



BRICS RESEARCH GROUP

# 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Interim Compliance Report

23 June 2022 to 13 January 2023

Prepared by

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Angela Min Yi Hou and Yana Sadeghi  
and the University of Toronto BRICS Research Group

and

Alexander Ignatov, Irina Popova, Andrey Shelepov and Andrei Sakharov  
and the Center for International Institutions Research  
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,  
Moscow

31 March 2023

## Contents

Research Team .....	3
Toronto BRICS Research Group .....	3
BRICS Research Group Analysts .....	3
RANEPA Research Group .....	3
Preface.....	4
Introduction and Summary.....	5
Methodology and Scoring System .....	5
The Breakdown of Commitments.....	5
Selection of Commitments .....	5
Compliance Scores.....	6
Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments Across Issue Areas, 2009–2022 .....	7
Table 2: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Priority Commitments.....	8
Table 3: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Interim Compliance Scores .....	10
Table 4: BRICS Compliance Scores, 2019–2022 .....	11
Table 5: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Interim Compliance Scores by Commitment .....	11
1. Development: Infrastructure Investment and PPPs .....	12
2. Development: Economic Recovery and Sustainable Development in Africa .....	24
3. Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform.....	32
4. Digital Economy: E-Commerce Consumer Protection.....	45
5. Health: COVID-19.....	51
6. Health: Infectious Diseases .....	55
7. International Taxation.....	62
8. International Financial Institutions Reform: IMF Reform .....	69
9. Crime and Corruption: Anti-Corruption Law Enforcement .....	79
10. Terrorism: Cross-border Movement, Terrorist Financing and Safe Havens .....	88
11. Regional Security: Afghanistan .....	98
12. ICT and Digital Economy: Open ICT Environment .....	105
13. Health: Universal Health Coverage.....	116
14. Sustainable Development: 2030 Agenda Implementation .....	125
15. Macroeconomics: Standardization in Sustainable Development .....	139
16. Trade: Interconnectivity of Supply Chains.....	148
17. Labour and Employment: Development and Recovery.....	158
18. Climate Change: Supporting Implementation.....	168

## **Research Team**

Dr. Marina Larionova, Co-director, BRICS Research Group  
Professor John Kirton, Co-director, BRICS Research Group  
Brittaney Warren, Compliance Specialists, BRICS Research Group

## **Toronto BRICS Research Group**

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Co-Chair of Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group  
Angela Min Yi Hou, Co-Chair of Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group  
Yana Sadeghi, Editor-in-Chief, BRICS Research Group

## **BRICS Research Group Analysts**

Reem Baghdady  
Vismay Buch  
Kunal Dadlani  
Presian Dragiev  
Tyler Fu  
Glen Xian Quan Hung  
Chan Wing Sze Kelly  
Firaz Khan  
Jennifer Lee  
Shih-Chieh Lee  
Vanessa Ataro Mabelle  
Ashton Mathias  
Sarah Nasir  
Pantea Jamshidi Nouri  
Kelley Prendergast  
Hania El Sayed  
Michael Shirley  
Timothy Tennant  
Xiaolong (James) Wang  
Yiran (Sarah) Xie  
Thomas Yue  
Katherine Zhang  
Vincent Zhang

## **RANEPA Research Group**

Alexander Ignatov  
Irina Popova  
Andrei Sakharov  
Andrey Shelepov  
Pavel Doronin

## Preface

The BRICS Research Group has been assessing progress made by the BRICS members in implementing commitments their leaders make at each summit since the 2011 Sanya meeting. These reports monitor each member's efforts to implement a carefully chosen selection of the many commitments produced at each summit. They are offered to the general public and to policy makers, academics, civil society, the media and interested citizens around the world in an effort to make the BRICS's work more transparent, accessible and effective, and to provide scientific data to enable the meaningful analysis of the causes of compliance and the impact of this important informal international institution. Previous reports are available at the BRICS Information Centre at <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/compliance> and at the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration available at <http://www.ranepa.ru/eng/ciir-ranepa/research-areas/brics/analytics>.

This current final report analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 17 priority commitments selected from the 162 commitments made by the leaders at Beijing Summit on 23 June 2022. The report covers actions taken by the BRICS members to implement those commitments between 23 June 2022 and 13 January 2022. The BRICS Research Group relies on publicly available information, documentation and media reports for its assessments. To ensure accuracy, comprehensiveness and integrity, we encourage comments from stakeholders. Indeed, scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available. All feedback remains anonymous. Responsibility for the contents of this report lies exclusively with the authors and analysts of the BRICS Research Group.

The final report will be released on the eve of the summit hosted by South Africa.

John Kirton and Marina Larionova  
Co-directors, BRICS Research Group

## Introduction and Summary

The 2022 BRICS Beijing Interim Compliance Report, prepared by the BRICS Research Group (based at the University of Toronto and the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration [RANEPA]), analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 18 priority commitments drawn from the total 162 commitments made by the leaders at the Beijing Summit which was held virtually on 23 June 2022.

## Methodology and Scoring System

This report draws on the methodology developed by the G7 Research Group, which has been monitoring G7 compliance since 1996 and adapted for monitoring G20 performance since 2008.<sup>1</sup> The use of this time-tested methodology provides for cross-institutional, cross-member and cross-issue consistency and thus allows compatibility and comparability of the compliance performance by different summit institutions and establishes a foundation for evidence-based assessment of the effectiveness of these institutions.<sup>2</sup>

The methodology uses a scale from -1 (0%) to +1 (100%), where +1 (50%) indicates full compliance with the stated commitment, -1 indicates a failure to comply or action taken that is directly opposite to the stated goal of the commitment, and 0 indicates partial compliance or work in progress, such as initiatives that have been launched but are not yet near completion and whose final results can therefore not be assessed.<sup>3</sup> Each member receives a score of -1, 0 or +1 for each commitment.

## The Breakdown of Commitments

At the Beijing Summit in 2022, the BRICS leaders focused on seven pillars: strengthening and reforming global governance, working in solidarity to combat COVID-19, safeguarding peace and security, promoting economic recovery, expediting implementation of the 20230 agenda for sustainable development, deepening people-to-people exchanges and institutional development. The theme was “Foster High-quality BRICS Partnership, Usher in a New Era for Global Development.” The topics discussed included a brighter shared future for the international community based on mutually beneficial cooperation; the COVID-19 pandemic and disease prevention; peace, security and counter-terrorism cooperation; sustainable development and innovative means to achieve it. BRICS leaders also acknowledged the need to strengthen and reform the multilateral system.

## Selection of Commitments

For each compliance cycle (that is, the period between summits), the research team selects commitments that reflect the breadth of the BRICS agenda and the priorities of the summit’s host, while balancing the selection to allow for comparison with past and future summits.<sup>4</sup> The selection also takes into account the breakdown of issue areas and the proportion of commitments in each one (see Table 1). The primary criteria for selecting a priority commitment for assessment are the comprehensiveness and relevance to the summit, the BRICS and the world. Selected commitments must meet secondary criteria such as measurability and ability to comply within a year. Tertiary criteria include significance, as identified by relevant stakeholders in the host country and scientific teams. Of

---

<sup>1</sup> The Compliance Coding Manual is available at <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/evaluations/index.html#method>.

<sup>2</sup> Informal summitry institutions are defined as international institutions with limited membership, relatively low bureaucracy and reliance on open, flexible and voluntary approaches. Regular meetings of the heads of states and governments who engage on a wide range of international, regional and domestic politics stand at the pinnacle of such international arrangements, which involve many actors operating according to established procedures on two levels: domestic and international. Commitments contained in the collectively agreed documents are not legally binding but their implementation is stimulated by peer pressure. Among such bodies engaged in global and regional governance are G7, G20, BRICS, the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation forum and others.

<sup>3</sup> The formula to convert a score into a percentage is  $P=50 \times (S+1)$ , where P is the percentage and S is the score.

<sup>4</sup> Guidelines for choosing priority commitments, as well as other applicable considerations, are available in the Compliance Coding Manual.

the 75 commitments made at the 2022 Beijing Summit, the BRICS Research Group selected 10 priority commitments for its compliance assessment (see Table 2).

### **Compliance Scores**

Compliance for the 2022 Beijing Summit Interim report is +0.16 (58%) (see Table 3).

By country, China and South Africa earned the highest compliance score at +0.28 (64%). India followed with a score of +0.22 (61%) and Brazil earned +0.06 (53%). Russia received the lowest score of -0.11 (44%) (see Table 4).

By issue, five commitments achieved 100% compliance: on universal health coverage, information and communications technologies and the digital economy, development and recovery in labour and employment, the macroeconomic commitment on standardization, and the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development. The commitment on international financial institutions reform earned the next highest score, with +0.60 (80%), followed by the commitment on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships, with +0.40 (70%). Intergovernmental organization reform and international taxation were the next best performing commitments with a score of +0.20 (60%), closely followed by the trade commitment on supply chains interconnectivity with 0 (50%). The remaining commitments achieved less than 50% (see Table 5).

**Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments Across Issue Areas, 2009–2022**

Issue Area	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Energy	5	9	1	2					6	2	2	3		2
Finance		3	1			6	6	5	9	5	1			2
Climate change		1	6	3	1	1	1	1	3		3	1	3	2
Macroeconomic policy		1	5	1	5	7	6	4	4	3	1	2	2	5
Trade	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7	21	18	8	2	3	12
International co-operation	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7	21	18	8	8	7	10
Socioeconomic	1	1	3	2		7	5	2		2				
Development	1	5	1	3	10	4	4	2	11	6	2	3	4	21
Natural disasters	1	1	1											1
Food and agriculture	3		1	1		1	17		5	3		2	1	3
ICT and digital economy			2			1	17	3	12	3	2	3	4	15
Science and education	1	1	1		2	5							1	4
Health			1	1		1	6	2	6	1		4	5	14
Human rights			1		1	2	5		2		1		3	5
Accountability			1											
Regional security	1		1	4	8	6	6	4	12	7	4	7	1	8
Terrorism			1	1	2	2	1	4	7	3	1	2	7	4
Culture		1				3	1	2	3			1		3
Sport		1												
IFI reform	1	2	1	2	9	8	3	2	5	2	2	1	1	1
Non-proliferation					1			1	2		1		2	7
Crime and corruption						4	10	3	8	6	10	3	7	7
Environment						1	1	1	3	3	3		2	1
Tourism							1			1				
International taxation										4	5	1		2
Space												1		
Inter-BRICS cooperation												1		
Intergovernmental organization reform													4	19
Peace and security													1	6
Good governance														4
Labour and employment														3
Infrastructure														1
Total	15	31	38	32	47	68	130	45	125	73	49	45	58	162

Notes: ICT = information and communication technologies; IFI = international financial institution.

**Table 2: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Priority Commitments**

	Issue Area	Commitment
1	Development: Infrastructure Investment and PPPs	We [welcome the exchange and sharing of good practices and experiences, and] encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and PPPs [public-private partnerships].
2	Development: Economic Recovery and Sustainable Development in Africa	We support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.
3	Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	We will engage constructively to pursue the necessary WTO [World Trade Organization] reform to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and LDCs [least developed countries].
4	ICT and Digital Economy: E-Commerce Consumer Protection	We also agree to promote consumer protection in e-commerce by advancing the implementation of the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.
5	Health: COVID-19	[We stress the need to continue to strengthen the cooperation on] ... research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of COVID-19 virus.
6	Health: Infectious Disease	We support and emphasize the urgent need for the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the WHO's [World Health Organization's] Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network.
7	International Taxation	We commit to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.
8	International Financial Institutions Reform: IMF Reform	We reaffirm our commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF [International Monetary Fund] at its center.
9	Crime and Corruption	While respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, we are committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.
10	Terrorism	We are committed to combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.
11	Regional Security: Afghanistan	We emphasize the need for all sides to encourage the Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation
12	ICT and Digital Economy: Open ICT Environment	We reaffirm our commitment to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT [information and communications technologies]-environment, [underscored the importance of enhancing common understandings and intensifying cooperation in the use of ICT and Internet.]



13	Health: Universal Health Coverage	[The BRICS countries will strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the fields of] ... Universal Health Coverage
14	Sustainable Development	We reaffirm our commitment to the implementation of the 2030 Agenda in all its three dimensions – economic, social and environmental – in a balanced and integrated manner.
15	Macroeconomics	We agree to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization and make full use of standards to advance sustainable development
16	Trade	We encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows
17	Labour and Employment: Development and Recovery	We reiterate the commitments to promote employment for sustainable development, including to develop skills to ensure resilient recovery
18	Climate Change	We express our support to] ... promote COP27 [27th Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change] to prioritize implementation and highlight the reinforcement of adaptation and delivery and enhancement of developed countries' commitments to provide financial support and technology transfer to developing countries

**Table 3: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Interim Compliance Scores**

	Issue	Brazil	Russia	India	China	South Africa	Average	
1	Development: Infrastructure Investment and PPPs	0	0	0	+1	+1	+0.40	70%
2	Development: Economic Recovery and Sustainable Development in Africa	-1	-1	0	0	0	-0.40	30%
3	Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	0	-1	+1	0	+1	+0.20	60%
4	Digital Economy: E-Commerce Consumer Protection	-1	-1	0	0	-1	-0.60	20%
5	Health: COVID-19	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1.00	0%
6	Health: Infectious Diseases	0	0	0	0	0	0	50%
7	International Taxation	0	0	+1	0	0	+0.20	60%
8	International Financial Institutions Reform: IMF Reform	0	0	+1	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
9	Crime and Corruption: Anti-Corruption Law Enforcement	0	-1	-1	-1	0	-0.60	20%
10	Terrorism: Cross-border Movement, Terrorist Financing and Safe Havens	-1	0	-1	0	+1	-0.20	40%
11	Regional Security: Afghanistan	0	0	0	0	-1	-0.20	40%
12	ICT and Digital Economy: Open ICT Environment	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
13	Health: Universal Health Coverage	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
14	Sustainable Development: 2030 Agenda Implementation	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
15	Macroeconomics: Standardization in Sustainable Development	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
16	Trade: Interconnectivity of Supply Chains	0	0	0	0	0	0	50%
17	Labour and Employment: Development and Recovery	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
18	Climate Change: Supporting Implementation	0	-1	-1	0	-1	-0.60	20%
	Average Interim Compliance	+0.06	-0.06	+0.22	+0.28	+0.28	+0.16	58%
		53%	47%	61%	64%	64%		

Note: ICT = information and communications technologies; IMF = International Monetary Fund; PPP = public-private partnerships; WTO = World Trade Organization.

**Table 4: BRICS Compliance Scores, 2019–2022**

	2022 Beijing		2021 Delhi		2020 Moscow				2019 Brasilia			
	Interim		Final		Final		Interim		Final		Interim	
China	+0.28	64%	+0.85	93%	+0.41	71%	+0.41	71%	+0.50	75%	40%	70%
South Africa	+0.28	64%	+0.35	68%	+0.24	62%	+0.18	59%	+0.20	60%	0%	50%
India	+0.22	61%	+0.60	80%	+0.65	82%	+0.35	68%	+0.60	80%	20%	60%
Brazil	+0.06	53%	+0.50	75%	+0.41	71%	+0.29	65%	+0.40	70%	-30%	35%
Russia	-0.06	47%	+0.65	83%	+0.47	74%	+0.24	62%	+0.50	75%	30%	65%
Average	+0.13	56%	+0.53	76%	+0.44	72%	+0.26	63%	+0.44	72%	12%	56%

**Table 5: 2022 BRICS Beijing Summit Interim Compliance Scores by Commitment**

1	Health: Universal Health Coverage	+1.00	100%
	ICT and Digital Economy: Open ICT Environment		
	Labour and Employment: Development and Recovery		
	Macroeconomics: Standardization in Sustainable Development		
	Sustainable Development: 2030 Agenda Implementation		
6	International Financial Institutions Reform: IMF Reform	+0.60	80%
7	Development: Infrastructure Investment and PPPs	+0.40	70%
8	Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	+0.20	60%
	International Taxation		
10	Health: Infectious Diseases	0	50%
	Trade: Interconnectivity of Supply Chains		
12	Regional Security: Afghanistan	-0.20	40%
	Terrorism: Cross-border Movement, Terrorist Financing and Safe Havens		
14	Development: Economic Recovery and Sustainable Development in Africa	-0.40	30%
15	Climate Change: Supporting Implementation	-0.60	20%
	Crime and Corruption: Anti-Corruption Law Enforcement		
	Digital Economy: E-Commerce Consumer Protection		
18	Health: COVID-19	-1.00	0%

## 1. Development: Infrastructure Investment and PPPs

“We [welcome the exchange and sharing of good practices and experiences, and] encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and PPPs [public-private partnerships].”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average		+0.40 (70%)	

### Background

Development is a central subject area of BRICS governance. At their first summit in 2009, the BRIC discussed development in the context of the voice and representation of developing economies in international financial institutions, as well as the Doha Development Agenda. In addition, the BRIC discussed the impact of the financial crisis on the poorest developing countries and urged the international community to provide liquid financial resources for these countries. Furthermore, the BRIC discussed the concept of sustainable development, stating that it should be “a major vector in the change of paradigm of economic development.”

At the 2010 Brasilia Summit, the BRIC emphasized that “developing countries have the potential to play an even larger and active role as engines of economic growth and prosperity.” In addition, BRIC members discussed multilateral development banks, the voice and representation of developing countries in international institutions, the Doha development round, the UN’s Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), sustainable development, and development assistance.

At the 2011 Sanya Summit, the BRICS again discussed the MDGs, sustainable development, and the Doha Development Round. At this summit, the BRICS also discussed development in the context of infrastructure development in Africa. Specifically, they stated their support for “infrastructure development in Africa and its industrialization within the framework of the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD).”

At the 2012 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS continued to discuss issues like development financing, the Doha round, trade and development, the MDGs, sustainable development, and development in Africa. Leaders also discussed the possibility of setting up a new Development Bank for mobilizing resources for infrastructure and sustainable development.

At the 2013 Durban Summit, the development partnership with Africa was the main theme. Specifically, the BRICS discussed NEPAD and industrialization in Africa, in addition to traditional topics such as multilateral development banks (MDBs), the Doha Round, trade and development, and sustainable development. On infrastructure, the BRICS agreed on establishing the New Development Bank (NDB) for mobilizing resources for infrastructure development.

At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the BRICS turned their attention to development in South America and the new post-2015 development agenda, in addition to discussing traditional topics such as sustainable development, trade and development, and the Doha Agenda. The BRICS also announced the signing of the Agreement establishing the NDB with the purpose of mobilizing resources for infrastructure and sustainable development.

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the BRICS agreed to intensify cooperation with the NDB. The leaders reiterated that “the NDB shall serve as a powerful instrument for financing infrastructure investment and sustainable development projects in the BRICS and other developing countries and emerging market economies.” In addition, the leaders discussed traditional issues such as trade and development, development financing, sustainable development, the post-2015 development agenda, and industrial development. The leaders also welcomed BRICS initiatives in promoting connectivity and infrastructure development.

At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS continued to discuss issues including sustainable development, development assistance, MDBs, the Doha Round, and the Sustainable Development Goals. Specifically on infrastructure, the BRICS highlighted the importance of public and private investments in infrastructure, including connectivity, to ensure sustained long-term growth.

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS focused on the NDB, innovation-driven development, and sustainable development. They also agreed to further promote infrastructure cooperation.

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS again turned their attention to development in Africa. Specifically, they emphasized the importance of infrastructure development in Africa, noted the infrastructure financing deficit, and stated that infrastructure, investment and international development assistance projects are the bedrock for sustainable development.

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS returned to traditional topics such as sustainable development, development assistance, the NDB, and trade and development. On infrastructure, the leaders discussed financing for infrastructure, as well as promoting and facilitating investments in infrastructure.

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS focused on infrastructure investment projects and public-private partnerships (PPPs). The BRICS took note of the progress made by the BRICS Taskforce on PPP and Infrastructure and agreed to mobilize resources for infrastructure and sustainable development.

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS recognized the importance of strengthening infrastructure and information-sharing to identify investment opportunities and leverage private sector resources. BRICS members also welcomed the “Technical Report on Social Infrastructure Financing and the Use of Digital Technologies” prepared by the BRICS Taskforce on PPP and Infrastructure. In addition, they agreed to strengthen engagement with the NDB on infrastructure.

Finally, at the most recent 2022 Beijing Summit, the BRICS leaders again recognized the key role that infrastructure investment plays in facilitating sustainable development. They reaffirmed that PPPs are an effective approach to leveraging the private sector to address infrastructure gaps.

### **Commitment Features**

In the context of discussions on the key role of infrastructure investment in facilitating sustainable development, the BRICS committed to “encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and PPPs.” This commitment has two aspects: to encourage cooperation on 1. Infrastructure investment generally; and 2. PPPs.

To “encourage” means to urge, to spur on, or to give help or patronage to something. “Cooperation” refers to acts of joint or common effort. In this context, to encourage further cooperation means to support or spur joint actions of two or more BRICS members or between a BRICS member and another country. Thus, actions that BRICS members take domestically within their own countries do not count towards compliance, as cooperation with another country is a foundational requirement.

“Infrastructure investment” refers to financial investments in any kind of infrastructure project. As the BRICS leaders noted, the lack of adequate financing for infrastructure continues to be a binding

constraint on growth in BRICS economies and other developing countries. As noted in the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, there are several ways of encouraging infrastructure investment between BRICS countries:

- improve significantly the investment climate and business environment including by stimulating competition and ensuring predictability and transparency of investment measures on a voluntary basis;
- stimulate interaction and cooperation between BRICS national investment agencies, to promote, attract and facilitate investment;
- support innovative and technological projects in primary areas of collaboration;
- raise awareness about existing intra-BRICS investment opportunities;
- enhance knowledge sharing among the BRICS members on improving business environment, including through the development of instruments aimed at facilitation of investments on a voluntary basis in order to improve their positions in international ease of doing business rankings;
- encourage cooperation of BRICS on technical assistance and capacity building provided to developing countries and especially least-developed countries among them on investment promotion and facilitation;
- attract investment in infrastructure development projects leveraging the various instruments of the New Development Bank;
- modernize industrial, transport, logistical, and other infrastructure in BRICS to facilitate infrastructural development;
- encourage development of infrastructure inter-operability to enhance air, land and sea connectivity among countries;
- create and develop safe, resilient, balanced and dynamic transnational transport and logistics systems, as well as infrastructure for information and communications technologies in urban and rural areas of the BRICS countries;
- ensure efficient city transport systems and freight movement systems, dynamic traffic control systems, and passenger-friendly services;
- foster digitalization and application of advanced technologies in the sphere of transport (including traffic management systems and road and air safety systems);
- exchange information on measures and programs concerning transport and logistics policy, adoption of relevant long-term cooperation programs;
- pursue the sustainable development of urban and rural areas, with the use of innovative technologies and exchange experience in this regard;
- promote development of smart cities among the BRICS countries;

PPPs are collaborative projects between a government agency and a private-sector company, or multiple stakeholders from the private and/or public sectors. PPPs allow large-scale government projects to be completed with private funding. Therefore, PPPs offer an innovative way to bridge the infrastructure investment gap as they can help improve the efficiency and quality of public goods and services. As the BRICS noted in its publication Good Practices on Public-Private Partnership

Frameworks, the PPP model is not only a tool for financing but “also a new concept of public governance and a measure of supply-side structural reform.” In addition, a government’s emphasis on promoting PPPs in infrastructure is intended to improve the socialization of public service and help improve market orientation as well as the legal and governance systems of BRICS countries. As noted in this BRICS publication, there are several distinct ways in which a country can encourage PPPs.

1. Providing political support: the government of BRICS countries can provide political support to PPPs by publicly promoting PPPs, enhancing stakeholder confidence to participate in PPPs, and creating a stable and long-term PPP market.
2. Developing a regulatory framework: BRICS members can design a well-defined regulatory framework, including a set of supporting policies, to support PPPs. Examples of areas of regulation include PPP operation, Value for Money evaluation, fiscal affordability assessments, procurement, contract management, and clarification of the roles and responsibilities of stakeholders.
3. Developing institutional arrangements: BRICS member countries can develop institutional arrangements to support PPPs by building up PPP institutions (that fulfil the obligations of policy research, project management, capacity building, etc.), and conducting training programs.
4. Providing incentive measures: BRICS member countries can provide policies that incentivize the private sector to engage in PPPs. For example, the government could set up a PPP preparation or financing fund, issue tax incentives, and provide project demonstration strategies.
5. Project Management: for example, the BRICS member can develop a unified project operation process, manage PPP expenditure, carry out Value for Money evaluation, regulate PPP procurement, promote information disclosure throughout the lifecycle of PPP projects, or establish an overall internet-based PPP information management platform.

The examples above are a non-comprehensive list of specific ways in which a BRICS member can support further cooperation on PPPs. Taking specific actions that fall into any of the aforementioned categories or themes counts towards compliance. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member needs to take actions under both infrastructure investment generally and PPPs specifically, and has to take at least four distinct actions in total. For partial compliance, the BRICS member has to take at least three separate actions, either under infrastructure investment generally or PPPs specifically, or some of both. Taking any less than three distinct actions in total would result in a score of lack of compliance. Lastly, less than strong actions, such as verbal declarations of support can only count towards partial compliance. Thus strong efforts at encouragement, as outlined above are required for full compliance.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS member did not sufficiently encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment or public-private partnerships (PPPs).
0	The BRICS member somewhat encouraged further cooperation on infrastructure investment OR PPPs OR some of both resulting in at least three actions.
+1	The BRICS member strongly encouraged further cooperation on infrastructure investment AND PPPs resulting in four or more actions.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Wang*

**Brazil: 0**

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships (PPPs).

On 21 July 2022, the Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs convened with seventeen counterparts to sign the Joint Declaration on Cooperation in Global Supply Chains.<sup>5</sup> The declaration aims to promote diversification and security through investments in critical infrastructure.

On 21 July 2022, the Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs participated in the Summit of Heads of State of the Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) and Associated States.<sup>6</sup> The meeting established a Working Group on Physical Infrastructure to facilitate the transnational development of infrastructure across MERCOSUR member states.

On 24 August 2022, Minister of Foreign Affairs Carlos Alberto Franco França hosted the eighth meeting of the Brazil-India Joint Commission with Minister of Foreign Affairs of India Subrahmanyam Jaishankar.<sup>7</sup> Minister Jaishankar praised Brazil's foreign investment in Indian information technology, machinery and energy. Additionally, Minister França thanked India's investments in Brazilian oil, mining, engineering and tractor manufacturing. Both parties expressed interest in future joint investment projects.

On 24 October 2022, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil met with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Ecuador, emphasizing the mutual importance to strengthen “regional value chains and contribute to regional integration and development.”<sup>8</sup> Both parties praised cooperative infrastructure investment thus far through the mechanisms of the Inter-American Development Bank.

On 18 November 2022, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil announced its upcoming participation in the second Investment Attraction Workshop.<sup>9</sup> The initiative aims to train diplomats in charge of Trade and Investment Promotion Sectors to foster international investment in the Brazilian economy.

On 6 December 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro participated in the 61st MERCOSUR Summit and contributed to the release of a joint communiqué.<sup>10</sup> The communiqué speaks to the importance of implementing regional infrastructure projects across MERCOSUR members and associated states.

---

<sup>5</sup> Joint Declaration on Cooperation in Global Supply Chains, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 21 July 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 25 October 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/declaracao-conjunta-sobre-cooperacao-em-cadeias-de-suprimentos-globais](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/declaracao-conjunta-sobre-cooperacao-em-cadeias-de-suprimentos-globais)

<sup>6</sup> MERCOSUR – Documents adopted on the occasion of the LX Summit of Heads of State of MERCOSUR and Associated States and the LX Ordinary Meeting of the Common Market Council, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 21 July 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 25 October 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/mercosul-2013-documentos-adotados-por-ocasio-da-lx-cupula-de-chefes-de-estado-do-mercosul-e-estados-associados-e-da-lx-reuniao-ordinaria-do-conselho-mercado-comum](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/mercosul-2013-documentos-adotados-por-ocasio-da-lx-cupula-de-chefes-de-estado-do-mercosul-e-estados-associados-e-da-lx-reuniao-ordinaria-do-conselho-mercado-comum)

<sup>7</sup> Joint press release on the 8th Meeting of the Brazil-India Joint Commission – Brasília, 24 August 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 24 August 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 25 October 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-a-imprensa-sobre-a-8a-reuniao-da-comissao-mista-brasil-india-2013-brasilia-24-de-agosto-de-2022](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-a-imprensa-sobre-a-8a-reuniao-da-comissao-mista-brasil-india-2013-brasilia-24-de-agosto-de-2022)

<sup>8</sup> Joint Communiqué between the Ministers of Foreign Affairs of Ecuador and Brazil, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 24 October 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 28 October 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-entre-os-ministros-das-relacoes-exteriores-do-equador-e-do-brasil](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-entre-os-ministros-das-relacoes-exteriores-do-equador-e-do-brasil)

<sup>9</sup> II MRE-BNDES-ApexBrasil-B3 Investment Attraction Workshop, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 18 November 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 3 January 2023. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/ii-workshop-de-atracao-de-investimentos-mre-bndes-apexbrasil-b3-1](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/ii-workshop-de-atracao-de-investimentos-mre-bndes-apexbrasil-b3-1)

<sup>10</sup> Joint Communiqué of the Presidents of the Member States of MERCOSUR and Associated States, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 6 December 2022. Access Date: 3 January 2023. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-dos-presidentes-dos-estados-partes-do-mercosul-e-estados-associados-2](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-dos-presidentes-dos-estados-partes-do-mercosul-e-estados-associados-2)



On 5 January 2023, the Government of Brazil announced the reincorporation of Brazil into the Community of Latin American and Caribbean States (CELAC).<sup>11</sup> Participation in CELAC fosters international cooperation on a range of issues, including the digital transformation and integration infrastructure.

Brazil has taken steps to encourage cooperation in infrastructure investment through meetings with established partners. However, Brazil did not take actions to promote PPPs.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Timothy Tennant*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships (PPPs).

On 4 July 2022, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin held joint talks with Prime Minister of Kazakhstan Alikhan Smailov at the Innoprom International Industrial Trade Fair.<sup>12</sup> Prime Minister Mushustin celebrated Kazakhstan's first participation in the fair and encouraged the immediate development of "production chains in industry, engineering, energy, peaceful nuclear power, transport infrastructure, and the digital economy."

On 6 July 2022, Deputy Chair of the Russian Government Yuri Borisov met with Foreign Minister of Venezuela Carlos Faria to review current industrial investment partnerships and arrange future joint projects in additional sectors, including transportation.<sup>13</sup>

On 7 July 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Alexander Novak hosted a meeting with Governor of the Central Bank of Iran Ali Salehabadi to discuss cooperative financial and industrial projects between the two countries, including investment in transport infrastructure.<sup>14</sup>

On 22 August 2022, Minister of Industry and Trade Denis Manturov met with Iran's Minister of Industry, Mines and Trade Fatemi Amin to discuss new partnerships for infrastructure cooperation in sectors including auto manufacturing, shipbuilding, and railway.<sup>15</sup> Minister Manturov expressed that "the current situation in the world is not only creating new challenges but also opening new windows of opportunity for deepening partnerships."

On 24 August 2022, the Ministry of Industry and Trade and the Chinese Ministry of Industry and Information Technology convened for the seventh Sub-Committee on Industry Cooperation. Minister Manturov declared that agreements were made "to promote mutually beneficial projects in priority areas."<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> Return of Brazil to CELAC, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia) 5 January 2023. Access Date: 7 January 2023. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/retorno-do-brasil-a-celac](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/retorno-do-brasil-a-celac)

<sup>12</sup> Russian-Kazakhstani talks, The Russian Government (Moscow) 4 July 2020. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/45911/>

<sup>13</sup> Yuri Borisov meets with Venezuelan Foreign Minister Carlos Faria, The Russian Government (Moscow) 6 July 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/45938/>

<sup>14</sup> Alexander Novak meets with Ali Salehabadi, Governor of the Central Bank of the Islamic Republic of Iran, The Russian Government (Moscow) 7 July 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/45957/>

<sup>15</sup> Denis Manturov and Iran's Minister of Industry, Mines and Trade Fatemi Amin discuss the prospects for industrial cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 22 August 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46304/>

<sup>16</sup> Meeting of Russian-Chinese sub-commission on industry cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 24 August 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46337/>

On 25 August 2022, Prime Minister Mishustin met with Chair of the Cabinet of Ministers of Kyrgyzstan Akyzbek Japarov at the Eurasian Intergovernmental Council meeting.<sup>17</sup> Prime Minister Mishustin reiterated the two countries' cooperation through the Russian-Kyrgyz Development Fund and expressed his intention to initiate new joint cooperation projects in Kyrgyzstan, including development of transport infrastructure.

On 26 August 2022, Deputy Prime Minister for Eurasian Integration Alexei Overchuk concluded the Eurasian Intergovernmental Council meeting.<sup>18</sup> Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk praised a selection of achieved intergovernmental commitments, including the development of transport and logistics infrastructure within the Eurasian Economic Union.

On 1 September 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk hosted the Minister of Investment and Foreign Trade of Uzbekistan Jamshid Khodjaev.<sup>19</sup> The two parties made progress in developing international transport connections in Central Asia and “emphasized that their bilateral partnership is of a strategic character.”

On 16 September 2022, Co-Chair of the Russian-Cuban Commission for Trade, Economic, Scientific and Technological Cooperation Dmitry Chernyshenko convened with Cuban Ambassador to Russia Julio Antonio Garmendia Pena.<sup>20</sup> Mr. Chernyshenko affirmed Russia's support for increasing “the effectiveness of joint projects in transport and energy.”<sup>21</sup>

On 19 September 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk attended the Russian-Armenian Interregional Forum.<sup>22</sup> He praised Russia's involvement in the Center for the Strategic Development of the Republic of Armenia and promoted Russian-Armenian cooperation in energy, transport and logistics. He further expressed his interest in strengthening partnerships between Russian and Armenian small and medium-sized enterprises to encourage Armenia's economic growth.

On 22 September 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk met with Minister of Trade and Integration of Kazakhstan Serik Zhumangarin to expand “cooperation in developing transport and logistic links, industry, the fuel and energy sector and environmental conservation.”<sup>23</sup>

On 6 October 2022, the Russian Government hosted the second Caspian Economic Forum alongside regional partners to stimulate large transnational investment projects, including transport

---

<sup>17</sup> Mikhail Mishustin's meeting with Akyzbek Japarov, Chairman of the Cabinet of Ministers and Head of the Presidential Administration of the Kyrgyz Republic, The Russian Government (Moscow) 25 August 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46345/>

<sup>18</sup> Alexei Overchuk's comment following Eurasian Intergovernmental Council meeting, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 August 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46356/>

<sup>19</sup> Alexei Overchuk's meeting with Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Investment and Foreign Trade of Uzbekistan Jamshid Khodjayev, The Russian Government (Moscow) 1 September 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46416/>

<sup>20</sup> Dmitry Chernyshenko holds working meeting with Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the Republic of Cuba, The Russian Government (Moscow) 16 September 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46536/>

<sup>21</sup> Dmitry Chernyshenko holds working meeting with Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the Republic of Cuba, The Russian Government (Moscow) 16 September 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46536/>

<sup>22</sup> Alexei Overchuk spoke at the 9th Russian-Armenian Interregional Forum, The Russian Government (Moscow) 19 September 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46553/>

<sup>23</sup> Alexei Overchuk's meeting with Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Trade and Integration of Kazakhstan Serik Zhumangarin, The Russian Government (Moscow) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46584/>

infrastructure.<sup>24</sup> Prime Minister Mishustin emphasized that collaborative projects would “boost the development of regional markets, build up trade and industrial collaboration.”

On 21 October 2022, Prime Minister Mishustin spoke at the meeting of the Eurasian Intergovernmental Council, stressing the importance of expanding the integration of the internal market.<sup>25</sup> He affirmed that “modern infrastructure is also necessary on our common continent for the development of the Greater Eurasian Partnership.”

On 28 October 2022, the Government of Russia convened with its neighboring counterparts at the meeting of the Council of Independent States.<sup>26</sup> Head of the Federal Service for the Oversight of Consumer Protection and Welfare Anna Popova addressed the meeting’s success in ensuring infrastructure investment cooperation among the member states, particularly concerning pandemic preparedness.

On 16 November 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk met with President Serdar Berdimuhamedov of Turkmenistan.<sup>27</sup> They discussed further cooperation and partnerships in transport logistics, industry, infrastructure development, as well as the fuel and energy sectors.

On 24 November 2022, First Deputy Prime Minister Andrei Belousov convened the ninth meeting of the Russian-Chinese Intergovernmental Commission on Investment Cooperation.<sup>28</sup> The Commission discussed bilateral cooperation on infrastructure investment, with specific focus on transport, infrastructure and green and high technologies.

On 28 November 2022, Minister Manturov met with Deputy Prime Minister of Uzbekistan Jamshid Khodjayev to discuss the development of a Comprehensive Programme of Joint Actions.<sup>29</sup> The Programme would expand industrial cooperation between the two countries over the long term in sectors such as transport, railways and energy.

On 10 January 2023, Deputy Prime Minister Overchuk convened with First Deputy Minister of Kazakhstan Roman Sklyar to expand industrial cooperation between the two countries.<sup>30</sup> The meeting resulted in a bilateral protocol to deepen cooperation in the railway freight industry, as well as launch Russian investment in Kazakhstan’s infrastructure and energy projects.

Russia has taken action to encourage cooperation on infrastructure investment through frequent negotiations with its partners. However, Russia did not take actions to promote PPPs.

---

<sup>24</sup> The 2nd Caspian Economic Forum, The Russian Government (Moscow) 6 October 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46720/>

<sup>25</sup> Expanded meeting of Eurasian Intergovernmental Council, The Russian Government (Moscow) 21 October 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46850/>

<sup>26</sup> Expanded meeting of the CIS Council of Heads of Government, The Russian Government (Moscow) 28 October 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46913/>

<sup>27</sup> Meeting of co-chairs of the Russian-Turkmen Intergovernmental Commission on Economic Cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 16 November 2022. Access Date: 2 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47052/>

<sup>28</sup> Press release on the results of the ninth meeting of the Russian-Chinese Intergovernmental Commission on Investment Cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 24 November 2022. Access Date: 2 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47130/>

<sup>29</sup> Denis Manturov’s meeting with Deputy Prime Minister, Minister of Investment and Foreign Trade of Uzbekistan Jamshid Khodjayev, The Russian Government (Moscow) 28 November 2022. Access Date: 3 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47166/>

<sup>30</sup> Alexei Overchuk and First Deputy Prime Minister of Kazakhstan Roman Sklyar discuss bilateral trade and economic cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 10 January 2023. Access Date: 11 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47515/>

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Timothy Tennant*

### **India: 0**

India has partially complied with its commitment to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships (PPPs).

On 26 June 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with President of Argentina Alberto Fernandez to review the progress made in implementing the bilateral Strategic Partnership established in 2019.<sup>31</sup> Both leaders agreed to enhance their engagement in the trade and investment, pharmaceutical, renewable energy, electric mobility, agriculture and food security and climate action sectors.

On 27 June 2022, Prime Minister Modi met with the President of South Africa Cyril Ramaphosa to review the progress made in implementing the bilateral Strategic Programme of Cooperation established in 2019.<sup>32</sup> Both leaders agreed to increase engagement in the skill development, digital financial inclusion and trade and investment sectors.

India has held several bilateral talks supporting increased engagement in developmental projects with the President of Argentina, the President of South Africa. However, it has not taken action to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and PPPs.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Pantéa Jamshidi Nouri*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with its commitment to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships (PPPs).

On 28 June 2022, Vice-Premier Hu Chunhua called on China and France to further strengthen trade and investment cooperation on major projects.<sup>33</sup>

On 28 June 2022, Director General of Algeria's National Highway Agency Mohamed Khaldi praised the highway project undertaken by China State Construction Engineering Corporation.<sup>34</sup> He noted that the project has facilitated further development in the country.

On 11 July 2022, State Councillor and Foreign Minister Wang Yi met with Indonesian President Joko Widodo to discuss new growth points and deepen further cooperation.<sup>35</sup> Minister Wang stated that the two countries would cooperate further to ensure the completion and opening of the Jakarta-Bandung High-Speed Railway.

---

<sup>31</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of Argentina on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Prime Minister's Office (New Delhi) 26 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1837190>

<sup>32</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Prime Minister's Office (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1837378>

<sup>33</sup> Vice-premier eyes China-France trade, investment cooperation, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 28 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/huchunhua/202206/28/content\\_WS62baa2f7c6d02e533532cdc4.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/huchunhua/202206/28/content_WS62baa2f7c6d02e533532cdc4.html)

<sup>34</sup> Chinese-built highway in Algeria praised for high quality, local contribution, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 29 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202206/29/content\\_WS62bba322c6d02e533532ce61.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202206/29/content_WS62bba322c6d02e533532ce61.html)

<sup>35</sup> Indonesia, China agree to foster new growth points, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 12 July 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. [http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202207/12/content\\_WS62ccc4f7c6d02e533532d984.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202207/12/content_WS62ccc4f7c6d02e533532d984.html)

On 12 July 2022, Minister Wang met with Malaysia's King Sultan Abdullah Sultan Ahmad Shah to speak about Chinese investment in Malaysia.<sup>36</sup> Both sides agreed to expedite practical cooperation and encourage the advancement of key Belt and Road projects.

On 4 August 2022, Minister Wang presented four proposals at the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) Plus Three foreign ministers meeting with the intention of promoting East Asian cooperation.<sup>37</sup> This included a proposal to set up a special donation under the framework of the ASEAN-China Cooperation Fund which would help ASEAN countries develop and grow.

On 7 August 2022, Minister Wang met with Bangladeshi Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina to discuss further bilateral cooperation.<sup>38</sup> Minister Wang noted that China is willing to enhance the Belt and Road Initiative with Bangladesh's Vision 2041, deepening cooperation in infrastructure, digital economy and more areas.

On 8-11 September 2022, the China International Fair for Investment & Trade was held in Xiamen.<sup>39</sup> The fair aimed to focus on establishing further investment cooperation between various countries and companies.

On 16 September, President Xi Jinping held a trilateral meeting with Russian President Vladimir Putin and Mongolian President Ukhnaa Khurelsukh where they agreed to move forward major projects in infrastructure and energy supply.<sup>40</sup> This will include the construction of the Power of Siberia-2 Pipeline in 2024 which will provide transit from Russia to China through Mongolia.

On 26 September 2022, a road project constructed by a Chinese company was commissioned in Cape Coast, Ghana.<sup>41</sup> The project was part of an agreement between Sinohydro Corporation Limited and the Ghanaian government, while being strongly supported by the Chinese government.

On 21 October 2022, a Chinese government official announced that Hunan province would build a number of trade and logistics support platforms to enhance China-Africa business cooperation over the next five years.<sup>42</sup> This plan includes transactions with public sectors from South Africa, Nigeria, Ghana, Kenya, Botswana and Zambia. This will include a trade center for non-resource products, a China-Africa cross-border renminbi settlement center, and a logistics hub to broaden channels for African products to enter China.

---

<sup>36</sup> China, Malaysia agree to expand, strengthen key BRI projects, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 13 July 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202207/13/content\\_WS62cdfc36c6d02e533532da43.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202207/13/content_WS62cdfc36c6d02e533532da43.html)

<sup>37</sup> FM puts forward 4 proposals on promoting East Asia cooperation, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 5 August 2022.

Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202208/05/content\\_WS62ec6de0c6d02e533532ee47.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202208/05/content_WS62ec6de0c6d02e533532ee47.html)

<sup>38</sup> China, Bangladesh pledge to strengthen partnership, deepen cooperation, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 8 August 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202208/08/content\\_WS62f05ccdc6d02e533532ef37.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202208/08/content_WS62f05ccdc6d02e533532ef37.html)

<sup>39</sup> China to hold international fair to promote investment cooperation, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 30 August 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202208/30/content\\_WS630e0d99c6d0a757729df6f7.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202208/30/content_WS630e0d99c6d0a757729df6f7.html)

<sup>40</sup> China-Russia-Mongolia summit secures infrastructure and energy connectivity, enhances regional trust, The Global Times (Beijing), 16 September 2022. Access Date: 27 October 2022. <https://www.globaltimes.cn/page/202209/1275413.shtml>

<sup>41</sup> Chinese-built road project commissioned in Ghana, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing), 27 September 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202209/27/content\\_WS6332ae99c6d0a757729e0934.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202209/27/content_WS6332ae99c6d0a757729e0934.html)

<sup>42</sup> Hunan-Africa trade eyes solid boost with major plans for logistics backing, China Daily (Beijing), 21 October 2022. Access Date: 27 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202210/21/content\\_WS6351da0bc6d0a757729e17a6.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202210/21/content_WS6351da0bc6d0a757729e17a6.html)

On 24 November 2022, China participated in the ninth meeting of the Russian-Chinese Intergovernmental Commission on Investment Cooperation.<sup>43</sup> The Commission discussed bilateral cooperation on infrastructure investment, with specific focus on transport, infrastructure and green and high technologies.

