase financial investment in ecological and environmental protection and to improve related price mechanisms and tax policies, including pollutant emission rights and ecological compensation.³⁹⁰

On 15 January 2020, Li Ganjie, Chinese Minister of Ecology and Environment, announced the government plans for environmental pollution reduction in 2020. According to the plan, by the end of 2020 total emissions of sulfur dioxide and nitrogen oxide will be cut by more than 15% compared to 2015 levels.³⁹¹

On 20 April 2020, Wu Xianfeng, Deputy Head of air quality management at the Ministry of Ecology and Environment, revealed the government plans to phase out 1 million highly polluting diesel-powered vehicles in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei province cluster and Fenhe-Weihe Plain area over the course of the year. According to the ministerial data, the targeted regions have the highest levels of air pollution in the country. The vehicles scheduled for the phase out comprise only 1.2% of the areas' automobiles, while contributing over 30% of nitric oxide pollutants and 50% of particulate matter.³⁹²

China took steps to meet all three main goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

South Africa: +1

South Africa fully complied with the commitment on the Paris Agreement implementation.

South Africa took actions to meet all three major goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

On 14 December 2019, Minister of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries Barbara Creecy expressed support for African countries' efforts to meet and improve the nationally determined contributions under

³⁸⁹ New blueprint details greater integration of Yangtze River Delta cities, Ministry of Ecology and Environment the People's Republic of China 21 November 2019. Access date: 1 May 2020.

http://english.mee.gov.cn/News_service/media_news/201911/t20191121_743484.shtml.

³⁹⁰ China to launch national green development fund in 2020: official, The State Council of the People's Republic of China 26 December 2019. Access date: 1 May 2020.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/201912/26/content_WS5e04a5d3c6d03c1f1c161af1.html.

³⁹¹ China to strengthen fight against environmental pollution in 2020, Ministry of Ecology and Environment the People's Republic of China 15 January 2020. Access date: 1 May 2020.

http://english.mee.gov.cn/News_service/media_news/202001/t20200115_759398.shtml.

³⁹² China to phase out diesel vehicles in areas with most air pollution, Ministry of Ecology and Environment the People's Republic of China 20 April 2020. Access date: 1 May 2020.

http://english.mee.gov.cn/news_service/media_news/202004/t20200413_774001.shtml.

the Paris Agreement, stating that climate finance remains crucial for the continent's efforts to face "extreme weather phenomena associated with climate change." "We urgently require new, predictable and adequate financing for adaptation beyond voluntary donor assistance," stated the Minister.

On 18 February 2020, Minister Creecy said that, "We have a common moral responsibility to future generations to honour our mutual commitments and our differentiated responsibilities to fight the causes and consequences of climate change". She noted, that "the transition to a low carbon growth trajectory would only be just if it took account of the existing high levels of inequality, unemployment and under-development". According to the ministerial statement, in 2020 the Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries of the South African Government plans to spend ZAR1.9 billion (USD100 million) to improve the resilience of infrastructure and human settlements to storms, floods and sea level rise.³⁹³

On 26 February 2020, Minister of Finance Tito Titus Mboweni outlined the government's plans for the 2020 budget. He stated that the government intends to provide "more focused spending on climate change mitigation."³⁹⁴ The 2020 budget lays out plans to continue the carbon tax program introduced in June 2019 and explores the potential for the introduction of new environmental taxes and reforms to existing instruments, including restructuring the general fuel levy to include a local air pollution emissions component, and reviewing inefficient fossil fuel subsidies.³⁹⁵

South Africa took steps to meet all three main goals of the Paris Agreement during the monitoring period.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

³⁹³ South Africa will not shrink from its responsibility to address climate change, Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries 18 February 2020. Access date: 1 May 2020.
https://www.environment.gov.za/mediarelease/creecy_climatechangeresponsibility_2020sonadebate

³⁹⁴ Minister Tito Mboweni: 2020 Budget Speech, South African Government 26 February 2020. Access date: 1 May 2020.
<https://www.gov.za/BudgetSpeech2020>.