China took actions towards encouraging further cooperation in infrastructure investment as well as PPPs, having taken four or more actions.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Kunal Dadlani*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to encourage further cooperation on infrastructure investment and public-private partnerships (PPPs).

On 27 June 2022, at the South Africa Trade and Investment Seminar in Porto, Portugal, the Deputy Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Alvin Botes, praised Portuguese investment in the country and encouraged further investment.<sup>44</sup>

On 28 June 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa met with Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi and discussed issues related to trade, investment, defence and food security.<sup>45</sup>

On 8 July 2022, the Deputy Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition, Fikile Majola, encouraged Swiss investors to increase levels of investment in South Africa.<sup>46</sup> Deputy Minister Majola highlighted the growing potential of the country and noted the growing increase in European investment in the country.

On 22 July 2022, President Ramaphosa held talks with Côte d'Ivoire President Alassane Ouattara that included discussions on further trade and investment cooperation.<sup>47</sup> President Ramaphosa noted that the portfolio of investments in Côte d'Ivoire by South African companies has increased, specifically in the telecommunications, broadcasting, banking, and insurance sectors. The President stated that there was further opportunity for investment by both state-owned and privately owned companies in Côte d'Ivoire, especially in the agricultural, mining, oil and gas, and transport sectors, but also as the country prepares to host the 34th African Cup of Nations in 2023.

---

<sup>43</sup> Press release on the results of the ninth meeting of the Russian-Chinese Intergovernmental Commission on Investment Cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 24 November 2022. Access Date: 2 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47130/>

<sup>44</sup> Deputy Minister Alvin Botes: South Africa Trade and Investment Seminar, South African Government (Pretoria), 27 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/keynote-address-deputy-minister-international-relations-and-cooperation-mr-alvin-botes>

<sup>45</sup> PM Narendra Modi meets South African, Indonesian Leaders, Economic Times (Mumbai), 28 June 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/india/pm-narendra-modi-meets-s-african-indonesian-leaders/articleshow/92499607.cms>

<sup>46</sup> Deputy Minister Majola urges Swiss investors to increase levels of investment in SA, Department of Trade, Industry and Competition (Pretoria), 8 July 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <http://www.thedtic.gov.za/deputy-minister-majola-urges-swiss-investors-to-increase-levels-of-investment-in-sa/>

<sup>47</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa: Official Talks during State Visit by Côte d'Ivoire President Alassane Ouattara, South African Government (Pretoria), 22 July 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-official-talks-during-state-visit-c%3%B4te-d%E2%80%99ivoire-president>

On 4 August 2022, President Ramaphosa spoke with Mokgweetsi Masisi, President of Botswana, to discuss trade and investment between the two countries.<sup>48</sup> President Ramaphosa was encouraged by the stronger investment ties between the two countries and emphasized the benefits of further investments between both countries.

On 8 August 2022, Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Naledi Pandor addressed Secretary of State of the United States, Antony Blinken, to discuss the importance of American investment in South Africa, but also the growth of South African investments in the US.<sup>49</sup>

On 15 October 2022, President Ramaphosa spoke after the closing session of the Saudi Arabi-South Africa Investment Conference and a state visit from the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia to discuss economic opportunities.<sup>50</sup> President Ramaphosa stated that the flow of investment between both countries is promising, and particularly focused on how South African firms can assist in the development of mining infrastructure in Saudi Arabia.

On 27 October 2022, President Ramaphosa met with Pedro Sánchez, President of Spain, and held in-depth discussions on deepening trade and investment between the two countries.<sup>51</sup> This also included meeting and engaging with various business leaders from both countries.

South Africa took actions towards encouraging further cooperation in infrastructure investment as well as PPPs, having taken four or more actions.

Thus, South Africa receives a +1.

*Analyst: Kunal Dadlani*

---

<sup>48</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa: South Africa-Botswana Business Roundtable, South African Government (Pretoria), 4 August 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-south-africa-botswana-business-roundtable-4-aug-2022-0000>

<sup>49</sup> Minister Naledi Pandor: South Africa-United States Strategic Dialogue, South African Government (Pretoria), 8 August 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/opening-remarks-minister-international-relations-and-cooperation-dr-naledi-pandor-0>

<sup>50</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa: Saudi Arabia-South Africa Investment Conference, South African Government (Pretoria), 15 October 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-saudi-arabia-south-africa-investment-conference-15-oct-2022-0000>

<sup>51</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa: Media briefing on official visit by President Pedro Sánchez of Spain, South African Government (Pretoria), 27 October 2022. Access Date: 29 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-media-briefing-remarks-official-visit-spain-27-oct-2022-0000>

## 2. Development: Economic Recovery and Sustainable Development in Africa

“We support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia	-1		
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average		-0.40 (30%)	

### Background

Since South Africa became a member of BRICS, issues relating to Africa have gained increased importance in BRICS summitry. BRICS leaders’ commitments and references to the African continent have addressed important development challenges and armed conflicts. BRICS leaders have also expressed support for the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD) and the New Development Bank’s activities concerning Africa. BRICS communiqués have also expressed support for the African Union (AU), its Agenda 2063, and various areas of socioeconomic development, notably infrastructure.

On 14 April 2011, at the Sanya Summit, BRICS leaders pledged to continue their cooperation in the United Nations Security Council on Libya, support infrastructure development in Africa, and foster industrialization under NEPAD. BRICS leaders reaffirmed the Millennium Development Goals, highlighting that the “eradication of extreme poverty and hunger is a moral, social, political and economic imperative of humankind and one of the greatest global challenges facing the world today, particularly in Least Developed Countries in Africa and elsewhere.”

At the 4th BRICS summit in New Delhi in 2012, BRICS leaders discussed issues in the Middle East and North Africa and sub-Saharan Africa. The leaders stated: “we will take our cooperation forward to support their efforts to accelerate the diversification and modernisation of their economies. This will be through infrastructure development, knowledge exchange and support for increased access to technology, enhanced capacity building, and investment in human capital, including within the framework of the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD) ... We express our commitment to the alleviation of the humanitarian crisis that still affects millions of people in the Horn of Africa and support international efforts to this end.”

On 27 March 2013, the Durban Summit was hosted by South Africa under the theme of “BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialization.” BRICS leaders pledged to hold a retreat with African leaders under the theme “Unlocking Africa’s potential: BRICS and Africa Cooperation on Infrastructure” to “discuss how to strengthen cooperation between the BRICS countries and the African Continent.” BRICS leaders reaffirmed their support for sustainable infrastructure development in Africa and committed to assisting African countries in achieving the Millennium Development Goals.

The 2014 Fortaleza Summit concluded with several statements on the geopolitical situations in West and Central Africa, as well as a reiteration of the commitment “made during the BRICS Leaders-Africa Retreat at the 5th BRICS Summit to foster and develop BRICS-Africa cooperation in support of the



socioeconomic development of Africa, particularly with regard to infrastructure development and industrialization.”

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders highlighted several devastating conflicts across the African continent and the Ebola crisis. The first mention of Africa by BRICS foreign ministers also took place in the context of the Ebola outbreak in 2014. On 25 September 2014, BRICS foreign ministers met in New York, where they discussed conflict hotspots in Africa, expressed support for the interim African Capacity for Immediate Response to Crisis and the African Stand-by Force, and called on the UN and World Health Organization to assist affected countries in addressing the Ebola outbreak.

On 22 May 2015, BRICS deputy foreign ministers met to discuss the situation in the Middle East, West Africa, and North Africa. The ministers discussed internal crises in Africa, expressed readiness to provide relevant humanitarian aid and other support to Yemen, and reiterated their support for the resumption of Palestinian-Israeli negotiations. In September 2015 and 2016, the ministers of foreign affairs met and discussed African efforts to resolve conflicts on the continent.

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders welcomed the AU Agenda 2063 and pledged to “continue to engage in joint endeavors to advance Africa’s solidarity, unity and strength through support measures for regional integration and sustainable development.”

The 2017 Xiamen Declaration further underscored the BRICS members’ commitment to the African continent. The leaders “reaffirm[ed] [their] commitment to strengthen cooperation with Africa.” This declaration follows the expressed intention to “help the continent to address illegal wildlife trade, promote employment, food security, infrastructure development and industrialization including through connectivity and developmental initiatives and projects.”

The 2018 Johannesburg Summit was held under the theme “BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution.” BRICS leaders welcomed outreach to African countries and reaffirmed their commitment to sustainable infrastructure development in Africa.

In 2019, the BRICS Summit was held on 14 November in Brasilia. BRICS leaders recognized the efforts of the AU and the progress in Sudan, highlighting that “increased trade can help with global growth, but the demand deficit in the global economy requires additional sources of growth, which could include infrastructure investment, including in digital infrastructure, skills development, particularly for young people, sustainable investment, investment in local basic services, and outward investment to areas of high potential growth, including on the African continent.”

On 17 November 2020, BRICS leaders adopted the Moscow Declaration, in which they articulated “support for AU Agenda 2063 and the efforts towards intensified integration and development in the continent, including through implementing the Agreement on the African Continental Free Trade Area (AfCFTA).” They noted progress on infrastructure development within the framework of NEPAD and the “importance of promoting investments with a view to supporting industrial development, creating jobs, ensuring food security, fighting poverty and providing for Africa’s sustainable development.” Most importantly (in the context of the present commitment tracked in this compliance report), the BRICS leaders reaffirmed their readiness to cooperate with Africa “with the aim to strengthening its potential to address the intertwined health, economic, and social effects of COVID-19,” acknowledging the impact of the pandemic.

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, BRICS leaders made a brief reference to Africa in the context of making “global governance more inclusive, representative and participatory to facilitate greater and more meaningful participation of developing and least developed countries.” They also touch on continuing conflicts and violence on the continent and in the Middle East and North Africa.

At the most recent Beijing Summit, BRICS leaders reiterated the commitments made at the 2021 New Delhi Summit and previous commitments relating to AU's Agenda 2063 and AfCFTA. In addition, they called on "international agencies and philanthropists to procure vaccines and boosters from manufacturers in developing countries, including in Africa, to ensure that the manufacturing capabilities being developed are retained." BRICS leaders also commended the "efforts of African countries, the AU and sub-regional organizations to address regional challenges, including maintaining peace and security, post conflict reconstruction as well as development efforts, and call for continued support by the international community to them." Lastly, they emphasized "issues including industrialization, infrastructure development, food security, health-care, and tackling climate change for the sustainable development of Africa."

### **Commitment Features**

The present commitment reads: "we support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era." This commitment has two components to its pledge to support Africa in the post-pandemic era: 1) economic recovery and 2) sustainable development.

To define the key words in this commitment, "support" is a high binding commitment verb understood as "the action or act of providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity." This infers that BRICS leaders intended for new, concrete efforts to be made. For example, concrete actions can take the form of actively participating in or hosting multilateral meetings on the subject, providing financial or technical assistance to stakeholders in Africa, or contributing to the work of African governments, regional institutions, or international organizations. In other words, verbal affirmations or political statements that reaffirm the objectives of this commitment are insufficient to constitute full compliance.

In the first part of this commitment, the term "economic recovery" should be understood in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic. An effective economic recovery includes getting economies and livelihoods back to pre-pandemic levels, as well as "building back better." According to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, "building back better" demands triggering "investment and behavioural changes that will reduce the likelihood of future shocks and increase society's resilience," including "a focus on well-being and inclusiveness, ... alignment with long-term emission reduction goals, factoring in resilience to climate impacts, slowing biodiversity loss and increasing circularity of supply chains." In the context of this commitment, BRICS members should demonstrate support for Africa's response to the long-term and intersectional health, socioeconomic, and environmental effects of the pandemic.

In the second part of this commitment, "sustainable development" is defined as "development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs." In articulating a global sustainable development agenda, the United Nations General Assembly adopted 17 Sustainable Development Goals in 2015, otherwise known as Agenda 2030. In this context, the BRICS member should support Africa in achieving progress with regards to the Sustainable Development Goals within the compliance cycle, keeping in mind the detrimental effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on sustainable development in Africa.

To score full compliance, the BRICS member must demonstrate support for Africa in attaining both economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era. Both dimensions of the commitment must be addressed by strong policy actions, and actions contributing to compliance must make explicit reference to the context of the pandemic i.e. not all development efforts are included in the parameters of the commitment.

With respect to the threshold for partial compliance, a BRICS member receives a score of 0 if it only satisfies one of the two pillars of the commitment. Similarly, partial compliance is also attributed to a

BRICS member that demonstrates less than strong compliance across both components of the commitment, or strong action in one of the components and less than strong action in the other.

A BRICS member will receive a score of  $-1$  for non-compliance in the case of inaction (i.e. lack of support therein), less than strong action in one of the two areas or actions contrary to the goal of Africa attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member DOES NOT support Africa in attaining economic recovery OR sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.
0	The BRICS member strongly supports Africa in attaining economic recovery OR sustainable development in the post-pandemic era OR some of both.
+1	The BRICS member strongly supports Africa in attaining economic recovery AND sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou*

### Brazil: $-1$

Brazil has failed to fully comply with its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

On 16 August 2022, the Brazilian Cooperation Agency of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs participated in the 13th Brazilian Cotton Congress.<sup>52</sup> The Agency presented the main results of technical cooperation between Brazil and other countries in the cotton sector over the past ten years. In Africa, technical experiments were carried out in areas with a total surface of about 300 hectares, supporting the sustainable development of Africa's agriculture sector.

On 11 October 2022, Deputy Permanent Representative to the United Nations João Genésio de Almeida Filho reiterated Brazil's commitment to inclusive growth, sustainable development, and peace and security in Africa at an open debate of the United Nations Security Council on cooperation between the UN and the African Union.<sup>53</sup>

On 31 October 2022, Minister of Health Luiz Henrique Mandetta participated in the opening of the first milk bank in Angola, which will contribute to reduced neonatal mortality.<sup>54</sup> Brazil also announced a new project for the prevention and control of cancer and a second project on comprehensive care for sickle cell anemia patients by providing training for Angolan professionals.

<sup>52</sup> ABC participa da 13ª edição do Congresso Brasileiro do Algodão [ABC participates in the 13th edition of the Brazilian Cotton Congress]. Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasília) 30 August 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 October 2021. <https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias-abc/13a-edicao-do-congresso-brasileiro-do-algodao-xiii-cba-presenca-da-abc-m>

<sup>53</sup> Declaração do Representante Permanente Alternativo, Embaixador João Genésio de Almeida Filho, durante reunião do Conselho de Segurança sobre a Cooperação entre as Nações Unidas e organizações regionais e subregionais: a União Africana (texto em inglês) - 11 de outubro de 2022 [Statement by the Alternate Permanent Representative, Ambassador João Genésio de Almeida Filho, during a Security Council meeting on Cooperation between the United Nations and regional and subregional organizations: the African Union (text in English) - October 11, 2022]. Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasília) 21 October 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 October 2021. <https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/Brasil-CSNU/discursos-artigos-e-entrevistas/discursos/janeiro-2022/outubro-2022/declaracao-do-representante-permanente-alterno-embaixador-joao-genesio-de-almeida-filho-durante-reuniao-do-conselho-de-seguranca-sobre-a-cooperacao-entre-as-nacoes-unidas-e-organizacoes-regionais-e-subregionais-a-uniao-africana-texto-em-ingles-11-de>

<sup>54</sup> Brasil exporta experiência com bancos de leite para Angola [Brazil exports experience with milk banks to Angola]. Brazil Services and Information (Brasília) 31 October 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 31 October 2022. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/saude-e-vigilancia-sanitaria/2019/11/brasil-exporta-experiencia-com-bancos-de-leite-para-angola>

Brazil has adopted several measures to support sustainable development in Africa, especially in the agriculture and health sectors. However, Brazil has not demonstrated support for Africa's post-pandemic economic recovery, and its actions relating to sustainable development are also not specific to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Yiran (Sarah) Xie*

### **Russia: -1**

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

On 15 September 2022, Russia committed to exporting 30 million tonnes of grain and 20 million tonnes of fertilizer to Asian and African countries to address the global food crisis.<sup>55</sup>

On 24 October 2022, at the second international youth forum "Russia-Africa: What's Next," Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov delivered a video address reaffirming Russia's commitment to developing stronger ties and cooperating with Africa.<sup>56</sup>

On 4 November 2022, Russia committed to send supplies of grain to poor African countries free of charge. The decision was announced after the telephone conversation of President of Russia Vladimir Putin and President of Turkey Tayyip Erdogan. Both countries participate in the Black Sea export deal that provides security guarantees for cargo ships going through the Black Sea amid the Russia-Ukraine armed conflict.<sup>57</sup>

On 11 November 2022, President Vladimir Putin had a telephone call with President of the Central African Republic Faustin-Archange Touadera. The parties addressed issues relating to bilateral cooperation in the fuel and energy sector. Also the leaders agreed to continue interaction in strengthening the Central Africa's sovereignty, stability and security. President Touadera expressed his intention to take part in the Russia-Africa summit to be held in the summer of 2023.<sup>58</sup>

On 9 March 2023, President Putin held a telephone call with President of Egypt Abdel Fattah el-Sisi. The leaders discussed issues relating to bilateral cooperation including delivery of agricultural products from Russia to Egypt and implementation of joint energy and industrial projects. Also the two leaders agreed to continue coordinating actions to settle current crises in the Middle East and North Africa.<sup>59</sup>

On 20 March 2023, President Putin spoke at the international parliamentary conference "Russia – Africa in a Multipolar World". President Putin touched upon issues relating to the country's cooperation with African states. When speaking about the situation in public health sphere, President Putin expressed commitment to "step up cooperation on such important topics for Africa as medicine

---

<sup>55</sup> Briefing by Foreign Ministry Spokeswoman Maria Zakharova, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 15 September 2022. Access Date: 14 November 2022. [https://www.mid.ru/en/press\\_service/spokesman/briefings/1829920/](https://www.mid.ru/en/press_service/spokesman/briefings/1829920/)

<sup>56</sup> Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov's video address at the second international youth forum, "Russia-Africa: What's next?", The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 October 2022. Access Date: 14 November 2022. [https://www.mid.ru/en/press\\_service/minister\\_speeches/1834826/](https://www.mid.ru/en/press_service/minister_speeches/1834826/)

<sup>57</sup> Erdogan, Putin agreed to send Russian grains to poor African countries for free, Reuters (Istanbul) 4 November 2022. Access Date: 17 February 2023. <https://www.reuters.com/world/erdogan-says-agreed-with-putin-grains-should-go-poor-african-countries-free-2022-11-04/>

<sup>58</sup> Vladimir Putin had a telephone conversation with President of the Central African Republic Faustin-Archange Touadera, Kremlin (Moscow) 11 November 2022. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/69823>

<sup>59</sup> Telephone conversation with President of Egypt Abdel Fattah el-Sisi, Kremlin (Moscow) 9 March 2023. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/70659>

and healthcare, as well as ensuring biological and epidemiological safety” and also to “transfer fully equipped mobile labs and modern medicines to Africans, and to train specialists”.<sup>60</sup>

Russia has not made any verbal commitments or taken any concrete actions to support Africa’s post-pandemic recovery.

Thus, Russia receives a score of  $-1$ .<sup>61</sup>

*Analyst: Glen Hung*

### **India: 0**

India has partially complied with its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

On 27 June 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with President of South Africa Cyril Ramaphosa on the margins of the G7 summit in Elmau, Germany. They welcomed the World Trade Organization agreement that supports the production of COVID-19 vaccines in developing countries.<sup>62</sup>

On 19 July 2022, Minister for Commerce and Industry Piyush Goyal stated that India plans on utilizing its knowledge in healthcare and education to deepen ties with Africa in the post-COVID world. India also plans on strengthening its partnership with Africa in areas including solar power, defense trade, healthcare, and digital infrastructure.<sup>63</sup>

India has verbally expressed its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic area. However, it has failed to take concrete actions to support Africa.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Sarah Nasir*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

On 18 August 2022, Foreign Minister Wang Yi chaired the Coordinators’ Meeting on the Implementation of Follow-up Actions of the 8th Ministerial Conference of the Forum on China–

---

<sup>60</sup> International Parliamentary Conference Russia – Africa in a Multipolar World, Kremlin (Moscow) 20 March 2023. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/70745>

<sup>61</sup> This non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: [https://www.mid.ru/en/press\\_service/announcements/](https://www.mid.ru/en/press_service/announcements/), <http://government.ru/en/news/>, <https://africacdc.org> and <https://www.oecd.org>

<sup>62</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G7 Summit, Prime Ministers Office (Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1837378>

<sup>63</sup> India plans to strengthen its partnership with Africa in the areas of Solar Power, defence trade & military exchanges, physical and digital infra and healthcare & pharma: Shri Piyush Goyal, Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 19 July 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1842662>

Africa Cooperation (FOCAC).<sup>64</sup> Minister Wang expressed the need for China and Africa to work together to navigate the complex situation that the COVID-19 pandemic had created.<sup>65</sup>

On 27 October 2022, the Mission of China to the African Union (AU) held a webinar reflecting on 20 years of cooperation. China expressed that it would align its development strategies with countries in Africa, and particularly with the AU Agenda 2063. China and Africa exchanged experiences on governance, specifically pertaining to poverty reduction, agriculture, entrepreneurship, and development. China reiterated its commitment to stand in solidarity with Africa while it fights against Ebola and COVID-19.<sup>66</sup>

China has established forums to exchange views on Africa's post-pandemic development and economic recovery. It has reaffirmed its commitment to sustainable development in Africa. However, it has only engaged in verbal commitments as opposed to concrete policy actions to realize its pledges.

On 9 January 2023, Foreign Minister Qin Gang embarked on an official visit to five African countries.<sup>67</sup> Throughout his visit, he repeatedly reaffirmed the value of China-Africa cooperation in responding to and recovering from the pandemic.<sup>68</sup>

China has established forums to exchange views on Africa's post-pandemic development and economic recovery. It has reaffirmed its commitment to sustainable development in Africa. However, it has only engaged in verbal commitments as opposed to concrete policy actions to realize its pledges.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Glen Hung*

### **South Africa: 0**

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to support Africa in attaining economic recovery and sustainable development in the post-pandemic era.

On 10 October 2022, South Africa issued an addition ZAR240 to the existing ZAR480 of Child Support Grant to improve the life for children living in poverty.<sup>69</sup>

---

<sup>64</sup> Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Wang Wenbin's Regular Press Conference on August 19, 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 19 August 2022. Access Date: 14 November 2022.

[https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/xwfw\\_665399/s2510\\_665401/202208/t20220819\\_10746251.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/xwfw_665399/s2510_665401/202208/t20220819_10746251.html)

<sup>65</sup> Wang Yi Talks about the Three-point Consensus Reached at the Coordinators' Meeting on the Implementation of the Follow-up Actions of the Eighth Ministerial Conference of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 18 August 2022. Access Date: 14 November 2022.

[https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/wjdt\\_665385/wshd\\_665389/202208/t20220821\\_10747251.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjdt_665385/wshd_665389/202208/t20220821_10747251.html)

<sup>66</sup> Mission of China to the African Union Held a Webinar on China and AU at 20th Years: A New Starting Point through Shared Future, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 28 October 2022. Access Date: 14 November 2022.

[https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/wjb\\_663304/zwjg\\_665342/zwbj\\_665378/202210/t20221028\\_10793690.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjb_663304/zwjg_665342/zwbj_665378/202210/t20221028_10793690.html)

<sup>67</sup> New Chinese foreign minister heads to Africa for first trip, Al Jazeera English (Doha) 9 January 2023. Access Date: 12 January 2023. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/1/9/chinas-new-foreign-minister-heads-to-africa-for-first-trip>

<sup>68</sup> Remarks by Foreign Minister Qin Gang at the Completion Ceremony for the China-aided Project of the Africa Center for Disease Control and Prevention Headquarters, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China. 11 January 2023. Access Date: 18 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202301/t20230111\\_11005847.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202301/t20230111_11005847.html)

<sup>69</sup> Minister Lindiwe Zulu: Social Development Month, update on the Child Support Grant Top-Up and COVID-19 SRD. South Africa Government (Cape Town) 10 October 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022.

<https://www.gov.za/speeches/speech-minister-social-development-ms-lindiwe-zulu-mp-10-oct-2022-0000>

On 11 October 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa announced its plan to advanced well-being and development of all citizens as well as the development priorities of developing countries including the South African Development Community and the African continent at a multilateral level.<sup>70</sup>

On 14 October 2022, on the 52nd Airlines Association of Southern Africa Annual General Assembly, Minister of Tourism Lindiwe Sisulu announced a Tourism Recovery Plan to navigate the sector's way out of the pandemic.<sup>71</sup> This Recovery Plan includes support for the protection of core tourism infrastructure and stimulating demand through various campaign and marketing programs.

On 27 October 2022, in the meeting with President Pedro Sánchez of Spain, President Ramaphosa shared South Africa's implementation of an Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, intending to drive economic growth and job creation.<sup>72</sup> He also claimed that continue to engage on Spain's Focus Africa 2023 plan and the specific cooperation programs to foster peace, stability and sustainable development across the continent of Africa.

South Africa has adopted recovery policies that help restore a range of public sectors such as tourism and child support. However, it has not yet adopted any policies on sustainable development besides verbal commitment.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Yiran (Sarah) Xie*

---

<sup>70</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa prepares to advance South Africa's growth and development, and international cooperation. South Africa Government (Cape Town) 11 October 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-prepares-advance-south-africa%E2%80%99s-growth-and-development-and>

<sup>71</sup> Minister Lindiwe Sisulu: 52nd Airlines Association of Southern Africa (AASA) Annual General Assembly. South Africa Government (Cape Town) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-lindiwe-sisulu-52nd-airlines-association-southern-africa-aasa-annual-general>

<sup>72</sup> President Cyril Ramaphosa: Official talks with President Pedro Sánchez. South Africa Government (Cape Town) 27 October 2022. Access Date: 25 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-official-talks-president-pedro-s%C3%A1nchez%C2%A0official-visit-27-oct-2022>

### 3. Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform

“We will engage constructively to pursue the necessary WTO [World Trade Organization] reform to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and LDCs [least developed countries].”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

#### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia	-1		
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa			+1
Average		+0.20 (60%)	

#### Background

At the 2022 BRICS summit hosted by China, the BRICS leaders reiterated their commitment to reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO). The renewal of this commitment reflects a continuation of the pledge to support the multilateral trading system and the central role of the WTO therein.

The WTO was first referenced by BRICS summitry in the context of Russia’s accession to the Organization in 2012. Adopted at the 4th BRICS summit on 29 March 2012, the Delhi Declaration acknowledged Russia’s accession as a step towards a more representative WTO system. Concurrently, BRICS leaders also emphasized the importance of upholding a rule-based multilateral trading system and rolling back protectionism.

Since 2012, BRICS members have repeatedly reaffirmed their support for an “open, inclusive, non-discriminatory, transparent and rule-based multilateral trading system,” including at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the 2015 Ufa Summit, the 2016 Goa Summit, and the 2017 Xiamen Summit. At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders called on all WTO Members to avoid unilateral and protectionist measures, and recognized the importance of WTO reform “to ensure the effectiveness and relevance of the organization and its capacity to better address current and future challenges.”

In the context of WTO reform, BRICS summitry has taken a specific interest in the role and representation of developing economies and least developed countries (LDCs) in the multilateral trading system. BRICS leaders advocated for the representation of developing economies at the WTO in the 2018 Johannesburg Declaration, the 2019 Brasilia Declaration, and the 2020 Moscow Declaration.

In the 2020 BRICS Moscow Declaration, and in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, the leaders acknowledged the crucial role of international trade in the global economic recovery. They committed to “support the necessary reform of the WTO with a view to making it more resilient and effective in confronting global economic challenges and to improve its key functions in the interest of all WTO Members.” They further recognized that “the reform must, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO, and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs, recognizing that the majority of WTO members are developing countries.” This commitment was reiterated virtually at the 2021 New Delhi Summit.



### **Commitment Features**

The commitment reads: “we will engage constructively to pursue the necessary WTO reform to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and LDCs.”

The word “will” is a high binding commitment verb. “Engage” is defined as the act of becoming involved or having contact with a certain subject. The scope of this term encapsulates actions such as verbal affirmations and political statements, economic and financial commitments, institutional or administrative support that is conducive to WTO reform, as per the term “engage constructively.”

To define the key concepts in this commitment, “WTO reform” refers to efforts to modernize and improve the WTO and its core functions in order to address challenges that are putting the multilateral trading system and the WTO’s role under stress. The scope of WTO reform covers a broad range of topics, including safeguarding and strengthening the WTO’s dispute settlement mechanism, reinvigorating its negotiating function, strengthening its Secretariat and more. “WTO reform” is qualified by the adjective “necessary,” which is defined as “needed in order to achieve a particular result.”

The commitment consists of four pillars of WTO reform:

1. to build an open world economy that supports trade and development,
2. to preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance,
3. to preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for supporting inclusive development, and
4. to preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and LDCs.

The first part of the commitment espouses the importance of “an open world economy that supports trade and development.” According to the World Bank, “countries that are open to international trade tend to grow faster, innovate, improve productivity and provide higher income and more opportunities to their people.” The commitment sets a specific emphasis on supporting “trade and development,” a nexus realized by provisions for special and differential treatment (S&DT) for developing countries across the WTO’s agreements. For example, actions that contribute to this pillar of the commitment include further integration into global value chains, participation in market access negotiations, provision of technical assistance to low-income countries and LDCs for their participation in international trade (e.g. the Aid for Trade Initiative), and advancing the Doha Development Agenda.

The second part of the commitment recognizes that the WTO embodies the multilateral frameworks and global trade rules under which cross-border trade unfolds. The WTO is “the only global international organization dealing with the rules of trade between nations” and seeks to “ensure that trade flows as smoothly, predictably and freely as possible.” Actions that contribute to this pillar of the commitment include tabling proposals in the WTO’s ongoing negotiations (including Joint Statement Initiatives), reaffirming the WTO’s role as a negotiating forum, participating actively in the Trade Negotiations Committee, and other actions that contribute to the modernizing and extension of international trade rules under the Organization’s purview.

The third part of the commitment pertains to WTO’s role in supporting “inclusive development.” As an illustrative definition, “inclusive development” can be understood to mean “societal progress that incorporates the participatory empowerment of citizens and promotes human well-being related outcomes in accordance with sustainability of societal foundations (institutions and environment).” In the context of the WTO, this could refer to initiatives that support historically disadvantaged groups,

including the participation of developing economies, fragile and conflict-affected countries, women, marginalized workers, and micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) in trade, among others. To comply with this dimension of the commitment, the BRICS member should demonstrate leadership or support for progress in the WTO on the Organization’s work on inclusive trade.

The fourth part of the commitment articulates a specific focus on the rights and interests of WTO members, including developing countries and LDCs. To comply with this pillar, the BRICS member must make explicit reference to the standing of developing countries and LDCs in their engagements at the WTO. For example, the BRICS member can put forward proposals on S&DT provisions in ongoing WTO negotiations, engage in the work of the WTO Committee on Trade and Development, or contribute financially to technical assistance programs managed by the WTO Secretariat.

LDCs refers to a group of “low-income countries confronting severe structural impediments to sustainable development” that are “highly vulnerable to economic and environmental shocks and have low levels of human assets.” This designation of LDCs is made by the Committee for Development Policy Secretariat of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs at the United Nations.

In contrast, the term “developing countries” in the context of WTO membership is a self-declared status, rather than a designation made by a third-party such as the United Nations based on socio-economic metrics. WTO members announce their own “developed” or “developing” status. Developing countries are privy to S&DT, which can manifest in rights such as longer transition periods to implement WTO agreements, access to technical assistance and capacity-building, and eligibility for unilateral Generalized System of Preferences offered by several developed Members. S&DT provisions can be found across various WTO agreements and frameworks.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must demonstrate compliance with all four pillars of the commitment. Partial compliance, or a score of 0, would be assigned if a member engages with two or three of the four abovementioned pillars. A score of non-compliance, or -1, would be attributed to BRICS members that do not take any action relating to WTO reform, or only engage with one of the four pillars of the commitment within the compliance cycle. One policy action can contribute to more than one pillars of compliance. Lastly, this report takes into account depth of compliance, i.e. such actions as verbal reiterations of support would count towards partial rather than full compliance.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS Member engages constructively in none or one of the four pillars of the commitment.
0	The BRICS Member engages constructively in two or three of the four pillars of the commitment.
+1	The BRICS Member engages constructively to pursue the necessary WTO reform to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development AND promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and LDCs.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou*

**Brazil: 0**

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to engage constructively to pursue the necessary reform of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and least developed countries.

On 24 June 2022, Brazil submitted its application to accede to the WTO's plurilateral Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft.<sup>73</sup> As part of the application, Brazil proposed tariff commitments that would adhere to the WTO's standards laid out in the agreement.

On 21 September 2022, Minister of Foreign Affairs Carlos Alberto Franco França attended the 10<sup>th</sup> Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting of the IBSA (India, Brazil, and South Africa) Dialogue Forum. During the meeting, Ministers “agreed to make all efforts to reform and strengthen the multilateral trading system and make the WTO more effective and responsive to the needs of its developing country members.”<sup>74</sup>

On 22 September 2022, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met on the margins of the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>75</sup> Among other items, the ministers stressed the need to expand the scope of the waiver of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property and underscored the importance of technology transfer in line with the Ministerial Declaration on the WTO Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic and Preparedness for Future Pandemics. Additionally, the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core and emphasized the urgency of restoring a WTO dispute settlement system by 2024.

On 23 November 2022, the 8th review of Brazil's trade policy at the WTO was held in Geneva, Switzerland.<sup>76</sup> The meeting reviewed Brazil's economic performance from 2017 to 2021. On this occasion, Brazil reiterated the priority it attributes to the WTO as a pillar of the multilateral trading system and highlighted the importance of the organization and rules-based trade for sustainable development.

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to WTO reform. Brazil has joined other like-minded countries in reaffirming the importance of WTO reform, with a view to promoting the rights of developing members. Brazil has also contributed to the WTO's role in setting global trade rules and governance and contributing to an open world economy by initiating its accession to the Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft. However, Brazil has not demonstrated support for inclusive development.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Xiaolong (James) Wang*

### **Russia: -1**

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to engage constructively to pursue the necessary reform of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and

---

<sup>73</sup> Committee on Trade in Civil Aircraft - Communication from Brazil - Addendum, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 24 June 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/PLURI/TCA/19A1-01.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>74</sup> INDIA-BRAZIL-SOUTH AFRICA DIALOGUE FORUM 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting 21 September 2022, Brazil's governmental internet portal (Brasília) 28 September 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022.

<https://www.gov.br/funag/en/content-centers/news/india-brazil-south-africa-dialogue-forum-10th-ibsa-trilateral-ministerial-commission-meeting-21-september2022>

<sup>75</sup> Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations on the margins of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/brics0922.htm>

<sup>76</sup> Reunião da OMC discute política comercial adotada pelo Brasil de 2017 a 2021[WTO meeting discusses trade policy adopted by Brazil from 2017 to 2021], Ministry of Economy (Brasília) 28 November 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 9 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/produtividade-e-comercio-exterior/pt-br/assuntos/comercio-exterior/noticias/2022/novembro/reuniao-da-omc-discute-politica-comercial-adotada-pelo-brasil-de-2017-a-2021>

governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and least developed countries.

On 25 July 2022, during the WTO General Council meeting, Russia expressed the need to launch discussions on reforming the WTO's dispute settlement mechanism by 2024, emphasizing that the system should be effective, predictable and two-tiered.<sup>77</sup> Russia further stated that WTO members should make all possible efforts to ratify the Agreement on Fisheries Subsidies as soon as feasible. Russia also reiterated that WTO negotiations should be transparent, open and inclusive.

On 17 September 2022, as agreed upon in the Joint Statement of the Economic Ministers' Meeting at the Tenth East Asia Summit, Russia and other participants recognized the importance of WTO reform.<sup>78</sup> They committed to having discussions on restoring the dispute settlement system by 2024, and resolved to strengthen an inclusive and equitable multilateral trading system.

On 22 September 2022, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met on the margins of the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>79</sup> Among other items, the Ministers stressed the need to expand the scope of the waiver of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property (TRIPS) and underscored the importance of technology transfer in line with the Ministerial Declaration on the WTO Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic and Preparedness for Future Pandemics. Furthermore, the ministers reaffirmed their commitment to the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core, and emphasized the urgency of restoring a WTO dispute settlement system by 2024.

On 18-19 November 2022, the leaders of the Asia-Pacific Economic Forum (APEC) issued a concluding declaration presenting the main outcomes of high-level talks. The participants welcomed the successful conclusion of the 12th WTO Ministerial Conference (MC12) and agreed to facilitate "the early and effective implementation of the MC12 outcomes."<sup>80</sup> The parties committed to work together to achieve progress by the 13th WTO Ministerial Conference.<sup>81</sup>

On 20 December 2022, Russia was one of ten participants in the Joint Initiative on Services Domestic Regulation that did not submit an improved schedule of services commitments for certification under the WTO's General Agreement on Trade in Services.<sup>82</sup>

Through statements made at the General Council and in BRICS joint statements, Russia has made verbal affirmations with respect to two pillars of the commitment: the role of the WTO in setting global trade rules and promoting the rights of its members in referencing the possible extension of the TRIPS waiver and the need for technology transfer. However, these affirmations were not substantiated by concrete policy action. Furthermore, Russia was one of the few participants in the

---

<sup>77</sup> General Council Minutes of the Meeting, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 21 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/M200.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>78</sup> THE TENTH EAS ECONOMIC MINISTERS' MEETING – ASEAN Media Statement, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Siem Reap) 17 September 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN\\_Media\\_Statement\\_10th\\_EAS\\_Economic\\_Ministers\\_Meeting\\_17.09.2022\\_Cambodia.pdf](https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN_Media_Statement_10th_EAS_Economic_Ministers_Meeting_17.09.2022_Cambodia.pdf)

<sup>79</sup> Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations on the margins of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/brics0922.htm>

<sup>80</sup> 2022 Leaders' Declaration, Kremlin (Moscow) 19 November 2023. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <http://static.kremlin.ru/media/events/files/en/KsvZ0YBXEXclg4TavY1pyQ4SZAcPMGAt.pdf>

<sup>81</sup> 2022 Leaders' Declaration, Kremlin (Moscow) 19 November 2023. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <http://static.kremlin.ru/media/events/files/en/KsvZ0YBXEXclg4TavY1pyQ4SZAcPMGAt.pdf>

<sup>82</sup> New commitments for domestic regulation of services move step closer to entry into force, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 20 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/news22\\_e/jssdr\\_20dec22\\_e.htm](https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/jssdr_20dec22_e.htm)

Joint Initiative on Services Domestic Regulation not to submit a revised schedule, undermining and acting contrary to the commitment.

Thus, Russia receives a score of –1.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with its commitment to engage constructively to pursue the necessary reform of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 27 June 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with South African President Cyril Ramaphosa on the sidelines of the G7 summit.<sup>83</sup> They “welcomed the WTO agreement reached in June 2022 that supports the production of COVID-19 vaccines in developing countries,” recalling that they “had submitted the first proposal suggesting a waiver for all WTO members on the implementation of certain provisions of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property (TRIPS) in relation to the prevention, containment or treatment of COVID-19.”

On 6 July 2022, India and five other WTO members circulated an informal proposal and timeline on paragraph 8 of the Ministerial Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement during a TRIPS Council meeting at the WTO. The proposal asked WTO members to make a decision on whether to expand the TRIPS waiver by December 2022.<sup>84</sup>

On 7 July 2022, during an informal Heads of Delegation meeting, India delivered a statement commenting on the outcomes of 12th WTO ministerial conference. Among other comments, India called on members to work quickly to arrive at a common understanding on the scope of the e-commerce moratorium. Furthermore, India emphasized the need for appropriate and effective special and differentiated treatment (S&DT) in a future comprehensive agreement on fishery subsidies. It also emphasized the need for LDCs to be an integral part of the aforementioned negotiations. In addition, the government urged members to expedite the pending decision over whether to expand the scope of the TRIPS waiver. Among other things, India welcomed WTO reform debates in the General Council, and hoped to expedite work on the proposal on S&DT and the Permanent Solution to Public Stock Holding (PSH) proposal.<sup>85</sup> India concluded by providing suggestions on how to improve the logistics of facilitating negotiations for 13th ministerial conference.

On 22 July 2022, Minister of State for Commerce and Industry Anupriya Patel released a written statement outlining India’s position on the WTO Agreement on Fisheries Subsidies.<sup>86</sup> The statement specifically proposed that WTO members who have historically provided huge subsidies or engaged

---

<sup>83</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Indian Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35448/Meeting\\_of\\_Prime\\_Minister\\_with\\_President\\_of\\_South\\_Africa\\_on\\_the\\_sidelines\\_of\\_G7\\_Summit](https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35448/Meeting_of_Prime_Minister_with_President_of_South_Africa_on_the_sidelines_of_G7_Summit)

<sup>84</sup> Statements Delivered by India – General Council Meeting 25-26 July 2022, Permanent Mission of India to the WTO (Geneva) 26 July 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public\\_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf](https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf)

<sup>85</sup> India’s Statement at HoDs Meeting on 7th July 2022, Permanent Mission of India to the WTO (Geneva) 7 July 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public\\_files/assets/pdf/India%E2%80%99s%20Statement%20during%20HoDs%20Meeting%20held%20on%207th%20July%202022.pdf](https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/India%E2%80%99s%20Statement%20during%20HoDs%20Meeting%20held%20on%207th%20July%202022.pdf)

<sup>86</sup> The Agreement on Fisheries Subsidies (Agreement) at the WTO Ministerial meeting to prohibit subsidies from being provided for Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated (IUU) fishing and overfished stocks, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 22 July 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1843952>

in large-scale industrial fishing should take on deeper obligations with respect to prohibiting fisheries subsidies, based on the principles of polluter-pay and common but differentiated responsibilities.

On 26-27 July 2022, the Indian Ambassador and Permanent Representative to the WTO delivered several statements at the General Council. Among other comments, India stated that the inability of the WTO to find consensus on PSH was unfortunate and urged the Secretariat to reconvene the TRIPS Council in the summer. It also expressed its commitment to work towards the meaningful integration of LDCs in the multilateral trading system.<sup>87</sup> With regards to a proposed General Council decision on transparency notifications, India indicated its preference for a proposal that covered notifications from all WTO agreements, including TRIPS and the General Agreement on Trade and Services. Finally, India co-sponsored two agenda items, including one on WTO reform where India discussed at length transparency provisions in its previously tabled WTO reform paper, highlighted areas where developed countries are failing to meet their transparency obligations and asked the Secretariat to provide LDCs with capacity-building support to meet transparency obligations.

On 5 August 2022, Commerce Secretary B.V.R. Subrahmanyam emphasized the important role India is expected to play, and should play, in trade-related discussions on labour, gender and the environment.<sup>88</sup>

On 17 September 2022, as agreed upon in the Joint Statement of the Economic Ministers' Meeting at the Tenth East Asia Summit, India and other participants recognized the importance of WTO reform.<sup>89</sup> They committed to having discussions on restoring the dispute settlement system by 2024, and resolved to strengthen an inclusive and equitable multilateral trading system.

On 21 September 2022, the 10th India-Brazil-South Africa (IBSA) Trilateral Ministerial Commission meeting took place in New York.<sup>90</sup> Among other items, the Ministers reaffirmed the centrality of the open and inclusive multilateral trading system as embodied in the WTO. The Ministers also committed to restoring the dispute settlement mechanism by 2024 and emphasized that the reform should entail making the WTO more effective and responsive to the needs of LDCs.<sup>91</sup> Additionally, the ministers agreed to a Memorandum of Understanding for Cooperation on Traditional Medicine among India, Brazil and South Africa in order to facilitate trade in this field, and to consult the TRIPS Council on the extension of the TRIPS waiver to COVID-19 therapeutics and diagnostics.

On 22 September 2022, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met on the margins of the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>92</sup> Among other items, the ministers stressed the need to expand the scope of the TRIPS waiver and underscored the importance of technology transfer

---

<sup>87</sup> Statements Delivered by India – General Council Meeting 25-26 July 2022, Permanent Mission of India to the WTO (Geneva) 26 July 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public\\_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf](https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf)

<sup>88</sup> The Centre for Trade and Investment Law (CTIL) celebrated its 5th Anniversary and released the Fifth Anniversary issue of CTIL's Magazine, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 5 August 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseframePage.aspx?PRID=1848832>

<sup>89</sup> THE TENTH EAS ECONOMIC MINISTERS' MEETING – ASEAN Media Statement, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Siem Reap) 17 September 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN\\_Media\\_Statement\\_10th\\_EAS\\_Economic\\_Ministers\\_Meeting\\_17.09.2022\\_Cambodia.pdf](https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN_Media_Statement_10th_EAS_Economic_Ministers_Meeting_17.09.2022_Cambodia.pdf)

<sup>90</sup> 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting, Indian Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35752/10th\\_IBSA\\_Trilateral\\_Ministerial\\_Commission\\_Meeting](https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35752/10th_IBSA_Trilateral_Ministerial_Commission_Meeting)

<sup>91</sup> Joint Communiqué of the 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/ibsa0921.htm>

<sup>92</sup> Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations on the margins of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/brics0922.htm>

in line with the Ministerial Declaration on the WTO Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic and Preparedness for Future Pandemics. Additionally, the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core and emphasized the urgency of restoring a WTO dispute settlement system by 2024.

On 22 September 2022, during the G20 Trade, Investment, and Industry Ministerial Meeting, Minister of Commerce and Industry Piyush Goyal urged the G20 to commit to timely discussions on issues mandated by MC12, including WTO reform and expanding the scope of the TRIPS waiver.<sup>93</sup> He also noted that several issues required urgent attention, including permanent solutions to the e-commerce duties moratorium, public stockholding and fisheries subsidies negotiations.

On 7 October 2022, at a meeting of the General Council, India's Ambassador and Permanent Representative to the WTO Brajendra Navnit expressed opposition to an effort to discuss India's PSH programme and invocation of the "peace clause" in a group setting, as opposed to a bilateral format.<sup>94</sup>

On 6-7 October 2022, at a meeting of the General Council, India and South Africa co-sponsored an agenda item to create a plan to advance progress on debating the scope of the e-commerce moratorium.<sup>95</sup> India was also one of several co-sponsors of the agenda item on expanding the scope of the TRIPS Agreement, as was similarly the case in the previous WTO General Council meeting on 26 July 2022.

On 11 October 2022, during a session of the WTO Committee on Trade and Development discussing the future of the Aid for Trade initiative, India presented its experience in implementing Aid for Trade activities, specifically pointing to the Indian Technical and Economic Cooperation Programme, which has developed trade-related infrastructure in 66 countries.<sup>96</sup>

On 20 October 2022, India hosted two side events during the WTO's Trade and Environment week.<sup>97</sup> The events showcased India's work to foster trade in solar panels and a circular economy as co-founder of the International Solar Alliance.

On 21 October 2022, during a session of the WTO Committee on Trade and the Environment, India reported on its key environmental policies, answered questions on their compliance with WTO rules and opined on the trade-environment nexus by expressing concern over the increasing use of unilateral trade-restrictive measures justified under the guise of environmentalism.<sup>98</sup>

---

<sup>93</sup> Goyal urges G20 to commit to positive and timely discussions on TRIPS waiver extension to COVID 19 diagnostics and therapeutics, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1861589>

<sup>94</sup> India opposes group consultation on food subsidies programme at WTO, The Business Standard (Geneva) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.business-standard.com/article/economy-policy/india-opposes-group-consultation-efforts-on-food-subsidy-programme-at-wto-122101401096\\_1.html](https://www.business-standard.com/article/economy-policy/india-opposes-group-consultation-efforts-on-food-subsidy-programme-at-wto-122101401096_1.html)

<sup>95</sup> Proposed Agenda – General Council – 6-7 October 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 6 October 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/FE\\_Search/FE\\_S\\_S009-DP.aspx?language=E&CatalogueIdList=288425,286513,285152,284410,283435,282390,279493,278885,277469,275714&CurrentCatalogueIdIndex=0&FullTextHash=&HasEnglishRecord=True&HasFrenchRecord=True&HasSpanishRecord=True](https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/FE_Search/FE_S_S009-DP.aspx?language=E&CatalogueIdList=288425,286513,285152,284410,283435,282390,279493,278885,277469,275714&CurrentCatalogueIdIndex=0&FullTextHash=&HasEnglishRecord=True&HasFrenchRecord=True&HasSpanishRecord=True)

<sup>96</sup> Members and partner organizations look into future priorities for Aid for Trade, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 11 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/news22\\_e/aid\\_14oct22\\_e.htm](https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/aid_14oct22_e.htm)

<sup>97</sup> WTO Trade and Environment Week 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.wto.org/french/tratop\\_f/envir\\_f/tedweek2022\\_f.htm](https://www.wto.org/french/tratop_f/envir_f/tedweek2022_f.htm)

<sup>98</sup> Members affirm environment committee's importance at end of Trade and Environment Week, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 21 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/news22\\_e/envir\\_21oct22\\_e.htm](https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/envir_21oct22_e.htm)

On 4 December 2022, during the first Sherpa meeting of India's G20 presidency, the G20 members discussed WTO reform under a broader session pertaining to multilateral institutional reform.<sup>99</sup>

On 6 December 2022, India co-sponsored a communication to other members of the TRIPS Council, calling for the General Council to immediately extend the WTO Ministerial Decision on the TRIPS Agreement from 17 June 2022 to include COVID-19 therapeutics and diagnostics.<sup>100</sup>

On 19 December 2022, similar to the prior meeting of the General Council on 6 October 2022, India and South Africa again co-sponsored an agenda item on rejuvenating the work programme on the scope of the e-commerce moratorium.<sup>101</sup> India further circulated a communication on the status quo regarding consumer protection in e-commerce, existing international standards and guiding questions for other WTO members to consider regarding the WTO's role in regulating e-commerce.

On 11 January 2023, following the 13th Ministerial-level meeting of the India-United States Trade Policy Forum, Minister Goyal and US Trade Representative Katherine Tai noted that WTO reform should build trust in the multilateral trading system and enable the WTO to better advance its foundational objectives while responding to the needs of all people.<sup>102</sup>

On 13 January 2023, India hosted the virtual "Voice of Global South Summit," where Minister Goyal stated that India would redouble its efforts to extend the TRIPS waiver to COVID-19 diagnostics and therapeutics.<sup>103</sup>

India has co-sponsored a concrete work plan on the expansion of the TRIPS waiver and advocated for discussions on the e-commerce moratorium and transparency provisions. Furthermore, it has reaffirmed the role of the WTO as a negotiation forum and asked members to consider the G90 proposal on S&DT and the proposal on PSH. Moreover, India has advocated for the inclusion of S&DT provisions and the participation of LDCs in a prospective comprehensive fisheries subsidies agreement. As such, India has engaged constructively and substantively with the four pillars of this commitment.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with its commitment to engage constructively to pursue the necessary reform of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and least developed countries.

---

<sup>99</sup> Substantive discussions on India's G20 Priorities conclude on Day 3 of the 1st Sherpa Meeting at Udaipur, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 6 January 2023. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1881220>

<sup>100</sup> DECISION TEXT ON EXTENSION OF THE 17 JUNE 2022 MINISTERIAL DECISION TO COVID-19 THERAPEUTICS AND DIAGNOSTICS, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 6 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/IP/C/W694.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>101</sup> Proposed Agenda – General Council – 19-20 December 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 19 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W861.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>102</sup> Joint Statement on India – United States Trade Policy Forum, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 12 January 2023. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1890606>

<sup>103</sup> Shri Goyal calls for redoubling efforts for extension of TRIPS waiver to COVID-19 diagnostics and therapeutics, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (New Delhi) 13 January 2023. Access Date: 13 January 2023.

<https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1891087>



On 22 September 2022, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met on the margins of the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>104</sup> Among other items, the ministers stressed the need to expand the scope of the waiver of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property (TRIPS) and underscored the importance of technology transfer in line with the Ministerial Declaration on the WTO Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic and Preparedness for Future Pandemics. Additionally, the ministers reaffirmed their commitment to the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core and emphasized the urgency of restoring a WTO dispute settlement system by 2024.

On 17 September 2022, as agreed upon in the Joint Statement of the Economic Ministers' Meeting at the Tenth East Asia Summit, China and other participants recognized the importance of WTO reform.<sup>105</sup> They committed to having discussions on restoring the dispute settlement system by 2024, and resolved to strengthen an inclusive and equitable multilateral trading system.

On 24 September 2022, Vice Minister of the Ministry of Commerce Wang Shouwen attended the G20 Trade, Investment and Industry Ministerial Meeting virtually.<sup>106</sup> The Vice Minister confirmed China's goal of leading the G20 countries in implementing the outcomes of WTO's 12th ministerial conference, promoting substantial progress on WTO reform and improving the multilateral trading system for the realization of Sustainable Development Goals.

On 8 December 2022, Premier Li Keqiang met with Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala, WTO Director-, in Huangshan City, Anhui Province.<sup>107</sup> Premier Li said that China firmly supports the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core and has earnestly fulfilled its commitments since joining the WTO more than 20 years ago. He stated that China will adhere to the principle of balancing rights and obligations in the WTO, and assume responsibilities commensurate with its development and capabilities.

Although China has verbally reaffirmed the importance of WTO reform and expressed a willingness to lead such efforts, it has yet to demonstrate compliance with the present commitment through concrete policy action.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Xiaolong (James) Wang*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to engage constructively to pursue the necessary reform of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to build an open world economy that supports trade and development, preserve the pre-eminent role of the WTO for setting global trade rules and

---

<sup>104</sup> Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations on the margins of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/brics0922.htm>

<sup>105</sup> THE TENTH EAS ECONOMIC MINISTERS' MEETING – ASEAN Media Statement, Indian Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Siem Reap) 17 September 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN\\_Media\\_Statement\\_10th\\_EAS\\_Economic\\_Ministers\\_Meeting\\_17.09.2022\\_Cambodia.pdf](https://www.indmissionasean.gov.in/pdf/press/ASEAN_Media_Statement_10th_EAS_Economic_Ministers_Meeting_17.09.2022_Cambodia.pdf)

<sup>106</sup> 商务部：中方愿同G20其他成员一道积极推动世贸组织改革 [Ministry of Commerce: China is willing to work with other G20 members to actively promote the reform of the WTO], Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 24 September 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 29 October 2022. [http://www.news.cn/2022-09/24/c\\_1129029704.htm](http://www.news.cn/2022-09/24/c_1129029704.htm)

<sup>107</sup> 李克强会见世界贸易组织总干事伊维拉 [Li Keqiang Meets with WTO Director-General Iweala], Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 9 December 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 9 January 2023. [http://www.gov.cn/premier/2022-12/09/content\\_5730878.htm](http://www.gov.cn/premier/2022-12/09/content_5730878.htm)

governance, supporting inclusive development and promoting the rights and interests of its members, including developing members and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 27 June 2022, on the sidelines of the G7 summit, President Cyril Ramaphosa met with Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi.<sup>108</sup> They “welcomed the WTO agreement reached in June 2022 that supports the production of COVID-19 vaccines in developing countries,” recalling that they “had submitted the first proposal suggesting a waiver for all WTO members on the implementation of certain provisions of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property (TRIPS) in relation to the prevention, containment or treatment of COVID-19.”

On 30 June 2022, President Ramaphosa and Minister of Trade and Industry Ebrahim Patel, among others, attended the 7th Summit of the Heads of State and Government of the Member States of the Southern African Customs Union (SACU).<sup>109</sup> The SACU applauded the role of the African Ministers in reaching a deal on the TRIPS waiver during the WTO’s 12th ministerial conference.

On 6 July 2022, during a TRIPS Council meeting at the WTO, South Africa and five other WTO members circulated an informal proposal and timeline on paragraph 8 of the Ministerial Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement, which asked WTO members to make a decision on whether to expand the TRIPS waiver by December 2022.<sup>110</sup>

On 25 July 2022, during the WTO General Council meeting, South Africa co-sponsored an agenda item on expanding the scope of the 17 June 2022 Ministerial Decision on the TRIPS Agreement.<sup>111</sup> South Africa delivered a number of statements, including pointing to the Africa Group and proposals on public stockholding as a way forward for agricultural negotiations, emphasizing the importance of targeting distant water fishing in fisheries subsidies talks, reiterating that WTO reform must result in inclusive trade and reaffirming that the current e-commerce moratorium should be extended.<sup>112</sup> On the possible expansion of the TRIPS waiver, South Africa expressed regret that the TRIPS Council of 8 July 2022 did not issue a factual report to the General Council, and reiterated the urgency of making a decision before December 2022. On the trade-related issues of LDCs, South Africa expressed support for appropriate support measures. On transparency measures, South Africa sought clarification on the U.S.-led revised Proposed Decision on Procedures to Enhance Transparency and Improve Compliance with Notification Requirements Under WTO Agreements.

On 17 September 2022, President Ramaphosa concluded his working visit to Washington DC.<sup>113</sup> During his meeting with U.S. President Joseph Biden, he “applauded the leadership role played by President Biden in assisting developing economies to strengthen their health systems and for support on the WTO TRIPS waiver on vaccine manufacturing.”

---

<sup>108</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Indian Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35448/Meeting\\_of\\_Prime\\_Minister\\_with\\_President\\_of\\_South\\_Africa\\_on\\_the\\_sidelines\\_of\\_G7\\_Summit](https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35448/Meeting_of_Prime_Minister_with_President_of_South_Africa_on_the_sidelines_of_G7_Summit)

<sup>109</sup> SACU calls for dialogue negotiation in Ukraine conflict, South African Government News Agency (Windhoek) 30 June 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/sacu-calls-dialogue-negotiation-ukraine-conflict>

<sup>110</sup> Statements Delivered by India – General Council Meeting 25-26 July 2022, Permanent Mission of India to the WTO (Geneva) 26 July 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public\\_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf](https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/India's%20Statements%20Delivered%20at%20GC%20meeting%2025%2026%20July%202022.pdf)

<sup>111</sup> Proposed Agenda – General Council – 25-26 July 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 22 July 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W853.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>112</sup> Minutes of the Meeting – General Council – 25-26 July 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 21 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/M200.pdf&Open=True>

<sup>113</sup> President Ramaphosa concludes positive Washington DC visit, Office of the President of South Africa (Pretoria) 17 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <https://www.thepresidency.gov.za/press-statements/president-ramaphosa-concludes-positive-washington-dc-visit>

On 20 September 2022, South Africa published a government notice that introduced a system of market access permits for importers of various agricultural and alcohol-related products, in order to fulfill South Africa's commitments on market access under the Marrakesh Agreement.<sup>114</sup>

On 21 September 2022, the 10th India-Brazil-South Africa (IBSA) Trilateral Ministerial Commission meeting took place in New York.<sup>115</sup> Among other items, the Ministers reaffirmed the centrality of the open and inclusive multilateral trading system as embodied in the WTO. The ministers also committed to restoring the dispute settlement mechanism by 2024 and emphasized that the reform should entail making the WTO more effective and responsive to the needs of LDCs.<sup>116</sup> Additionally, the ministers agreed to an IBSA Memorandum of Understanding for Cooperation on Traditional Medicine in order to facilitate trade in this field, and to consult the TRIPS Council on the extension of the TRIPS waiver to COVID-19 therapeutics and diagnostics.

On 22 September 2022, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met on the margins of the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>117</sup> Among other items, the ministers stressed the need to expand the scope of the TRIPS waiver and underscored the importance of technology transfer in line with the Ministerial Declaration on the WTO Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic and Preparedness for Future Pandemics. Additionally, the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to the multilateral trading system with the WTO at its core and emphasized the urgency of restoring a WTO dispute settlement system by 2024.

On 6-7 October 2022, at a meeting of the General Council, India and South Africa co-sponsored an agenda item to create a plan to advance progress on debating the scope of the e-commerce moratorium.<sup>118</sup> Similar to the previous General Council meeting, South Africa again co-sponsored an agenda item on expanding the scope of the 17 June 2022 Ministerial Decision on the TRIPS Agreement.

On 6 December 2022, South Africa co-sponsored a communication to other members of the TRIPS Council, calling for the General Council to immediately extend the WTO Ministerial Decision on the TRIPS Agreement from 17 June 2022 to include COVID-19 therapeutics and diagnostics.<sup>119</sup>

On 29 November 2022, the Department of Trade, Industry, and Commerce presented a report on South Africa's trade portfolio to the Select Committee on Trade and Industry, Economic

---

<sup>114</sup> APPLICATION FOR MARKET ACCESS PERMITS FOR AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTS IN TERMS OF THE WORLD TRADE ORGANISATION (WTO) AGREEMENT FOR 2023, South African Department of Agriculture, Land Reform, and Rural Development (Pretoria) 20 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022.

[https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis\\_document/202209/46922gon2512.pdf](https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_document/202209/46922gon2512.pdf)

<sup>115</sup> 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting, Indian Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35752/10th\\_IBSA\\_Trilateral\\_Ministerial\\_Commission\\_Meeting](https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35752/10th_IBSA_Trilateral_Ministerial_Commission_Meeting)

<sup>116</sup> Joint Communiqué of the 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/ibsa0921.htm>

<sup>117</sup> Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations on the margins of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Department of International Relations and Cooperation of the Republic of South Africa (New York) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 4 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/brics0922.htm>

<sup>118</sup> Proposed Agenda – General Council – 6-7 October 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 6 October 2022.

Access Date: 4 November 2022. [https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/FE\\_Search/FE\\_S\\_S009-DP.aspx?language=E&CatalogueIdList=288425,286513,285152,284410,283435,282390,279493,278885,277469,275714&CurrentCatalogueIdIndex=0&FullTextHash=&HasEnglishRecord=True&HasFrenchRecord=True&HasSpanishRecord=True](https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/FE_Search/FE_S_S009-DP.aspx?language=E&CatalogueIdList=288425,286513,285152,284410,283435,282390,279493,278885,277469,275714&CurrentCatalogueIdIndex=0&FullTextHash=&HasEnglishRecord=True&HasFrenchRecord=True&HasSpanishRecord=True)

<sup>119</sup> DECISION TEXT ON EXTENSION OF THE 17 JUNE 2022 MINISTERIAL DECISION TO COVID-19 THERAPEUTICS AND DIAGNOSTICS, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 6 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/IP/C/W694.pdf&Open=True>

Development, Tourism, Employment and Labour.<sup>120</sup> On the issue of the e-commerce moratorium, the Department stated that its position was to continue working multilaterally through the Working Programme on Electronic Commerce. On WTO reform, the Department stated that South Africa wishes for reform to preserve the core principles of the WTO and its multilateral character, and that it should rebalance trade rules from the Uruguay Round to facilitate Africa's industrialization.

On 19 December 2022, similar to the prior meeting of the General Council on 6 October 2022, India and South Africa again co-sponsored an agenda item on rejuvenating the work programme on the scope of the e-commerce moratorium.<sup>121</sup>

South Africa contributed to an open world economy by taking steps to fulfill its market access commitments at the WTO. It contributed to the WTO's rule-making function, support for inclusive development, while also promoting the rights and interests of developing members and LDCs through ongoing work relating to the TRIPS waiver, e-commerce moratorium, and other outcomes of the 12th ministerial conference.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

---

<sup>120</sup> Select Committee on Trade and Industry, Economic Development, Tourism, Employment and Labour – Report on South Africa's Trade Portfolio, South African Department of Trade, Industry, and Commerce (Pretoria) 29 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.thedtic.gov.za/wp-content/uploads/SC-Trade-Policy.pdf>

<sup>121</sup> Proposed Agenda – General Council – 19-20 December 2022, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 19 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W861.pdf&Open=True>

#### 4. Digital Economy: E-Commerce Consumer Protection

“We also agree to promote consumer protection in e-commerce by advancing the implementation of the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

##### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia	-1		
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.60 (20%)	

##### Background

E-commerce has been an important area of discussion among BRICS leaders since 2012. At the second meeting of the BRICS trade and economic ministers in New Delhi, BRICS trade ministers began exploring the possibility of e-commerce cooperation. At the fourth meeting of the BRICS trade ministers in Fortaleza in 2014, BRICS trade ministers emphasized the importance of strengthening intra-BRICS cooperation on e-commerce and welcomed a proposal to establish a BRICS Expert Dialogue on E-Commerce. At the fifth meeting of the BRICS trade ministers in 2015, they once again highlighted the importance of strengthening intra-BRICS cooperation on e-commerce and welcomed the Framework for E-Commerce Cooperation as an instrument to promote BRICS partnerships in this area.

At the Ufa Summit in 2015, promoting e-commerce development and cooperation was listed as one of the goals and priority areas for BRICS trade cooperation. The leaders also endorsed the Framework for BRICS E-Commerce Cooperation as an instrument to promote current and future initiatives and build close partnerships in the sphere of e-commerce. At the sixth meeting of BRICS trade ministers in 2016, the BRICS ministers reiterated the importance of BRICS e-commerce cooperation and emphasized that the development potential in this area has not been fully realized. Thus, they took note of a proposal to conduct a joint study to promote cooperation in areas of common interest in e-commerce.

The BRICS E-Commerce Working Group was officially established in 2017 at the 7th Meeting of the BRICS trade ministers in Shanghai under China’s chairmanship. At this meeting, BRICS trade ministers pointed out that “e-commerce has become one of the world’s most dynamic and constantly evolving business activities, which is playing an increasingly important role in promoting trade growth, industry transformation and job creation, and has the potential to enable developing countries and SMEs to better participate in and benefit from global value chains and international trade.” The ministers also recognized the challenges brought about by the digital divide, and the need to bridge the digital divide to address its socio-economic implications and ensure that e-commerce better contributes to inclusive growth. As such, they agreed to establish the BRICS E-Commerce Working Group, as per Annex IV of the statement adopted at the seventh meeting of the BRICS trade ministers entitled the BRICS E-Commerce Cooperation Initiative. The document stated that the working group aims to promote BRICS cooperation on e-commerce and serve as a body to coordinate intergovernmental cooperation. The working group was designed to meet periodically and conduct activities such as “exchanging information including on policy and best practices, providing guidance to the members on enhancing cooperation, and exploring a roadmap for cooperation.”

The importance of e-commerce cooperation was reaffirmed in subsequent summits by BRICS leaders and trade ministers. In the 2020 Moscow Declaration, the BRICS leaders recognized “the role of the digital economy as an important tool for modernization and transformation of the industry, promotion of inclusive economic growth, support of seamless global trade and business conduct, and thus helping BRICS national economies to meet the Sustainable Development Goals.” The leaders also acknowledged the challenges arising from “the unprecedented growth of digital technologies and e-commerce” and emphasized the need to overcome the digital divide and support developing countries. In this context, the BRICS leaders committed to enhancing cooperation through the E-Commerce Working Group. They also noted “the potential for establishing a workstream to examine the experience of BRICS and other countries, as well as international associations in the field of consumer protection in e-commerce and create a basis for exploring the development of a practical framework for ensuring consumer protection in the BRICS countries.”

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS acknowledged the significant role of digital platforms and recognized that the pandemic has played an instrumental role in accelerating the use of digital processes across the world. The BRICS also discussed the importance of bridging the digital divide and strengthening the role of digital technologies in infrastructure projects. In addition, the BRICS endorsed the Framework for Ensuring Consumer Protection in E-Commerce, which was adopted at the trade ministers’ meeting.

At the most recent 2022 Beijing Summit, the BRICS again agreed to use innovative digital tools to promote sustainable development and discussed the importance of the digital economy in mitigating the impact of the pandemic. The BRICS endorsed the BRICS Digital Economy Partnership Framework and welcomed the establishment of the Digital Economy Working Group by upgrading the E-Commerce Working Group. Furthermore, they paid specific attention to promoting consumer protection in e-commerce.

### **Commitment Features**

In this commitment, BRICS members agreed to “promote consumer protection in e-commerce by advancing the implementation of the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-commerce.”

To “promote” means to support or renew old efforts or create new efforts in the area. It should not have to be a brand new initiative, but merely to contribute to growth or prosperity of, or to help bring something into being.

“Consumer protection in e-commerce” refers to the protection of the users of e-commerce platforms. Major areas of consumer protection in e-commerce include e-transactions, privacy and data protection, cyber information security, advertising and marketing practices, and online disclosures relating to information about businesses, goods or services, and transactions.

To “advance” means to accelerate the progress of something or to bring something forward.

“Implementation” refers to the process of making something active or effective.

The BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-commerce is a document adopted by trade ministers at the 2021 New Delhi Summit. This document lists the rationale and guidelines for consumer protection, as well as specific actions that BRICS members can take to implement the goals of the Framework. Specifically, the document lists six areas of action for BRICS members. These actions count toward compliance with the commitment to implement the Framework:

1. “BRICS Members resolve to enhance cooperation through the BRICS E-commerce Working Group to examine the experience of BRICS and other countries and international associations in the field of consumer protection in e-commerce, and further explore practical options for ensuring

consumer protection and in this endeavor, actively involving representatives of the academia, civil organizations, private sector, etc.

2. With a view to promoting better understanding and to enable coordination on various aspects of e-commerce, BRICS Members may consider exchanging best practices on how regulatory frameworks are adapting to new challenges which are emerging as a result of the dynamic nature of e-commerce.
3. BRICS Members may also consider elaborating on the steps undertaken by them to address issues of consumer protection and at the same time, seek measures to control the sale of counterfeit products, catalogue rogue/fake portals, and adopt appropriate measures to support offline retailers and neighbourhood stores.
4. BRICS Members may consider developing a plan of action on the priority areas of consumer protection in the era of e-commerce.
5. To promote consumer protection in e-commerce and exchange best practices. BRICS Members may consider holding events (conference/round table) on specific aspects of consumer protection.
6. BRICS Members may consider organizing information campaigns on key issues of consumer protection in e-commerce.”

Overall, this commitment requires BRICS members to advance consumer protection in e-commerce by taking actions that fall under the six areas of action listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce, summarized above. For full compliance, BRICS members must take action in at least five of the six areas of action above. Partial compliance requires BRICS members to take action in three to four of the six areas of action above. Failing to take action in at least three of the six areas above will result in non-compliance. Further, this report applies a depth analysis, where weaker actions, such as verbal reiterations of support may count towards partial but not full compliance.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member took action in 0 to 2 of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.
0	The BRICS member took action in 3 to 4 of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.
+1	The BRICS member took strong action in 5 to 6 of the areas of action listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Wang*

### **Brazil: -1**

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to promote consumer protection and advance the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-commerce.

On 22 December 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro approved and signed bill 14.478, a bill that regulates cryptocurrency transactions, into law.<sup>122</sup> The bill states that violators would be penalized and criminalized for fraud regarding crypto frauds, which aims at decreasing the risks of cryptocurrency transactions among both consumers and businesses.

Brazil took actions in fewer than two of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

---

<sup>122</sup> Brazilian president signs crypto bill into law (Washington) 22 December 2022. Access Date: 13 December 2022. <https://cointelgraph.com/news/brazilian-president-signs-crypto-bill-into-law>

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Kelly Chan*

**Russia: -1**

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to promote consumer protection and advance the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-commerce.

On 25 September 2022, Chairman of the State Duma Committee on Financial Market Anthony Aksavok addressed the urgency for regulating cryptocurrencies to protect user's digital assets and security. Chairman Aksavok emphasized that Russia is working on using digital roubles to facilitate economic settlements with China, which can be expanded to include other states in the future.<sup>123</sup>

On 13 October 2022, the Bank of Russia announced that the Forum of Innovative Financial Technologies (FINOPOLIS 2021/22) will be held 10-11 November 2022 in Moscow. The forum will focus on the prospects of Russian technological development and security, in which cybersecurity, digital mortgages and commercial biometric systems are areas that will be emphasized in the discussion.<sup>124</sup>

On 23 January 2023, the Bank of Russia amended the basic standards for microfinance transactions operations. The bank recommended to verify the validity of an applicant's personal documents and credit history accuracy. In sum, the amended standards include ten new measures to increase financial services consumers' protection against fraud.<sup>125</sup>

On 15 – 17 February 2023, the Bank of Russia co-hosted the forum “Cybersecurity in Finance” in Yekaterinburg. Public officials including Governor of Central Bank Elvira Nabiullina and business representatives attended the event. The participants discussed various topics including combatting fraud, information security staff training, cyber risk insurance, etc.<sup>126</sup>

Russia took actions in two of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Kelly Chan*

**India: 0**

India has partially complied with its commitment to promote consumer protection in e-commerce by advancing the implementation of the BRICS Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

On 1 July 2022, Piyush Goyal, the Union Minister for Commerce and Industry, launched a Grand Hackathon to promote the Open Network for Digital Commerce (ONDC). The ONDC helps bring buyers and sellers to a platform, democratizing the agriculture value chain and digitizing the agriculture

---

<sup>123</sup> Russia plans to use digital rouble in settlements with China, says lawmaker (London) 26 September 2022. Access Date: 13 October 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/markets/currencies/russia-plans-use-digital-rouble-settlements-with-china-says-lawmaker-2022-09-26/>

<sup>124</sup> FINOPOLIS 2021/22: business programme (Moscow) 13 October 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://www.cbr.ru/eng/press/event/?id=14235>

<sup>125</sup> Issue of microloans online to become more secure, Central Bank of Russia (Moscow) 23 January 2023. Access Date: <https://www.cbr.ru/eng/press/event/?id=14494>

<sup>126</sup> The Main Day of the Cybersecurity Forum to Star with the Panel Discussion on “Combating social engineering techniques and fraud” to be Attended by Governor of Bank of Russia Elvira Nabiullina, Central Bank of Russia (Moscow) 16 February 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <https://www.cbr.ru/press/event/?id=14556>



sector. The ONDC will help small sellers and traders to participate alongside large players in the market. The ONDC will eliminate algorithmic malpractices including those that force consumers to go for some suppliers over others.<sup>127</sup>

On 28 August 2022, Minister Goyal reviewed the progress of the Government e Marketplace (GeM). The minister suggested revising thresholds and adding features to improve delivery timelines. He also suggested an end-to-end online fulfilment and payment mechanism for all transactions by buyers on GeM.<sup>128</sup>

On 29 August 2022, Minister Goyal called for the integration of the One District One Product (ODOP) with the ONDC. The ONDC would help the ODOP by providing a platform for both sellers and buyers. The initiative will help develop remote areas. The minister expressed the need to increase the availability of ODOP products to counter fakes in the market and called for action against those who sell counterfeit products.<sup>129</sup>

On 30 August 2022, Minister Goyal chaired a meeting to review the ONDC. During the meeting, the ONDC discussed ways to help small traders get digitized and avail the opportunities of the e-commerce system. The ONDC plans to begin beta-testing its network with public users. Minister Goyal stressed the importance of the ONDC to enforce transparent return policies, address consumer grievances and to assist entrepreneurs develop e-commerce apps.<sup>130</sup>

On 16 December 2022, the Secretary of the Department for Promotion of Industry and Internal Trade Anurang Jain inaugurated an ONDC office in New Delhi. He reiterated ONDC's commitment to democratize e-commerce and empower consumers.<sup>131</sup>

India took actions in three of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Sarah Nasir*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with the digital economy commitment within the Framework of Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

On 19 September 2022, the People's Bank of China announced that the digital yuan trial program will be expanding to the whole of Guangdong, Sichuan, Hebei and Jiangsu.<sup>132</sup> The program aims to

---

<sup>127</sup> Union Minister Shri Goyal launches a three-day "Grand Hackathon" on Agriculture domain to promote open eCommerce network, Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 1 July 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1838674>

<sup>128</sup> Shri Piyush Goyal reviews the progress of Government e Marketplace, Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 28 August 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1854929>

<sup>129</sup> Integration of One District One Product (ODOP) with Open Network for Digital Commerce (ONDC) will help in further expanding the frontiers of ODOP – Shri Piyush Goyal, Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 29 August 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1855279>

<sup>130</sup> Shri Piyush Goyal Chairs progress review of Open Network for Digital Commerce (ONDC), Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 30 August 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1855563>

<sup>131</sup> ONDC to democratize e-Commerce and enable millions of small traders to avail opportunities offered by e-Commerce: Secretary Shri Anurang Jain, Ministry of Commerce & Industry (Delhi) 16 December 2022. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1884249>

<sup>132</sup> China Launches Digital Yuan App – All you need to Know. China Briefing. 22 September 2022. Access date: 31 October 2022. <https://www.china-briefing.com/news/china-launches-digital-yuan-app-what-you-need-to-know/>

promote the innovation of digital yuan application scenarios, the improvement of digital yuan system, and the development of legal digital currency.

On 21 September 2022, the 43rd meeting of the Standing Committee of the 15th Beijing Municipal People's Congress held a second review of the Beijing Digital Economy Promotion Regulations. The second draft proposed that people who have real difficulties in using digital public services should be provided with alternative services and products.<sup>133</sup>

On 30 December 2022, the Chinese Banking and Insurance Commission has issued its Banking and Insurance Institution Consumer Rights and Interests Protection Administrative Measures.<sup>134</sup> These measures are set to come into effect starting with 1 March 2023. The purpose of these measures is to maintain a fair and just financial market environment, protect the lawful rights and interests of banking sector consumers, and expedite a healthy development of the sector.

China took actions in three of the areas listed in the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Thomas Yue*

### **South Africa: -1**

South Africa has failed to comply with its digital economy commitment within the Framework of Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.

South Africa has not taken actions in any of the areas under the Framework for Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.<sup>135</sup>

Thus, South Africa has received a score of -1.

*Analyst: Thomas Yue*

---

<sup>133</sup> China: China Monthly Data Protection Update – October 2022. 19 October 2022. Access Date: 31 October 2022.

<https://www.mondaq.com/china/data-protection/1241554/china-monthly-data-protection-update--october-2022>

<sup>134</sup> China introduces new rules for protecting consumer rights. 4 January 2023. Access Date: 15 January 2023.

<https://thepaypers.com/online-mobile-banking/china-introduces-new-rules-for-protecting-consumer-rights--1259688>

<sup>135</sup> This non-compliance was determined with reference to the following websites: Upcoming regulation of e-commerce in the Republic of South Africa. 13 June 2022. Access Date: 15 January 2023.

<https://www.dentons.com/en/insights/alerts/2022/june/13/upcoming-regulation-of-e-commerce-in-the-republic-of-south-africa>; E-Commerce transactions under the Electronic Communications and Transactions Act and Consumer Protection Act. 26 August 2022. Access Date: 15 January 2023. <https://www.dentons.com/en/insights/articles/2022/august/26/e-commerce-transactions-under-the-electronic-communications>

## 5. Health: COVID-19

“[We stress the need to continue to strengthen the cooperation on] ... research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of COVID-19 virus.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia	-1		
India	-1		
China	-1		
South Africa	-1		
Average	-1.00 (0%)		

### Background<sup>136</sup>

Vaccine cooperation has been an important area of BRICS health governance since 2017. On 4 September 2017, at the Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders agreed to “enhance BRICS role in global health governance, especially in the context of the World Health Organization and UN agencies, and foster the development and improve the availability of innovative medical products through the promotion of research and development and access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics, and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services through enhanced health systems and health financing.”<sup>137</sup>

On 26 July 2018, BRICS leaders adopted the Johannesburg Declaration, in which they committed to “strengthening the coordination and cooperation on vaccine research and development within BRICS countries.”<sup>138</sup> BRICS leaders also welcomed a proposal to establish the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre.

On 30 January 2020, the World Health Organization (WHO) declared the novel coronavirus a public health emergency of international concern under the International Health Regulations.<sup>139</sup> In this context, on 17 November 2020, the BRICS adopted its first leader-level commitment on COVID-19. Specifically, they committed to “acknowledge initiatives by the WHO, governments, non-profit organizations, research institutes and the pharmaceutical industry to expedite the research, development, and production of the COVID-19 vaccine and therapeutics, and support cooperative approaches in this regard.” They further committed to “work to ensure that, when available, [the COVID-19 vaccine] is disseminated in a fair, equitable and affordable basis.”<sup>140</sup>

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, BRICS members again stressed the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and in this context recognized that “the production of COVID-19 vaccines has provided the greatest hope to conquer the pandemic and that COVID-19 extensive immunization is a global

<sup>136</sup> This background section is an updated version of the 2020 compliance report on health (Covid-19) produced by the BRICS Research Group.

<sup>137</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 2 January 2021. [brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html](https://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html)

<sup>138</sup> BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 2 January 2021.

<sup>139</sup> Statement on the second meeting of the International Health Regulations (2005) Emergency Committee regarding the outbreak of novel coronavirus (2019-nCoV), World Health Organization (Geneva) 30 January 2020. Access Date: 2 January 2021.

<sup>140</sup> XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 2 January 2021. [brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html](https://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html)

public good.”<sup>141</sup> In addition, the BRICS recognized the importance of safe, efficacious, accessible, and affordable vaccines and committed to supporting countries around the world in combatting the pandemic through financing, donation, local production, and facilitating the export of vaccines. Furthermore, the leaders also stressed the importance of science-based and objective assessment of the safety and efficacy of vaccines by regulators throughout the world.

**Commitment Features**

At the 2022 Beijing Summit, BRICS members reiterated the importance of ensuring the availability of safe, efficacious, accessible, and affordable vaccines. In this context, they committed to strengthening cooperation in the research on vaccine efficacy and safety in light of new variants of COVID-19. “Cooperation” refers to joint actions between different BRICS members or between a BRICS member and any other country. Thus, actions taken within a BRICS member country domestically do not count towards compliance.

The content of the actions that count towards compliance must be geared towards “research on the efficacy and safety” of COVID-19 vaccines. Thus, BRICS members must engage in joint cooperative efforts with other countries in support of research on COVID-19 vaccines with particular attention to their efficacy and safety. Vaccine “efficacy” is a measure of how much the vaccine lowered the risk of getting sick.<sup>142</sup> Vaccine “safety” is a measure of whether or not the vaccines can be safely administered to different groups of people without causing disproportionate adverse effects.<sup>143</sup> Finally, BRICS members must also conduct their actions “in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.” New variants refer to genetic variations of the original virus. Examples include previously circulating variants such as Delta, Gamma, Beta, and Alpha, and the currently, as of this writing, circulating variant, omicron.<sup>144</sup>

Overall, there are three essential aspects to achieving full compliance with this commitment. First, the BRICS member must engage in cooperative action with at least one other BRICS or non-BRICS country; second, the cooperative action must be geared towards supporting research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy; third, the supported research must take into account new variants of the COVID-19 virus. Members that merely engage in cooperative activity to support research on COVID vaccine safety and efficacy without taking into account new variants of the virus will receive only partial compliance. Finally, not engaging in any cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy results in a score of non-compliance. Further, applying a depth analysis, verbal reiterations of support do not count towards compliance, due to the language “to strengthen” suggesting “to do more than before.”

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS member did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.
0	The BRICS member engaged in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy, NOT specifically in light of new variants of the virus.
+1	The BRICS member engaged in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy AND in light of new variants of the virus.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Wang*

<sup>141</sup> XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 September 2022. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

<sup>142</sup> Vaccine efficacy and effectiveness, WHO 14 July 2021. Access Date: 25 September 2022. <https://www.who.int/news-room/feature-stories/detail/vaccine-efficacy-effectiveness-and-protection>

<sup>143</sup> Safety of COVID-19 Vaccines, WHO 31 March 2021. Access Date: 25 September 2022. <https://www.who.int/news-room/feature-stories/detail/safety-of-covid-19-vaccines>

<sup>144</sup> Tracking SARS-CoV-2 variants, WHO. Access Date: 18 September 2022. <https://www.who.int/activities/tracking-SARS-CoV-2-variants>

**Brazil: -1**

Brazil has not complied with its commitment to continue to strengthen the cooperation on research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.

Brazil did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.<sup>145</sup>

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Tanmaya Ramprasad*

**Russia: -1**

Russia has not complied with its commitment to with its commitment to continue to strengthen the cooperation on research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.

On 30 November 2022, Russia and Vietnam held a meeting on cooperation in education, science, and technologies. The parties expressed their willingness to promote cooperation in biotechnologies and the production of COVID-19 vaccines.<sup>146</sup>

On 15 December 2022, the Ministry of Health presented a renewed version of methodological recommendations on the prevention, diagnostics and treatment of the COVID-19 virus. The 17th iteration of the document was actualized as to provide effective data for healthcare practitioners on treatment of the newest COVID-19 strain named “Cerberus.”<sup>147</sup>

Russia did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.<sup>148</sup>

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Tyler Fu*

**India: -1**

India has not complied with its commitment to continue to strengthen the cooperation on research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.

---

<sup>145</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: <https://www.gov.br>, <https://www3.paho.org>, <https://www.gov.br/anvisa/pt-br/english>, <https://www.cevs.rs.gov.br/sispncd>, <https://www.bbc.com/>, <https://www.cnnbrasil.com.br/>, <http://antigo.anvisa.gov.br/en/english>, <https://www.conass.org.br/>, <https://www.unicef.org/>, <https://www.who.int/>.

<sup>146</sup> Russia and Viet Nam to Discuss Cooperation in Education, Science and Education, Ministry of Science and Higher Education of Russia (Moscow) 30 November 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 29 March 2023. <https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/press-center/news/mezhdunarodnoe-sotrudnichestvo/61600/>

<sup>147</sup> The Ministry of Health of Russia has developed a new version of temporary methodological studies on the detection, diagnosis and threat of a new coronavirus infection (COVID-19), Ministry of Health (Moscow) 156 December 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 7 February 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/12/15/19661-minzdrav-rossii-razrabotal-novuyu-versiyu-vremennyh-metodicheskikh-rekomendatsiy-po-profilaktike-diagnostike-i-lecheniyu-novoy-koronavirusnoy-infektsii-covid-19#downloadable>

<sup>148</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: [government.ru/en](https://www.government.ru/en), [www.bbc.com](https://www.bbc.com), <https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/draft-landscape-of-covid-19-candidate-vaccines>

India did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.<sup>149</sup>

Thus, India receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Tanmaya Ramprasad*

**China: -1**

China has not complied with its commitment to with its commitment to continue to strengthen the cooperation on research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.

China did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.<sup>150</sup>

Thus, China receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Tyler Fu*

**South Africa: -1**

South Africa has not complied with its commitment to continue to strengthen the cooperation on research on their efficacy and safety in light of new variants of the COVID-19 virus.

South Africa did not engage in cooperative activity that supports research on COVID-19 vaccine safety and efficacy.<sup>151</sup>

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Kelley Prendergast*

---

<sup>149</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: <https://hmis.nhp.gov.in/#/standardReports>, <https://www.nhp.gov.in/>, <https://www.mohfw.gov.in/>, <https://main.mohfw.gov.in/>, <https://tbcindia.gov.in/>, <https://www.india.gov.in/>, <https://www.who.int/>, <https://nhm.gov.in/>, <https://dhr.gov.in/>, <https://www.mygov.in/covid-19/>, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world/asia/india>, <http://www.nihfw.org/>, <https://nhsrcindia.org/>.

<sup>150</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: [www.gov.cn/en](http://www.gov.cn/en), [www.bbc.com](http://www.bbc.com), <https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/draft-landscape-of-covid-19-candidate-vaccines>

<sup>151</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: <https://www.gov.za/>, <https://www.who.int/>, <https://www.bbc.com/>.

## 6. Health: Infectious Diseases

“We support and emphasize the urgent need for the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the WHO’s [World Health Organization’s] Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average		0 (50%)	

### Background

The discussion surrounding the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System did not begin until the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic. However, the general subject area of BRICS cooperation on health has been a long-standing discussion. The BRICS first discussed health at the 2011 Sanya Summit, where the leaders committed to “strengthen dialogue and cooperation in the fields of social protection, decent work, gender equality, youth, and public health, including the fight against HIV/AIDS.”<sup>152</sup> At the subsequent 2012 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS leaders made a general commitment to address common public health challenges, including the growing burden of communicable and non-communicable diseases.<sup>153</sup>

The next discussion on health came at the 2015 Ufa Summit, where the BRICS affirmed “the right of every person” to “the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.”<sup>154</sup> The leaders similarly expressed their concern with growing global threats posed by communicable and non-communicable diseases. In addition, the BRICS agreed to work together in risk management related to emerging infections with pandemic potential, compliance with commitments to stop the spread of communicable diseases, and research, develop, produce and supply medicines for communicable diseases.