³⁹⁵ Budget Review 2020, National Treasury Republic of South Africa 26 February 2020. Access date: 1 May 2020.
<http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/National%20Budget/2020/review/FullBR.pdf>.

10. Regional Security: Syria

We also reaffirm our commitment to advancing a Syrian-led and Syrian-owned, UN-facilitated political process in line with United Nations Security Council Resolution 2254

BRICS Brasilia Declaration

Assessment

Country	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia		0	
India	-1		
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.60 (20%)	

Background

The Syrian Arab Republic and its people face severe political, security and socioeconomic challenges due to ongoing regional instability, terrorist activity and lack of governmental capacity to tackle the current crisis. Since 2011, Syria have been plunged into severe interior armed conflict grew out of discontent of the local people with Bashar al-Assad policy amid a heavy drought of 2006-2011. The main frontline lies between the north-east regions of the country controlled by the Syrian opposition and the territories remain under control of the government. Since 2015, Russia has been conducting airstrikes against numerous terrorist groups namely the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIS), Al-Nusra Front, Jabhat Fateh al-Sham and others; Turkey, Israel, Iran and the United States are also involved into conflict directly or indirectly. For many years the situation in Syria has been on agenda of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC). In 2015 the UNSC unanimously adopted a roadmap for a peace process in Syria (Resolution 2254 (2015))³⁹⁶. The UNSC expressed support for free and fair elections and acknowledged the link between a ceasefire and a parallel political process based on decisions made in Geneva in 2012³⁹⁷. The parties concerned expressed their support for peaceful settlement of the conflict and endorsed the role played by the United Nations Supervision Mission in Syria, established by the UNSC Resolution 2043 in April 2012.³⁹⁸ Russia as party involved in the conflict took steps toward initiation of a dialog among hostiles and hosted the multilateral meeting in Sochi in January 2018. The results of an intensive negotiation process were summarized in the final statement of the Congress of the Syrian national dialogue.³⁹⁹ In the final document, the participants pointed out 12 principles of national reconciliation in Syria, including full respect of the sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity and unity of the country; the right of the Syrian people to determine the future of their country; and support of democratic processes.

In 2012, the BRICS leaders addressed the situation in Syria for the first time, expressing their concern and support for a “Syrian-led inclusive political process” and encouraging “the Syrian government and all sections of Syrian society to demonstrate the political will to initiate ‘an inclusive political’ process.”⁴⁰⁰ In 2013 in Durban, South Africa, the BRICS leaders adopted the eThekweni Declaration in which they condemned “the increasing violations of human rights and of international humanitarian law” and again

³⁹⁶ Resolution 2254 (2015) adopted by the Security Council at its 7588th meeting, on 18 December 2015. United Nations (New York) 18 December 2015. Access date: 13 May 2020. [http://undocs.org/S/RES/2254\(2015\)](http://undocs.org/S/RES/2254(2015))

³⁹⁷ Action Group for Syria Final Communique 30.06.2012. United Nations (New York) 30 June 2012. Access date: 13 May 2020. <https://www.un.org/News/dh/infocus/Syria/FinalCommuniqueActionGroupforSyria.pdf>

³⁹⁸ United Nations Supervision Mission in Syria. United Nations (New York). Access date: 13 May 2020. <https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/>

³⁹⁹ Final statement of the Congress of the Syrian national dialog, Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs 30 January 2018. (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/ckNonkJE02Bw/content/id/3046246