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders emphasized the “importance of cooperation among BRICS countries in promoting research and development of medicines and diagnostic tools to end epidemics and to facilitate access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines.”<sup>155</sup>

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders agreed to enhance the BRICS role in global health governance, “especially in the context of the World Health Organization and United Nations agencies, and foster the development and improve the availability of innovative medical products through promotion of research and development and access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services

<sup>152</sup> Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

<sup>153</sup> Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

<sup>154</sup> VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. [http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration\\_en.html](http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html)

<sup>155</sup> 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

through enhanced health systems and health financing.”<sup>156</sup> They also agreed to improve surveillance capacity and medical services to combat infectious diseases, including Ebola, HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria, as well as non-communicable diseases, and encouraged the greater application of information and communications technologies to improve the level of health service provision.

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders emphasized “the importance of [BRICS] collective action in promoting research and development of medicines and diagnostic tools to end epidemics, to combat communicable diseases and to facilitate access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines, as well as activities to strengthen non-communicable diseases prevention.”<sup>157</sup>

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS reiterated their commitment to strengthening BRICS cooperation in addressing health challenges. Specifically, in the context of discussions of the COVID-19 pandemic, the BRICS noted Russia’s proposal to set up the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks.”<sup>158</sup>

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, BRICS members built on their previous discussions and agreed to strengthen intra-BRICS cooperation on preparedness and response to the pandemic. Specifically, they supported the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks in accordance with International Health Regulations (IHR) and the Global Outbreak Alert (GOARN) and Response Network of the World Health Organization (WHO).<sup>159</sup> This commitment was reiterated at the 2022 Beijing Summit.<sup>160</sup>

### **Commitment Features**

In this commitment, “support” means to give assistance to, promote the interests of, assist, provide financial assistance for,<sup>161</sup> or back up an initiative or entity.<sup>162</sup> “Progress” refers to a forward movement or the gradual betterment of something,<sup>163</sup> in this case, the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System.

The “BRICS Integrated Early Warning System” is the name of a system proposed by Russia at the 2020 Moscow Summit. The aim of this system is to prevent mass infectious disease risks and provide a platform for institutional collaboration on identifying upcoming pandemics and forecasting future outbreaks.<sup>164</sup> “Mass infectious diseases” are diseases with the potential for mass infection, such as

---

<sup>156</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

<sup>157</sup> Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

<sup>158</sup> XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

<sup>159</sup> XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 September 2022. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

<sup>160</sup> XIV BRICS Summit Beijing Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Beijing) 23 June 2022. Access Date: 18 September 2022. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/220623-declaration.html>

<sup>161</sup> Definition of Support, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/support>

<sup>162</sup> Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. [http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance\\_Coding\\_Manual\\_2020.pdf](http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf)

<sup>163</sup> Definition of Progress, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/progress>

<sup>164</sup> XI BRICS Health Ministers’ Meeting Declaration, BRICS India Summit Official Website, July 2021. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://brics2021.gov.in/brics/public/uploads/docpdf/getdocu-29.pdf>



diseases that result from infection from the entrance of a large number of pathogens into the circulation or tissues.<sup>165</sup>

The “International Health Regulations 2005” is the third edition of the IHR originally adopted by the World Health Assembly in 1969. This document discusses issues related to the management of the global regime for the control of the international spread of disease. The purpose of the 2005 edition is “to prevent, protect against, control and provide a public health response to the international spread of disease in ways that are commensurate with and restricted to public health risks, and which avoid unnecessary interference with international traffic and trade.”<sup>166</sup>

GOARN is a network of institutions established in 2000 with the aim of improving the coordination of international outbreak responses. It consists of a network of over 250 technical institutions that respond to public health events. Specifically, its primary aims are to “assist countries with disease control efforts by ensuring rapid and appropriate technical support to affected populations; investigate and characterize events and assess risks of rapidly emerging epidemic disease threats; and support national outbreak preparedness by ensuring that responses contribute to sustained containment of epidemic threats.”<sup>167</sup>

“Identifying” means to know and pinpoint what something is.<sup>168</sup> In this context, “identify” refers to the identification of particular diseases. “Forecasting” means to predict in advance a future happening or condition.<sup>169</sup> In this context, forecasting refers to foreseeing instances of outbreaks of future pandemics. “Institutional collaboration” refers to the collaboration between institutions that respond to public health events, such as those in the GOARN.<sup>170</sup>

This commitment requires states to engage in actions that support progress towards establishing the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System. As noted in the commitment text, the aim of this system is to prevent mass infectious disease risks by identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration. The commitment text also notes that the system needs to be established in accordance with the IHR 2005 and the GOARN. The BRICS Integrated Early Warning System is currently only a proposed initiative that has yet to come to fruition, and support at this initial stage of development can take several forms. For example:

1. A BRICS member can provide verbal or political assistance by affirming their commitment to the establishment of the system, or by affirming the value of this system. This corresponds with the definition of “support” as backing up an initiative or entity. Providing verbal reiterations count towards partial compliance.
2. A BRICS member can also act in a way that promotes the interests or aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system. This corresponds with the definition of “support” as promoting the interests of an initiative or entity. A wide range of actions can count towards compliance under this category. For example:
  - a. Engaging in collaborative efforts towards the goal of preventing mass infectious diseases,

---

<sup>165</sup> Mass Infection, Medical Dictionary. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://medical-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/mass+infection>

<sup>166</sup> International Health Regulations (2005) Third Edition, World Health Organization. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789241580496>

<sup>167</sup> Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, World Health Organization. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.who.int/csr/outbreaknetwork/goarnenglish.pdf>

<sup>168</sup> Definition of Identify, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/identify>

<sup>169</sup> Definition of Forecast, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/forecast>

<sup>170</sup> About Us, GOARN. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://extranet.who.int/goarn/about-us>

- b. Collaborating on identifying and forecasting future pandemics,
  - c. Engaging in discussions or activities related to the IHR 2005 (since the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System needs to be established in accordance with these regulations),
  - d. Engaging in discussions or activities related to the GOARN (since the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System needs to be established in accordance with the GOARN).
3. Taking actions that promote the interests or aims of the system (without explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the system) count towards partial compliance. Taking these actions while explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System count towards full compliance.
  4. A BRICS member can also provide financial assistance to the establishment of the system. This corresponds with the definition of “support” as the provision of financial assistance towards an initiative or entity. Providing financial assistance to establish the system count towards full compliance.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member needs to engage in activities that explicitly supports the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System, either through providing financial assistance to the establishment of the system, or through taking actions that promote the interests and aims of the system while explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the system. Partial compliance requires the BRICS member to engage in activities that promote the interests and aims of the system without explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the system, and/or providing merely verbal or political support by reaffirming their commitment to establishing the system. Failure to undertake any relevant activities in any of the three above categories indicates a lack of compliance.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not take any relevant actions that demonstrate support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System.
0	The BRICS member demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing verbal or political support AND/OR engaging in actions that promote the aims of the system (WITHOUT explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System).
+1	The BRICS member demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing financial assistance towards the establishment of the system OR by engaging in actions that promotes the aims of the system (while explicitly recognizing their relevance to the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System).

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinbe Wang*

### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network of the World Health Organization, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 12 September 2022, National Committee for Technology Incorporation (CONITEC) established three public consultations for Brazil including “Public Consultation No. 30 – Proposal for the incorporation of xylometazolin 0.1% for the treatment of acute laryngitis,” “Public Consultation No. 31 – Proposal to exclude artemeter 80mg/ml in the treatment of severe malaria,” and “Public

Consultation No. 32 – Proposal to update the Clinical Protocol and Therapeutic Guidelines of Infantile Nephrotic Syndrome.”<sup>171</sup> Technical recommendations are provided for these consultations.

On 24 September 2022, Brazil along with Russia, India, China and South Africa gave support through a pledge to increase cooperation on disaster management regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, natural disasters and climate change.<sup>172</sup> This agreement includes strategic planning, law and disaster mitigation and prevention. The agreement may also include risk monitoring, early warning assessment, accident prevention in production and other tasks.

Brazil demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System engaging in actions that promote the aims of the system, but did not explicitly recognize their relevance to the establishment of the System. Brazil also did not provide financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Kelley Prendergast*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network of the World Health Organization, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 24 September 2022, Russia along with Brazil, India, China and South Africa gave support through a pledge to increase cooperation on disaster management regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, natural disasters and climate change.<sup>173</sup> This agreement includes strategic planning, law and disaster mitigation and prevention. The agreement may also include risk monitoring, early warning assessment, accident prevention in production and other tasks.

Russia demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing verbal support. However, Russia did not provide financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Reem Baghdady*

### **India: 0**

India has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network of the World Health Organization, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

---

<sup>171</sup> Infantile nephrotic syndrome, severe malaria and acute rosinositis are the themes of new public consultations, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 12 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. <https://www.gov.br/conitec/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2017/julho/sindrome-nefrotica-infantil-malaria-grave-e-rinosinusite-aguda-sao-os-temas-das-novas-consultas-publicas>

<sup>172</sup> BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management. China Daily 24 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management - World - Chinadaily.com.cn

<sup>173</sup> BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management. China Daily 24 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management - World - Chinadaily.com.cn

On 24 September 2022, Brazil along with Russia, India, China and South Africa gave support through a pledge to increase cooperation on disaster management regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, natural disasters and climate change.<sup>174</sup> This agreement includes strategic planning, law and disaster mitigation and prevention. The agreement may also include risk monitoring, early warning assessment, accident prevention in production and other tasks.

India demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing verbal support through a pledge. However, India did not provide financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Vismay Buch*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network of the World Health Organization, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 24 September 2022, Brazil along with Russia, India, China and South Africa gave support through a pledge to increase cooperation on disaster management regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, natural disasters and climate change.<sup>175</sup> This agreement includes strategic planning, law and disaster mitigation and prevention. The agreement may also include risk monitoring, early warning assessment, accident prevention in production and other tasks.

China demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing verbal support through a pledge. However, China did not provide financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Vismay Buch*

### **South Africa: 0**

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network of the World Health Organization, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 24 September 2022, Brazil along with Russia, India, China and South Africa gave support through a pledge to increase cooperation on disaster management regarding the COVID-19 pandemic, natural disasters and climate change.<sup>176</sup> This will include strategic planning, law and disaster mitigation and prevention. This may also include risk monitoring, early warning assessment, accident prevention in production and other tasks.

---

<sup>174</sup> BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management. China Daily 24 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management - World - Chinadaily.com.cn

<sup>175</sup> BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management. China Daily 24 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management - World - Chinadaily.com.cn

<sup>176</sup> BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management. China Daily 24 September 2022. Access Date: 15 October 2022. BRICS pledge to boost cooperation on disaster management - World - Chinadaily.com.cn

On 7 January 2023, the Genomic Surveillance Unit at Stellenbosch University detected “a XBB.1.5 subvariant of Omicron variant from a specimen which was obtained from a patient on 27 December 2022.”<sup>177</sup> South Africa did not impose travel restrictions but outlined certain recommendations. These include to promote testing, increase wastewater surveillance especially from high-risk countries including China and US, and promote the vaccination campaign.

South Africa demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by providing verbal support through a pledge. However, South Africa did not provide financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Reem Baghdady*

---

<sup>177</sup> Minister Joe Phaahla on recent COVID-19 developments. Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 10 January 2023. Access Date: 17 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-health-dr-joe-phaahla-10-jan-2023-0000>

## 7. International Taxation

“We commit to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average		+0.20 (60%)	

### Background

BRICS leaders first addressed the issue area of international taxation at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit in July 2014, where they committed to “continue a cooperative approach on issues related to tax administrations and enhance cooperation in the international forums targeting tax base erosion and information exchange for tax purposes.” They also “express[ed] concern over the harmful impact of tax evasion, transnational fraud and aggressive tax planning on the world economy.”

Subsequently, on 15 November 2014, on the margins of the G20 summit in Brisbane, BRICS leaders released a media note on their informal meeting stating that they exchanged views on “strengthening the financial system and cooperation on tax matters.”

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders made commitments to address tax issues in light of economic digitalization, tackle tax evasion and base erosion caused by aggressive tax planning, strengthen the tax administration capacity of developing countries, and ensure tax transparency and exchange of information for taxation purposes. The leaders noted an intention to adapt “to new rules introduced by the Action Plan on Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) and the Common Reporting Standard for Automatic Exchange of Tax Information (AEOI)” and “participate in the development of international standards of international taxation and cooperation for countering BEPS.” At this summit, BRICS leaders additionally adopted the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, which includes “strengthening of the financial system and cooperation on tax matters” as a dimension of financial cooperation.

Commitments on similar priorities in the international tax agenda were made at successive summits. At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders emphasized “the need to use tax policy and public expenditure in a more growth-friendly way” and “enhanced international cooperation to address ... tax evasion,” and reiterated a “commitment towards a globally fair and modern tax system and welcome[d] the progress made on effective and widespread implementation of the internationally agreed standards.” In addition, BRICS leaders expressed “support [for] the implementation of the BEPS Project with due regard to the national realities of the countries” and “encourage[d] countries and International Organisations to assist developing economies in building their tax capacity.” They reaffirmed support for the AEOI and “recall[ed] the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development including its emphasis on inclusive cooperation and dialogue among national tax authorities on international tax matters with increased participation of developing countries and reflecting adequate, equitable, geographical distribution, representing different tax systems.”

On 4 September 2017, BRICS leaders agreed to the Xiamen Declaration, which reaffirmed a “commitment to achieving a fair and modern global tax system and promoting a more equitable, pro-

growth and efficient international tax environment, including to deepening cooperation on addressing BEPS, promoting exchange of tax information and improving capacity-building in developing countries.” They expressed resolve to “strengthen BRICS tax cooperation to increase BRICS contribution to setting international tax rules and provide, according to each country’s priorities, effective and sustainable technical assistance to other developing countries.”

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders echoed previous commitments to address “the implications of the digital economy and, within that context, to ensure the fairness of the international tax system particularly towards the prevention of base erosion and shifting of profits, exchange of tax information, both on request and automatically, and needs-based capacity building for developing countries.” They also welcomed the “establishment of the Capacity Building Mechanism between BRICS Revenue Authorities.”

In 2019, at the leaders’ summit in Brasilia, BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to the prevention of BEPS, the exchange of tax information, and the provision of needs-based capacity building for developing countries. They also pledged to address the tax challenges of economic digitalization. They called on “all jurisdictions to sign and ratify the Multilateral Convention on Mutual Administrative Assistance in Tax Matters.” They further echoed a commitment made at the previous Johannesburg summit to “deeper exchanges and sharing of experiences and best practices, as well as to mutual learning in taxation matters.”

On November 17, 2020, BRICS leaders adopted the Moscow Declaration, in which they committed to enhancing “international cooperation to put an end to tax avoidance strategies that exploit gaps and mismatches in tax rules.” They further “committed to promoting efforts on improving compliance with internationally agreed standards on tax transparency and exchange of information and look forward to further progress in information sharing for improvement of our tax authorities’ abilities and technical capacity to deter, detect and disrupt illicit financial flows, tax evasion and tax avoidance.” The leaders also adopted the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, which includes a clause on expanding “cooperation between the BRICS tax administrations.”

The 2021 New Delhi Summit did not adopt any leader-level language on international taxation.

At the 2022 Beijing Summit, BRICS leaders adopted the present commitment and created “a signature knowledge product called “the Best Tax Practices from BRICS” to serve as reference for other developing countries.”

### **Commitment Features**

The commitment requires BRICS members to “commit to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.”

The word “commit” is defined as the action “to do or perform, to pledge or bind (a person or an organization) to a certain course or policy.” Given that “commit” is a high binding commitment verb, this indicates an intention by the BRICS leaders to take concrete policy actions to this end. Thus, verbal affirmations or political statements supporting the objectives of the commitment are insufficient to demonstrate full compliance. Rather, policy or funding decisions must be made for the BRICS member to merit compliance.

To define the other key terms of the commitment, “strengthen cooperation” is understood to mean “the process of working together to address issues.” “Coordination” refers to “the act of making all the people involved in a plan or activity work together in an organized way.”

The commitment outlines three dimensions of strengthening cooperation and coordination in international taxation: 1) tax information exchange, 2) capacity-building, and 3) innovation in tax administration.

First, BRICS members should demonstrate action in the area of tax information exchange. According to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), effective exchange of tax information is key to addressing harmful tax practices, implementing international tax standards and other instruments, and ending bank secrecy and tax evasion and avoidance. Tax information exchange can take the form of bilateral or multilateral collaboration between competent revenue authorities, and information may be shared on request, spontaneously, or automatically. To demonstrate compliance in this work area, for example, BRICS members can enter, enhance, or initiate negotiations for new tax information exchange agreements with each other. BRICS members can also carry out peer reviews to assess compliance with international standards on tax transparency, or engage constructively in international fora on issues of tax information exchange (such as the OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs).

Second, BRICS members committed to strengthening cooperation and coordination on tax capacity-building. As noted in the Background section above, BRICS leaders have repeatedly committed to strengthening the tax administration capacity of developing countries. The OECD reports that “developing countries are frequently reporting the need to implement measures designed to balance protecting their tax base whilst creating a transparent and predictable investment climate through the introduction of rules that are effective in addressing BEPS and create certainty and consistency for business.” Thus, technical assistance and capacity-building programs are essential for developing countries to achieve tax policy-related objectives. To comply with this aspect of the commitment, BRICS members may consider providing technical and financial resources to capacity-building programs and training activities, collaborating and/or funding international agencies in their implementation of related programs, or engaging in multi-stakeholder dialogues to share best practices and tools.

Third, BRICS members must engage constructively on innovation in tax administration. “Tax administration” refers to the implementation of tax law and the collection of tax revenues. It involves a complex set of processes and institutions, giving rise to the need to improve administrative effectiveness and efficiency. To comply with this dimension of the commitment, BRICS governments can explore novel approaches to tax compliance (such as trust-building measures) and reforms, digitization of tax systems and payments, and other sandbox or experimental measures.

To demonstrate full compliance, BRICS members must take strong action to advance cooperation and coordination in all three pillars of the commitment text. A score of 0 for partial compliance will be attributed to BRICS members that only demonstrate substantive action in one or two of the pillars of this commitment or some of all three. A score of -1 for non-compliance will be assigned to BRICS members that do not take any action to comply with this commitment, take weak action in one pillar, or act contrary to the spirit of the commitment.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS Member DOES NOT commit to strengthening cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building OR innovation in tax administration.
0	The BRICS Member strongly commits to strengthening cooperation and coordination in one or two areas of tax information exchange, capacity building or innovation in tax administration OR some of all three.
+1	The BRICS Member strongly commits to strengthening cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building AND innovation in tax administration.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou*

### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.



On 29 June 2022, the Brazilian Federal Revenue Service proposed a new transfer pricing plan to use economic assessments to ensure the accuracy of taxation calculations. This plan was proposed to comply with the guidelines published by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), and intends to provide tax accuracy, eliminate double taxation and increase foreign investment.<sup>178</sup>

On 4 November 2022, Brazil and Norway signed a convention to stop double taxation and tax evasion with a focus on income and capital gain tax.<sup>179</sup> This treaty will allow for improved tax transparency and increased international commerce.

On 18 November 2022, Brazil and other G20 members adopted a leaders' declaration at the G20 Bali summit, committing to the implementation of the OECD/G20 two-pillar international tax package.<sup>180</sup>

On 29 November 2022, Brazil and the United Kingdom signed a double taxation agreement to improve cross-border commerce and tax information exchange.<sup>181</sup>

On 29 December 2022, Brazil released new transfer pricing legislation in accordance with OECD guidelines.<sup>182</sup>

Brazil has introduced preliminary domestic measures to advance innovation in tax administration through its new transfer pricing policy. Brazil has also strengthened cooperation and coordination in tax information exchange through the implementation of double taxation agreements with the United Kingdom and Norway. However, Brazil has yet to build tax administration capacity in developing contexts.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Hania El Sayed*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.

On 28 June 2022, the State Duma announced new laws on the taxation of digital financial assets. Through these laws, the government aims to impose rules regarding value-added tax, income tax and personal income tax on transactions made with digital financial assets.<sup>183</sup>

On 3 November 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Alexei Overchuk attended the Intergovernmental Russian-Kyrgyz Commission on Trade, Economic, Scientific, Technical and Humanitarian

---

<sup>178</sup> Brazil's tax authority unveils game-changing TP plan, International Tax Review (London) 30 June 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022. <https://www.internationaltaxreview.com/article/2aapqly7cwum6f0j3fpxc/brazils-tax-authority-unveils-game-changing-tp-plan>

<sup>179</sup> Brazil – Double Taxation Treaties Signed with Norway, United Kingdom, KPMG (São Paulo) 12 December 2022. Access Date: 5 January 2023. <https://assets.kpmg/content/dam/kpmg/xx/pdf/2022/12/fa22-219.pdf>

<sup>180</sup> G20 Leaders Committed to Swift Implementation of OECD/G20 Two-Pillar International Tax Package, Orbitax News (San Francisco) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/G20-Leaders-Committed-to-Swift-51352>

<sup>181</sup> United Kingdom – Double Taxation Convention with Brazil Signed, Not Yet in Force, KPMG (São Paulo) 2 December 2022. Access Date: 5 January 2023. <https://home.kpmg/xx/en/home/insights/2022/12/flash-alert-2022-212.html>

<sup>182</sup> Brazilian Government publishes Provisional Measure adopting arm's-length principle, EY (São Paulo) 30 December 2022. Access Date: 5 January 2023. <https://globaltaxnews.ey.com/news/2022-6266-brazilian-government-publishes-provisional-measure-adopting-arms-length-principle>

<sup>183</sup> The State Duma has established features of the taxation of digital financial assets, RIA Novosti (Moscow). 28 June 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022. <https://ria.ru/20220628/aktivy-1798704057.html>

Cooperation in Kyrgyzstan. The leaders discussed bilateral cooperation in industry, finance, and energy. They also reviewed progress on Russia's technical assistance to Kyrgyzstan's tax administration.<sup>184</sup>

On 18 November 2022, Russia and other G20 members adopted a leaders' declaration at the G20 Bali summit, committing to the implementation of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development/G20 two-pillar international tax package.<sup>185</sup>

Russia has taken domestic action to strengthen innovation in tax administration. It has also engaged in tax capacity building by providing technical assistance to Kyrgyzstan. However, Russia has not engaged in robust cooperation and coordination in the areas of tax information exchange or innovation in tax administration.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Firaz Khan*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.

On 1 October 2022, the Ministry of Finance announced that the goods and services tax revenue of September 2022 increased by 26 per cent compared to September 2021. This growth is partly due to new monitoring technologies such as e-way bills and e-invoices, which have improved tax reporting, compliance and tax collection.<sup>186</sup>

On 9 September 2022, India participated in the release of the ministerial statement of Pillar IV of the U.S.-led Indo-Pacific Economic Framework for Prosperity (IPEF). Under this arrangement, participating countries will coordinate the exchange of information between competent authorities, promote international transparency and provide technical assistance through domestic resource mobilization. The statement also encouraged innovation for more effective tax administrative practices and sought to address tax challenges arising from economic digitalization.<sup>187</sup>

On 14 October 2022, at the G20 finance ministers meeting, India called for the simplification of international taxation laws to facilitate implementation. India also called for a universal tax information system that focuses on assessing foreign crypto-currency assets.<sup>188</sup>

---

<sup>184</sup> Alexei Overchuk holds a meeting of the co-chairs of the Intergovernmental Russian-Kyrgyz Commission on Trade, Economic, Scientific, Technical and Humanitarian Cooperation, Government of Russia (Moscow) 3 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/46976/>

<sup>185</sup> G20 Leaders Committed to Swift Implementation of OECD/G20 Two-Pillar International Tax Package, Orbitax News (San Francisco) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/G20-Leaders-Committed-to-Swift-51352>

<sup>186</sup> September GST revenues rise 26% amid imports surge, The Hindu (New Delhi) 01 October 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.thehindu.com/business/Economy/gst-collections-hit-147-lakh-crore-in-september-26-higher-than-2021/article65958327.ece>

<sup>187</sup> Ministerial Statement for Pillar IV of the Indo-Pacific Economic Framework for Prosperity, Indo-Pacific Economic Framework for Prosperity (Tokyo) 9 September 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100391691.pdf>

<sup>188</sup> India calls for investments in infrastructure and simplification of international taxation rules, NewsOnAir (Sharjah) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://newsonair.com/2022/10/14/india-calls-for-investments-in-infrastructure-and-simplification-of-international-taxation-rules/>

On 18 November 2022, India and other G20 members adopted a leaders' declaration at the G20 Bali summit, committing to the implementation of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)/G20 two-pillar international tax package.<sup>189</sup>

On 13 December 2022, India hosted the first G20 finance and central bank deputies meeting under its G20 Presidency. The meeting included discussions on priority areas in international taxation, "including monitoring the progress of the Two-Pillar Tax Package being developed under the OECD/G20 Inclusive Framework, enhancing tax transparency and multilateral capacity building on taxation."<sup>190</sup>

India has introduced domestic measures and joined international partnerships such as the G20 and IPEF to strengthen cooperation and coordination in tax information exchange, capacity building and innovative tax administration.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Hania El Sayed*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.

On 16 October 2022, the 20th Congress of the Chinese Communist Party produced a report outlining China's policy agenda for the next five-year term. The report includes tax policy changes to facilitate China's low-carbon economic transition, specifically by "improving the fiscal, tax, financial, investment, price policies and standard systems that support green development."<sup>191</sup>

On 18 November 2022, China and other G20 members adopted a leaders' declaration at the G20 Bali summit, committing to the implementation of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development/G20 two-pillar international tax package.<sup>192</sup>

China has taken domestic action to strengthen innovation in tax administration. However, it has not engaged in robust cooperation and coordination in the areas of tax information exchange, capacity building, or innovation in tax administration.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Firaz Khan*

### **South Africa: 0**

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation and coordination in areas of tax information exchange, capacity building and innovation in tax administration.

---

<sup>189</sup> G20 Leaders Committed to Swift Implementation of OECD/G20 Two-Pillar International Tax Package, Orbitax News (San Francisco) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/G20-Leaders-Committed-to-Swift-51352>

<sup>190</sup> India hosts the 1st G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies (FCBD) meeting under the G20 India presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, India Ministry of Finance (New Delhi) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1883538>

<sup>191</sup> 20th Party Congress Report: What it Means for Business, the Economy, and Social Development, China Debriefing. 31 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.china-briefing.com/news/20th-party-congress-report-what-it-means-for-business/>

<sup>192</sup> G20 Leaders Committed to Swift Implementation of OECD/G20 Two-Pillar International Tax Package, Orbitax News (San Francisco) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/G20-Leaders-Committed-to-Swift-51352>

On 30 September 2022, South Africa ratified the Multilateral Convention to Implement Tax Treaty Related Measures to Prevent Base Erosion and Profit Sharing. The convention officially came into effect on 1 January 2023 in South Africa.<sup>193</sup>

On 26 October 2022, Minister of Finance Enoch Godongwana presented the 2022 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (MTBPS) to Parliament.<sup>194</sup> The South African Revenue Service (SARS) Commissioner Edward Kieswetter stated that the MTBPS focuses on increasing tax compliance through automated risk engines that evaluate non-compliance, expand data profiling and modernize digital tax systems.<sup>195</sup>

On 18 November 2022, SARS revealed its Vision 2024 plan at the Global Forum on Tax Transparency and Exchange of Information for Tax Purposes held by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).<sup>196</sup> SARS aims to modernize tax institutions and utilize technologies such as artificial intelligence and machine learning to increase tax transparency, including automatically sharing tax information with 78 global partners.

On 18 November 2022, South Africa and other G20 members adopted a leaders' declaration at the G20 Bali summit, committing to the implementation of the OECD/G20 two-pillar international tax package.<sup>197</sup>

South Africa has introduced domestic reforms and ratified key international conventions to increase tax administration capabilities and commit to cross-border cooperation. It has also improved tax information exchange through SARS' Vision 2024. However, South Africa has not demonstrated robust action to make tax processes more innovative or support tax capacity-building in other developing economies.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Katherine Zhang*

---

<sup>193</sup> Mongolia Signs Landmark Agreement to Strengthen its Tax Treaties and South Africa Deposits an Instrument for the Ratification of the Multilateral BEPS Convention, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (Paris) 6 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/mongolia-signs-landmark-agreement-to-strengthen-its-tax-treaties-and-south-africa-deposits-an-instrument-for-the-ratification-of-the-multilateral-beps-convention.htm>

<sup>194</sup> 2022 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, South African Revenue Service (Cape Town) 26 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.sars.gov.za/latest-news/2022-medium-term-budget-policy-statement>

<sup>195</sup> SARS is Making a Permanent Change in How it Does Business – What You Need to Know, BusinessTech (Lyttelton) 1 November 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://businesstech.co.za/news/finance/639627/sars-is-making-a-permanent-change-in-how-it-does-business-what-you-need-to-know/>

<sup>196</sup> Greater Focus on Taking Tax Transparency and Exchange of Information to the Next Level, South African Revenue Service (Tshwane) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.sars.gov.za/media-release/greater-focus-on-taking-tax-transparency-and-exchange-of-information-to-the-next-level/>

<sup>197</sup> G20 Leaders Committed to Swift Implementation of OECD/G20 Two-Pillar International Tax Package, Orbitax News (San Francisco) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.orbitax.com/news/archive.php/G20-Leaders-Committed-to-Swift-51352>

## 8. International Financial Institutions Reform: IMF Reform

“We reaffirm our commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF [International Monetary Fund] at its center.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.60 (80%)		

### Background

BRICS members have consistently addressed the topic of reforming international financial institutions (IFIs) since the inception of the leaders’ summit, especially with regards to the International Monetary Fund (IMF). In addition to the present commitment found in the 2022 Beijing Declaration, a similar commitment to “a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at the center of the global financial safety net” was adopted at the 2021 New Delhi Summit, 2020 Moscow Summit, the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the 2016 Goa Summit, and the 2015 Ufa Summit.

On 9 September 2022, BRICS leaders adopted the New Delhi Declaration, in which they reaffirmed their “commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center, and express deep disappointment at the failure in addressing the quota and governance reforms under the 15th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).”

On 17 November 2021, BRICS leaders adopted the Moscow Declaration. The leaders welcomed the IMF’s response to the COVID-19 pandemic, acknowledged the need to resource IMF financing, and noted the ongoing 16<sup>th</sup> General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

Adopted on 14 November 2019, the Brasilia Declaration expressed its disappointment with the 15<sup>th</sup> GRQ, which failed to increase the quota size of the IMF and realign quota shares to increase the representation of emerging markets and developing countries. Similarly, at the 2021 New Delhi Summit, 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the 2016 Goa Summit, and the 2013 Durban Summit, the BRICS leaders emphasized the importance of increasing the representation of the poorest IMF members in Sub-Saharan Africa and globally.

BRICS summit documents have also called on the IMF to efficiently conclude GRQs. At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the leaders observed a commitment to complete the 15th GRQ by 2019. This commitment mirrors that of the Xiamen Declaration adopted on 4 September 2017, which committed to the same deadline of 2019.

On 15 July 2014, the Fortaleza Declaration adopted by BRICS leaders called for the implementation of the 2010 IMF reforms and outcomes of the 14th GRQ. The Declaration also stipulated the leaders’ hope that IMF reforms would proceed “with a few to ensuring increased voice and representation of emerging markets and developing countries.”

On 29 March 2012, at the 4th BRICS Summit in New Delhi, the leaders expressed concern for the pace of the IMF’s quota and governance reforms, as well as the Fund’s access to sufficient resources. The Declaration also included a call for the IMF to improve its surveillance framework.

On 14 April 2011, the BRICS leaders adopted the Sanya Declaration, which called for IFIs to “reflect changes in the world economy, increasing the voice and representation of emerging economies and developing countries.” The leaders further called for improvements to the Special Drawing Rights’ (SDRs) basket of currencies and reforms to international financial regulatory oversight.

Building on a decade of engagement on IFI reform, the BRICS summit hosted by China in June 2022 reaffirmed a collective commitment “to a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.” The BRICS leaders also called for “the timely and successful completion of the 16th General Review of Quotas by 15 December 2023, to reduce the IMF’s reliance on temporary resources, to address under-representation of emerging markets and developing countries for their meaningful engagement in the governance of IMF and protect the voice and quota shares of the poorest and smallest members.” The leaders further welcomed “progress on voluntary channeling of Special Drawing Rights (SDRs) from countries with strong external positions to support countries most in need, as well as the IMF’s decision to establish the Resilience and Sustainability Trust (RST)” and looked forward to the “early operationalization of the RST.”

### **Commitment Features**

To define the key concepts in this commitment, “reaffirm” is understood to mean “affirm again, whereby affirm is to assert strongly, state as fact, confirm or ratify a judgment.” This term qualifies the communiqué excerpt as a politically binding commitment, and acknowledges that the commitment requires new efforts in an area that has been established in the past. As a low-binding commitment verb, “reaffirm” also encapsulates within the parameters of compliance any verbal statements by BRICS governments in support of the commitment.

According to the IMF, the Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) consists of “international reserves, central bank bilateral swap arrangements (BSAs), regional financing arrangements (RFAs), Fund resources, and market-based instruments.” The GFSN’s purpose is to “(i) provide insurance for countries against a crisis; (ii) supply financing when crises hit; and (iii) incentivize sound macroeconomic policies.”

The IMF is an international organization that works to “foster global monetary cooperation, secure financial stability, facilitate international trade, promote high employment and sustainable economic growth, and reduce poverty around the world.” The IMF is governed and financed by quotas, which are denominated in SDRs and determined by an IMF Member’s relative economic standing. In other words, quotas are the determinant of an IMF member’s financial obligations to the organization, voting power, and access to financing.

The IMF Board of Governors conducts GRQs every five years. Over the past decade, under the New Arrangements to Borrow, a group of Members has provided additional lending resources to the IMF, maintaining their relative shares as aggregate IMF quotas doubled. This change was introduced to ensure that the IMF was “adequately resourced,” or to provide the IMF with resources to operate at its optimal capacity.

The present commitment is understood in two parts. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must reaffirm its commitment to both 1) a strong and effective GFSN and 2) a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

To comply with the first part of the commitment, the BRICS member should take action to support a robust GFSN (see definition and objectives above). The GFSN refers to a wider breadth of international, regional, and domestic financial institutions. Examples of compliant actions include aligning domestic policies with regional financing arrangements or providing support to financial and market instruments that safeguard against financial crises in developing economies.

With regards to the latter half of the commitment, examples of compliance include policy actions taken with a view to increasing the BRICS members’ financial contributions to the Fund or expressing support for a future quota increase during GRQs to ensure the adequate availability of IMF financing.

Falling short of fulfilling both parts of the commitment, a BRICS member would receive a score of 0 for partial compliance if it reaffirmed its commitment to the GFSN without reference to a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF. Partial compliance would also be assigned to a BRICS member that somewhat complies with both aspects of the commitment or lacks strong compliance and concrete actions in one or the other.

Non-compliance, or a score of –1, would be assigned to a BRICS member that does not take any actions within the compliance cycle to reaffirm its pledge to a strong GFSN or reforms to the IMF’s quota system and adequate resourcing.

**Scoring Guidelines**

–1	The BRICS member DOES NOT reaffirm its commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net OR a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.
0	The BRICS Member reaffirms its commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net OR a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center OR some of both.
+1	The BRICS Member reaffirms its commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net WITH a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou*

**Brazil: 0**

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to reaffirm its commitment to maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.

On 16 July 2022, Minister of Economy Pablo Guedes attended the third meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors.<sup>198</sup> During the meeting, G20 members reiterated their commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center. Additionally, members welcomed the voluntary channeling of Special Drawing Rights and called upon the IMF to ensure the full operationalization of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust (RST) by the 2022 Annual Meetings. Furthermore, members welcomed pledges for voluntary contributions to the RST and the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust (PGRT).

On 12 October 2022, during the fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, Brazil and other G20 participants stated, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>199</sup>

<sup>198</sup> Finance Minister Sri Mulyani and Brazil’s Minister of Economy Agree to Support the Global Health and Sustainable Finance Agenda in Indonesia’s G20 Presidency, G20 (Bali) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. <https://www.g20.org/finance-minister-sri-mulyani-and-brazils-minister-of-economy-agree-to-support-the-global-health-and-sustainable-finance-agenda-in-indonesias-g20-presidency/>

<sup>199</sup> G20 Chair’s Summary - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221013-finance-chair-summary.html>

On 14 October 2022, Minister of Economy Pablo Guedes participated in the forty-sixth meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee.<sup>200</sup> During the meeting, attendees drafted a communiqué that, *inter alia*, reaffirmed their commitment to a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at the center of the GFSN. The communiqué also expressed members' interest in the operationalization of the first RST-supported programs in 2022. It further stated that members will undertake all necessary efforts to close the remaining funding gap for the PGRT through subsidies and loans.

On 16 November 2022, the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration reaffirmed the commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>201</sup>

On 16 November 2022, during the G20 Bali Summit, Brazil reaffirmed along with other G20 leaders, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th GRQ, including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>202</sup>

On 13 December 2022, Brazil participated in the first G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under India's presidency, where G20 participants exchanged views on the global financial safety net.<sup>203</sup>

Brazil has verbally reaffirmed its support for a strong and effective GFSN with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center. However, Brazil has not demonstrated strong compliance and concrete action to achieve full compliance with the commitment.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to reaffirm maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.

On 16 July 2022, Russia participated in the third meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors and signed onto a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong GFSN "with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center."<sup>204</sup>

On 12 October 2022, during the fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, Russia and other G20 participants stated, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the

---

<sup>200</sup> Chair's Statement Forty-Sixth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2022/10/14/pr22357-imfc-chair-statement-forty-sixth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

<sup>201</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022.

<http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>202</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>203</sup> India hosts the First G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under the G20 India Presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, Group of 20 – Indian Presidency (Bengaluru) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023.

<https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/fin-14/>

<sup>204</sup> G20 Chair's Summary: Third G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, G20 (Bali) 16 July 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.g20.org/g20-chairs-summary-third-g20-finance-ministers-and-central-bank-governors-meeting/>



adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>205</sup>

On 13 October 2022, Russia attended the fourth meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors and signed a joint communiqué, expressing intent to revise its quota system to ensure adequacy and “continue IMF governance reform.”<sup>206</sup>

On 28 October 2022, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin reaffirmed the importance of regional financial stability and building a strong, new global financial infrastructure at a meeting of the Heads of Government of the Commonwealth of Independent States.<sup>207</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the G20 Bali Leaders’ Declaration reaffirmed the commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>208</sup>

On 16 November 2022, during the G20 Bali Summit, Russia reaffirmed along with other G20 leaders, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th GRQ, including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>209</sup>

On 13 December 2022, Russia participated in the first G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under India’s presidency, where G20 participants exchanged views on the global financial safety net.<sup>210</sup>

Through its participation in international meetings, Russia has demonstrated reaffirmation of a strong GFSN with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center. However, Russia has failed to adopt concrete policy actions toward this commitment.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Shib-Chieh Lee*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.

---

<sup>205</sup> G20 Chair's Summary - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221013-finance-chair-summary.html>

<sup>206</sup> G20 Chair's Summary: Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, G20 (Bali) 13 October 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.g20.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/G20-Chairs-Summary-4th-FMDBG-12-13-Oct-2022.pdf>

<sup>207</sup> Restricted meeting of the CIS Council of Heads of Government, The Russian Government (Moscow) 28 October 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/46912/>

<sup>208</sup> G20 Bali Leaders’ Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>209</sup> G20 Bali Leaders’ Declaration, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>210</sup> India hosts the First G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under the G20 India Presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, Group of 20 – Indian Presidency (Bengaluru) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/fin-14/>

On 16 July 2022, India attended the third meeting of the G20 Finance Minister and Central Bank Governors and signed on to a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong GFSN, with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>211</sup>

On 5 October 2022, Minister of Finance Chancel Sarkar welcomed the achievement accomplished by the Global Partnership for Financial Inclusion (GPFI) and reaffirmed India's commitment to the GFSN.<sup>212</sup> India emphasized its proposed G20 Finance Track agenda for 2023, in which GFSN receives a special focus.

On 12 October 2022, during the fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, India and other G20 participants stated, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>213</sup>

On 13 October 2022, the Minister of Finance and Corporate Affairs addressed the importance of a strong GFSN, specifically in light of the situation in Sri Lanka, reaffirming India's commitment to a strong GFSN with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>214</sup> Additionally, the government signed the communiqué at the fourth meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, affirming its commitment to IMF governance reform and a strong quota-based system.<sup>215</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration reaffirmed the commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>216</sup>

On 16 November 2022, during the G20 Bali Summit, India reaffirmed along with other G20 leaders, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th GRQ, including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>217</sup>

On 13-14 December 2022, the first meeting of G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies was held under India's presidency, where India reaffirmed its commitment to the global financial safety net. India further proposed its G20 Finance Track agenda for 2023, which prioritizes the establishment of a robust GFSN and the issue of international debt sustainability.<sup>218</sup>

---

<sup>211</sup>G20 Chair's Summary: G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 (Bali) 16 July 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.g20.org/g20-chairs-summary-third-g20-finance-ministers-and-central-bank-governors-meeting/>

<sup>212</sup> Third Plenary Meeting of the Global Partnership for Financial Inclusion, G20 GPFI (Bali) 5 October 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022. <https://www.gpfi.org/news/gpfi-holds-its-third-plenary-under-indonesian-presidency>

<sup>213</sup> G20 Chair's Summary - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221013-finance-chair-summary.html>

<sup>214</sup>IMFC Statement by Zainab Ahmed Minister of Finance, Budget, and Planning Nigeria, International Monetary and Financial Committee (Washington D.C.) 13 October 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://meetings.imf.org/-/media/AMSM/Files/AM2022/IMFC/Nigeria.ashx>

<sup>215</sup>G20 Chair's Summary: Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20(Bali) 13 October 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.g20.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/G20-Chairs-Summary-4th-FMDBG-12-13-Oct-2022.pdf>

<sup>216</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>217</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>218</sup>India hosts the First G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under the G20 India Presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, G20 Press Release (Bengaluru) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 7 January 2023. <https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/fin-14/>

On 9-11 January 2023, the first GPFI meeting under India's G20 Presidency was held in Kolkata. Under India's leadership, G20 participants discussed the monitoring of global economic risks and the establishment of the GFSN according to India's proposed agenda.<sup>219</sup>

India has demonstrated concrete policy action to support a robust GFSN, including in its capacity as the G20 presidency. The government of India has further expressed support for strengthening the GFSN with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Shib-Chieh Lee*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.

On 25 June 2022, the People's Bank of China announced that it signed an agreement with the Bank of International Settlements to create the Renminbi Liquidity Arrangement. This agreement will provide liquidity support for central banks during periods of volatility and support the regional financial safety net.<sup>220</sup> The central banks of Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore and Chile were among the first participants.

On 4 July 2022, the People's Bank of China and the Hong Kong Monetary Authority upgraded their 2009 currency swap arrangement to a standing swap arrangement that does not need to be renewed.<sup>221</sup> The authorities also expanded the swap scale from RMB500 billion to RMB800 billion.

On 16 July 2022, Governor of the People's Bank of China Yi Gang attended the third meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors.<sup>222</sup> During the meeting, members reiterated their commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center, and welcomed the voluntary channeling of Special Drawing Rights (SDRs). Furthermore, members called upon the IMF to ensure the full operationalization of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust (RST) by the 2022 Annual Meetings and welcomed pledges for voluntary contributions to the RST and the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust (PGRT).

On 18 August 2022, Foreign Minister Wang Yi attended the Coordinators' Meeting on the Implementation of Follow-up Actions of the Eighth Ministerial Conference of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation. During the meeting, Minister Wang reiterated China's preparedness to re-channel USD10 billion of its SDRs to Africa through the PGRT. China will also encourage the IMF to direct China's contributions to Africa.<sup>223</sup>

---

<sup>219</sup> First Global Partnership for Financial Inclusion, Kolkata, G20 Press Release (Kolkata) 7 January 2023. Access Date: 7 January 2023. <https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/cabinet-approves/>

<sup>220</sup> The PBOC joined the BIS' Renminbi Liquidity Arrangement, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 25 June 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4437084/4586998/index.html>

<sup>221</sup> PBC and HKMA Signed Standing Currency Swap Agreement and Expanded Swap Size, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 4 July 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4437084/4593234/index.html>

<sup>222</sup> Governor Yi Gang Attended G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting Virtually, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 16 July 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4437084/4608332/index.html>

<sup>223</sup> Wang Yi: China Honors Its Commitments to Actively Advance Cooperation with Africa, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 18 August 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202208/t20220821\\_10747204.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202208/t20220821_10747204.html)

On 10 October 2022, the People's Bank of China renewed a bilateral currency swap arrangement with the European Central Bank for three years, with an unchanged size of RMB350 billion.<sup>224</sup>

On 12 October 2022, during the fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, China and other G20 participants stated, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>225</sup>

On 14 October 2022, Deputy Governor of the People's Bank of China Xuan Changneng participated in the forty-sixth meeting of the International Finance and Monetary Committee.<sup>226</sup> At the meeting, attendees drafted a communiqué that, *inter alia*, reaffirmed their commitment to a strong, quota-based, and adequately resourced IMF at the center of the GFSN. The communiqué also expressed members' interest in the operationalization of the first RST-supported programs later in 2022. It further stated that all members will undertake all necessary efforts to close the remaining funding gap for the PGRT through subsidies and loans.

On 12 November 2022, China committed to being a donor country to the newly established Financial Intermediary Fund for Pandemic Prevention, Preparedness, and Response (Pandemic Fund) during a meeting of G20 Health and Finance Ministers.<sup>227</sup>

On 12 November 2022, Premier Li Keqiang participated in the 25th Association of Southeast Asian Nations Plus Three Summit. During the summit, Premier Li Keqiang underscored the need to build a stronger capacity for crisis response, including by supporting efforts to make the Chiang Mai Initiative Multilateralization more readily available and effective, in addition to improving the regional financial safety net.<sup>228</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration reaffirmed the commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>229</sup> During the summit, President Xi Jinping also stated that the IMF should speed up the on-lending of Special Drawing Rights (SDRs) to low-income countries.<sup>230</sup>

On 16 November 2022, during the G20 Bali Summit, China reaffirmed along with other G20 leaders, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the

---

<sup>224</sup> PBC and ECB Extend Bilateral Currency Swap Agreement, the People's Bank of China (Beijing) 10 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688241/3688636/3688657/4678261/index.html>

<sup>225</sup> G20 Chair's Summary - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221013-finance-chair-summary.html>

<sup>226</sup> Chair's Statement Forty-Sixth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington D.C.) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2022/10/14/pr22357-imfc-chair-statement-forty-sixth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

<sup>227</sup> G20 Health and Finance Ministers Agree to Launch Pandemic Fund, G20 (Bali) 12 November 2022. Access Date: 18 November 2022. <https://www.g20.org/g20-health-and-finance-ministers-agree-to-launch-pandemic-fund/>

<sup>228</sup> Speech by H.E. Li Keqiang Premier of the State Council of the People's Republic of China At the 25th ASEAN Plus China, Japan, ROK Summit, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 June 2022. Access Date: 17 November 2022. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202211/t20221114\\_10974032.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202211/t20221114_10974032.html)

<sup>229</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>230</sup> Working Together to Meet the Challenges of Our Times and Build a Better Future, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 15 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/wjdt\\_665385/zjyh\\_665391/202211/t20221115\\_10975360.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjdt_665385/zjyh_665391/202211/t20221115_10975360.html)

process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>231</sup>

On 13 December 2022, China participated in the first G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under India's presidency, where G20 participants exchanged views on the global financial safety net.<sup>232</sup>

On 12 January 2023, Foreign Minister Qin Gang said that with respect to China's commitment to channel USD10 billion of its SDRs to Africa, "this work has seen initial progress."<sup>233</sup>

China has verbally reaffirmed its commitment to voluntarily channel a portion of its SDRs to Africa and contributed to a regional financial safety net. Furthermore, the government has verbally reaffirmed its commitment to a strong and effective GFSN with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center. In addition, it has financially supported a new global fund that will mitigate pandemic-related financial instability in developing countries, and has renewed at least two currency swap arrangements.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm maintaining a strong and effective Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) at its center.

On 30 June 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa attended the 7th Summit of the Southern African Customs Union (SACU) Heads of State or Government.<sup>234</sup> Summit participants endorsed the SACU Work Programme, which referenced a regional financing mechanism as one of its three main priorities.

On 8 July 2022, at the G20 Foreign Ministers' Meeting in Bali, Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Naledi Pandor stated that G20 agreements on post-COVID-19 recovery interventions, including access to Special Drawing Rights (SDRs), have not been fully acted upon.<sup>235</sup>

On 16 July 2022, Finance Minister Enoch Godongwana attended the third meeting of the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors.<sup>236</sup> He participated in discussions where G20 members had discussed their commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based, and adequately resourced IMF at its center and welcomed the voluntary channeling of SDRs. Members had also called upon the IMF to ensure the full operationalization of the Resilience and Sustainability

---

<sup>231</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>232</sup> India hosts the First G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under the G20 India Presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, Group of 20 – Indian Presidency (Bengaluru) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/fin-14/>

<sup>233</sup> Qin Gang: So-called China's "Debt Trap" in Africa Is a Narrative Trap Imposed on China and Africa, Embassy of the People's Republic of China in the Federal Republic of Nigeria (Abuja) 12 January 2023. Access Date: 13 January 2023. [http://ng.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgxw/202301/t20230112\\_11006510.htm](http://ng.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgxw/202301/t20230112_11006510.htm)

<sup>234</sup> Communiqué on 7th Summit of the SACU Heads of State of Government, Presidency of South Africa (Pretoria) 30 June 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/communiqu%C3%A9-7th-summit-sacu-heads-state-or-government-30-jun-2022-0000>

<sup>235</sup> Speech by the Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Dr Naledi Pandor at the G20 Foreign Minister Meeting in Bali, Indonesia, Department of International Relations and Cooperation (Pretoria) 8 July 2022. Access Date: 30 November 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/speeches/2022/pand0708.htm>

<sup>236</sup> Minister Enoch Godongwana leads SA delegation to the 3rd G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, National Treasury of South Africa (Pretoria) 18 July 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-enoch-godongwana-leads-sa-delegation-3rd-g20-finance-ministers-and-central-bank>

Trust (RST) by the 2022 Annual Meetings, and welcomed pledges for voluntary contributions to the RST and the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust (PGRT).

On 12 October 2022, during the fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting, South Africa and other G20 participants stated, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ), including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>237</sup>

On 12 November 2022, during a meeting of G20 Health and Finance Ministers, South Africa committed to being a donor country to the newly established Financial Intermediary Fund for Pandemic Prevention, Preparedness, and Response (Pandemic Fund).<sup>238</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration reaffirmed the commitment to maintaining a strong and effective GFSN with a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.<sup>239</sup>

On 16 November 2022, during the G20 Bali Summit, South Africa reaffirmed along with other G20 leaders, *inter alia*, that they remain committed to revisiting the adequacy of quotas and would continue the process of IMF governance reform under the 16th GRQ, including a new quota formula as a guide, by 15 December 2023.<sup>240</sup>

On 13 December 2022, South Africa participated in the first G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under India's presidency, where G20 participants exchanged views on the global financial safety net.<sup>241</sup>

South Africa made several verbal commitments to maintain a strong and effective GFSN with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF. In addition, the government endorsed a work programme that prioritized a regional financing mechanism and provided direct financial support to a new fund, mitigating financial instability in developing countries.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Ashton Mathias*

---

<sup>237</sup> G20 Chair's Summary - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221013-finance-chair-summary.html>

<sup>238</sup> G20 Health and Finance Ministers Agree to Launch Pandemic Fund, G20 (Bali) 12 November 2022. Access Date: 18 November 2022. <https://www.g20.org/g20-health-and-finance-ministers-agree-to-launch-pandemic-fund/>

<sup>239</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date: December 30 2022. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>240</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>241</sup> India hosts the First G20 Finance and Central Bank Deputies Meeting under the G20 India Presidency in Bengaluru, Karnataka, Group of 20 – Indian Presidency (Bengaluru) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. <https://www.g20.org/en/media-resources/press-releases/december-2022/fin-14/>

## 9. Crime and Corruption: Anti-Corruption Law Enforcement

“While respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, we are committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia	-1		
India	-1		
China	-1		
South Africa		0	
Average		-0.60 (20%)	

### Background

The five BRICS members are parties to the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC), the only legally binding universal anti-corruption instrument. The Convention focuses on five main areas of work: preventive measure, criminalization and law enforcement, international cooperation, asset recovery, and technical assistance and information exchange. As UNCAC parties, the BRICS countries have consistently placed anti-corruption on the agenda of their leaders' summits.

At the Durban Summit hosted in South Africa, the BRICS leaders adopted the eThekweni Declaration on 27 March 2013, in which the leaders acknowledged anti-corruption as an emerging area of cooperation.

On 15 July 2014, BRICS leaders met in Fortaleza, Brazil, where they committed “to combat domestic and foreign bribery, and strengthen international cooperation, including law enforcement cooperation, in accordance with multilaterally established principles and norms, especially the UNCAC.” This was the first explicit reference and commitment to anti-corruption made by BRICS leaders.

On 9 July 2015, at the Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders declared corruption a legal challenge that requires international cooperation to tackle and reaffirmed a commitment to the UNCAC. Furthermore, BRICS leaders announced the creation of a BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption Cooperation.

On 1 November 2015, the BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption met for the first time. The Group expressed its intention to work with the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group and other relevant multilateral organizations.

On 16 October 2016, at the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders stated their support for strengthening international cooperation against corruption, including on issues relating to asset recovery and persons sought for corruption, and in the context of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.

Before the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on 22 January 2017 in Berlin and on 9 April 2017 in Brasilia. On 4 September 2017, at the Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders declared their support for improving BRICS anti-corruption cooperation, reaffirming their commitment to experience-sharing and compiling a compendium on fighting corruption. BRICS leaders once again reiterated their support for strengthening anti-corruption collaboration through the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group and based on the UNCAC and other international legal instruments.

On 26 February 2018, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met in Buenos Aires, Argentina. A subsequent meeting was convened on 26 June 2018 in Paris, France.

On 28 July 2018, BRICS leaders met in Johannesburg, where they discussed the negative impacts of corruption and its effect on economic growth. The leaders reaffirmed their commitment to international cooperation under Chapter IV of UNCAC and committed to strengthening international cooperation under the BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption Cooperation, stating that “subject to our domestic legal systems, we will cooperate in an anti-corruption law enforcement, extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders and repatriation in matters relating to assets recovery and other related criminal and non-criminal matters involving corruption and call on the international community to deny safe haven to corrupt persons and proceeds of corruption.”

On 28 June 2019, on the sidelines of the G20 Osaka Summit, BRICS leaders held an informal meeting and released a joint statement. The statement reaffirmed their commitment to fighting corruption, promoting international anti-corruption cooperation, strengthening legal frameworks, improving mutual efforts in prosecuting corrupt persons, and “recogniz[ing] the need to strengthen cooperation, subject to domestic legal systems, in anti-corruption law enforcement, extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders, and in recovering stolen assets.”

On 26 July 2019, BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, where they reiterated their commitment “to strengthen[ing] the legal framework related to the resolution of cases of corruption, in accordance with the UNCAC and other multilateral principles and norms.”

On 14 November 2019, at the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders stated their “commitment to fight corruption, inter alia, through the strengthening of domestic legal frameworks, as appropriate, to more effectively address cases of corruption. We remain committed to adopting integrity measures in the public sector and promoting integrity standards in private enterprises and to build a stronger global commitment to a culture of intolerance towards corruption. We will maintain our ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings. We will make full use of the BRICS Meeting on Asset Recovery and strengthen experience-sharing and case-cooperation on asset recovery among BRICS countries. We will enhance our exchange of views within multilateral frameworks such as UNCAC and the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group, with the aim of joining efforts in denying safe haven to economic and corruption offenders and to facilitate the repatriation of proceeds of crime.”

On 3 February 2020, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on the sidelines of the G20 Meeting of the Anti-Corruption Working Group.

On 4 September 2020, BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs and International Relations met virtually due to the pandemic. They reaffirmed “their commitment to promote international anti-corruption cooperation and strengthen BRICS collaboration, subject to domestic legal systems, on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on extradition of fugitives, economics and corruption offenders and in recovering stolen assets.”

On 7 September 2020, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on the sidelines of the G20 Meeting of the Anti-Corruption Working Group. They met again on 19 October 2020.

On 17 November 2020, the BRICS leaders reiterated a commitment to promoting the UNCAC as an integral mechanism for international anti-corruption cooperation, especially “in light of the 2021 Special Session of the United Nations General Assembly against corruption, strengthen BRICS collaboration, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, on all issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on matters related to asset recovery and denying safe haven to corrupt persons and proceeds of corruption.”



On 9 September 2021, BRICS leaders adopted the New Delhi Declaration at a virtual leaders' summit hosted by India. The Declaration states: "we reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption. We will continue to enhance anti-corruption capacity building through various education and training programs. We welcome the 2021 special session of the UN General Assembly on challenges and measures to prevent and combat corruption and strengthen international cooperation, and reiterate our commitment to implement its political declaration."

On 23 June 2022, BRICS leaders pledged the present commitment in the Beijing Declaration. They also welcomed the BRICS Initiative on Denial of Safe Haven to Corruption and the first BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meeting, further committing to "strengthen anti-corruption capacity building through education and training programs and enhance anti-corruption exchanges and cooperation within multilateral frameworks."

### **Commitment Features**

The BRICS commitment reads: "while respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, we are committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery."

Through both "experience sharing" and engagement in "practical cooperation," the commitment stipulates three main areas of work in anti-corruption for BRICS countries: 1) the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, 2) mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and 3) asset recovery.

The word "committed" is a highly binding commitment word that indicates the BRICS leaders' commitment to undertaking substantial and concrete actions in line with the commitment. "Strengthen" is understood as the act of "making or becoming stronger." "Cooperation" refers to "the action or process of working together to the same end." "Law enforcement" refers to "the agencies and employees responsible for enforcing laws, maintaining public order, and managing public safety, whose primary duties include the investigation, apprehension, and detention of individuals suspected of criminal offenses."

Both components – experience sharing and practical cooperation – must be satisfied in each of the three pillars of the commitment, in order for the BRICS member to score full compliance. In addition, given the strong action verb leading the commitment, verbal reaffirmations of the commitment text or passive participation in international meetings on anti-corruption do not constitute sufficient evidence for full compliance. Policy actions that contribute to compliance must demonstrate a certain level of significance and concrete decision. For example, BRICS members can contribute to existing bilateral or multilateral initiatives or agreements, or launch new coordination programs to fulfill the "practical cooperation" criterion. On the other hand, BRICS members can participate in technical assistance programs in partnership with other BRICS members to fulfill the "experience-sharing" criterion.

First, the BRICS member must demonstrate actions in both experience sharing and practical cooperation in the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders. "Pursuit" is defined as "the act of following or searching for someone or something, in order to catch or attack the person or thing." "Offender" refers to an individual who is guilty of a crime, and in this context economic crime or a corruption offense. To comply with the first dimension of this commitment, for example, BRICS members can take actions to deny safe havens to corrupt persons and their proceeds of corruption by denial of visa or entry. BRICS members can also collaborate with other governments on extradition arrangements and prevent situations where corrupt public officials are immune or sheltered from legal prosecution due to a lack of cross-border coordination.

Second, the commitment stipulates that the BRICS leaders commit to experience sharing and practical cooperation on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters. “Mutual legal assistance” refers to “a process by which states seek for and provide assistance to other states in servicing of judicial document and gathering evidence.” For example, one country can obtain a court order on behalf of another country, usually under the auspices of authority provided by mutual legal assistance agreements. In the context of anti-corruption, “civil and administrative proceedings” refer to two types of legal liability to punish “acts perpetrated against the public administration.”

Third, “asset recovery” refers to “the process by which the proceeds of corruption transferred abroad are recovered and repatriated to the country from which they were taken or to their rightful owners.” On this third pillar of the commitment, for example, BRICS members can engage in actions that support the return of confiscated property obtained through corrupt means, collaborate across policy jurisdictions to prove ownership and determine the damage caused and victim compensations, or cooperate in the investigation and prosecution of offenses more broadly.

For full compliance, a BRICS member must take strong action to fulfil all three components of the commitment, and through both experience sharing and practical cooperation. If a BRICS member only takes strong action in one or two of the three components, or partial action therein (for example, only experience sharing and no practical cooperation across the three components), the BRICS member would score a 0 for partial compliance.

If a BRICS member takes no action to advance any component of the commitment, it would be assigned a score of -1 for non-compliance. Similarly, if the BRICS member takes action against the objective of this commitment, it is considered non-compliant.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	While respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, the BRICS Member is NOT committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, NOR on asset recovery.
0	While respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, the BRICS Member is committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, OR on asset recovery.
+1	While respecting the legal systems of our respective countries, the BRICS Member is committed to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, AND on asset recovery.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou*

**Brazil: 0**

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters and on asset recovery.

On 13 July 2022, Brazil attended the first BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meeting, where BRICS members agreed to promote experience-sharing, anti-corruption education and cooperation.<sup>242</sup> The meeting was held to support the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.<sup>243</sup>

On 20 July 2022, Brazil presented three projects on anti-corruption and countering money laundering at a G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group meeting: the National Network of Technology Laboratories Against Money Laundering (Rede-Lab), the Financial System Customer Registry (CCS) and Banking Transactions Investigation System (Simba). Both Rede-Lab and CCS employ technology to combat money laundering, with the former analyzing data for criminal investigations and the latter tracking accounts at financial institutions to support official investigations. Simba is designed to allow more efficient data transmission between banks and governments to increase transparency. All three initiatives were developed under the National Strategy to Combat Corruption and Money Laundering (Enccla).<sup>244</sup>

On 15 September 2022, the U.S. Department of Justice announced that GOL Linhas Aéreas Inteligentes S.A., a Brazilian airline company, will pay over USD41 million in settlements for bribing Brazilian officials, of which approximately USD3.4 million will be paid to the Brazilian Comptroller General and Attorney General. The joint investigation between Brazil and the US demonstrated cooperation between their criminal and civil authorities to resolve parallel bribery investigations.<sup>245</sup>

On 15-16 November 2022, Brazil renewed its commitment to zero tolerance for corruption as part of the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration.<sup>246</sup> The communiqué reaffirmed Brazil's commitment to combating cross-border corruption, bribery and the removal of safe havens for economic criminals.

On 22 December 2022, the Attorney General's Office and the Comptroller General of the Union reached a joint resolution with Keppel Offshore & Marine (KOM), a Singaporean company, with respect to payments made by a corrupt former agent in Brazil.<sup>247</sup> The settlement entails BRL343.57 million (USD65 million) in fines and damages, which KOM will pay within 30 days of signing the leniency agreement with the treasury of Brazil.

Brazil has taken some actions to strengthen experience sharing and practical cooperation on two issues: anti-corruption law enforcement and mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters. It has also undertaken practical cooperation to advance asset recovery. However, Brazil has not taken strong action in both experience sharing and practical cooperation regarding the pursuit of economic and

---

<sup>242</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communique, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/P020220715583024224584.pdf>

<sup>243</sup> Meeting of BRICS Foreign Affairs and International Affairs Ministers on the Sidelines of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil (Brasilia) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022)

<sup>244</sup> Brazil Presents Anti-Corruption Initiatives at G20 Event, Ministry of Justice and Public Security (Brasilia) 20 July 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mj/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-apresenta-iniciativas-de-combate-a-corrupcao-em-evento-do-g20>

<sup>245</sup> GOL Linhas Aéreas Inteligentes S.A. Will Pay Over \$41 Million in Resolution of Foreign Bribery Investigations in the United States and Brazil, United States Department of Justice (Washington, D.C.) 15 September 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/gol-linhas-reas-inteligentes-sa-will-pay-over-41-million-resolution-foreign-bribery>

<sup>246</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date 12 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>247</sup> Keppel O&M to Pay \$65 Million to Settle Brazil Corruption Scandal, Upstream (Singapore) 22 December 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.upstreamonline.com/finance/keppel-o-m-to-pay-65-million-to-settle-brazil-corruption-scandal/2-1-1378513>

corruption offenders, nor experience sharing with respect to asset recovery. Therefore, it has fulfilled two of the four components of the commitment.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Katherine Zhang*

### **Russia: -1**

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.

On 13 July 2022, Russia attended the first BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meeting, where BRICS members agreed to promote experience-sharing, anti-corruption education and cooperation.<sup>248</sup> The meeting was held to support the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.<sup>249</sup> The final communiqué emphasized the importance of cooperation in addressing trans-border corruption and strengthening information sharing among specialised domestic agencies. In addition, it discussed strategies in incorporating the private sector with the help of compliance and internal control mechanisms, strengthening anti-corruption education and training and cooperating to address asset recovery.<sup>250</sup>

On 16 September 2022, the Council of Heads of State of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) released a list of initiatives that were agreed upon at the SCO summit in Samarkand, Uzbekistan, on 15-16 September 2022. The final declaration reaffirmed cooperation between Prosecutor Generals' Offices and coordination on issues such as forensic investigations, information sharing and joint events. The declaration further affirmed international anti-corruption cooperation and an enhanced role for the United Nations therein.<sup>251</sup>

On 15-16 November 2022, Russia renewed its commitment to zero tolerance for corruption as part of the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration.<sup>252</sup> The communiqué reaffirmed Russia's commitment to combating cross-border corruption, bribery and the removal of safe havens for economic criminals.

On 1 January 2023, President Vladimir Putin submitted a draft law that would withdraw Russia from the European Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (CICC) in response to Russia's expulsion from the Council of Europe in March 2023.<sup>253</sup> The law, if passed, would no longer hold Russia to the same

---

<sup>248</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communique, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022.

<http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/P020220715583024224584.pdf>

<sup>249</sup> Meeting of BRICS Foreign Affairs and International Affairs Ministers on the Sidelines of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil (Brasilia) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022)

<sup>250</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communique, BRICS (Beijing) 15 July 2022. Access Date: 23 October 2022.

[http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/t20220718\\_10722916.html](http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/t20220718_10722916.html)

<sup>251</sup> The Samarkand Declaration of the Heads of State Council of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, Shanghai

Cooperation Organization (Beijing) 16 September 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022.

<http://eng.sectesco.org/load/914622/>

<sup>252</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date 12 January 2023.

<http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>253</sup> Putin Set to Withdraw Russia from Europe's Anti-Corruption Convention, Organized Crime and Corruption Reporting Project (Moscow) 12 January 2023. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.occrp.org/en/daily/17231-putin-set-to-withdraw-russia-from-europe-s-anti-corruption-convention>

standards of the CICC with respect to bribery, money laundering, insider trading or other forms of corruption.

Russia has taken several steps to strengthen experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters and asset recovery. However, Russia's actions are primarily to reaffirm BRICS commitments in bilateral and multilateral meetings, as opposed to introducing new and concrete measures. In addition, Russia has not demonstrated robust action to pursue economic and corruption offenders. Most importantly, Russia has acted in a manner contrary to the commitment by introducing domestic legislation that undermines cross-border anti-corruption law enforcement.

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Michael Shirley*

### **India: -1**

India has failed to comply with its commitment to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.

On 13 July 2022, Union Minister Jitendra Singh attended the BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meeting, reaffirming India's commitment to anti-corruption. He noted recent federal reforms to make India's anti-corruption services more user-friendly and recognized the Central Vigilance Commission's role in overseeing preventative measures. Minister Singh also reiterated the importance of international cooperation in extraditing known offenders, preventing the transferring of illegal profits overseas and implementing global anti-money laundering standards.<sup>254</sup>

On 15-16 November 2022, India renewed its commitment to zero tolerance for corruption as part of the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration.<sup>255</sup> The communiqué reaffirmed India's commitment to combating cross-border corruption, bribery and the removal of safe havens for economic criminals.

On 7 December 2022, India concluded the first Sherpa meeting in preparation for its upcoming G20 presidency.<sup>256</sup> In this context, G20 Sherpa Amitabh Kant emphasized the importance of combatting corruption and economic crime.

India has demonstrated a verbal reaffirmation of international anti-corruption efforts, covering law enforcement, the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders and asset recovery. However, India's action primarily reaffirms BRICS commitments as opposed to introducing new and concrete measures. In addition, India's action does not address mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters.

Thus, India receives a score of -1.

*Analyst: Katherine Zhang*

---

<sup>254</sup> Union Minister Dr Jitendra Singh Addresses the BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meet; Reiterates India's Commitment Against Corruption, Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances & Pensions (New Delhi) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=235162>

<sup>255</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date 12 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>256</sup> Agriculture, Trade, Anti-Corruption: Discussions on India's G20 Priorities Conclude on Day 3 of 1st Sherpa Meeting, India Today (New Delhi) 7 December 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/discussions-on-indias-g20-priorities-conclude-on-day-3-of-1st-sherpa-meeting-2306177-2022-12-07>

### **China: –1**

China has failed to comply with its commitment to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.

On 13-15 July 2022, China hosted the first BRICS Anti-corruption Ministerial Meeting, where BRICS members agreed to promote experience-sharing, anti-corruption education and cooperation.<sup>257</sup> The meeting was held to support the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.<sup>258</sup> The meeting produced the BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communiqué, which emphasized cooperating in addressing trans-border corruption and strengthening information sharing among specialised domestic agencies. In addition, it discussed strategies in incorporating the private sector with the help of compliance and internal control mechanisms, strengthening anti-corruption education and training and cooperating to address asset recovery.<sup>259</sup>

On 16 September 2022, the Council of Heads of State of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) released a list of initiatives that were agreed upon at the SCO summit in Samarkand, Uzbekistan. The final declaration reaffirmed cooperation between Prosecutor Generals' Offices and coordination on issues such as forensic investigations, information sharing, and joint events. The declaration further affirmed international anti-corruption cooperation and an enhanced role for the United Nations therein.<sup>260</sup>

On 15-16 November 2022, China renewed its commitment to zero tolerance for corruption as part of the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration.<sup>261</sup> The communiqué reaffirmed China's commitment to combating cross-border corruption, bribery and the removal of safe havens for economic criminals.

China has demonstrated a desire to work with domestic and international bodies to combat corruption, covering law enforcement, the pursuit of economic and corruption offenders and asset recovery. However, China's actions primarily reaffirm BRICS commitments as opposed to introducing new and concrete measures. In addition, China's actions do not address mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters.

Thus, China receives a score of –1.

*Analyst: Michael Shirley*

### **South Africa: 0**

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to strengthening experience sharing and practical cooperation on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on the pursuit of

---

<sup>257</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communiqué, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022.

<http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/P020220715583024224584.pdf>

<sup>258</sup> Meeting of BRICS Foreign Affairs and International Affairs Ministers on the Sidelines of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil (Brasilia) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022)

<sup>259</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communiqué, BRICS (Beijing) 15 July 2022. Access Date: 23 October 2022.

[http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/t20220718\\_10722916.html](http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/t20220718_10722916.html)

<sup>260</sup> The Samarkand Declaration of the Heads of State Council of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, Shanghai Cooperation Organization (Beijing) 16 September 2022. Access Date: 28 October 2022. <http://eng.sectesco.org/load/914622/>

<sup>261</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date 12 January 2023.

<http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

economic and corruption offenders, on mutual legal assistance in civil and administrative matters, and on asset recovery.

On 13 July 2022, South Africa attended the first BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Meeting, where BRICS members agreed to promote experience-sharing, anti-corruption education and cooperation.<sup>262</sup> The meeting was held to support the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.<sup>263</sup>

On 26 October 2022, the National Treasury released the 2022 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, introducing two bills to amend weaknesses in the legislative framework to increase transparency and report suspicious financial activities. The bills were introduced in reaction to South Africa's low score by the Financial Action Task Force and to align with international standards dedicated to anti-money laundering.<sup>264</sup>

On 15-16 November 2022, South Africa renewed its commitment to zero tolerance for corruption as part of the G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration.<sup>265</sup> The communiqué reaffirmed South Africa's commitment to combating cross-border corruption, bribery and the removal of safe havens for economic criminals.

On 13 December 2022, the National Treasury passed two bills relating to financial crimes and corruption.<sup>266</sup> Amendments to the Anti-Money Laundering and Combating Terrorism Financing Act and the Protection of Constitutional Democracy Against Terrorist and Related Activities were passed to address loopholes in South Africa's legal system that pertain to money laundering and financial crime. The amendments demonstrate South Africa's commitment to anti-corruption in accordance with international standards.

South Africa has taken significant actions to strengthen domestic responses to combat corruption. However, South Africa has not engaged in experience sharing and practical cooperation in the areas stipulated in this commitment in international or multilateral frameworks.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Katherine Zhang*

---

<sup>262</sup> BRICS Anti-Corruption Ministerial Communique, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022.

<http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/hywj/ODMM/202207/P020220715583024224584.pdf>

<sup>263</sup> Meeting of BRICS Foreign Affairs and International Affairs Ministers on the Sidelines of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Brazil (Brasilia) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/reuniao-de-ministros-de-relacoes-exterores-e-relacoes-internacionais-do-brics-nas-margens-da-77a-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-22-de-setembro-de-2022)

<sup>264</sup> SA Doing All Possible to Avoid Greylisting, South African Government News Agency (Cape Town) 26 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/sa-doing-all-possible-avoid-greylisting>

<sup>265</sup> G20 Bali Leaders' Declaration, G20 (Bali) 15-16 November 2022. Access Date 12 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/221116-declaration.html>

<sup>266</sup> National Assembly, NCOP Pass Two Money Bills, South African Government News Agency (Cape Town) 19 December 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2023. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/national-assembly-ncop-pass-two-money-bills>

## 10. Terrorism: Cross-border Movement, Terrorist Financing and Safe Havens

“We are committed to combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.”

*XIV BRICS Summit: Beijing Declaration*

### Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia		0	
India	-1		
China		0	
South Africa			+1
Average	-0.20 (40%)		

### Background

Counter-terrorism has been an important subject of discussion since the first meeting of the BRICS leaders. At the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, BRICS leaders condemned terrorism in all its forms and manifestations and called for the urgent adoption of the Comprehensive Convention Against International Terrorism. At the 2010 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders again condemned all acts of terrorism. In their declaration, the leaders noted that “the fight against international terrorism must be undertaken with due respect to the UN Charter, existing international conventions and protocols, the UN General Assembly and Security Council resolutions.” In addition, they urged the early conclusion of negotiations in the United Nations General Assembly of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.

At the 2011 Sanya Summit, in addition to voicing their condemnation of terrorism, BRICS leaders also reiterated that “the United Nations has a central role in coordinating the international against terrorism within the framework of the UN Charter and in accordance with principles and norms of the international law.” Again, BRICS leaders urged the early conclusion of the negotiations of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.

At the 2012 New Delhi Summit, BRICS leaders discussed terrorism in the context of regional stability in Afghanistan, affirming their commitment to support “Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism, and underscore the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilization of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.” In addition, the BRICS leaders again reiterated that “the United Nations has a central role in coordinating international action against terrorism, within the framework of the UN Charter and in accordance with principles and norms of international law” and urged an early adoption of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.

At the 2013 Durban Summit, BRICS leaders, following the footsteps of the preceding New Delhi Summit, discussed terrorism in the context of regional security in Afghanistan and reiterated their commitment “to support Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism, and underscore the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilization of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.” Similarly, following previous summits, they reaffirmed the UN’s central role in coordinating international counter-terrorism actions. In their declaration, BRICS leaders affirmed support for the implementation of the UN General Assembly Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy.



At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, BRICS leaders mentioned terrorism in a wide range of security-related discussions, including the activities of Boko Haram, the instability of Iraq, security issues in Afghanistan, as well as the activities of Al-Qaeda in Syria. Again, following previous summits, BRICS leaders emphasized the central role of the UN in coordinating international actions against terrorism. The leaders also affirmed their commitment to implementing the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy. In addition, for the first time, the BRICS voiced their concern with the increasing use by terrorists of information and communications technologies (ICTs).

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders discussed terrorism in a wide range of contexts including Syria, Iraq, Afghanistan, Somalia, and Kenya. Following previous summits, BRICS leaders emphasized the central role of the UN in coordinating international action against terrorism and called upon the international community to implement the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy. In addition, for the first time, the BRICS reaffirmed “their commitment to the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) International Standards on Combating Money Laundering and the Financing of Terrorism and Proliferation.”

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders discussed terrorism in the context of Syria, Afghanistan, and Iraq. The leaders also condemned recent terrorist attacks in India. They committed to strengthening cooperation in combating international terrorism at the bilateral level and in international fora. The BRICS reiterated a commitment to combat terrorist financing by intensifying cooperation in the FATF. In addition, the leaders built on previous discussions of terrorism and ICT and agreed to strengthen joint efforts to enhance security in the use of ICT. For the first time, the leaders addressed the issue of chemical and biological terrorism, and emphasized the need for launching multilateral negotiations on an international convention to suppress chemical and biological terrorism, particularly one that addresses the issue of Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMD) and terrorism. Furthermore, the BRICS leaders welcomed the establishment and first meeting of the BRICS Joint Working Group on Counter-Terrorism in New Delhi.

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders again addressed terrorism in their discussions of Afghanistan and Iraq, among other regional security hotspots. They addressed issues related to terrorist financing and ICTs. Specifically, the leaders welcomed the Meeting of BRICS High Representatives for Security Issues in Beijing, as well as the second BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group Meeting. The leaders called for the establishment of a broad international counter-terrorism coalition and committed to increasing the effectiveness of the UN counter-terrorism framework.

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders acknowledged the devastating effects of terrorism. The leaders continued their call for an international counter-terrorism coalition, encouraged the adoption of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism by the UN General Assembly, and supported the launch of multilateral negotiations on an international convention suppressing acts of chemical and biological terrorism. Furthermore, the BRICS leaders again noted the importance of combating terrorism in Afghanistan and Syria and the Financing of Terrorism and Proliferation in the FATF.

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to fight terrorism under UN frameworks, tackle the misuse of ICTs for terrorist activities, address the threat of chemical and biological terrorism, address terrorism financing, and support efforts against terrorism in Syria and Afghanistan. In addition, the leaders noted the process made in the Fourth Meeting of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group, particularly the establishment of thematic sub-working groups.

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, BRICS leaders reiterated their long-standing commitments to fight terrorism in Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan, address the threat of chemical and biological terrorism, respect the central role of the UN, and combat terrorist financing. In addition, the leaders welcomed the outcomes of the Fifth BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group and endorsed the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy. Specifically, the leaders asked the BRICS High Representatives for Security to lead

the review of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group's development of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan. On 20 November 2020, shortly after the Moscow Summit, the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy was published. The document outlined the main principles and goals of BRICS counter-terrorism cooperation.

At the 2021 New Delhi Summit, terrorism was discussed in a stand-alone section of the summit declaration entitled "Peace, Security and Counter-Terrorism Cooperation," whereby BRICS leaders discussed terrorism and its relationship to a wide range of regional conflicts, the misuse of ICT, and illicit financing. In addition to a statement condemning terrorism, the BRICS also made a clear commitment to "combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens." This commitment was reiterated at the 2022 Beijing Summit.

### **Commitment Features**

This commitment requires BRICS members to take action towards "combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations." The specification of all "forms and manifestations" indicates that many different kinds of actions against terrorism can contribute to compliance. Specifically, the BRICS specified three domains of action under which member countries should take action. Thus, there are three prongs to this commitment:

1. "Cross-border movement of terrorists": The crossing of borders is an activity that provides opportunities for exploitation by terrorist actors. However, borders also provide opportunities to disrupt and intercept terrorist activities, requiring inter-state collaboration.

The BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan lists the following actions with respect to combatting the cross-border movement of terrorists:

- Preventing the movement of terrorists in the territories of BRICS countries.
  - Exchanging best practices on immigration control to monitor and disrupt the movement of terrorists through all possible entry points like airports, maritime ports, and land routes.
  - Exchanging national experiences in the implementation and operation of Advance Passenger Information (API) and Passenger Name Record (PNR).
  - Sharing experience on the challenges faced in the prosecution of terrorist-fighters returnees and their family members, where applicable, and evolving a handbook of best practices on this issue.
  - Implementing effective border security and management to prevent and counter the flow of known and suspected terrorists.
  - Strengthening border and customs control at regular custom ports/entry points to prevent and detect cross-border movement of terrorists, illicit trafficking of cultural property, trafficking in persons, as well as the illicit trade in natural resources including gold and other precious metals and stones, minerals, charcoal and oil, and illicit trafficking in wildlife, chemical, biological, radiological, nuclear and explosive materials, for terrorist purposes.
  - Enhancing the skill and capacity of Screeners in detecting document fraud and profiling at regular custom ports/entry points and sharing good practices and national experiences.
2. "Terrorism financing networks": The evolution of terrorist organizations has led to a range of different methods employed to raise and manage funds. Understanding how a terrorist organization raises and manages funds is critical for combatting terrorist activities in the long-term.

The BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan lists the following actions towards combatting terrorism financing networks:

- Strengthening BRICS countries' capabilities to address the terrorism-organized crime nexus, where applicable, to disrupt illicit funding of terrorists.
  - Cooperating in preventing the movement of illegal funds across borders, freezing terrorist assets, and suppressing illicit trade and trafficking in drugs, arms, cultural property, and other resources.
  - Exchanging information on the sources and channels of terrorist financing, including suspicious hawala operators, travel agencies, money changers, etc.
  - Developing a Handbook on the Integration of Financial Intelligence and Risk Assessment and strengthening capabilities of financial and banking sectors to safeguard their activities from terrorist abuse.
  - Exchanging best practices for suppressing the financing of terrorism including through emerging and new methods such as online crowdfunding, digital payments, dark web, cryptocurrencies, etc.
  - Promoting, as appropriate, effective public-private partnerships for exchange of information on countering terrorism financing between competent national authorities and the private sector.
3. "Safe havens": A terrorist safe haven is "an area of relative security exploited by terrorists to indoctrinate, recruit, coalesce, train, and regroup, as well as prepare and support their operations." Safe havens allow terrorist actors to plan and inspire acts of terrorism. Thus, denying safe havens is important to undermining terrorist organizations' capacity to operate.

The BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan does not contain specific actions against terrorist safe havens. However, the UN's Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy provides useful measures that countries can take to address the underlying conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism. These actions – including measures that address prolonged unresolved conflicts, the lack of the rule of law, discrimination and political exclusion, socio-economic marginalization, and lack of good governance – target the conditions that are most likely to be present in terrorist safe havens:

- Promote a culture of peace, justice and human development, ethnic, national and religious tolerance and respect for all religions, religious values, beliefs or cultures by establishing and encouraging, as appropriate, education and public awareness programs involving all sectors.
- Continue to work to adopt such measures as may be necessary and appropriate and in accordance with obligations under international law to prohibit by law incitement to commit a terrorist act or acts and prevent such conduct.
- Eradicate poverty and promote sustained economic growth, sustainable development, and global prosperity for all.
- Pursue and reinforce development and social inclusion agendas at every level as goals in themselves, recognizing that success in this area, especially on youth unemployment, could reduce marginalization and the subsequent sense of victimization that propels extremism and the recruitment of terrorists.
- Consider putting in place, on a voluntary basis, national systems of assistance that would promote the needs of victims of terrorism and their families and facilitate the normalization of their lives. In this regard, we encourage States to request the relevant United Nations entities to help them to develop such national systems.

Full compliance with this commitment requires BRICS members to strong take action in all three domains above. Taking strong actions that fall under only one or two of the domains would count as partial compliance OR less than strong action in three areas. Lack of action in any of the three domains specified above indicates a lack of compliance OR less than strong action in less than two areas. Less than strong action refers to weaker efforts such as verbal reiterations of support or attending but not participating in meetings.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS member did NOT take any actions towards combating the cross-border movement of terrorists, terrorism financing, OR safe havens, OR less than strong action in two or less areas.
0	The BRICS member took strong action in combatting ONE or TWO of the three listed aspects of terrorism: cross-border movement of terrorists, terrorism financing networks, or safe havens OR the BRICS member took less than strong action in all three areas.
+1	The BRICS member took strong action in combatting ALL of the three listed aspects of terrorism: cross-border movement of terrorists, terrorist financing networks, or safe havens.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Wang*

**Brazil: -1**

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to take action towards combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

On 24 October 2022, Minister of Foreign Affairs Carlos Alberto Franco França met with the Chancellor of Ecuador Juan Carlos Holguín to express the government’s support for the recent signing of the Interinstitutional Cooperation Agreement between the Ministry of the Interior of Ecuador and the Ministry of Justice and Public Security of Brazil.<sup>267</sup> This bilateral agreement serves to promote cooperation in public security, fighting transnational organized crime, trafficking illicit drugs, penitentiary management and cybercrimes.

On 30 November 2022, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs confirmed that Brazil adhered to the Convention on Cybercrime by depositing a letter to the Council of Europe.<sup>268</sup> Brazil’s accession to the Convention will facilitate the combat and prosecution of cybercrimes through international cooperation.

Brazil reiterated its support for combating transnational organized crime and trafficking of illicit drugs. However, the government did not take any strong action towards the commitment.

<sup>267</sup> Comunicado Conjunto entre os Ministros das Relações Exteriores do Equador e do Brasil, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 24 October 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 October 2022. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-entre-os-ministros-das-relacoes-exteriores-do-equador-e-do-brasil](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa/comunicado-conjunto-entre-os-ministros-das-relacoes-exteriores-do-equador-e-do-brasil)

<sup>268</sup> Nota Conjunta do Ministério das Relações Exteriores e do Ministério da Justiça e Segurança Pública – Adesão do Brasil à Convenção sobre o Crime Cibernético, celebrada em Budapeste, em 23 de novembro de 2001, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 30 November 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 11 January 2023. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/nota-conjunta-do-ministerio-das-relacoes-exteriores-e-do-ministerio-da-justica-e-seguranca-publica-2013-adesao-do-brasil-a-convencao-sobre-o-crime-cibernetico-celebrada-em-budapeste-em-23-de-novembro-de-2001](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/nota-conjunta-do-ministerio-das-relacoes-exteriores-e-do-ministerio-da-justica-e-seguranca-publica-2013-adesao-do-brasil-a-convencao-sobre-o-crime-cibernetico-celebrada-em-budapeste-em-23-de-novembro-de-2001)

Thus, Brazil receives a score of  $-1$ .<sup>269</sup>

*Analyst: Pantéa Jamshidi Nouri*

**Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to take action towards combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

On 17 November 2022, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin signed an agreement with the Republic of Azerbaijan to cooperate in fighting the legalization of profits from crime and financing of terrorism in cross-border movements of money.<sup>270</sup> The agreement between Russia and the Republic of Azerbaijan combats terrorism financing networks by targeting cross-border movement of individuals financing terrorist activities.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Pantéa Jamshidi Nouri*

**India: -1**

India has failed to comply with its commitment to take action towards combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

On 27 June 2022, Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi met with the Prime Minister of Canada Justin Trudeau to discuss bilateral relations. Both leaders stressed the importance of strengthening cooperation in security and counterterrorism.<sup>271</sup>

On 16 August 2022, Minister of External Affairs Subrahmanyam Jaishankar met with Argentina's Minister of Foreign Affairs Santiago Cafiero during the Joint Commission Meeting between India and Argentina.<sup>272</sup> Both ministers reiterated the importance of eradicating terrorist safe havens and infrastructure, while disrupting terrorist networks and financing channels of cross-border terrorism.

India affirmed its support for counterterrorist measures in a meeting with the Prime Minister of Canada and the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Argentina. However, the government did not take any strong action towards combating cross-border movement of terrorists, terrorism financing nor safe havens.

Thus, India receives a score of  $-1$ .