⁴⁰⁰ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 29 March 2012. Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/Fourth%20BRICS%20Summit.pdf>

stated that “a Syrian-led political process leading to a transition can be achieved only through broad national dialogue that meets the legitimate aspirations of all sections of Syrian society and respect for Syrian independence, territorial integrity and sovereignty.”⁴⁰¹ The commitment to support a Syrian-led peaceful reconciliation process was successively reiterated in 2014 in Fortaleza Declaration⁴⁰². In 2015 in Ufa Declaration the leaders also expressed firm denouncement of “any use of toxic chemicals as a weapon” and commended the “outcome of setting international control over the Syrian arsenals of chemical weapons.”⁴⁰³ The same year the BRICS deputy foreign ministers adopted a joint communiqué on the situation in the Middle East and North Africa in which the parties condemned terrorism in all forms and urged the hostile forces in Syria to combine efforts in achieving politico-diplomatic resolution of the crisis.⁴⁰⁴ Successive presidencies of India in 2016 and China in 2017 again reiterated the parties’ commitment to support “Syrian-led, Syrian-owned” political process which “safeguards the sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity of Syria.”^{405,406} In 2018 in Johannesburg the BRICS countries reaffirmed “commitment for a political resolution of the conflict in Syria, through an inclusive “Syrian-led, Syrian-owned” political process that safeguards the state sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity of Syria, in pursuance of United Nations Security Council Resolution 2254 (2015) and taking into account the result of the Congress of the Syrian National Dialogue in Sochi.”⁴⁰⁷

Commitment Features

Syria now faces the challenges that are closely interconnected and do not possess the capabilities to tackle them successfully. To overcome crisis, the country needs massive support in economic, social, security and other spheres. The current problems of Syria fall within the local government’s jurisdiction, that is why the BRICS countries’ support for Syria in its fight against terrorism should be aimed at providing necessary resources, dedicated to capacity-building. The commitment requires the BRICS members to provide capacity-building assistance to Syria in socioeconomic development, security and good governance that will contribute to national reconciliation, fight against terrorism, security facilitation, promotion of independent political and economic course. Advise support and assistance for Syria may include support for national reconciliation, electoral process, constitutional review and implementation of constitutional provisions, resolution of disputed internal boundaries, regional dialogue on border security, energy and refugees, planning, funding and implementing reintegration programs for former members of illegal armed groups, and initial planning for the conduct of a comprehensive census.

Actions of the BRICS countries in support for Syria may be aimed at improving coordination and delivery of humanitarian assistance, establishing cooperation with donors and international financial institutions, coordinating and implementing programs to provide essential services for people of Syria, reforming the economy, building capacity and improving conditions for sustainable development, developing effective civil, social and essential services, and supporting contributions by UN agencies, funds and programs. Further assistance in protecting human rights and reforming judicial and legal systems to maintain the rule of law in the country also might be counted as a valid action.

⁴⁰¹ Fifth BRICS Summit eThekweni Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/130327-statement.pdf>

⁴⁰² Fortaleza Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

⁴⁰³ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 9 July 2014. Access date: 13 May 2020. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

⁴⁰⁴ Consultative meeting of the BRICS countries on situation in the Middle East (in Russian), Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/%D0%B1%D0%BB%D0%B8%D0%B6%20%D0%B2%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82%D0%BE%D0%BA.pdf>

⁴⁰⁵ Goa Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

⁴⁰⁶ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access date: 13 May 2020. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwxo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

⁴⁰⁷ 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (Moscow). Access date: 13 May 2020. https://www.ranepa.ru/eng/images/CIIR/BRICS/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not provide assistance to Syria in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.
0	The BRICS member provides assistance to Syria in addressing only one or two of the following challenges: security, socioeconomic development or good governance.
+1	The BRICS member provides assistance to Syria in addressing all of the following challenges: security, socioeconomic development and good governance.

Brazil: -1

Brazil did not comply with the commitment to provide Syria with necessary assistance in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.

No evidence was found of any effort to do so during the compliance period.⁴⁰⁸

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with the commitment on providing assistance to Syria in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.