*Analyst : Pantéa Jamshidi Nouri*

---

<sup>269</sup> Other sources consulted: [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa?b\\_start:int=0](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-imprensa?b_start:int=0), <http://www.gov.br/secretariageral>, <http://www.gov.br/segov>, <http://www.gov.br/planalto>, [https://www.gov.br/mj/pt-br/assuntos/noticias?b\\_start:int=0](https://www.gov.br/mj/pt-br/assuntos/noticias?b_start:int=0)

<sup>270</sup> Russian-Azerbaijani talks, Russian Government (Moscow) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 11 January 2023. <http://government.ru/en/news/47066/>

<sup>271</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with the Prime Minister of Canada on the sidelines of G7 Summit, Prime Minister's Office (New Delhi) 28 June 2022. Access Date: 30 October 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleseDetail.aspx?PRID=1837409>

<sup>272</sup> Joint Press Statement following the Joint Commission Meeting between India and Argentina, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 16 August 2022. Access Date: 11 January 2023. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/35654/joint+press+statement+following+the+joint+commission+meeting+between+india+and+argentina+aug+ust+26+2022>

## China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

On 9 June 2022, State Councillor and Foreign Minister Wang Yi attended the China and Central Asia Foreign Ministers' meeting to reaffirm China's commitment to maintaining political security and social stability. This meeting introduced a five-point proposal to achieve this, which included calling for joint work to combat the three forces of terrorism, separatism, and extremism. To achieve this, all nations pledged to strengthen "bilateral and multilateral coordination" and uphold the purposes and principles of the United Nations Charter.<sup>273</sup>

On 28 June 2022, Minister Wang held a phone call with Acting Foreign Minister of the Afghan Interim Government Amir Khan Muttaqi related to combatting security threats. The parties expressed the necessity to make joint efforts to combat terrorism in Afghanistan, such as through strengthening cooperation in the international arena through the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO).<sup>274</sup>

On 12 September 2022, External Security Commissioner of the Foreign Ministry Cheng Guoping held the first meeting on the "consultation mechanism on counterterrorism and deradicalization cooperation" with Chair of the International Center of Excellence for Countering Violent Extremism of the United Arab Emirates Ali Al Nuaimi. The meeting covered discussions on the current international and regional situations counterterrorism in their respective nations, as well as counterterrorism security concerns. Additionally, representatives of victims of terrorism from the People's Government of Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region spoke on their personal experiences of terrorist attacks in China.<sup>275</sup>

On 16 September 2022, President Xi Jinping attended the 22nd SCO to reaffirm his support for Central Asian countries in the safeguarding of their national sovereignty and security against any external forces' inferences.<sup>276</sup> This reaffirmation resulted in proposed initiatives such as the Global Security Initiative with aims to reinforce "international cooperation and solidarity to address global challenges."<sup>277</sup> Additionally, President Jinping announced the establishment of a China-SCO base for training counter-terrorism personnel, and a commitment to providing emergency humanitarian assistance of grain and other supplies worth RMB1.5 billion.

On 20 September 2022, Minister Wang met with Mali's Foreign Minister Abdoulaye Diop to discuss China providing support and assistance for Mali's stable development. The meeting discussed how

---

<sup>273</sup> FM attends third C+C5 foreign ministers' meeting in Kazakhstan, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 9 June 2022. Access Date 20 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202206/09/content\\_WS62a13e04c6d02e533532be21.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202206/09/content_WS62a13e04c6d02e533532be21.html)

<sup>274</sup> FM talks with Afghan acting FM on phone, The State Council, (Beijing) 28 June 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202206/28/content\\_WS62ba5481c6d02e533532cd67.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202206/28/content_WS62ba5481c6d02e533532cd67.html)

<sup>275</sup> China and the UAE Hold the First Meeting of the Consultation Mechanism on Counterterrorism and Deradicalization Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 18 September 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/wjbxw/202209/t20220919\\_10767793.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202209/t20220919_10767793.html)

<sup>276</sup> A Trip that Pointed the Way Forward in Turbulent Times and Reinvigorated the Ancient Silk Road, State Councillor and Foreign Minister Wang Yi on President Xi Jinping's Attendance at the Samarkand Summit of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization and State Visits to Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 17 September 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022.

[https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202209/t20220917\\_10767432.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202209/t20220917_10767432.html)

<sup>277</sup> SCO injects more positivity into regional stability, development as Xi's proposals win hearts of int'l community, Ministry of National Defense of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 18 September 2022. Access Date: 21 October 2022. [http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2022-09/18/content\\_4921361.html](http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2022-09/18/content_4921361.html)

their continued mutually beneficial cooperation will help towards overcoming concerns on national sovereignty and contribute towards “fighting terrorism and safeguarding national unity” in Mali.<sup>278</sup>

On 29 October 2022, Minister Wang held a video conference with foreign ministers of countries neighbouring Afghanistan to help “achieve lasting peace and stability in the country.”<sup>279</sup> He proposed ideas included strengthening counter-terrorism cooperation through supporting the Afghan government in effectively combatting all extremist and terrorist organizations, as well as forging a “united front against terrorism” through multilateral platforms such as the UN and the SCO. Additionally, Minister Wang called for encouraging Afghanistan to take an inclusive political stance through protecting the basic rights of all citizens and pursue policies of cooperation.

On 10 December 2022, President Xi hosted the first China-Arab States Summit to discuss their mutual support for safeguarding sovereignty and national dignity.<sup>280</sup> Further agreements included the need to reject all associations of terrorism, support deradicalization and advocate for peace and justice.

On 29 December 2022, spokesperson for the Ministry of National Defense Senior Colonel Tan Kefei held a press conference.<sup>281</sup> He stated that the Chinese military had participated in meetings of the Experts’ Working Group on Counter-terrorism and on Peacekeeping Operations under Association of Southeast Asian Nations Defence Ministers Meeting Plus.

On 6 January 2023, President Xi held talks with Turkmenistan’s President Serdar Berdimuhamedov on strengthening their strategic partnership.<sup>282</sup> Both sides expressed the need to deepen their cooperation on security through working together to crack down on terrorism, separatism and extremism in their respected nations.

China has taken strong actions to address terrorist safe havens. However, it has not taken strong actions to address the cross-border movement of terrorists or terrorism financing.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Vanessa Mabelle*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross border-movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

On 15 July 2022, Home Affairs Minister Dr Aaron Motsoaledi affirmed the importance of the Border Management Authority in protecting the security of South Africa. The speech reaffirmed that any entry into South Africa had to be through the Ports of Entry, which included new procedures of giving

---

<sup>278</sup> Wang Yi Meets with Foreign Minister Abdoulaye Diop of Mali, Ministry of Foreign Affairs for the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 20 October 2022.

[https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202209/t20220923\\_10770366.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202209/t20220923_10770366.html)

<sup>279</sup> FM calls for stronger cooperation among neighbouring countries of Afghanistan for lasting peace, stability, The State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 29 October 2022. Access Date: 1 November 2022.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202110/29/content\\_WS617b376ec6d0df57f98e431f.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202110/29/content_WS617b376ec6d0df57f98e431f.html)

<sup>280</sup> Xi calls for fostering closer China-Arab community with shared future, Ministry of National Defense of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 10 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2022-12/10/content\\_4928127.htm](http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2022-12/10/content_4928127.htm)

<sup>281</sup> Regular Press Conference of the Ministry of National Defense on December 29, Ministry of National Defense of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 31 December 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [http://eng.mod.gov.cn/focus/2022-12/31/content\\_4930355.htm](http://eng.mod.gov.cn/focus/2022-12/31/content_4930355.htm)

<sup>282</sup> Chinese, Turkmen presidents hold talks, elevating ties to comprehensive strategic partnership, Ministry of National Defense of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing), 7 January 2023. Access Date: 10 January 2023. [http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2023-01/07/content\\_4930175.htm](http://eng.mod.gov.cn/news/2023-01/07/content_4930175.htm)

biometrics and staying at a Refugee Reception centre.<sup>283</sup> The new method aims to ensure the nation can keep track of every individual's action in the country.

On 10 August 2022, Minister in the Presidency Mondli Gungubele visited the Sedibeng District Municipality to express the need to mobilize the public in supporting Government effort to eradicate poverty and reduce inequality.<sup>284</sup> The visit saw Minister Gungubele interact with citizens regarding the need to improve access to government services to achieve such commitment.

On 18 August 2022, Minister of Finance Enoch Godongwana introduced the General Laws (Anti-Money Laundering and Combating Terrorism Financing) Amendment Bill to the National Assembly. The Amendment Bill aims to make significant changes to relevant laws related to fighting against financial crimes.<sup>285</sup> The proposed amendment is composed of five pieces of legislation, including amending the “powers of access by authorized representatives to records of accountable institutions” and amending offences provisions.

On 21 September 2022, Minister of Health Dr Joe Phaahla attended the 10th India-Brazil-South Africa (IBSA) Trilateral Ministerial Commission to underscore the importance of the values and principles that underpin the IBSA. The meeting included reaffirming solidarity to fighting against terrorism and eliminating safe havens, such as through supporting the adoption of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism in the United Nations General Assembly.<sup>286</sup> Additionally, the meeting welcomed the establishment of the IBSA National Security Advisors Meetings to enhance their cooperation on counter-terrorism and transnational crime.

On 13 October 2022, Deputy President David Mabuz held a meeting with traditional and khoi-san leaders to discuss the need to sustain their leaderships against possible interferences.<sup>287</sup> The meeting included calling for traditional leaders to sustain their significant roles in standing against all forms of violence and attacks that can interfere their lands. Additionally, the meeting called for cooperation to targeting investments in infrastructure and accessibility to services to provide people with basic needs.

On 9 November 2022, Minister Gungubele reiterated the country's commitment to combatting acts of terrorism and illicit financing activities in the nation. He agreed to work with its US counterparts to combat all manifestations of terrorism, including any form of terrorist funding.<sup>288</sup>

On 6 January 2023, President Cyril Ramaphosa enacted the General Laws (Anti-Money Laundering and Combatting Terrorism Financing) Amendment Act No 22 and the Protection of Constitutional

---

<sup>283</sup> Minister Aaron Motsoaledi: Deployment of first group of Border Management Authority Border Guards, South African Government (Pretoria) 15 July 2022. Access Date: 22 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-aaron-motsoaledi-deployment-first-group-border-management-authority-border-guards>

<sup>284</sup> Minister Mondli Gungubele conducts a frontline monitoring programme in Sedibeng as part of Gauteng Presidential Imbizo, South African Government (Pretoria) 10 August 2022. Access Date: 22 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-mondli-gungubele-conducts-frontline-monitoring-programme-sedibeng-part-gauteng>

<sup>285</sup> General Laws (Anti-Money Laundering and Combating Terrorism Financing) Amendment Bill, South African Government (Pretoria) 18 August 2022. Access Date: 22 October 2022. [https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis\\_document/202208/46744gon2993.pdf](https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_document/202208/46744gon2993.pdf)

<sup>286</sup> Joint Communiqué of the 10th IBSA Trilateral Ministerial Commission Meeting, Department of International Relations and Cooperation (Pretoria) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 22 October 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2022/ibsa0921.htm>

<sup>287</sup> Deputy President David Mabuza: Traditional and Khoi-San Leaders engagement, South African Government (Pretoria) 13 October 2022. Access Date: 22 October 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/opening-remarks-deputy-president-david-mabuza-delivered-engagement-traditional-and-khoi-san>

<sup>288</sup> Minister Mondli Gungubele reiterates South Africa's resolve to combat acts of terrorism and illicit funding, South African Government (Pretoria) 9 November 2022. Access Date: 8 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/terrorism-and-illicit-financing%C2%A09-nov-2022-0000>



Democracy against Terrorism and Related Activities Amendment Act No 23 into law.<sup>289</sup> These new laws refine the offences of terrorist financing to target supporters of terrorist organizations and target forms of cyber-terrorism.

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to combatting terrorism in all forms of its manifestations. It has taken strong actions to prevent the movement of terrorists through implementing effective border security and introduced policies to suppress the financing of terrorism. Additionally, it has introduced policies that have aimed to deny safe havens to terrorists through aiming to promote a culture of peace and economic growth, demonstrating full compliance with this commitment.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Vanessa Mabelle*

---

<sup>289</sup> Treasury on enactment of key anti-monitoring laundering and combating of terror financing laws, South African Government (Pretoria) 6 January 2023. Access Date: 8 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/treasury-enactment-key-anti-money-laundering-and-combating-terror-financing-laws-6-jan-2023>

## 11. Regional Security: Afghanistan

“We emphasize the need for all sides to encourage the Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.20 (40%)	

### Background

Afghanistan and its people face severe political, security and socioeconomic challenges due to ongoing regional instability and recent political events. The fall of central government in August 2021 after a long armed stand-off against Taliban and other militant and terrorist groups caused massive civil unrest and credible apprehension concerning further internal deterioration and regional instability. In September 2021, the United Nations Security Council adopted the Resolution 2596 (2021) concerning the recent developments in political situation in the country that extended the mandate of the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA) until 17 March 2022. The Council stressed “the critical importance of a continued presence of UNAMA and other United Nations Agencies, Funds and Programmes across Afghanistan, and calls upon all Afghan and international parties to coordinate with UNAMA in the implementation of its mandate and to ensure the safety, security and freedom of movement of United Nations and associated personnel throughout the country.”<sup>290</sup> As of the moment this guideline was commended, the UNAMA headquarters remained temporary relocated to Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan, due to personnel security considerations.<sup>291</sup>

The BRICS leaders first addressed the situation in Afghanistan in 2012 in Delhi Summit Declaration committing to “support Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism” and underscoring “the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilisation of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.”<sup>292</sup> This commitment was reaffirmed in Durban in 2013.<sup>293</sup> Also in 2013 the BRICS Leaders for the first time expressed their full support for the decisions made in Bonn in 2011 concerning the interior situation in Afghanistan and capacity-building measures of the country’s central government. In 2014 in Fortaleza the BRICS leaders committed again “to remain engaged in Afghanistan during the transformation decade (2015-2024), as enunciated at the Bonn International Conference in December 2011.”<sup>294</sup>

<sup>290</sup> Resolution 2596 (2021), United Nations (New York) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 17 October 2022. [https://undocs.org/en/S/RES/2596\(2021\)](https://undocs.org/en/S/RES/2596(2021))

<sup>291</sup> UN statement on temporary relocation of the UNAMA staff to Almaty, United Nations Kazakhstan (Nur-Sultan) 20 August 2021. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://kazakhstan.un.org/en/140984-un-statement-temporary-relocation-unama-staff-almaty>

<sup>292</sup> Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/Fourth%20BRICS%20Summit.pdf>

<sup>293</sup> Fifth BRICS Summit, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/130327-statement.pdf>

<sup>294</sup> Fortaleza Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 17 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th\\_BRICS\\_Summit\\_Fortaleza\\_Declaration\\_and\\_Action\\_Plan.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf)

In 2015 during Russia's presidency the BRICS leaders called upon the international community "to remain engaged in Afghanistan and fulfill its long-term commitments on civilian and security assistance, including strengthening its security forces' capability."<sup>295</sup>

In 2016 in Goa declaration the BRICS leaders expressed "deep concern at the persisting security challenges in Afghanistan and significant increase in terrorist activities in Afghanistan" and reaffirmed "support to the efforts of the Afghan Government to achieve Afghan-led and Afghan-owned national reconciliation and combat terrorism, and readiness for constructive cooperation in order to facilitate security in Afghanistan, promote its independent political and economic course, becoming free from terrorism and drug trafficking."<sup>296</sup> The BRICS commitment to "Afghan-led and Afghan-owned" peace and national reconciliation has been affirmed again in 2017 in Xiamen,<sup>297</sup> in 2018 in Johannesburg,<sup>298</sup> in 2019 in Brasilia,<sup>299</sup> and in 2020 in Moscow.<sup>300</sup>

In 2021 during India's presidency the BRICS members stressed "the need to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country" along with "the need to address the humanitarian situation and to uphold human rights, including those of women, children and minorities."<sup>301</sup>

In 2022 in Beijing the BRICS leaders expressed strong support for a "a peaceful, secure and stable Afghanistan" and emphasized "the respect for its sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity, national unity and non-interference in its internal affairs." While highlighting "the need for all sides to encourage the Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation," the BRICS countries put stress on "the significance of relevant UNSC resolutions."<sup>302</sup>

### **Commitment Features**

Following the commitment's reading, the BRICS countries pledged to "encourage the Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation."

"Dialogue" refers to "a discussion between representatives of parties to a conflict that is aimed at resolution."<sup>303</sup>

---

<sup>295</sup> VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf)

<sup>296</sup> Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>297</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>298</sup> 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG\\_DECLARATION.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf)

<sup>299</sup> 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News\\_ciir/Project/BRICS\\_new\\_downloadings/2019/11th\\_BRICS\\_Summit\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf)

<sup>300</sup> XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsdatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>301</sup> XIII BRICS Summit – New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 09 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsdatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>302</sup> XIV BRICS Summit Beijing Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 23 June 2022. Access Date: 17 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2022/XIV-BRICS-Summit-Beijing-Declaration-ENG.pdf>

<sup>303</sup> Dialogue Definition & Meaning, Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/dialogue>

“Negotiation” means “the action of process of negotiating or being negotiated.”<sup>304</sup> Thus, “negotiate” refers to “to arrange for or bring about through conference, discussion, and compromise.”<sup>305</sup>

Finally, “reconciliation” implies “to restore to friendship or harmony.”<sup>306</sup>

In practice it means that the BRICS countries could participate in or organize bilateral and multilateral talks, meetings, conferences, workshops, etc. in other countries or within their own territory in order to bring conflicting parties in Afghanistan to a peaceful settlement of internal disputes.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS members have to take strong actions that match the commitment’s features. Strong action in this regard implies taking steps as to facilitate internal Afghan reconciliation process that goes beyond a mere demonstration of support for the local authorities, namely organizing multilateral talks involving representatives of Afghani authorities or other local political parties.

Organizing multilateral talks that touches upon the situation in Afghanistan without direct participation of the country government representatives or other political powers or movements stands for partial compliance and is awarded a score of 0. As to achieve partial compliance, the BRICS member may also participate in multilateral events related to internal situation in Afghanistan organized by third parties. Demonstration of public support for peaceful reconciliation in Afghanistan also contributes to partial compliance.

Lack of any action that matches abovementioned requirements (e.g. participating in talks or demonstrating public support for a peaceful reconciliation of Afghanistan’s internal issues) is treated as non-compliance and is awarded with a score of -1.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS member does not take any action as to achieve national reconciliation in Afghanistan through dialogue and negotiation.
0	The BRICS member participates in multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan organized by third parties OR demonstrates public support for the process.
+1	The BRICS member organizes multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan involving representatives of local political powers.

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

**Brazil: 0**

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment on Afghanistan’s national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.

On 23 June 2022, Brazil’s Permanent Representative in the United Nations Ambassador Ronaldo Costa Filho made a statement on the Security Council meeting. In his speech he said that lifesaving aid of the international community must continue to flow to alleviate the suffering of the vulnerable in Afghanistan, and humanitarian assistance to the Afghan people does not and should not constitute a violation of the sanctions regime. He also emphasized that Brazil reiterates its full support to the work of both the Special Representative of the Secretary General to Afghanistan and the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA) in their mandate to support and promote gender

<sup>304</sup> Negotiation Definition & Meaning, Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/negotiation>

<sup>305</sup> Negotiate Definition & Meaning, Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/negotiate>

<sup>306</sup> Reconcile Definition & Meaning, Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 17 October 2022. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/reconciling>

equality, women's and girls' empowerment and the full protection of their human rights, including education, and the full, equal, meaningful and safe participation, engagement and leadership of women at all levels and stages of decision-making, in line with resolution 1325 (2000) and related resolutions.<sup>307</sup>

Brazil supported UNAMA but did not initiate any dialogue itself.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with the commitment on Afghanistan's national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.

On 27 July, 2022, Russia participated in the meeting of Special Envoys (Special Representatives) of Afghanistan's Neighboring Countries on the Afghan Issue at the Tashkent International High-Level Conference on Afghanistan. Special Envoys and officials in charge of Afghan affairs of China, Pakistan, Iran and Tajikistan attended the meeting. The participants agreed to strengthen coordination and cooperation related to Afghan affairs, speed up efforts to follow up and implement the outcomes of the previous meetings, and push the establishment of three working groups on politics and diplomacy, economy and humanity, and security and stability as soon as possible.<sup>308</sup>

On 24 August 2022, Russia participated in the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation Defence Ministers' meeting in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. Russia declared full support to a peaceful, secure and stable Afghanistan, and emphasized the need to respect the principles of sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity, national unity and non-interference in internal affairs. The meeting participants urged all parties to encourage Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation and establish a broad-based, inclusive and representative political structure in the country. The participants also underlined the importance of United Nations Security Council resolutions in this regard.<sup>309</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the 4th meeting of multilateral format of consultations on Afghanistan mostly referred as Moscow format of a so-called "took place in Moscow. Representatives of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan attended the meeting as main negotiating parties along with spokespersons from the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia and Turkey as guest parties. The participants discussed issues related to Afghanistan's international position, namely the issue of the country's gold and currency reserves frozen by the United States. The meeting concluded with a joint statement presenting the participants' position on

---

<sup>307</sup> Statement by the Permanent Representative, Ambassador Ronaldo Costa Filho, at the Security Council meeting on Afghanistan - June 23, 2022, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 23 June 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/Brasil-CSNU/discursos-artigos-e-entrevistas/discursos/janeiro-2022/junho-2022/declaracao-do-representante-permanente-embaixador-ronaldo-costa-filho-em-reuniao-do-conselho-de-seguranca-sobre-afeganistao-23-de-junho-de-2022-texto-em-ingles>.

<sup>308</sup> Special Envoy on Afghan Affairs of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Yue Xiaoyong Chairs the Meeting of Special Envoys (Special Representatives) of Afghanistan's Neighboring Countries on the Afghan Issue, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 27 July 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202207/t20220727\\_10728861.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202207/t20220727_10728861.html).

<sup>309</sup> SCO member states must fight together & eliminate terrorism in all its forms: Raksha Mantri during Defence Ministers' meet in Uzbekistan, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (Beijing) 24 August 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1854128>.

the interior reconciliation process and a call to the countries in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization to pay contributions to restore the harm caused during the 20-year-long military intervention.<sup>310</sup>

Russia has participated in multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan organized by third parties and demonstrated public support for the process.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **India: 0**

India has partially complied with the commitment on Afghanistan's national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.

On 24 August 2022, Indian Defense Minister Shri Rajnath Singh participated in the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation Defence Ministers' meeting in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. Shri Rajnath Singh highlighted India's full support of a peaceful, secure and stable Afghanistan, while emphasizing the need to respect its sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity, national unity and non-interference in internal affairs. He urged all parties to encourage Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation and establish a broad-based, inclusive and representative political structure in the country. He also underlined the importance of United Nations Security Council resolutions in this regard.<sup>311</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the 4th meeting of multilateral format of consultations on Afghanistan mostly referred as "Moscow format" took place in Moscow. Representatives of India, China, Pakistan, Iran, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan attended the meeting as main negotiating parties along with spokespersons from the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia and Turkey as guest parties. The participants discussed issues related to Afghanistan's international position, namely the issue of the country's gold and currency reserves frozen by the United States. The meeting concluded with a joint statement presenting the participants' position on the interior reconciliation process and a call to the countries in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization to pay contributions to restore the harm caused during the 20-year-long military intervention.<sup>312</sup>

India has participated in multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan organized by third parties and demonstrated public support for the process.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepon*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with the commitment on Afghanistan's national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.

---

<sup>310</sup> The Moscow Format on Afghanistan Participants Called On the USA to Unblock Afghanistan's Assets, Interfax (Moscow) 16 November 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 09 January 2023. <https://www.interfax.ru/world/872746>

<sup>311</sup> SCO member states must fight together & eliminate terrorism in all its forms: Raksha Mantri during Defence Ministers' meet in Uzbekistan, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India 24 August 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1854128>.

<sup>312</sup> The Moscow Format on Afghanistan Participants Called On the USA to Unblock Afghanistan's Assets, Interfax (Moscow) 16 November 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 09 January 2023. <https://www.interfax.ru/world/872746>

On July 27, 2022, Special Envoy on Afghan Affairs of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China Yue Xiaoyong chaired the meeting of Special Envoys (Special Representatives) of Afghanistan's Neighboring Countries on the Afghan Issue at the Tashkent International High-Level Conference on Afghanistan. Special Envoys and officials in charge of Afghan affairs of Russia, Pakistan, Iran and Tajikistan attended the meeting. The participants agreed to strengthen coordination and cooperation related to Afghan affairs, speed up efforts to follow up and implement the outcomes of the previous meetings, and push the establishment of three working groups on politics and diplomacy, economy and humanity, and security and stability as soon as possible.<sup>313</sup>

On 28 July 2022, Chinese State Councilor and Foreign Minister Wang Yi met with Acting Foreign Minister of the Afghan Interim Government Amir Khan Muttaqi on the sidelines of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) foreign ministers' meeting. Minister Wang emphasized that China would continue to urge the United States and other Western countries to remove unreasonable sanctions on Afghanistan.<sup>314</sup>

On 1 August 2022, Special Envoy Yue held talks with Director-General of the Department of South Asia of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Turkey. The two sides exchanged views on the current situation in Afghanistan and agreed to strengthen dialogue and cooperation on Afghanistan-related issues both bilaterally and multilaterally and jointly push for an early realization of peace, stability and development in Afghanistan.<sup>315</sup>

On 24 August 2022, China participated in the SCO Defence Ministers' meeting in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. China declared full support for a peaceful, secure and stable Afghanistan, while emphasizing the need to respect its sovereignty, independence, territorial integrity, national unity and non-interference in internal affairs. The meeting's participants urged all parties to encourage Afghanistan authorities to achieve national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation and establish a broad-based, inclusive and representative political structure in the country. The participants also underlined the importance of United Nations Security Council resolutions in this regard.<sup>316</sup>

On 16 November 2022, the 4th meeting of multilateral format of consultations on Afghanistan mostly referred as "Moscow format" took place in Moscow. Representatives of China, India, Pakistan, Iran, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan attended the meeting as main negotiating parties along with spokespersons from the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia and Turkey as guest parties. The participants discussed issues related to Afghanistan's international position, namely the issue of the country's gold and currency reserves frozen by the United States. The meeting concluded with a joint statement presenting the participants' position on the interior reconciliation process and a call to the countries in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization to pay contributions to restore the harm caused during the 20-year-long military intervention.<sup>317</sup>

---

<sup>313</sup> Special Envoy on Afghan Affairs of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Yue Xiaoyong Chairs the Meeting of Special Envoys (Special Representatives) of Afghanistan's Neighboring Countries on the Afghan Issue, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 27 July 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202207/t20220727\\_10728861.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202207/t20220727_10728861.html).

<sup>314</sup> Wang Yi Meets with Acting Foreign Minister of the Afghan Interim Government Amir Khan Muttaqi, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 29 July 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/wjdt\\_665385/wshd\\_665389/202207/t20220729\\_10730548.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjdt_665385/wshd_665389/202207/t20220729_10730548.html).

<sup>315</sup> Special Envoy on Afghan Affairs of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Yue Xiaoyong Visits Türkiye, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 2 August 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202208/t20220803\\_10733210.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202208/t20220803_10733210.html).

<sup>316</sup> SCO member states must fight together & eliminate terrorism in all its forms: Raksha Mantri during Defence Ministers' meet in Uzbekistan, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India 24 August 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1854128>.

<sup>317</sup> The Moscow Format on Afghanistan Participants Called On the USA to Unblock Afghanistan's Assets, Interfax (Moscow) 16 November 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 09 January 2023. <https://www.interfax.ru/world/872746>

China has participated in multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan organized by third parties and demonstrated public support for the process.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Andrey Sheleпов*

**South Africa: -1**

South Africa has failed to comply with the commitment on Afghanistan's national reconciliation through dialogue and negotiation.

No action on supporting multilateral talks aimed at achieving national reconciliation in Afghanistan organized by third parties or demonstration of public support for the process has been found.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.<sup>318</sup>

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>318</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: Government of South Africa <https://www.gov.za/>; Department of International Relations & Cooperation <http://www.dirco.gov.za/>; the Presidency <https://www.thepresidency.gov.za/>; Parliament of the Republic of South Africa <https://www.parliament.gov.za/>; South African News Agency <https://www.sanews.gov.za/>



## 12. ICT and Digital Economy: Open ICT Environment

“We reaffirm our commitment to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT [information and communications technologies]-environment, [underscoring the importance of enhancing common understandings and intensifying cooperation in the use of ICTs and Internet.]”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

### Background

The BRICS first addressed issues related to information and communication technologies (ICT) during Russia’s BRICS presidency in 2015. In the Ufa Declaration the BRICS leaders highlighted the importance of an “open, non-fragmented and secure Internet.”<sup>319</sup> In 2016, the BRICS noted the need for “enhanced cooperation in ecommerce” and declared support for “efforts aimed at capacity building for effective participation in e-commerce trade.”<sup>320</sup>

The digital economy itself was discussed during China’s BRICS presidency in 2017. In the Xiamen Declaration, the BRICS leaders committed to “act on the basis of principles of innovation, partnership, synergy, flexibility, open and favorable business environment, trust and security, protection of consumer rights in order to ensure the conditions for a thriving and dynamic digital economy, that will foster global economic development and benefit everyone.”<sup>321</sup>

In 2019 under the Brazilian BRICS presidency, the BRICS communication ministers held a meeting in Brasilia. The parties committed to work together on connectivity, innovation, security, human development, fostering digital transformation and promoting digital governance.<sup>322</sup> The BRICS leaders underscored “the importance of an open, secure, peaceful, stable, accessible and nondiscriminatory environment for information and communications technologies” and committed to “explore in appropriate fora ways to promote and facilitate investments in productive sectors, ecommerce, micro, small and medium sized enterprises, infrastructure and connectivity, which will help to promote economic growth, trade and job creation.”<sup>323</sup>

In 2020, the BRICS leaders recognized “the role of the digital economy as an important tool for modernization and transformation of the industry, promotion of inclusive economic growth, support

<sup>319</sup> VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf)

<sup>320</sup> Goa Declaration October 16, 2016, RANEPa (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>321</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>322</sup> Declaration of the 5th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting, RANEPa (Moscow) 14 August 2019. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News\\_ciir/Project/BRICS\\_new\\_downloadings/2019/](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/)

<sup>323</sup> 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News\\_ciir/Project/BRICS\\_new\\_downloadings/2019/11th\\_BRICS\\_Summit\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf)

of seamless global trade and business conduct” and highlighted the need to focus on “overcoming the digital divide.”<sup>324</sup>

The BRICS launched cooperation “in order to address common security challenges in the use of ICT in 2015.”<sup>325</sup> In Goa the BRICS agreed to strengthen joint efforts to enhance security in the use of ICTs and “to continue to work together for the adoption of the rules, norms and principles of responsible behaviour of States including through the process of UNGGE [United Nations Group of Governmental Experts].”<sup>326</sup> In 2017 the BRICS decided to promote cooperation according to the BRICS Roadmap of Practical Cooperation on Ensuring Security in the Use of ICTs and acknowledged the initiative of the Russian Federation on a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation in ensuring security in the use of ICT<sup>327</sup>. The leaders underscored “the UN a central role in developing universally accepted norms of responsible state behavior in the use of ICTs to ensure a peaceful, secure, open, cooperative, stable, orderly, accessible and equitable ICT environment” and reiterated its importance at each subsequent summit. In 2018 the BRICS acknowledged the importance of establishing a framework of cooperation among BRICS member States on ensuring security in the Use of ICTs and, in agreed to work towards consideration and elaboration of a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation on this matter.<sup>328</sup> In 2019 and 2020 the BRICS welcomed the establishment and progress of a UN open-ended working group and the UNGGE and reaffirmed the importance of establishing legal frameworks of cooperation among BRICS member States on ensuring security in the use of ICT as a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation on ensuring security in the use of ICTs or bilateral agreements among BRICS countries on the matter.<sup>329</sup>

In 2021, the BRICS nations reaffirmed commitment to the “promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment” and highlighted “the importance of establishing legal frameworks of cooperation among BRICS States on this matter.”<sup>330</sup>

In 2022 in Beijing the BRICS member states reaffirmed their commitment to “the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment” and underscored “the importance of enhancing common understandings and intensifying cooperation in the use of ICTs and Internet.”<sup>331</sup>

### **Commitment Features**

In New Delhi the BRICS leaders committed to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT environment. Also, the BRICS members again highlighted “the role of the United Nations in promoting dialogue, to forge common understandings in the security of and in the use of

---

<sup>324</sup> XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>325</sup> VII BRICS Summit, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/ruspresidency2/Declaration\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf)

<sup>326</sup> Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>327</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>328</sup> 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG\\_DECLARATION.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf)

<sup>329</sup> 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration , RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News\\_ciir/Project/BRICS\\_new\\_downloadings/2019/11th\\_BRICS\\_Summit\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf)

<sup>330</sup> XIII BRICS Summit – New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>331</sup> XIV BRICS Summit Beijing Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 23 June 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/briks/2022/XIV-BRICS-Summit-Beijing-Declaration-ENG.pdf>

ICT and development of universally agreed norms, rules and principles for responsible behaviour of States in the realm of ICT, without prejudice to other relevant international fora.”

Finding common ground for understanding the issues relating to ‘open, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment’ remains on the top of the international agenda. The UNGGE has contributed much to bringing the multilateral consensus on the topic into life and its widely acknowledged<sup>332</sup> list of 11 voluntary, non-binding norms of responsible State behavior in the cyberspace<sup>333</sup> could serve as a basis for further assessment of the BRICS member states actions on fulfilling the commitment under consideration.

Following the recommendations given by the UNGGE, we thus have three dimensions for assessing the states behavior in the cyberspace regarding ‘promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment’. These dimensions include: 1) adherence to the voluntary, non-binding norms of responsible behavior in cyberspace; 2) actions referring to capacity building in use of ICT; and 3) confidence-building measures. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member shall take actions aimed at capacity building and confidence building and shall not take steps that could be regarded as breaking the recommended rules of responsible state behavior in the cyberspace.

### **Rules/Principles of responsible behavior of states**

The UNGGE proposes the following norms as a benchmark of responsible state behavior:

1. Consistent with the purposes of the United Nations, including to maintain international peace and security, States should cooperate in developing and applying measures to increase stability and security in the use of ICT and to prevent ICT practices that are acknowledged to be harmful or that may pose threats to international peace and security;
2. In case of ICT incidents, States should consider all relevant information, including the larger context of the event, the challenges of attribution in the ICT environment and the nature and extent of the consequences;
3. States should not knowingly allow their territory to be used for internationally wrongful acts using ICT;
4. States should consider how best to cooperate to exchange information, assist each other, prosecute terrorist and criminal use of ICT and implement other cooperative measures to address such threats. States may need to consider whether new measures need to be developed in this respect;
5. States, in ensuring the secure use of ICT, should respect Human Rights Council resolutions 20/8 and 26/13 on the promotion, protection and enjoyment of human rights on the Internet, as well as General Assembly resolutions 68/167 and 69/166 on the right to privacy in the digital age, to guarantee full respect for human rights, including the right to freedom of expression;
6. A State should not conduct or knowingly support ICT activity contrary to its obligations under international law that intentionally damages critical infrastructure or otherwise impairs the use and operation of critical infrastructure to provide services to the public;
7. States should take appropriate measures to protect their critical infrastructure from ICT threats, taking into account General Assembly resolution 58/199 on the creation of a global culture of

---

<sup>332</sup> Developments in the field of information and telecommunications in the context of international security, United Nations (New York) 30 December 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://documents-dds-nny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N15/457/57/PDF/N1545757.pdf?OpenElement>

<sup>333</sup> Group of Governmental Experts on Developments in the Field of Information and Telecommunications in the Context of International Security, United Nations (New York) 22 July 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://undocs.org/en/A/70/174>

cybersecurity and the protection of critical information infrastructures, and other relevant resolutions;

8. States should respond to appropriate requests for assistance by another State whose critical infrastructure is subject to malicious ICT acts. States should also respond to appropriate requests to mitigate malicious ICT activity aimed at the critical infrastructure of another State emanating from their territory, taking into account due regard for sovereignty;
9. States should take reasonable steps to ensure the integrity of the supply chain so that end users can have confidence in the security of ICT products. States should seek to prevent the proliferation of malicious ICT tools and techniques and the use of harmful hidden functions;
10. States should encourage responsible reporting of ICT vulnerabilities and share associated information on available remedies to such vulnerabilities to limit and possibly eliminate potential threats to ICT and ICT-dependent infrastructure;
11. States should not conduct or knowingly support activity to harm the information systems of the authorized emergency response teams (sometimes known as computer emergency response teams or cybersecurity incident response teams) of another State. A State should not use authorized emergency response teams to engage in malicious international activity.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member shall not take steps that violate any of the abovementioned recommendations.

#### **Capacity-building measures**

The UNGGE noted that the implementation of the recommended measures ‘may not immediately be possible, in particular for developing countries, until they acquire adequate capacity.’<sup>334</sup> Regarding capacity building, the UNGGE suggests the following:

1. Assist in strengthening cooperative mechanisms with national computer emergency response teams and other authorized bodies;
2. Provide assistance and training to developing countries to improve security in the use of ICT, including critical infrastructure, and exchange legal and administrative best practices;
3. Assist in providing access to technologies deemed essential for ICT security;
4. Create procedures for mutual assistance in responding to incidents and addressing short-term problems in securing networks, including procedures for expedited assistance;
5. Facilitate cross-border cooperation to address critical infrastructure vulnerabilities that transcend national borders;
6. Develop strategies for sustainability in ICT security capacity-building efforts;
7. Prioritize ICT security awareness and capacity-building in national plans and budgets, and assign it appropriate weight in development and assistance planning. This could include ICT security awareness programmes designed to educate and inform institutions and individual citizens. Such programmes could be carried out in conjunction with efforts by international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations;

---

<sup>334</sup> Group of Governmental Experts on Developments in the Field of Information and Telecommunications in the Context of International Security, United Nations (New York) 22 July 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://undocs.org/en/A/70/174>

8. Encourage further work in capacity-building, such as on forensics or on cooperative measures to address the criminal or terrorist use of ICT.

States may also consider additional measures taken on a bilateral, subregional, regional and multilateral basis such as:

1. Strengthen cooperative mechanisms between relevant agencies to address ICT security incidents and develop additional technical, legal and diplomatic mechanisms to address ICT infrastructure-related requests, including the consideration of exchanges of personnel in areas such as incident response and law enforcement, as appropriate, and encouraging exchanges between research and academic institutions;
2. Enhance cooperation, including the development of focal points for the exchange of information on malicious ICT use and the provision of assistance in investigations;
3. Establish a national computer emergency response team and/or cybersecurity incident response team or officially designate an organization to fulfil this role. States may wish to consider such bodies within their definition of critical infrastructure. States should support and facilitate the functioning of and cooperation among such national response teams and other authorized bodies;
4. Expand and support practices in computer emergency response team and cybersecurity incident response team cooperation, as appropriate, such as information exchange about vulnerabilities, attack patterns and best practices for mitigating attacks, including coordinating responses, organizing exercises, supporting the handling of ICT-related incidents and enhancing regional and sector-based cooperation;
5. Cooperate, in a manner consistent with national and international law, with requests from other States in investigating ICT-related crime or the use of ICT for terrorist purposes or to mitigate malicious ICT activity emanating from their territory.

To meet the capacity-building criterion of the commitment, the BRICS member shall take steps that somewhat match any of the abovementioned areas of action.

### **Confidence-building measures**

As regarding building trust and confidence to ensure peaceful and safe use of ICT, the UNGGE urges states to do the following:

1. Assist in strengthening cooperative mechanisms with national computer emergency response teams and other authorized bodies;
2. Provide assistance and training to developing countries to improve security in the use of ICT, including critical infrastructure, and exchange legal and administrative best practices;
3. Assist in providing access to technologies deemed essential for ICT security;
4. Create procedures for mutual assistance in responding to incidents and addressing short-term problems in securing networks, including procedures for expedited assistance;
5. Facilitate cross-border cooperation to address critical infrastructure vulnerabilities that transcend national borders;
6. Develop strategies for sustainability in ICT security capacity-building efforts;
7. Prioritize ICT security awareness and capacity-building in national plans and budgets, and assign it appropriate weight in development and assistance planning. This could include ICT security awareness programmes designed to educate and inform institutions and individual citizens. Such

programmes could be carried out in conjunction with efforts by international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations;

8. Encourage further work in capacity-building, such as on forensics or on cooperative measures to address the criminal or terrorist use of ICT.

Also, the UNGGE notes, that in the interest of ICT security capacity-building ‘States may consider forming bilateral and multilateral cooperation initiatives that would build on established partnership relations. Such initiatives would help to improve the environment for effective mutual assistance between States in their response to ICT incidents and could be further developed by competent international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations.’

To ensure compliance with the confidence-building criterion of the commitment, the BRICS member shall take steps in line with any of the areas of action listed in this section.

A +1 score indicating the full compliance with the commitment on the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment requires the BRICS member to take actions that match both of the key subject areas and thus contributing to capacity-building and confidence building. Also, no action within the monitoring period shall be regarded as inconsistent with the voluntary, non-binding rules of responsible state behavior in the cyberspace. Failing to meet the criterion of adhering to the set of rules will serve as a precondition to grant the BRICS member a 0 score even if the two other criteria are met.

To achieve a partial compliance (a 0 score) the BRICS member shall take action in any of the two key spheres. Also, its steps shall not violate the rules of responsible state behavior.

A –1 score indicating a non-compliance with the commitment shall be given if the BRICS member takes no steps that could be treated as contributing to capacity-building or confidence-building regarding use of ICTs. Also, if the BRICS member takes actions matching at least one of two subject areas but some of its actions violate the rules of responsible states behavior this will be a –1 score case as well.

**Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The BRICS member does not contribute to either of the commitment’s subject areas, namely capacity building and confidence building OR some of its actions that match ONE out of TWO subject areas could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states
0	The BRICS member takes actions that match at least ONE out of TWO subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states
+1	The BRICS member takes actions that match TWO subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states

*Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

**Brazil: +1**

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 1 September 2022, the G20 Digital Ministers held a meeting in Bali. The main outcomes were presented in the Chair’s summary, including priorities of joint work as to ensure the free flow of data with trust. The participating parties, including representatives of Brazil, exchanged insights and experiences to foster common understanding and convergence between existing regulatory and policy

approaches and instruments. The parties expressed commitment to “enabling an inclusive, empowering, and sustainable digital transformation to achieve a resilient recovery and prosperous digital economy” and agreed to “discuss policies to create an enabling, inclusive, open, and fair digital economy that fosters the application of new technologies and allows businesses and entrepreneurs to thrive.”<sup>335</sup>

On 21 September 2022, the Digital Governance and Information Security Committee was created in Brazil. The committee will aim to plan, coordinate and integrate strategic initiatives related to ICT and information management. The Committee will be advisory and deliberative, will be of a permanent nature, and will aim to determine the priorities of investment and funding programs in ICT, as well as initiatives related to Information Technology to ensure the quality of, efficiency and effectiveness of activities and actions that support compliance with the institutional mission of the Ministry.<sup>336</sup>

On 22 September 2022, the Cabinet for Institutional Security signed a memorandum of understanding with the Latin America and the Caribbean Cyber Competence Center (supported and resourced by the EU Cyber Capacity Building Network (EU CyberNet) to facilitate cooperation in training in the area of cybersecurity. The EU CyberNet project aims to strengthen the delivery, coordination and overall coherence of the EU’s external cyber capacity building projects and reinforce its capacity to provide technical assistance to partner countries in the field of security and cybercrime.<sup>337</sup>

On 11 November 2022, the Secretariat for Digital Government of the Ministry of Economy released a complete guide with guidelines for public bodies regarding privacy, protection of personal data and information security within the scope of the System of Administration of Information Technology Resource, which is responsible for planning and coordinating the IT resources of the Federal Public Administration. The initiative proposes guidelines to public institutions to help identify, monitor and fill gaps in privacy and information security. These guidelines were developed based on the provisions set out in the General Law for the Protection of Personal Data and the National Security Policy of the Information.<sup>338</sup>

On 14 December 2022, in partnership with the Inter-American Development Bank and the National Education and Research Network, the Digital Government Secretariat of the Ministry of Economy the Center Digital Government Integrated Cybersecurity System. Its mission is to carry out the operational coordination of prevention, treatment and response actions to cyber incidents of the 238 federal agencies belonging to the Information Technology Resources Administration System.<sup>339</sup>

On 23 January 2023, the Joint Declaration on the occasion of the official visit to the Argentine Republic of President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva was issued. The declaration stated that leaders decided to consolidate the bilateral digital dialogue mechanism in order to be able to address in particular issues

---

<sup>335</sup> Minister's Letter and Chair's Summary: G20 Digital Economy Ministers’ Meeting 2022, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/220921-digital-chair-summary-and-letter.html>

<sup>336</sup> Digital Governance and Information Security Committee created, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/turismo/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/criado-comite-de-governanca-digital-e-seguranca-da-informacao>.

<sup>337</sup> Memorandum of Understanding between the GSI/PR and the Latin America and the Caribbean Cyber Competence Center (LAC4), Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 22 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/gsi/pt-br/composicao/SSIC/dsic/noticias-antecedentes/testando-noticia-numero-2>.