On 20 January 2020, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin announced that Russia would allocate USD20 million to provide Syria with food assistance. The allocated funds would be channelled into the Food and Agriculture Organization.⁴⁰⁹

On 17 December 2019, the Government of Russia announced the allocation of USD5.8 million to support Syria via specialized funds and programs of the United Nations. The funds would be transferred to the UN Development Programme. Moreover, Russia announced its intention to allocate USD5 million to UNICEF and USD3 million to the World Health Organization.⁴¹⁰

On 17 December 2019, the Government of Russia announced that it would send 100,000 tonnes of grain to support Syria amid humanitarian and food crisis. The supplies would be delivered throughout the first and second quarters of 2020.⁴¹¹

On 19 November 2019, Ministry of Defense Spokesperson I. Konashenkov announced that Russia had sent military police forces to northern part of Syria. The group was said to observe the normalization between Turkey- and Syria-led forces. Russia's military police were also instructed to provide necessary assistance to the local population in fulfilling its basic needs including medical services.⁴¹²

Russia provided assistance to Syria in addressing security and socioeconomic development challenges, but no actions aimed at tackling the challenges of governance in Syria have been found.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁴⁰⁸ No actions which can be counted as compliance were found on official web-sites of Brazilian Ministry of International Affairs, Government as well as in open sources.

⁴⁰⁹ Rossija vydelit do 20 millionov dollarov fondu OON na pomoshh' Sirii (Russia to Donate \$20 mln to UN Fund), RIA (Moscow) 30 January 2020. Access date: 27 April 2020. <https://ria.ru/20200130/1564047862.html> (in Russian)

⁴¹⁰ Rossija vydelit \$5,8 mln na pomoshh' Sirii (Russia to Allocate \$5.8 mln to Support Syria), Komsomol'skaja Pravda (Moscow) 17 December 2019. Access date: 27 April 2020. <https://www.kp.ru/online/news/3708122/> (in Russian)

⁴¹¹ Rossija vydelit Sirii 100 tysjach tonn zerna gumanitarnoj pomoshhi (Russia to Donate Syria 100 Thousands Tones of Grains as Humanitarian Assistance), Komsomol'skaja Pravda (Moscow) 17 December 2019. Access date: 27 April 2020. https://www.kp.ru/online/news/3707989/?utm_source=yxnews&utm_medium=desktop&utm_referrer=https%3A%2F%2Fyandex.ru%2Fnews (in Russian)

⁴¹² Rossija napravila dopolnitel'nye sily voennoj policii na sever Sirii (Russia to Send Military Police to Syria's North), Interfax (Moscow) 19 November 2019. Access date: 27 April 2020. <https://www.interfax.ru/world/684723> (in Russian)

India: -1

India did not comply with the commitment to provide assistance to Syria in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.

No evidence was found of any actions taken during the compliance period.⁴¹³

Thus, India receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

China: 0

China partially complied with the commitment on providing assistance to Syria in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.

On 15 April 2020, China delivered a humanitarian cargo to Syria containing 2,016 COVID-19 testing kits. The batch was said to improve situation in Syria concerning detection of COVID-19-positive persons to avoid further spread of infection across the country⁴¹⁴.

On 16 December 2019, China and Syria announced their intention to implement a series of bilateral projects under the framework of China's global Belt and Road Initiative. President of Syria Bashar Assad said he has proposed a number of projects to Beijing in the hope of securing investment for reconstruction in the war-torn country⁴¹⁵. However, no further details were provided.

China provided assistance to Syria in addressing socioeconomic development challenges, but no concrete actions aimed at tackling the challenges of security and governance in Syria have been found.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: -1

South Africa did not comply with the commitment to provide Syria with necessary assistance in addressing security, socioeconomic development and governance challenges.

No evidence was found of any action taken during the compliance period.⁴¹⁶

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁴¹³ No actions which can be counted as compliance were found on official web-sites of Indian Ministry of International Affairs, Government, Press information bureau as well as in open sources.

⁴¹⁴ China donates COVID-19 test kits to Syria. Xinhua (Beijing) 16 April 2020. Access date: 27 April 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-04/16/c_138979876.htm

⁴¹⁵ Syria in 'serious dialogue' with China about joining Belt and Road initiative, says Assad. The Telegraph (London) 16 December 2019. Access date: 27 April 2020. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2019/12/16/syria-serious-dialogue-china-joining-belt-road-initiative-says/>

⁴¹⁶ No actions which can be counted as compliance were found on official web-sites of South African Ministry of International Affairs, Government as well as in open sources.