<sup>338</sup> Ministry of Economy launches guide that is a benchmark for privacy and information security, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 11 November 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/governodigital/pt-br/noticias/ministerio-da-economia-lanca-guia-que-e-referencial-de-privacidade-e-seguranca-da-informacao>.

<sup>339</sup> Federal government launches Digital Government Integrated Cybersecurity Center, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/governodigital/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-lanca-centro-integrado-de-seguranca-cibernetica-do-governo-digital>.

related to connectivity, Internet governance, artificial intelligence, cybersecurity and cybercrime, recognizing the growing importance of digital development as a fundamental foundation for strengthen connectivity and integration between the two countries and the region.<sup>340</sup>

Brazil has taken both confidence and capacity-building actions to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

### **Russia: +1**

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 20 July 2022, Russia and Iran held the 3rd meeting of bilateral information technology cooperation working group. The parties discussed issues related to cybersecurity, urban area digitalization and business-to-business contact facilitation.<sup>341</sup>

On 1 September 2022, the G20 Digital Ministers held a meeting in Bali. The meeting concluded with no joint statement. The main outcomes were presented in the Chair's summary, including priorities of joint work as to ensure the free flow of data with trust. The participating parties, including representatives of Russia, exchanged insights and experiences to foster common understanding and convergence between existing regulatory and policy approaches and instruments. The parties expressed their commitment to “enabling an inclusive, empowering, and sustainable digital transformation to achieve a resilient recovery and prosperous digital economy” and agreed to “discuss policies to create an enabling, inclusive, open, and fair digital economy that fosters the application of new technologies and allows businesses and entrepreneurs to thrive.”<sup>342</sup>

On 27 September 2022, Russia and Congo held the 6th meeting of Intergovernmental Commission on Economic, Scientific and Trade Cooperation. The meeting resulted in a bilateral agreement on cooperation in information and communication technologies. The parties agreed on strengthening contacts between governmental bodies and entrepreneurs, facilitating exchange in expertise, and organizing joint research projects.<sup>343</sup>

On 25 October 2022, the government-led website Gosuslugi (State Services) launched a special page titled “Cybersecurity is Easy!” The page is designed as to provide easy-to-comprehend information on

---

<sup>340</sup> Acts signed on the occasion of the visit of the President of the Republic to the Argentine Republic - Buenos Aires, January 23, 2023, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 23 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. [https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais\\_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/atos-assinados-por-ocasio-da-viagem-do-senhor-presidente-da-republica-a-republica-argentina-buenos-aires-23-de-janeiro-de-2023](https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/atos-assinados-por-ocasio-da-viagem-do-senhor-presidente-da-republica-a-republica-argentina-buenos-aires-23-de-janeiro-de-2023).

<sup>341</sup> Russia and Iran Discussed Cooperation in Information and Communication Technologies, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 July 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 18 January 2023. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41740/>

<sup>342</sup> Minister's Letter and Chair's Summary: G20 Digital Economy Ministers' Meeting 2022, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/220921-digital-chair-summary-and-letter.html>

<sup>343</sup> Russia and Congo to Sign an Agreement on Cooperation in Information and Communication Technologies, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 27 September 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 January 2023. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/42008/>



how to avoid typical cyberthreats including fraud. Website users are allowed to download prospects on personal data security and maintenance of personal accounts' privacy.<sup>344</sup>

On 28 – 30 November 2022, Vice Minister Maxim Parshin visited countries of Northern and Eastern Africa. During his visit, he held several working meetings with colleagues from Egypt and Ethiopia. The parties agreed to exchange expertise on cybersecurity and creating opportunities for IT-businesses. In addition, Vice Minister Parshin held a talk with Amandeep Gill, the UN Secretary-General special envoy on technology and discussed the Global Digital Compact Initiative on creating open and secure digital future.<sup>345</sup>

Russia has taken both confidence and capacity-building actions to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with the commitment to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 5 August 2022, the government introduced a mandatory social media account verification requirement. Minister of State for Electronics & Information Technology Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar claimed that this measure is aimed as to contain spread of misinformation, bots, criminality and digital threats to users in general.<sup>346</sup>

On 1 September 2022, the G20 Digital Ministers held a meeting in Bali. The main outcomes were presented in the Chair's summary, including priorities of joint work as to ensure data free flow with trust. The participating parties, including representatives of India, exchanged insights and experiences to foster common understanding and convergence between existing regulatory and policy approaches and instruments. The parties expressed their commitment to “enabling an inclusive, empowering, and sustainable digital transformation to achieve a resilient recovery and prosperous digital economy” and agreed to “discuss policies to create an enabling, inclusive, open, and fair digital economy that fosters the application of new technologies and allows businesses and entrepreneurs to thrive.”<sup>347</sup>

On 18 November 2022, the government presented the Draft Digital Personal Data Protection Bill. The bill is designed as to provide better fulfilment of citizen rights when personal data is processed. The bill is said to establish the comprehensive legal framework governing digital personal data protection in the country recognizing “the right of individuals to protect their personal data, societal rights and the need to process personal data for lawful purposes.” The government also invited all

---

<sup>344</sup> A New “Gosuslugi” Page “Cybersecurity is Easy!” is Launched, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 October 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 January 2023. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/42137/>

<sup>345</sup> Digital Ministry Vice Minister Held Talks with Egypt, Ethiopia and UN Secretary-General Envoy, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 1 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 January 2023. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/42264/>

<sup>346</sup> Mandatory Verification of Social Media Accounts, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 5 August 2022. Access Date: 18 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1848736>

<sup>347</sup> Minister's Letter and Chair's Summary: G20 Digital Economy Ministers' Meeting 2022, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/220921-digital-chair-summary-and-letter.html>

interested parties to comment on the bill and provided a feedback period of a month till 17 December 2022.<sup>348</sup>

India has taken both confidence and capacity-building actions to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with the commitment to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 29 August 2022, the Sub Forum on Rule of Law Building in Cyberspace was opened in Tianjin under the China Internet Civilization Forum. The Sub Forum was attended by several of China's high rank officials including a member of the Political Bureau of the Communist Party of China (PBCPC) Huang Kunming and Li Hongzhong, a member of PBCPC and the Party secretary of Tianjin. Officials addressed the conference participants and highlighted the importance of developing a civilized internet and enabling an advanced culture.<sup>349</sup>

On 1 September 2022, the G20 Digital Ministers held a meeting in Bali. The main outcomes were presented in the chair's summary, including priorities of joint work as to ensure data free flow with trust. The participating parties, including representatives of China, exchanged insights and experiences to foster common understanding and convergence between existing regulatory and policy approaches and instruments. The parties expressed commitment to "enabling an inclusive, empowering, and sustainable digital transformation to achieve a resilient recovery and prosperous digital economy" and agreed to "discuss policies to create an enabling, inclusive, open, and fair digital economy that fosters the application of new technologies and allows businesses and entrepreneurs to thrive."<sup>350</sup>

On 19 December 2022, the Chinese Government released a policy document on the development of a data ownership system, a circulation and trading system and an income distribution system. An official at the National Development and Reform Commission said that the latest measures are intended to promote the lawful and efficient use of data to empower the real economy and enable people to share the dividends from the growth of the digital economy. The proposed set of measures is designed to bolster the protection of personal information and ensure the fulfilment of personal data rights.<sup>351</sup>

China has taken both confidence and capacity-building actions to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>348</sup> MeitY invites feedback on the draft 'Digital Personal Data Protection Bill 2022', Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 18 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1877030>

<sup>349</sup> Official calls for advancing cyber civilization progress, Supreme People's Court of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 29 August 2022. Access Date: 18 January 2023. [https://english.court.gov.cn/2022-08/29/c\\_806386.htm](https://english.court.gov.cn/2022-08/29/c_806386.htm)

<sup>350</sup> Minister's Letter and Chair's Summary: G20 Digital Economy Ministers' Meeting 2022, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/220921-digital-chair-summary-and-letter.html>

<sup>351</sup> Policy looks to regulate data usage, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 4 January 2023. Access Date: 27 January 2023. [http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202301/04/content\\_WS63b4dbeec6d0a757729e5100.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202301/04/content_WS63b4dbeec6d0a757729e5100.html)

**South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 1 September 2022, the G20 Digital Ministers held a meeting in Bali. The main outcomes were presented in the Chair's summary, including priorities of joint work as to ensure data free flow with trust. The participating parties, including representatives of South Africa, exchanged insights and experiences to foster common understanding and convergence between existing regulatory and policy approaches and instruments. The parties expressed their commitment to “enabling an inclusive, empowering, and sustainable digital transformation to achieve a resilient recovery and prosperous digital economy” and agreed to “discuss policies to create an enabling, inclusive, open, and fair digital economy that fosters the application of new technologies and allows businesses and entrepreneurs to thrive.”<sup>352</sup>

On 21-22 November 2022, the Information Regulator in cooperation with the Africa Digital Rights Hub held the 2022 Edition of the Data Protection Act Africa Summit in Johannesburg. The summit brought together data collectors, processors, innovators, regulators, and other stakeholders to discuss and present solutions to emerging data protection issues.<sup>353</sup>

On 29 November 2022, the Public Service Commission held a roundtable on government support for bettering the ICT services delivery. The roundtable is said to focus on understanding the nature and extent of the challenges experienced within ICT by different stakeholders, the impact of these challenges on service delivery, and areas where interventions have been implemented to address these challenges.<sup>354</sup>

South Africa has taken both confidence and capacity-building actions to promote an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT-environment and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>352</sup> Minister's Letter and Chair's Summary: G20 Digital Economy Ministers' Meeting 2022, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2022/220921-digital-chair-summary-and-letter.html>.

<sup>353</sup> Information Regulator and Africa Digital Rights Hub host Data Protection Africa Summit in Johannesburg, 21 to 22 Nov, Government of South Africa (Johannesburg) 16 November 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/information-regulator-and-africa-digital-rights-hub-host-data-protection-africa-summit>

<sup>354</sup> Public Service Commission hosts roundtable on government support focusing on ICT for service delivery, 30 Nov, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 29 November 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/roundtable-29-nov-2022-0000>

### 13. Health: Universal Health Coverage

“[The BRICS countries will strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the fields of] ... Universal Health Coverage.”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

#### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

#### Background

BRICS countries addressed health and medicine issues for the first time in 2011 in the Sanya declaration, where the BRICS leaders stated “firm commitment to strengthen dialogue and cooperation in the fields of social protection, decent work, gender equality, youth, and public health, including the fight against HIV/AIDS.”<sup>355</sup>

In 2012 BRICS health ministers committed to “focus on cooperation in combating HIV/AIDS through approaches such as innovative ways to reach out with prevention services, efficacious drugs and diagnostics, exchange of information on newer treatment regimens, determination of recent infections and HIV-TB [HIV/AIDS-tuberculosis] co-infections.”<sup>356</sup> At their third meeting in 2013 they reiterated their joint commitment to “collaborate on key thematic areas focusing on strengthening health surveillance systems; reducing Non-Communicable Disease (NCD) risk factors through prevention and health promotion; Universal Health Coverage (UHC); strategic health technologies, with a focus on communicable and non-communicable diseases; medical technologies; and drug discovery and development.”<sup>357</sup>

In 2014 at their fourth meeting, health ministers during Brazil’s presidency expressed deep concern about recent outbreak of Ebola in West African countries and called for “urgent and comprehensive international support to the efforts coordinated by the UN, and particularly to the actions undertaken by the WHO [World Health Organization], to accelerate the response to the Ebola outbreak.”<sup>358</sup>

In 2015, under Russia’s presidency, BRICS leaders expressed deep concern with “continuing spread of major diseases (HIV/AIDS, TB, malaria and others), and with the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential, such as highly pathogenic influenza, novel coronavirus or Ebola” and agreed to work together in such areas as:

- Management of risks related to emerging infections with pandemic potential;

<sup>355</sup> Sanya Declaration, 2011, RANEP. Access Date: 9 February

2018.<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/chpresidency1/Sanya%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>356</sup> Communiqué of the II Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEP. Access Date: 9 February

2018.<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/health%202013%201.pdf>

<sup>357</sup> Communiqué of the III Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEP. Access Date: 9 February

2018.<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/health2013.pdf>

<sup>358</sup> Communiqué of the IV Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEP. Access Date: 9 February 2018.

<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/Communiq%C3%A9%20of%20the%20IV%20Meeting%20of%20BRICS%20Health%20Ministers.pdf>

- Compliance with commitments to stop the spread of and eradicate communicable diseases that hamper development (HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, “neglected” tropical diseases, poliomyelitis, measles);
- Research, development, production and supply of medicines aimed at providing increased access to prevention and treatment of communicable diseases.<sup>359</sup>

Between 2011 and 2015 BRICS countries discussed such issues as HIV/AIDS, Ebola, and sexual and reproductive health. At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS made its first commitment on antimicrobial resistance.<sup>360</sup>

In 2017 in Xiamen leaders agreed to foster the development and improve the availability of innovative medical products through promotion of research and development, foster access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services through enhanced health systems and health financing and to improve surveillance capacity to combat infectious diseases, including Ebola, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, as well as non-communicable diseases.<sup>361</sup>

In 2018 in Johannesburg BRICS leaders committed to strengthening the coordination and cooperation on vaccine research and development within BRICS countries.<sup>362</sup>

In 2020 Moscow declaration leaders acknowledged initiatives by the WHO, governments, non-profit organisations, research institutes and the pharmaceutical industry to expedite the research, development and production of the COVID-19 vaccine and therapeutics, and support cooperative approaches in this regard and promised to ensure that, when available, it is disseminated in a fair, equitable and affordable basis. They supported the Access to COVID-19 Tools Accelerator (ACT-A) initiative. BRICS countries also reiterated their commitment to further enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing the challenges to health and human well-being including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (HIV/AIDS, TB, malaria and others) and the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential.<sup>363</sup>

In 2021 Delhi declaration BRICS leaders pledged to continue “ongoing efforts in supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic through financing, donation, local production and facilitating export of vaccines, therapeutics, diagnostics and other life saving equipment<sup>364</sup>”.

In 2022 in Beijing leaders agreed to strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the fields of Universal Health Coverage.

---

<sup>359</sup> Ufa Declaration, 2015, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf)

<sup>360</sup> Goa Declaration, 2016, RANEPА (Moscow) 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf)

<sup>361</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>362</sup> BRICS: A 15-Year Review, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/brics\\_15\\_year\\_review.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/brics_15_year_review.pdf)

<sup>363</sup> XII BRICS summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>364</sup> New Delhi Declaration. RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

### Commitment Features

The commitment requires BRICS members to take actions to strengthen multilateral technical cooperation in UHC. The commitment has two parts.

“Universal health coverage” means that all people have access to the health services they need, when and where they need them, without financial hardship. It includes the full range of essential health services, from health promotion to prevention, treatment, rehabilitation, and palliative care.<sup>365</sup>

Technical cooperation refers to the provision of resources aimed at the transfer of technical and managerial skills or of technology for the purpose of building up general national capacity.<sup>366</sup>

#### Part one: Strengthen UHC at home

To comply with the first part of the commitment BRICS member should take actions to improve access to UHC domestically.

World Bank identifies four priority areas of action to strengthen UHC:

- ramp up investments in affordable, quality primary healthcare, allocating more resources to diagnostics and early detection of diseases;
- engage the private sector and unlock new models for health financing and delivery;
- improving education, broadening social services, and creating jobs;
- change the models of UHC’s financing so countries get better outcomes for the money they are spending.<sup>367</sup>

#### Part two: Promote multilateral technical cooperation in UHC

The second part of the commitment requires BRICS members to engage in multilateral cooperation on the issue of UHC.

According to the definition of technical cooperation, BRICS members should provide financial, managerial or other resources and technologies to build up the capacity of other countries in the field of UHC. To comply with this part of the commitment BRICS member can engage in bilateral or multilateral (for example, led by WHO, World Bank or other international entities) projects in UHC.

To achieve full compliance BRICS member should both take actions to strengthen UHC domestically and promote multilateral cooperation. Partial compliance will be awarded to BRICS member which will only take actions domestically.

The score –1 will be awarded if a BRICS member fails to deliver on both parts of the commitment.

### Scoring Guidelines

–1	The BRICS member has taken no actions to strengthen Universal Health Coverage.
0	The BRICS member has taken actions to strengthen Universal Health Coverage domestically BUT failed to promote multilateral technical cooperation in this field.
+1	The BRICS member has taken actions to strengthen Universal Health Coverage domestically AND promoted multilateral technical cooperation in this field.

<sup>365</sup> Universal Health Coverage, WHO (Geneva). 1 April 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022.  
[https://www.who.int/health-topics/universal-health-coverage#tab=tab\\_1](https://www.who.int/health-topics/universal-health-coverage#tab=tab_1)

<sup>366</sup> Technical Co-Operation Grants, OECD (Paris) 28 August 2003. Access Date: 18 October 2022.  
<https://stats.oecd.org/glossary/detail.asp?ID=6022>

<sup>367</sup> Universal Health Coverage, The World Bank (Washington) 9 February 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022.  
<https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/universalhealthcoverage#2>

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Irina Popova*

**Brazil: +1**

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the field of Universal Health Coverage.

On 5 December 2022, the Ministry of Health launched the first edition of the Technical Guidance Manual for the Preparation, Analysis and Accountability of Projects of the National Program to Support Institutional Development of the Unified Health System. The manual is an instrument for guiding and standardizing the performance of its technicians and managers, its foundations and linked public associations, health councils, health entities of recognized excellence, and other actors who work in the program.<sup>368</sup>

On 28 December 2022, the Ministry of Health signed four new contracts through the Department of Informatics of the SUS with the aim of offering significant improvements to the technological platforms used by the Unified Health System.<sup>369</sup>

On 5 January 2023, the Ministry of Health invited managers and health professionals to participate in the ASPAS Study – Situational Assessment of Assistance Protocols of the Unified Health System. The initiative is aimed at those who work in Specialized Care and Pharmaceutical Assistance. The objective is to identify how the Clinical Protocols and Therapeutic Guidelines are being implemented in practice. Interested parties can register using the form.<sup>370</sup>

On 19 January 2023, Brazil and the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO) signed a Cooperation Strategy. According to the document, cooperation between Brazil and PAHO is aimed at improving people's health and well-being and expanding access to and coverage of health in an integral and equitable manner, with an emphasis on primary care. The Cooperation Strategy involves actions such as protecting and promoting the health of the population, centered on people, families and communities, especially those in vulnerable situations, in addition to recovering, improving and strengthening health services and priority programs impacted by the pandemic from COVID-19. The document is also a strategic reference for the process of planning and allocating technical cooperation resources to Brazil.<sup>371</sup>

On 22 January 2023, the Ministry of Health announced its plan to accelerate a recruitment process for the Mais Médicos Program (More Doctors Program) to employ professionals, both trained in Brazil and abroad, to work in the Indigenous Health Districts on a permanent basis. The More Doctors Program is part of a broad effort by the federal government, with support from states and municipalities, to improve service to users of the Unified Health System. In addition to taking more

---

<sup>368</sup> Health launches Proadi-SUS Manual, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 5 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/dezembro/saude-lanca-manual-do-proadi-sus>.

<sup>369</sup> Ministry of Health signs four new contracts for the evolution of digital health in 2023, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 29 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/dezembro/ministerio-da-saude-assina-quatro-novos-contratos-para-evolucao-da-saude-digital-em-2023>.

<sup>370</sup> Health registers managers and professionals to evaluate SUS care protocols, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 5 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2023/janeiro/saude-cadastra-gestores-e-profissionais-para-avaliacao-de-protocolos-assistenciais-do-sus>.

<sup>371</sup> Brazil-PAHO cooperation strategy foresees goals to strengthen the SUS, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 19 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2023/janeiro/estrategia-de-cooperacao-brasil-opas-preve-metas-para-fortalecer-o-sus>.

doctors to regions where there is a shortage or absence of these professionals, the program also provides for more investments in the construction, renovation and expansion of Basic Health Units.<sup>372</sup>

On 23 January 2023, Ministry of Health of Brazil and the Ministry of Health of Argentina signed a declaration of intentions to develop bilateral cooperation between the two countries in priority areas of health. The exchange of experiences is foreseen in the bilateral agreement, especially for epidemiological surveillance strategies and public health emergencies. It is also planned to train health professionals and promote technical-scientific exchange for researchers and professionals from research centers, in addition to strengthening the capacity and infrastructure of clinical trials in Latin America.<sup>373</sup>

Brazil has taken actions to strengthen Universal Health Coverage inside the country and also engaged in bilateral and multilateral cooperation in this field.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

### **Russia: +1**

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the field of Universal Health Coverage.

On 26 October 2022, the government assigned RUB58.6 billion to facilitate the development of regional healthcare systems. The Ministry of Healthcare is responsible for the proper allocation of designated funds. Most of the funding is said to be spent on payments for health practitioners in accordance with the ministry's planning.<sup>374</sup>

On 18 November 2022, Russia and the United Arab Emirates held a bilateral meeting. The parties discussed issues related to bilateral cooperation in healthcare. The countries demonstrated mutual interest in promoting cooperation in scientific development and pharmaceutical production.<sup>375</sup>

On 25 November 2022, the Ministry of Healthcare presented the new platform designed to promote implementation of artificial intelligence into healthcare. The platform would facilitate the discussion on current issues, gathering of medical data for further processing. All the gathered non-personal datasets would be available for everyone to use.<sup>376</sup>

---

<sup>372</sup> Ministry of Health will accelerate recruitment of professionals for indigenous districts, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 22 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2023/janeiro/ministerio-da-saude-vai-acelerar-recrutamento-de-profissionais-para-distritos-indigenas>.

<sup>373</sup> Note: visit by Minister of Health to Argentina, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 23 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2023/janeiro/nota-visita-da-ministra-da-saude-a-argentina>.

<sup>374</sup> Government to Allocate 58.6 billion to Minzdrav for Regional Healthcare Systems Development, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 26 October 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/10/26/19472-pravitelstvo-vydelilo-minzdravu-58-6-mlrd-rublej-na-podderzhku-regionalnyh-sistem-zdravoohraneniya>

<sup>375</sup> Minzdrav and UAE to Discuss Bilateral Cooperation, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 18 November 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/11/18/19556-minzdravy-rossii-i-oae-obsudili-perspektivy-dvustoronnego-sotrudnichestva>

<sup>376</sup> Minzdrav to Launch a Platform for AI in Healthcare, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 25 November 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/11/25/19580-minzdrav-rossii-zapustil-platformu-iskusstvennogo-intellekta-v-zdravoohranenii>



On 9 December 2022, the government-run website “Gosuslugi” (State Services) presented an online application form for companies importing non-registered pharmaceutical products and biomaterials. The new form is designed to facilitate the process and to satisfy the local demand.<sup>377</sup>

On 15 December 2022, Russia and Turkmenistan held a bilateral meeting on healthcare cooperation. The parties demonstrated mutual interest in deepening ties in such spheres as medical tourism, professional education and digital transformation in healthcare.<sup>378</sup>

On 29 December 2022, the government initiated a nation-wide project providing distant diagnostic health monitoring services based on cutting-edge medical devices and technologies. Most remote services are designed to help people with diabetes and hypertonic disease. Data gathered would be transferred to medical practitioners to facilitate diagnosis.<sup>379</sup>

On 30 December 2022, Russia and Burkina Faso held a meeting on cooperation in healthcare. The parties agreed on deepening professional exchanges including short-term internships and joint pharmaceutical production.<sup>380</sup>

On 23 January 2023, the government extended the scope of medical services covered by obligatory health insurance. Patients would receive more substantial financial support, and more services including neonatal screening and chronic diseases treatment would be provided.<sup>381</sup>

Russia has taken actions to strengthen Universal Health Coverage inside the country and also engaged in bilateral and multilateral cooperation in this field.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with the commitment on health.

On 28 September 2022, the Emergency and Trauma Unit at B. Dharavandhoo Health Centre in Male, Maldives was inaugurated. The project was implemented by Ministry of Health of Maldives under the

---

<sup>377</sup> Gosuslugi Allows to Apply for Import of Non-Registered Drugs and Biomaterials, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 9 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/12/09/19637-podat-zayavlenie-na-vvoz-nezaregistrovannyh-lekarstvennyh-preparatov-i-biomaterialov-teper-mozhno-cherez-portal-gosuslug>

<sup>378</sup> Minzdrav Held a Meeting with Ministry of Healthcare and Medical Production of Turkmenistan, Ministry of Health (Moscow) 15 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/12/15/19662-v-minzdrave-rossii-sostoyalas-vstrecha-s-ministerstvom-zdravoohraneniya-i-medsinskoy-promyshlennosti-turkmenistana>

<sup>379</sup> Pilot Project on Distant Health Condition Monitoring with High-Tech Devices Started in Russia, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 29 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 14 January 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/12/29/19716-v-rossii-startoval-pilotnyy-proekt-po-distantsionnomu-monitoringu-sostoyaniya-zdorovya-patsientov-s-ispolzovaniem-vysokotekhnologichnyh-ustroystv-i-servisov>

<sup>380</sup> Minzdrav to Discuss Healthcare Cooperation with Burkina Faso, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 30 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/12/20/19683-v-minzdrave-rossii-obsudili-voprosy-sotrudnichestva-v-sfere-zdravoohraneniya-s-burkina-faso>

<sup>381</sup> State Health Insurance Program to be Substantially Extended in 2023, Ministry of Healthcare (Moscow) 23 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2023/01/23/19792-programma-gosudarstvennyh-garantiy-besplatnoy-medsinskoy-pomoschi-na-2023-god-znachitelno-rasshirena>

cash grant projects scheme of the Government of India in Maldives. The total Indian contribution for the project was around MVR7.5 million.<sup>382</sup>

On 28 November 2022, the Indian Union Minister of Power and New and Renewable Energy Shri R.K. Singh inaugurated the initiative for procurement, operation and maintenance of ten Mobile Health Clinics at Sadar Hospital, Aarah, Bhojpur District Bihar. The total cost of the project is INR120 million which will facilitate operational expenditure for three years for smooth functioning of the project.<sup>383</sup>

On 9 January 2023, the National Health Authority announced a new system to measure and grade hospital performance under the flagship scheme Ayushman Bharat Pradhan Mantri Jan Arogya Yojana (AB PM-JAY). The new initiative will introduce the concept of ‘value- based care’, where payment will be outcome based and providers will be rewarded according to the quality of the treatment delivered. Under the new model, the providers will be rewarded for helping the patients improve their health, which consequently will reduce the effects of disease in the population in the long term.<sup>384</sup>

On 13 January 2023, Indian Union Minister of Health and Family Welfare Mansukh Mandaviya chaired the Health Ministers’ virtual session of “Voice of Global South Summit – 2023.” He commended India’s efforts in providing training to support countries in terms of capacity building of their healthcare professionals. The training included COVID-19 testing, clinical practices, case management, vaccine development and delivery. India also shared its medical expertise by dispatching Rapid Response Teams to Kuwait and Maldives. Minister Mandaviya also stated that under the soon to be launched Heal in India initiative, India aims to provide its health infrastructure for patients abroad and make it a global hub for healthcare. He mentioned that India affirms to work with partners in the Global South to harness the potential of traditional medicine to promote health, wellness and people-centric care.<sup>385</sup>

India has taken actions to strengthen universal health coverage domestically and promoted multilateral technical cooperation in this field.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with the commitment on health.

On 6 October 2022, China handed over a pharmaceutical warehouse to the Zimbabwean government. The warehouse is set to boost Zimbabwe’s drug storage capacity and improve its health delivery system. Constructed and funded by the Chinese government, it is worth USD22 million and is situated at the country’s second largest referral hospital, Sally Mugabe Central Hospital, in Harare.<sup>386</sup>

---

<sup>382</sup> Press Release: Inauguration of Emergency & Trauma Unit at B. Dharavandhoo Health Centre on 28 September, 2022, High Commission of India (Male) 28 September 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://hci.gov.in/male/?17350?000>.

<sup>383</sup> Shri R.K Singh inaugurates 10 Mobile Health Clinics 'Doctor Apke Dwar' under REC's CSR project in Bihar, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (New Delhi) 28 November 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1879602>.

<sup>384</sup> National Health Authority (NHA) introduces new system to measure and grade performance of hospitals empaneled under Ayushman Bharat PM-JAY scheme, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (New Delhi) 9 January 2023. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1889730>.

<sup>385</sup> Union Health Minister Dr Mansukh Mandaviya chairs Health Ministers’ virtual Session of “Voice of Global South Summit – 2023” titled: Cooperation to build resilient healthcare systems, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (New Delhi) 13 January 2023. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1891014>.

<sup>386</sup> China hands over modern pharmaceutical warehouse to Zimbabwe, China International Development Cooperation Agency 12 October 2022. [http://en.cidca.gov.cn/2022-10/12/c\\_819448.htm](http://en.cidca.gov.cn/2022-10/12/c_819448.htm).

On 11 November 2022, Premier of the State Council Li Keqiang participated the 25th China-ASEAN Summit. He mentioned that the Chinese Government will accelerate the establishment of the China-ASEAN Public Health Research and Development Collaborating Center to build a stronger shield for regional public health security.<sup>387</sup>

On 16 November 2022, President of Indonesia Joko Widodo and President Xi Jinping held talks on bilateral cooperation. The two countries agreed to promote the whole industry-chain vaccine cooperation as well as drug research and development, strengthen cooperation in vaccine and genomic research, development and production. China pledged to support Indonesia in its effort to build a regional vaccine hub and continue to play an exemplary role in health cooperation and the fight against COVID-19 to improve global public health governance.<sup>388</sup>

On 6 December 2022, the Chinese Government announced detailed measures to promote the role of IT in the development of traditional Chinese medicine (TCM) during the 14th Five-Year Plan period (2021-2025). According to the National Administration of Traditional Chinese Medicine, by 2025, a TCM information system that works in coordination with China's medical and healthcare mechanism will be established. The plan also provides for the establishment of smart TCM hospitals around the country and the promotion of online TCM pharmacies and medical services. Moreover, flexible inter-hospital patient transfer, mutual recognition and sharing of lab and examination reports and other services will be enhanced among TCM hospitals.<sup>389</sup>

On 22 December 2022, several medical and health platforms were launched under the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) to provide members of the group with better health services. During a forum held by the SCO hospital alliance in Wuhan, three SCO telemedicine cooperation platform centers were launched in Hubei, Gansu and Xinjiang. Besides, four online platforms under the SCO hospital alliance were launched, focusing on the hepatobiliary and pancreatic specialties, gynecology, internet hospitals, and hospital management.<sup>390</sup>

On 17 January 2023, Ministry of Finance announced an increased government spending for medical treatment subsidies, temporary allowances of medical personnel, vaccines and vaccination, and medical capacity improvement. In addition, more resources will be channeled to the treatment of severe COVID cases in county-level hospitals, and emergency treatment and critical care in rural areas.<sup>391</sup>

China has taken actions to strengthen universal health coverage domestically and promoted multilateral technical cooperation in this field.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

---

<sup>387</sup> Speech by H.E. Li Keqiang Premier of the State Council of the People's Republic of China At the 25th China-ASEAN Summit, Embassy of the PRC in the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (London) 12 November 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://gb.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgyw/202211/t20221112\\_10973135.htm](http://gb.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgyw/202211/t20221112_10973135.htm).

<sup>388</sup> Joint Statement between The People's Republic of China and The Republic of Indonesia, Embassy of the PRC in the Sultanate of Oman (Muscat) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://om.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgyw/202211/t20221117\\_10976784.htm](http://om.china-embassy.gov.cn/eng/zgyw/202211/t20221117_10976784.htm).

<sup>389</sup> China releases plan to promote online TCM services, State Council of China 6 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202212/06/content\\_WS638ee0b1c6d0a757729e402f.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202212/06/content_WS638ee0b1c6d0a757729e402f.html).

<sup>390</sup> New platforms launched to enhance SCO health cooperation, State Council Information Office of China 23 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://english.scio.gov.cn/international/exchanges/2022-12/23/content\\_85023641.htm](http://english.scio.gov.cn/international/exchanges/2022-12/23/content_85023641.htm).

<sup>391</sup> China to ensure funding for new-phase COVID response, State Council of China 17 January 2023. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/17/content\\_WS63c65487c6d0a757729e5a42.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/17/content_WS63c65487c6d0a757729e5a42.html).

### South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to strengthen technical multilateral cooperation aimed at enhancing capacities in the field of Universal Health Coverage.

On 1 August 2022, the South African government and the United States President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) held a bilateral meeting. The parties agreed to maintain established relations to fight the spread of the disease in South Africa. PEPFAR has committed to support the country while putting special attention to the younger generation as to curb spread of new infections.<sup>392</sup>

On 10 October 2022, the South African Health Products Regulatory Authority (SAHPRA) held a meeting with representatives of the Paul Ehrlich Institute, Germany. SAHPRA is interested in strengthening blood and blood products regulations in the country. The Institute's BloodTrain Program demonstrated interest in entering the collaboration in this regard. The Program conducts external assessment in line with the WHO Global Benchmarking Tole and provides assistance as to overcome identified gaps and deficiencies.<sup>393</sup>

On 20 October 2022, the Department of Health reported on progress achieved in negotiations with Eskom – the main power provider in the country. The Department aims to set an agreement with the provider as to exclude primary hospitals in various regions in South Africa from loadshedding, allowing these facilities to operate uninterrupted.<sup>394</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the SAHRPA approved seven COVID-19 self-testing kits for public usage. With the authority's approval, local vendors are allowed to sell self-kits openly at any pharmacy.<sup>395</sup>

South Africa has taken actions to strengthen universal health coverage domestically and promoted multilateral technical cooperation in this field.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>392</sup> Health on United States President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief support for South Africa to fight HIV/AIDS, South African Government (Pretoria) 1 August 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/health-united-states-president%E2%80%99s-emergency-plan-aids-relief-support-south-africa-fight>

<sup>393</sup> SAHPRA Collaborates With Germany's BloodTrain Programme, SAHRPA (Pretoria) 10 October 2022. Access Date: <https://www.sahpra.org.za/news-and-updates/sahpra-collaborates-with-germanys-bloodtrain-programme/>

<sup>394</sup> Health and Eskom report progress on hospitals exemptions from loadshedding, South African Government (Pretoria) 20 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/health-and-eskom-report-progress-hospitals-exemptions%C2%A0-20-oct-2022-0000>

<sup>395</sup> SAHPRA Approves Antigen Self-Test Kits For Public Use, SAHPRA (Pretoria) 24 November 2022. Access Date: <https://www.sahpra.org.za/press-releases/sahpra-approves-antigen-self-test-kits-for-public-use/>

## 14. Sustainable Development: 2030 Agenda Implementation

“We reaffirm our commitment to the implementation of the 2030 Agenda in all its three dimensions - economic, social and environmental - in a balanced and integrated manner..”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

### Background

The 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development and its constituent Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were adopted by the United Nations on 25 September 2015.<sup>396</sup> At the 2016 Summit in Goa the BRICS leaders welcomed the document’s adoption and committed to “to lead by example in the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in line with national circumstances and development context respecting the national policy space.”<sup>397</sup> The commitment has been reiterated every year, with a particular focus on the Goal 12 at the 2021 New Delhi Summit.<sup>398</sup>

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS leaders stated: “We stress the importance of education to promoting sustainable economic and social development, and to strengthening BRICS partnership, and commend the positive progress in our education cooperation. We reiterate our support for BRICS University League and BRICS Network University in conducting education and research cooperation, welcome efforts to promote cooperation among educational think tanks, and exchanges among youth including by organizing youth summer camps and offering more scholarship opportunities to BRICS students. We agree to share experience and practices in realizing education-related sustainable development goals.”<sup>399</sup>

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS leaders met under the theme: “BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution.” They discussed inclusive and sustainable growth, economic and social recovery, job creation, education and SMEs.<sup>400</sup>

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS leaders discussed sustainable development in terms of economic and social, as well as environment. SMEs and job creation were also discussed, but the main

<sup>396</sup> Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015, 70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, United Nations (New York) 25 September 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

[https://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/generalassembly/docs/globalcompact/A\\_RES\\_70\\_1\\_E.pdf](https://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/generalassembly/docs/globalcompact/A_RES_70_1_E.pdf)

<sup>397</sup> Goa Declaration, 16 October 2016. RANEPА (Moscow). Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>.

<sup>398</sup>XIII BRICS Summit- New Delhi Declaration, 9 September 2021. RANEPА (Moscow). Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsdatelstva/briks-indiyskoe-predsdatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>399</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>400</sup>10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

focus was about strengthening and reforming the multilateral system, economic and financial cooperation, and intra-BRICS cooperation.<sup>401</sup>

### **Commitment Features**

The commitment requires the BRICS countries to take action to implement the UN 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development in its entirety – in economic, social and environmental dimensions. The 17 SDGs contained in the Agenda are:

- Goal 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere;
- Goal 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture;
- Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages;
- Goal 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all;
- Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls;
- Goal 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all;
- Goal 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all;
- Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all;
- Goal 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation;
- Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries;
- Goal 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable;
- Goal 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns;
- Goal 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts;
- Goal 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development;
- Goal 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss;
- Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels;
- Goal 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development.

---

<sup>401</sup> 11th BRICS Summit, Brasília Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News\\_ciir/Project/BRICS\\_new\\_downloadings/2019/11th\\_BRICS\\_Summit\\_eng.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf)

The list of concrete targets is also defined in the Agenda.<sup>402</sup>

Full compliance with the commitment requires the BRICS members to implement policy actions on at least 11 of the 17 Goals. Partial compliance requires the BRICS members to implement actions on at least four of the Goals. Non-compliance implies that less than four Goals were covered by the BRICS country's actions during the monitoring period.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS country takes action on fewer than four SDGs.
0	The BRICS country takes action on at least four SDGs.
+1	The BRICS country takes action on at least 11 SDGs.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to advance the implementation of the United Nations 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

On 30 June 2022, a new Brazilian Mineral Policy document was published. The Policy provides for the creation of instruments for planning in the mineral sector and a collegiate body for coordinating and implementing the respective public policy - National Council of Mineral Policy. The general aim is to promote economic, social and environmentally responsible use of the country's mineral resources, aiming at the competitiveness and development of the mineral sector.<sup>403</sup>

On 26 September 2022, the Ministry of Environment announced a second call for the applications to the Floresta+ Conservation initiative. Small producers, owners and holders of rural properties in the nine states of the Legal Amazon are eligible to enroll in the program until 28 February 2023. The project provides financial incentives to individuals and enterprises, which contributes to the protection and recovery of forest areas, and contributes to the reduction of greenhouse gases emissions.<sup>404</sup>

On 4 October 2022, the Ministry of Health announced that the Unified Health System Institutional Development Support Program was to invest additional BR7.4 million in research and development on healthcare and nutrition. As of October 2022, the Unified Health System had 154 projects in the execution phase in the areas of research, management, incorporation of technologies, and training in health.<sup>405</sup>

<sup>402</sup> Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015, 70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, United Nations (New York) 25 September 2015. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

[https://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/generalassembly/docs/globalcompact/A\\_RES\\_70\\_1\\_E.pdf](https://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/generalassembly/docs/globalcompact/A_RES_70_1_E.pdf)

<sup>403</sup> Brazilian Mineral Policy is instituted, Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 30 June 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/politica-mineral-brasileira-e-instituida>.

<sup>404</sup> Floresta+ Amazônia Project receives registrations in the Conservation modality and has an open call for information request for the Recovery modality, Ministry of the Environment (Brasilia) 26 September 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/projeto-floresta-amazonia-recebe-inscricoes-na-modalidade-conservacao-e-tem-chamada-aberta-de-solicitacao-de-informacao-para-a-modalidade-recuperacao>.

<sup>405</sup> Proadi-SUS invests over R\$ 7.4 million in research development, Brazilian Ministry of Healthcare (Brasilia) 4 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/outubro/proadi-sus-investe-mais-r-7-4-milhoes-em-desenvolvimento-de-pesquisas>.

On 20 October 2022, the Management Committee of the Unified Health System Institutional Development Support Program approved three more projects and project development proposals, in the order of BR27.1 million, to strengthen and improve the Unified Health System.<sup>406</sup>

On 22 December 2022, Minister of Mines and Energy Adolfo Sachsida gave an account of his ministry's plans for 2023. It is expected that energy costs for consumers in three Brazilian regions will be reduced by BR9 billion. The Minister announced the structural reduction of electricity tariff by 38.9% for 2023.<sup>407</sup>

On 22 December 2022, the National System of Attendance to Women in Situations of Violence (Sistema ELA) was launched as an interactive virtual platform by the Ministry of Women, Family and Human Rights of Brazil. This virtual tool includes a database capable of generating the necessary statistics to monitor and evaluate public policies to combat violence against women. The system allows the registration of all calls made in the Brazilian Women's Houses, Reference Centers and Assistance to Women and Specialized Center for Assistance to Women throughout the country.<sup>408</sup>

On 23 December 2022, the Brazilian Government announced the preliminary results of the 2022/2023 Crop Plan. The Plan, in force from July 2022 to June 2023, was conceived by the Ministry of Economy in partnership with the Ministry of Agriculture, the Central Bank, and the National Treasury. It is projected to benefit hundreds of thousands of rural agricultural producers with credit lines exceeding BR340 billion, of which BR246.3 billion are allocated for funding and commercialization, and BR 94.6 billion for investments.<sup>409</sup>

On 26 December 2022, the Brazilian Government announced that the Special Secretariat for Investment Partnerships Program of the Ministry of Economy concluded 48 projects by 2022 and secured BR101 billion in new investments. The primary mission of the Special Secretariat is to support society, the business environment, and state and municipal governments, through attracting investment and improving the "internal mechanisms" of local governments.<sup>410</sup>

On 26 December 2022, the National Department of Transportation Infrastructure announced the completion of reconstruction works on 21.94 kilometers of the BR-265/MG highway, between Jacuí and São Sebastião do Paraíso. According to the government, the project "will provide greater comfort and safety for users, lower maintenance costs for the road, reduced travel time, reduced transportation costs for agricultural inputs such as fertilizers and fertilizers, and also reduced transportation costs

---

<sup>406</sup> Proadi-SUS enables over R\$ 27.1 million to strengthen the SUS, Brazilian Ministry of Healthcare (Brasilia) 21 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/outubro/proadi-sus-viabiliza-mais-r-27-1-milhoes-para-o-fortalecimento-do-sus>.

<sup>407</sup> Minister takes stock of his management and reinforces commitment to the consumer of electricity, Brazilian Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 22 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ministro-faz-balanco-da-sua-gestao-e-reforca-compromisso-com-o-consumidor-de-energia-eletrica>.

<sup>408</sup> National system creates database on care for women in situations of violence, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 27 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/assistencia-social/2022/12/sistema-nacional-cria-base-de-dados-sobre-atendimento-a-mulheres-em-situacao-de-violencia>.

<sup>409</sup> Plano Safra grants credit of more than BRL 340 billion to rural producers, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 23 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/financas-impostos-e-gestao-publica/2022/12/plano-safra-concede-credito-de-mais-de-r-340-bilhoes-aos-produtores-rurais>.

<sup>410</sup> PPI Special Secretariat completed 48 projects in 2022 and secured BRL 101 billion in new investments, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 26 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/financas-impostos-e-gestao-publica/2022/12/secretaria-especial-do-ppi-concluiu-48-projetos-em-2022-e-assegurou-r-101-bilhoes-em-novos-investimentos>.



corresponding to the disposal of typical products from the region.” The investment amounted to BR9 million.<sup>411</sup>

On 27 December 2022, the Decree 11.310/2022 regulating the provisions of Law 12.334/2010, which establishes the National Policy for Dam Safety, was published. The decree provides monitoring of safety precautions and control of dams of various types. The establishment of these measures, according to the Ministry of Mines and Energy, would help organize the actions of federal agencies and improve the processes of planning, execution and monitoring of dam safety.<sup>412</sup>

On 4 January 2022, Minister of Environment and Climate Change Marina Silva announced the creation of the National Authority for Climate Security within the Ministry. She said that the creation of the National Authority for Climate Security would be formalized by March 2023. Additionally, the National Council on Climate Change is to be created and headed by the President of the Republic, with the participation of all ministries, states and municipalities. The purpose of the National Climate Security Authority is to produce funding for the execution and implementation of the National Policy on Climate Change, as well as to regulate and monitor the implementation of actions related to sectoral policies and targets for mitigation, adaptation and promotion of resilience to climate change.<sup>413</sup>

On 24 January 2023, the Ministry of Healthcare of Brazil announced the plans to distribute 150 thousand rapid tests to support leprosy diagnosis in the Unified Health System. According to the Ministry, the units will be aimed at people who have had close and prolonged contact with confirmed cases of the disease and will be of two types: the rapid test, and the molecular biology test.<sup>414</sup>

During the monitoring period Brazil has taken actions to advance the implementation of SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### **Russia: +1**

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to advance the implementation of the United Nations 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

On 2 August 2022, the Government of Russia approved a list of environmental protection measures, for financing through environmental payments system. Environmental payments received by the regions’ budgets, including fines for environmental violations, will be primarily used to liquidate facilities that have a negative impact on the environment, e.g. landfill sites, abandoned enterprises, ownerless landfills, hazardous waste, etc. In addition, funds are allowed to be allocated for additional

---

<sup>411</sup> Delivered 21.94 kilometers of revitalized lane on BR-265, in Minas Gerais, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 26 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/transito-e-transportes/2022/12/entregue-21-94-quilometros-de-pista-revitalizada-na-br-265-em-minas-gerais>.

<sup>412</sup> Decree published to increase dam safety, Brazilian Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 27 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mme-publica-decreto-para-aumentar-seguranca-de-barragens>.

<sup>413</sup> Marina Silva announces the creation of the National Climate Security Authority, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 5 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/meio-ambiente-e-clima/2023/01/marina-silva-anuncia-a-criacao-da-autoridade-nacional-de-seguranca-climatica>.

<sup>414</sup> Ministry of Health will distribute 150,000 rapid tests to fight leprosy, Brazilian Ministry of Healthcare (Brasilia) 24 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2023/janeiro/ministerio-da-saude-vai-distribuir-150-mil-testes-rapidos-para-enfrentamento-a-hanseniose>.

environmental measures to protect and defend forests, protected areas, water bodies, flora and fauna, projects to reduce air pollution, land reclamation after mining, and other measures.<sup>415</sup>

On 24 August 2022, the Russian Government approved a RUB1.5 billion (USD25.2 million) federal subsidy to the regions for the purchase of containers for separate collection of solid municipal waste. This support measure is aimed at increasing recycling of MSW and accelerating the country's transition to circular economy.<sup>416</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the Russian Government issued a decree, allocating RUB2.6 billion to the development of social, municipal and transport infrastructure in the regions of the Arctic zone. The package includes funds aimed at enhancing medical care facilities, transport infrastructure, schools, cultural centers and residential buildings in the Far North of the country.<sup>417</sup>

On 8 December 2022, the Russian Government issued a decree on financing the creation of agro-industrial enterprises in the Volgograd, Kaliningrad, and Smolensk regions. RUB1.4 billion were allocated to partially compensate the regional governments for the cost of establishing agro-industrial enterprises. Specifically, the reimbursement was aimed at the completion of a plant for deep processing of corn grain in Volgograd Region, the building of a new fish-processing factory in Kaliningrad region, and the construction of a dry dairy products plant in Smolensk region.<sup>418</sup>

On 19 December 2022, the Russian Government approved a decree on the free retraining of citizens in 2023 and 2024 as part of measures to support the labor market. In 2023 and 2024, unemployed citizens, including employees at risk of dismissal, certain categories of citizens under the age of 35, people over 50 years, women with young children, and refugees, will be able to undergo free retraining or receive additional vocational training. The Government plans to reimburse the costs of educational organizations for the training of citizens with grants. The federal budget for 2023 will provide around RUB8.2 billion for the initiative, and RUB6.2 billion in 2024.<sup>419</sup>

On 29 December 2022, the Russian Government issued a decree on a new National Action Strategy for Women until 2030. The key objectives of the Strategy are the observance of the principle of equal rights of men and women in different spheres of life, increasing the economic independence and political activity of Russian women, as well as the prevention of female disadvantages. These issues are planned to be resolved by encouraging women to take interest in technical and technological professions, involving women in the digital economy, creating a system of continuing education and professional development, developing long-distance forms of employment, and increasing women's participation in entrepreneurship.<sup>420</sup>

On 29 December 2022, the Russian Government approved the prolongation of the light industry support program until the end of 2023. In 2023, light industry enterprises will continue to receive

---

<sup>415</sup> The government approved a list of environmental protection measures, for which environmental payments will be made, Russian Government 2 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/46198/>.

<sup>416</sup> The government will finance the purchase of containers for separate collection of municipal waste, Russian Government 24 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/46331/>.

<sup>417</sup> The government will allocate more than 2.6 billion rubles for the development of social, municipal and transport infrastructure in the regions of the Arctic zone, Russian Government 28 November 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47163/>.

<sup>418</sup> The government will finance the creation of agro-industrial enterprises in three regions, Russian Government 12 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023 <http://government.ru/news/47301/>.

<sup>419</sup> The government approved a decree on free retraining of citizens in 2023 and 2024 as part of measures to support the labor market, Government of Russia (Moscow) 20 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47377/>.

<sup>420</sup> Mikhail Mishustin approved the new National Strategy of Action for Women until 2030, Government of Russia (Moscow) 8 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47493/>.

federal subsidies, with which they will be able to offset the cost of repayment of interest on loans. The government allocated around RUB600 million annually for this support measure.<sup>421</sup>

On 29 December 2022, the Government of Russia adopted the program of state guarantees of free medical care until 2025. The program provides for further development of medical rehabilitation, including provision of such care at home and provision of necessary medical devices to patients. It also includes provisions to deal with the spread and treatment of hepatitis C and diabetes, through increased financing of appropriate medical institutions and health insurance schemes.<sup>422</sup>

On 29 December 2022, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin signed a decree reviewing and expanding the five-year road-building plan. The updated plan includes two major projects - the construction of bypass roads around the cities of Khasavyurt and Derbent. Their length will total 21 km and 32 km respectively. Construction of these bypasses is aimed at developing the North-South international transport corridor, connecting Russia, Azerbaijan and Iran.<sup>423</sup>

On 9 January 2023, Prime Minister Mishustin signed a decree on special social payments for certain categories of medical workers. In 2023, Russian medics are to receive monthly social payments ranging from RUB4.5 thousand to RUB18.5 thousand per person. Increases to the basic salary are intended for medical workers of rare specialties: doctors and specialists of primary health care, doctors of regional hospitals, as well as doctors working at the stations and in the emergency departments. It is projected that the total number of recipients of these payments will amount to 1.1 million people. A total of RUB152.4 billion is to be allocated for this purpose.<sup>424</sup>

On 12 January 2023, the Russian Government issued a directive on the procedure for financing the development and launch of the Northern Sea Route digital ecosystem. The directive provides for the creation of an “ice navigator,” which allows to accurately plot a safe route in the constantly changing conditions of the Arctic Ocean. In 2023-2024 a subsidy of RUB3.8 billion will be allocated from the federal budget for this purpose.<sup>425</sup>

On 17 January 2023, the Russian Government signed an agreement on cooperation in high-tech development with the companies “Rosatom” and “Gazprom.” The agreement primarily involves cooperative work on developing hydrogen energy capabilities and energy storage technologies. It is planned that by 2024, at least 25000 electric cars will be produced in Russia and more than 9000 charging stations will be opened. Domestic demand for energy storage will reach 17.5 GWh, of which 16 GWh per year will come from electric cars.<sup>426</sup>

On 23 January 2023, Prime Minister Mishustin signed a decree “On Approving the Rules for the Development and Approval of Documents for the Prospective Development of the Electric Power Industry and on Amendments to Certain Acts of the Government of the Russian Federation.” The amendments will help optimize the construction and modernization of grid infrastructure and generating facilities. The decree regulates the costs of building power lines and substations, as well as

---

<sup>421</sup> The government extended the program to support light industry until the end of 2023, Government of Russia (Moscow) 4 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47488/>.

<sup>422</sup> The program of state guarantees of free medical care for the next three years has been approved, Government of Russia (Moscow) 3 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47486/>.

<sup>423</sup> The government expanded the five-year plan of road activities, Government of Russia (Moscow) 31 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47484/>.

<sup>424</sup> The government has established special social payments for certain categories of medical workers, Government of Russia (Moscow) 9 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47504/>.

<sup>425</sup> The government will finance infrastructure projects necessary for the development of the Northern Sea Route, Government of Russia (Moscow) 12 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47546/>.

<sup>426</sup> Alexander Novak took part in the signing of the final package of agreements on cooperation in the development of high-tech areas, Government of Russia (Moscow) 17 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47555/>.

provides for the gradual formation of a rational structure of generating capacity in the country, while taking into account the objectives of low-carbon development.<sup>427</sup>

On 23 January 2023, Prime Minister Mishustin signed a decree providing for the modernization of public utilities in Russian regions. In 2023, RUB30 billion are to be allocated to the task.<sup>428</sup>

During the monitoring period Russia has taken actions to advance the implementation of SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with the commitment to advance the implementation of the United Nations 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

On 2 August 2022, the Ministry of Women and Child Development issued Operational Guidelines regarding implementation of the “Saksham Anganwadi and Poshan 2.0” scheme. “Saksham Anganwadi and Poshan 2.0” is an Integrated Nutrition Support Program, which seeks to tackle malnutrition in children, adolescent girls, pregnant women, and lactating mothers through a strategic shift in nutrition content and delivery and by the creation of a convergent eco-system to develop and promote practices that nurture health, wellness, and immunity. The new guidelines seek to address various gaps and shortcomings in the on-going nutrition program and to improve implementation as well as to accelerate improvement in nutrition and child development outcomes.<sup>429</sup>

On 3 August 2022, the Ministry of Commerce and Industry announced that the Department for Promotion of Industry and Internal Trade was conducting several initiatives under Ease of Doing Business and Reducing Compliance Burden. The initiatives are aimed at creating a conducive business environment, and include simplification of procedures related to applications, renewals, inspections, filing records, etc.; rationalization by repealing, amending or subsuming redundant laws; digitization by creating online interfaces eliminating manual forms and records; and decriminalization of minor technical or procedural defaults. The initiatives are undertaken in conjunction with the Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises.<sup>430</sup>

On 10 August 2022, the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change announced the Action Plan for Introduction of Cheetah in India. The goal of the project is to reestablish breeding cheetah population in its historical habitat in India, thereby contributing to its global conservation efforts. Another goal of the plan is to “restore ecosystems with a lost element that has played a significant role in their evolutionary history, allow ecosystems to provide services to their full potential, and use the cheetah as an umbrella species for conserving the biodiversity of grasslands, savanna and open forest systems.”<sup>431</sup>

---

<sup>427</sup> The government has adopted new rules for the prospective development of the electric power industry, Government of Russia (Moscow) 23 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47604/>

<sup>428</sup> The government will finance the development of municipal infrastructure in the regions, Government of Russia (Moscow) 23 January 2023. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <http://government.ru/news/47593/>.

<sup>429</sup> Ministry of Women and Child Development issues Guidelines of ‘Saksham Anganwadi and Poshan 2.0’ - an Integrated Nutrition Support Programme, Indian Government 3 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1847548>.

<sup>430</sup> Initiatives taken to create a conducive business environment, Government of India (New Delhi) 10 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1847864>.

<sup>431</sup> Action Plan for Introduction of Cheetah in India, Government of India (New Delhi) 3 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1850587>.

On 12 August 2022, the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry has launched Basmati crop survey. The survey aims to estimate acreage and assess crop health and expected yield of aromatic and long grain rice during 2022-2023 crop season, with the application of climate-based modelling. This exercise is intended to assist state governments in the promotion of Basmati rice cultivation and provide relevant information to farmers.<sup>432</sup>

On 17 September 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi launched the Unified Logistics Interface Platform (ULIP) as part of the National Logistics Policy. The initiative aims to ensure a “technologically-enabled, integrated, cost-efficient, resilient and sustainable logistics ecosystem for accelerated and inclusive growth.” Among the policy goals of the ULIP are cost reduction of logistics in India to global benchmark levels by 2030; improvement of the Logistics Performance Index ranking, to be among top 25 countries by 2030; and creation of data driven decision support mechanism for an efficient logistics ecosystem.<sup>433</sup>

On 18 October 2022, the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare announced the launch of a INR5 billion accelerator program to enhance the successful initiatives of Agri Startups. The goal of the program is to facilitate inter-institutional linkages between agri-producers and various certification agencies, financial institutions, and agricultural universities.<sup>434</sup>

On 15 November 2022, the National Commission for Women launched the fourth phase of Digital Shakti Campaign – a country-wide project to digitally empower and provide digital skills to women and girls. The Digital Shakti 4.0 campaign is focused on “making women digitally skilled and aware to stand up against any illegal/inappropriate activity online.”<sup>435</sup>

On 22 November 2022, NITI Aayog, NETRA NTPC and the National Centre of Excellence in Carbon Capture and Utilisation, IIT Bombay launched the assessment of CO<sub>2</sub> Geological Storage Potential in India. As a part of this initiative, an assessment of potential storage of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) in select Coalbed Methane rich coalfields will be carried out, and the CO<sub>2</sub> Storage Atlas will be produced. The project is envisaged as a part of India’s CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation strategy to facilitate the transition towards a low-carbon energy economy and subsequently to a ‘Net-Zero’ emission level.<sup>436</sup>

On 13 December 2022, the Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare and Department of Space signed a memorandum of Understanding on the development of the Krishi-Decision Support System (Krishi-DSS) using geospatial technologies and related databases for enhancing evidence based

---

<sup>432</sup> Government commences Basmati crop survey to estimate acreage, assess crop health, expected yield of Basmati rice during 2022-2023 crop year, Government of India (New Delhi) 12 August 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1851287>.

<sup>433</sup> Policy introduces Unified Logistics Interface Platform, Standardization, Monitoring framework and skill development for greater efficiency in logistics services, Prime Minister of India (New Delhi) 21 September 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. [https://www.pmindia.gov.in/en/news\\_updates/policy-introduces-unified-logistics-interface-platform-standardization-monitoring-framework-and-skill-development-for-greater-efficiency-in-logistics-services/](https://www.pmindia.gov.in/en/news_updates/policy-introduces-unified-logistics-interface-platform-standardization-monitoring-framework-and-skill-development-for-greater-efficiency-in-logistics-services/).

<sup>434</sup> Central government’s policy initiative for Agricultural Startups, Union Agriculture Minister makes many announcements in the conference, Government of India (New Delhi) 18 October 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1868937>.

<sup>435</sup> NCW launches Digital Shakti 4.0 focussing on making women digitally skilled and aware, Government of India (New Delhi) 16 November 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1876462>.

<sup>436</sup> NETRA NTPC, NITI Aayog, and the National Centre of Excellence in Carbon Capture & Utilisation (NCoE-CCU), IIT Bombay launches the assessment of ‘CO<sub>2</sub> Geological Storage Potential’, Government of India (New Delhi) 22 November 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1878184>.

decision making capability of all the stakeholders in the agriculture sector. On the same day, the data products and services of RISAT-1A satellite were formally released for the user community.<sup>437</sup>

On 13 December 2022, the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare announced the commencement of the work to create Agristack - a collection of technologies and digital databases proposed by the Central Government focusing on India's farmers and the agricultural sector. The core concept of "India Digital Ecosystem of Agriculture (IDEA)" was finalized, which, according to the Ministry, lays down a framework for Agristack. The system is aimed at tackling the issue of inadequate access to credit and information, pest infestation, crop wastage, poor price discovery, and yield forecasting, through the application of digital technology in agriculture.<sup>438</sup>

During the monitoring period India has taken actions to advance the implementation of SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 15.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with the commitment to advance the implementation of the UN 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

On 28 July 2022, National Development and Reform Commission of China announced an allocation of CNY2.4 billion (USD355 million) to save energy and reduce carbon emissions as part of the country's effort to transition to a greener economy. The allocation is aimed at supporting the low-carbon and energy-saving transformation for key areas and industries, technology innovation in areas like low carbon, zero carbon, carbon removal and energy saving, as well as the promotion of a circular economy.<sup>439</sup>

On 19 August 2022, China's National Health Commission released a plan for the development of medical talent for the 14th Five-Year Plan period (2021-2025). The Plan aims to increase the number of medical workers in specialized public health institutions to more than 1.2 million, with around 250,000 engaged in disease prevention and control. It also provides for the optimization of the distribution of medical workers across specialties, between urban and rural areas, and among different regions. Finally, by 2025 the number of assistant physicians is set to reach 4.5 million, up from 4.28 million in 2021, and the number of registered nurses should amount to 5.5 million.<sup>440</sup>

On 19 September 2022, the Chinese government released a policy document on "conserving the mountains, rivers, forests, farmlands, lakes, grasslands and sands of the Yangtze River Basin area." Targets of the document include: ensuring that all water in the river basin area meets standards for second-tier classification by the end of 2025, ensuring the harmless disposal of at least 97 percent of the garbage produced in Yangtze River Economic Belt counties, eliminating polluted water bodies in

---

<sup>437</sup> Memorandum of Understanding signed on developing Krishi-Decision Support System using RISAT and VEDAS, Government of India (New Delhi) 13 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1883182>.

<sup>438</sup> Agristack Project, Government of India (New Delhi) 13 December 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023.

<https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1883173>.

<sup>439</sup> NDRC allocates \$355m for greener economy, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 28 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202207/28/content\\_WS62e1de6ec6d02e533532e93d.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202207/28/content_WS62e1de6ec6d02e533532e93d.html).

<sup>440</sup> Plan devised to bolster development of medical workers, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 19 August 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202208/19/content\\_WS62ff9393c6d02e533532f79e.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202208/19/content_WS62ff9393c6d02e533532f79e.html).

urban areas, recycling at least 80 percent of animal waste from livestock and poultry farms and continuously improving biodiversity.<sup>441</sup>

On 30 September 2022, the State Council of the People's Republic of China announced the delivery of the first 2,000-metric-ton offshore wind-power installation platform for use in the Nansha district of Guangzhou, in Guangdong province. According to the message, it is the first offshore wind-power installation platform that meets the fourth-generation standards of offshore wind equipment in China.<sup>442</sup>

On 2 December 2022, the China Meteorological Administration reported that two new meteorological satellites started their operation. According to the message of the State Council of the People's Republic of China, the trial operation of the satellites demonstrated the reduced forecast deviation, strengthened interaction between observation and forecast, and enhanced accuracy of path prediction.<sup>443</sup>

On 26 December 2022, The State Forestry and Grassland Administration of China announced the adoption of the National Desertification Prevention and Control Plan.<sup>444</sup> According to the plan, 6.7 million hectares of land affected by desertification will be reclaimed by 2025, and 12.4 million hectares will be reclaimed by 2030. The document also identified seven areas where spreading deserts need to be pushed back, including the mountains of the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, the areas around the Kubuqi Desert in the Inner Mongolia autonomous region and the Mu Us Desert in Shaanxi province.<sup>445</sup>

On 30 December 2022, the State Council of the People's Republic of China announced that the Baihetan-Zhejiang 800-kilovolt ultra-high-voltage direct current power transmission project was completed. According to the message, the new power line transmits the clean electricity generated at the Baihetan hydropower station to eastern Zhejiang Province through a transmission line stretching 2,121 km.<sup>446</sup>

On 1 January 2023, the State Council of the People's Republic of China announced the launch of the Beijing-Xiong'an expressway, which linked these two locations, helping reduce travel time by approximately 50 minutes. The newly built expressway is a major component of Xiong'an New Area's

---

<sup>441</sup> New move aims to protect Yangtze, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 28 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202209/28/content\\_WS63339e76c6d0a757729e09ab.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202209/28/content_WS63339e76c6d0a757729e09ab.html).

<sup>442</sup> Platform installs wind power offshore, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 30 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202209/30/content\\_WS63363f3ac6d0a757729e0b9a.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202209/30/content_WS63363f3ac6d0a757729e0b9a.html)

<sup>443</sup> China's two meteorological satellites put into operation, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 2 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202212/02/content\\_WS6389b7b2c6d0a757729e3f56.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202212/02/content_WS6389b7b2c6d0a757729e3f56.html).

<sup>444</sup> The "National Desertification Prevention and Control Plan (2021-2030)" was officially issued and implemented, Teller Report 26 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[https://www.tellerreport.com/news/2022-12-26-the-"national-desertification-prevention-and-control-plan-\(2021-2030\)"-was-officially-issued-and-implemented.SkQSIM3UYs.html](https://www.tellerreport.com/news/2022-12-26-the-).

<sup>445</sup> National plan aims to push back desertification, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202301/20/content\\_WS63c9fd57c6d0a757729e5ec2.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202301/20/content_WS63c9fd57c6d0a757729e5ec2.html).

<sup>446</sup> Major Chinese power transmission project now fully operational, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 30 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202212/30/content\\_WS63ae7fa4c6d0a757729e4f04.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202212/30/content_WS63ae7fa4c6d0a757729e4f04.html).

traffic network, with its main section running from Beijing's sixth ring road and covering a total of 81 km.<sup>447</sup>

On 3 January 2023, the State Council of the People's Republic of China reported the adoption of a new guideline for water and soil conservation. The guideline, jointly released by the general offices of the Communist Party of China Central Committee and the State Council, details China's targets to strengthen water and soil conservation by 2025 and 2035. By 2025, China aims to improve its institutional mechanism and system for soil and water conservation, enhance management efficiency, and effectively control soil erosion caused by human activities in key regions. By 2035, a new soil conservation system is to be formed, with human-induced soil erosion under control, and soil erosion in key areas comprehensively negated. Areas without soil erosion should account for 75 percent of the nation's territory by that date, according to the document.<sup>448</sup>

On 19 January 2023, the State Council of the People's Republic of China announced its plans to increase the use of manufacturing robots, doubling their utilization by 2025. The "robotics+" action plan was released by the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology and 16 other government departments. The document also provided for the expansion of efforts "to build a collaborative innovation system for robot production and application and speed up the development and promotion of robot application standards."<sup>449</sup>

On 19 January 2023, China's State Council Information Office released the "China's Green Development in the New Era" white paper. The document lists seven key areas of China's green transformation – "commitment to green growth, green territorial configuration, adjustment and improvement of the industrial structure, application of green production methods, eco-friendly living, institutions and mechanisms for green development, and efforts to build the earth into a beautiful home."<sup>450</sup>

During the monitoring period China has taken actions to advance the implementation of SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to advance the implementation of the UN 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

On 21 August 2022, Minister of Public Works and infrastructure Patricia de Lille signed off the release of four plots of land on a gratis basis to be released to the Housing Development Agency for human

---

<sup>447</sup> New expressway opens between Beijing and Xiong'an New Area, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 2 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202301/02/content\\_WS63b21522c6d0a757729e5022.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202301/02/content_WS63b21522c6d0a757729e5022.html).

<sup>448</sup> China issues guideline to strengthen conservation of water, soil, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 3 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202301/03/content\\_WS63b43533c6d0a757729e50d1.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202301/03/content_WS63b43533c6d0a757729e50d1.html).

<sup>449</sup> China to boost density of manufacturing robots, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/20/content\\_WS63c9d296c6d0a757729e5e28.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/20/content_WS63c9d296c6d0a757729e5e28.html).

<sup>450</sup> China issues white paper on green development, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 30 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/20/content\\_WS63c9eef2c6d0a757729e5e80.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202301/20/content_WS63c9eef2c6d0a757729e5e80.html).



settlement development purposes. This measure is aimed primarily at communities, displaced by the flooding in KwaZulu Natal region earlier in 2022.<sup>451</sup>

On 26 August 2022, the updated National Biodiversity Framework 2019 to 2024 was published by Minister Creecy. The Revised Framework addresses the biodiversity threats identified during the scientific assessment of the state of biodiversity and ecosystems in the country by the South African National Biodiversity Institute.<sup>452</sup>

On 14 September 2022, South Africa Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment announced the extension of the period for public comment on the draft white paper on the Conservation and Sustainable use of South Africa's biodiversity and the draft Game Meat Strategy until 26 September 2022. The Draft White Paper was published in the Government Gazette 46687 (Notice No 2252) on 8 July 2022. The document emphasizes the need for a holistic approach to sustainable use, responsible and humane use of South Africa's biodiversity, and the ending of poor and harmful practices. The White Paper also aims to ensure transformation, with the participation of communities adjacent to protected areas, as well as of previously disadvantaged individuals.<sup>453</sup>

On 18 November 2022, Minister Creecy published the Revised National list of Ecosystems that are Threatened and in need of Protection. The List incorporates the information on terrestrial ecosystems' extent and condition, pressures and drivers of change. A total of 120 of the 456 terrestrial ecosystem types assessed in the list are categorized as threatened. Together these threatened ecosystems make up approximately 10 percent of the country's habitats. According to the report, 55 of the 120 terrestrial ecosystems are critically endangered, 51 -endangered and 14 - vulnerable.<sup>454</sup>

On 21 January 2023, the Water and Sanitation Minister of South Africa, Senzo Mchunu, announced the launch of a steering committee to oversee and ensure that water and sanitation services management is sustainable in the North West Province. According to the Minister's statement, a technical task team will be established under the steering committee, comprised of professional engineers from the Department and Water and Sanitation, the Magalies Water Board, as well as all district and local municipalities, to carry out technical work of assessing, planning, and implementation of water and sanitation needs of the whole province.<sup>455</sup>

On 21 January 2023, the National Energy Crisis Committee released a six-month progress report on the implementation of the Energy Action Plan. In July 2022, President of South Africa Cyril Ramaphosa announced a range of measures to improve the performance of existing power stations and add new generation capacity. The updated report highlighted major steps that had been taken during the six-month implementation of the Plan, including a new Ministerial determination for 14771 MW of new generation capacity from wind, solar and battery storage, and an additional 300 MW

---

<sup>451</sup> Minister Patricia de Lille on release of land for human settlements developments and accommodation for KZN flood victims, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 21 August 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

<https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-patricia-de-lille-%C2%A0dpwi-approves-gratis-release-four-parcels-land-human>.

<sup>452</sup> Minister Barbara Creecy publishes revised National Biodiversity Framework 2019 to 2024 for implementation, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 29 August 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

<https://www.gov.za/speeches/revised-national-biodiversity-framework-published-implementation-29-aug-2022-0000>.

<sup>453</sup> Forestry, Fisheries and Environment extends public comment on white paper and draft strategy, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 14 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/extension-period-public-comment-14-sep-2022-0000>.

<sup>454</sup> Minister Barbara Creecy publishes the revised national list of ecosystems that are threatened and in need of protection, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 21 November 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023.

<https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-barbara-creecy-publishes-revised-national-list-ecosystems-are-threatened-and-need>.

<sup>455</sup> Minister Senzo Mchunu on permanent water solutions for North West residents, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 21 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-senzo-mchunu-resolute-finding-permanent-water-supply-solutions-north-west>.

imported through the Southern African Power Pool, with the negotiations underway to secure a further 1,000 MW from neighboring countries in 2023.<sup>456</sup>

During the monitoring period South Africa has taken actions to advance the implementation of SDGs 1, 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

---

<sup>456</sup> National Energy Crisis Committee releases six month progress update on implementation of Energy Action Plan, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 21 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/national-energy-crisis-committee-releases-six-month-progress-update-implementation-energy>.

## 15. Macroeconomics: Standardization in Sustainable Development

“We agree to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization and make full use of standards to advance sustainable development”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

### Background

The issue of standardization was for the first time addressed by BRICS in the BRICS Trade and Investment Facilitation Plan adopted in 2014. Enhancing cooperation and coordination in standardization and encouraging the use of international standards as a basis for national standards were indicated as suggested actions to enhance mutual trade.<sup>457</sup>

In 2015, BRICS trade ministers noted that strengthening cooperation on standards “would create favourable conditions for enhancing intra-BRICS trade.”<sup>458</sup> In 2016, the ministers endorsed the Framework for Cooperation on Standardisation agreed to by the Contact Group on Economic and Trade Issues (CGETI). They also urged the CGETI to work on the elements of the Framework “with a view to ensuring that the cooperation leads to a better understanding of each other standards.”<sup>459</sup>

At the Goa Summit, the BRICS leaders for the first time recognized standardization as a possible area of future cooperation.<sup>460</sup>

In 2017, the BRICS trade ministers agreed to strengthen cooperation in the area of standardization based on operationalization of the Framework for Cooperation on standardization.<sup>461</sup> The BRICS Trade In Services Cooperation Roadmap<sup>462</sup> and the Framework on Strengthening the Economic and Technical Cooperation for BRICS Countries<sup>463</sup> adopted by the ministers contained the commitments to explore, where possible, possibilities for mutual recognition of regulatory standards in line with

<sup>457</sup> BRICS Trade and Investment Facilitation Plan, RANEP (Moscow) July 2014. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/plan.pdf>

<sup>458</sup> The Fifth Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers Joint Communique, RANEP (Moscow) 7 July 2015. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/>

[BRICS+Trade+Ministers+Communique+2015+FINAL+version.pdf](#)

<sup>459</sup> Trade Ministers Communique, RANEP (Moscow) 13 October 2016. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/58006d2c04b26BRICSTradeMinistersCommuniquefinal%20\(1\).pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/58006d2c04b26BRICSTradeMinistersCommuniquefinal%20(1).pdf)

<sup>460</sup> Goa Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>461</sup> 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers Statement, RANEP (Moscow) 2 August 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/china2016/trade\\_statement\\_2017.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/china2016/trade_statement_2017.pdf)

<sup>462</sup> BRICS Trade In Services Cooperation Roadmap, RANEP (Moscow) 31 July 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/china2016/BRICS%20Trade%20in%20Services%20Cooperation%20Roadmap%20-%20final.pdf>

<sup>463</sup> Framework on Strengthening the Economic and Technical Cooperation for BRICS Countries, RANEP (Moscow) 31 July 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/china2016/Framework%20on%20Strengthening%20the%20ECOTEC%20%20Final.pdf>

international standards. The BRICS Action Agenda on Economic and Trade Cooperation mentioned standards as an area for future cooperation.<sup>464</sup>

In 2018, the BRICS trade ministers endorsed the Working Mechanism on technical regulations, standards, metrology and conformity assessment procedures “in order to facilitate and increase trade in goods.”<sup>465</sup> However, the relevant text is not publicly available. In 2019, the BRICS trade ministers reaffirmed the importance of cooperation under the Working Mechanism on technical regulations, standards, metrology, conformity assessment and accreditation.<sup>466</sup> Similar statements were made in 2020 at the ministerial<sup>467</sup> and leaders<sup>468</sup> level.

In 2021, the cooperation mechanism established in 2018 was referred to as the Mechanism on Technical Regulations, Standards, Metrology and Conformity Assessment.<sup>469</sup> At the Beijing Summit the BRICS leaders for the first time made a commitment in this area and agreed to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization and make full use of standards to advance sustainable development.<sup>470</sup>

### Commitment Features

The commitment requires BRICS members to facilitate exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization in order to stimulate mutual trade and promote sustainable development.

Full compliance is registered for BRICS countries that manage to deepen cooperation in standardization bilaterally or multilaterally in partnership with other BRICS members, for instance through the exchange of national standards in order to ensure their further application in mutual trade and investment projects, direct application of each other’s standards in different sectors, joint expert studies, etc. Verbal support to cooperation on standardization without concrete actions is considered as partial compliance.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	BRICS member has not taken any steps to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization
0	BRICS member has provided verbal support to enhancing exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization
+1	BRICS member has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

<sup>464</sup> BRICS Action Agenda on Economic and Trade Cooperation, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/BRICS%20Action%20Agenda%20on%20Economic%20and%20Trade%20Cooperation.pdf>

<sup>465</sup> 8th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers: Joint Communiqué, RANEPА (Moscow) 5 July 2018. Access Date: 18 October 2022. [https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/brics\\_trade\\_2018.pdf](https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/brics_trade_2018.pdf)

<sup>466</sup> The Ninth Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers Joint Communiqué, RANEPА (Moscow) 11 November 2019. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191111-trade.pdf>

<sup>467</sup> The Tenth Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers JOINT COMMUNIQUE, RANEPА (Moscow) 23 July 2020. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/BRICS%20Trade%20and%20Economy%20ministers%20joint%20communique%2023%2007%202020.pdf>

<sup>468</sup> XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>469</sup> XIII BRICS Summit- New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>470</sup> XIV BRICS Summit Beijing Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 23 June 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2022/XIV-BRICS-Summit-Beijing-Declaration-ENG.pdf>

**Brazil: +1**

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

On 28 June 2022, the workshop on emission peak and carbon neutrality standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 20 participants, including experts and representatives from the national standardization bodies. During the meeting, experts shared their work experience concerning emission peak and carbon neutrality related standards. They also held discussions on further cooperation within the framework of the International Organization for Standardization and reached a consensus on promoting communication on standards related to carbon peak and neutrality in BRICS countries.<sup>471</sup>

On 5 July 2022, the workshop on e-commerce standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of e-commerce. During the meeting, experts shared the progress of e-commerce standardization in each country and discussed standards research and cooperation. A consensus was reached on further promoting communication and cooperation on standards related to e-commerce among the BRICS countries.<sup>472</sup>

On 7 July 2022, the workshop on traditional medicine standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 30 participants, including experts from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of traditional medicine. Experts and representatives from the BRICS countries made exchanges on the status quo and development experience of traditional medicine standardization in each country and discussed how to better bridge the tradition of medicine and modern quality requirements.<sup>473</sup>

On 14 July 2022, the workshop on the semiconductor lighting standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The meeting was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from national standardization bodies, BRICS Solid-State Lighting Working Group as well as experts and scholars in the area of semiconductor lighting. During the meeting, experts shared the ideas on the integration of semiconductor lighting and standardization. Consensus was reached on the suggestions for four international standards on semiconductor lighting and the establishment of the semiconductor lighting standardization working group of the BRICS countries.<sup>474</sup>

On 3 August 2022, the 2nd Brazil-China Dialogue on Sustainable Agriculture was held. The Brazil-China Business Council and the Chinese think tank Institute of Finance and Sustainability organized the event. The event brought together representatives of governments, financial institutions and environmental entities from both countries and Europe, as well as an executive from the New Development Bank. During the discussion it was mentioned that Brazil and China should adopt common criteria for classifying low-carbon agricultural projects that can receive financing linked to combating the effects of climate change.<sup>475</sup>

---

<sup>471</sup> Workshop on Emission Peak and Carbon Neutrality Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023.

[http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350152.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350152.htm).

<sup>472</sup> E-commerce Standardization Enhanced in BRICS Countries, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350150.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350150.htm).

<sup>473</sup> Workshop on Traditional Medicine Standardization Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350151.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350151.htm).

<sup>474</sup> Semiconductor Lighting Standardization Highlighted, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202209/t20220913\\_350214.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202209/t20220913_350214.htm).

<sup>475</sup> Brazil and China should develop common standards to finance sustainable agriculture, Brazil-China Business Council (Rio de Janeiro) 29 July 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.cebc.org.br/2022/07/29/proximo-evento-03-08-2022-as-8h-2o-dialogo-brasil-china-sobre-agricultura-sustentavel/>.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>476</sup>

Brazil has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

### **Russia: +1**

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

On 28 June 2022, the workshop on emission peak and carbon neutrality standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 20 participants, including experts and representatives from the national standardization bodies. During the meeting, experts shared their work experience concerning emission peak and carbon neutrality related standards. They also held discussions on further cooperation within the framework of the International Organization for Standardization and reached a consensus on promoting communication on standards related to carbon peak and neutrality in BRICS countries.<sup>477</sup>

On 5 July 2022, the workshop on e-commerce standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of e-commerce. During the meeting, experts shared the progress of e-commerce standardization in each country and discussed standards research and cooperation. A consensus was reached on further promoting communication and cooperation on standards related to e-commerce among the BRICS countries.<sup>478</sup>

On 7 July 2022, the workshop on traditional medicine standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 30 participants, including experts from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of traditional medicine. Experts and representatives from the BRICS countries made exchanges on the status quo and development experience of traditional medicine standardization in each country and discussed how to better bridge the tradition of medicine and modern quality requirements.<sup>479</sup>

On 14 July 2022, the workshop on the semiconductor lighting standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The meeting was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from national standardization bodies, BRICS Solid-State Lighting Working Group as well as experts and scholars in the area of semiconductor lighting. During the meeting, experts shared the ideas on the integration of semiconductor lighting and standardization. Consensus was reached on the suggestions

---

<sup>476</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>477</sup> Workshop on Emission Peak and Carbon Neutrality Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350152.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350152.htm).

<sup>478</sup> E-commerce Standardization Enhanced in BRICS Countries, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350150.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350150.htm).

<sup>479</sup> Workshop on Traditional Medicine Standardization Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350151.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350151.htm).

for four international standards on semiconductor lighting and the establishment of the semiconductor lighting standardization working group of the BRICS countries.<sup>480</sup>

On 19 October 2022, the Russia-China Task Force on Civil Aircraft held its 12th meeting. The Federal Agency on Technical Regulating and Metrology of Russia and the Standardization Administration for Market Regulation of China released a new national standard of the two countries, the Requirements for cabin acoustic design of transport aircraft. The standard will be included in the list of mutually recognized standards on civil aircraft in China and Russia and available for use in the projects on civil aircraft in the two countries.<sup>481</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>482</sup>

Russia has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

#### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with the commitment to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

On 28 June 2022, the workshop on emission peak and carbon neutrality standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 20 participants, including experts and representatives from the national standardization bodies. During the meeting, experts shared their work experience concerning emission peak and carbon neutrality related standards. They also held discussions on further cooperation within the framework of the International Organization for Standardization and reached a consensus on promoting communication on standards related to carbon peak and neutrality in BRICS countries.<sup>483</sup>

On 5 July 2022, the workshop on e-commerce standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of e-commerce. During the meeting, experts shared the progress of e-commerce standardization in each country and discussed standards research and cooperation. A consensus was reached on further promoting communication and cooperation on standards related to e-commerce among the BRICS countries.<sup>484</sup>

On 7 July 2022, the workshop on traditional medicine standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 30 participants, including experts from the national

---

<sup>480</sup> Semiconductor Lighting Standardization Highlighted, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022.

Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202209/t20220913\\_350214.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202209/t20220913_350214.htm).

<sup>481</sup> China and Russia Jointly Release a National Standard on Aircraft, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 28 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228\\_350355.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228_350355.htm).

<sup>482</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>483</sup> Workshop on Emission Peak and Carbon Neutrality Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350152.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350152.htm).

<sup>484</sup> E-commerce Standardization Enhanced in BRICS Countries, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350150.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350150.htm).

standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of traditional medicine. Experts and representatives from the BRICS countries made exchanges on the status quo and development experience of traditional medicine standardization in each country and discussed how to better bridge the tradition of medicine and modern quality requirements.<sup>485</sup>

On 14 July 2022, the workshop on the semiconductor lighting standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The meeting was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from national standardization bodies, BRICS Solid-State Lighting Working Group as well as experts and scholars in the area of semiconductor lighting. During the meeting, experts shared the ideas on the integration of semiconductor lighting and standardization. Consensus was reached on the suggestions for four international standards on semiconductor lighting and the establishment of the semiconductor lighting standardization working group of the BRICS countries.<sup>486</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>487</sup>

India has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

#### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with the commitment to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

On 28 June 2022, the workshop on emission peak and carbon neutrality standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 20 participants, including experts and representatives from the national standardization bodies. During the meeting, experts shared their work experience concerning emission peak and carbon neutrality related standards. They also held discussions on further cooperation within the framework of the International Organization for Standardization and reached a consensus on promoting communication on standards related to carbon peak and neutrality in BRICS countries.<sup>488</sup>

On 5 July 2022, the workshop on e-commerce standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of e-commerce. During the meeting, experts shared the progress of e-commerce standardization in each country and discussed standards

---

<sup>485</sup> Workshop on Traditional Medicine Standardization Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350151.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350151.htm).

<sup>486</sup> Semiconductor Lighting Standardization Highlighted, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202209/t20220913\\_350214.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202209/t20220913_350214.htm).

<sup>487</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>488</sup> Workshop on Emission Peak and Carbon Neutrality Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350152.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350152.htm).



research and cooperation. A consensus was reached on further promoting communication and cooperation on standards related to e-commerce among the BRICS countries.<sup>489</sup>

On 7 July 2022, the workshop on traditional medicine standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 30 participants, including experts from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of traditional medicine. Experts and representatives from the BRICS countries made exchanges on the status quo and development experience of traditional medicine standardization in each country and discussed how to better bridge the tradition of medicine and modern quality requirements.<sup>490</sup>

On 14 July 2022, the workshop on the semiconductor lighting standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The meeting was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from national standardization bodies, BRICS Solid-State Lighting Working Group as well as experts and scholars in the area of semiconductor lighting. During the meeting, experts shared the ideas on the integration of semiconductor lighting and standardization. Consensus was reached on the suggestions for four international standards on semiconductor lighting and the establishment of the semiconductor lighting standardization working group of the BRICS countries.<sup>491</sup>

On 3 August 2022, the 2nd China-Brazil Dialogue on Sustainable Agriculture was held. The China-Brazil Business Council and the Chinese think tank Institute of Finance and Sustainability organized the event. The event brought together representatives of governments, financial institutions and environmental entities from both countries and Europe, as well as an executive from the New Development Bank. During the discussion it was mentioned that Brazil and China should adopt common criteria for classifying low-carbon agricultural projects that can receive financing linked to combating the effects of climate change.<sup>492</sup>

On 19 October 2022, the China-Russia Task Force on Civil Aircraft held its 12<sup>th</sup> meeting. The Standardization Administration for Market Regulation of China and the Federal Agency on Technical Regulating and Metrology of Russia released a new national standard of the two countries, the Requirements for cabin acoustic design of transport aircraft. The standard will be included in the list of mutually recognized standards on civil aircraft in China and Russia and available for use in the projects on civil aircraft in the two countries.<sup>493</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>494</sup>

---

<sup>489</sup> E-commerce Standardization Enhanced in BRICS Countries, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350150.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350150.htm).

<sup>490</sup> Workshop on Traditional Medicine Standardization Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350151.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350151.htm).

<sup>491</sup> Semiconductor Lighting Standardization Highlighted, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202209/t20220913\\_350214.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202209/t20220913_350214.htm).

<sup>492</sup> Brazil and China should develop common standards to finance sustainable agriculture, Brazil-China Business Council (Rio de Janeiro) 29 July 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.cebc.org.br/2022/07/29/proximo-evento-03-08-2022-as-8h-2o-dialogo-brasil-china-sobre-agricultura-sustentavel/>.

<sup>493</sup> China and Russia Jointly Release a National Standard on Aircraft, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 28 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228\\_350355.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228_350355.htm).

<sup>494</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

China has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

### **South Africa: +1**

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to enhance exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

On 28 June 2022, the workshop on emission peak and carbon neutrality standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 20 participants, including experts and representatives from the national standardization bodies. During the meeting, experts shared their work experience concerning emission peak and carbon neutrality related standards. They also held discussions on further cooperation within the framework of the ISO and reached a consensus on promoting communication on standards related to carbon peak and neutrality in BRICS countries.<sup>495</sup>

On 5 July 2022, the workshop on e-commerce standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of e-commerce. During the meeting, experts shared the progress of e-commerce standardization in each country and discussed standards research and cooperation. A consensus was reached on further promoting communication and cooperation on standards related to e-commerce among the BRICS countries.<sup>496</sup>

On 7 July 2022, the workshop on traditional medicine standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The workshop was attended by more than 30 participants, including experts from the national standardization bodies and experts and scholars in the area of traditional medicine. Experts and representatives from the BRICS countries made exchanges on the status quo and development experience of traditional medicine standardization in each country and discussed how to better bridge the tradition of medicine and modern quality requirements.<sup>497</sup>

On 14 July 2022, the workshop on the semiconductor lighting standardization of the BRICS countries was held. The meeting was attended by more than 40 participants, including representatives from national standardization bodies, BRICS Solid-State Lighting Working Group as well as experts and scholars in the area of semiconductor lighting. During the meeting, experts shared the ideas on the integration of semiconductor lighting and standardization. Consensus was reached on the suggestions for four international standards on semiconductor lighting and the establishment of the semiconductor lighting standardization working group of the BRICS countries.<sup>498</sup>

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate

---

<sup>495</sup> Workshop on Emission Peak and Carbon Neutrality Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350152.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350152.htm).

<sup>496</sup> E-commerce Standardization Enhanced in BRICS Countries, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350150.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350150.htm).

<sup>497</sup> Workshop on Traditional Medicine Standardization Held, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202208/t20220801\\_350151.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202208/t20220801_350151.htm).

<sup>498</sup> Semiconductor Lighting Standardization Highlighted, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 19 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International\\_Activities/202209/t20220913\\_350214.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/International_Activities/202209/t20220913_350214.htm).

on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>499</sup>

South Africa has taken practical steps to enhance intra-BRICS exchanges and cooperation in the field of standardization.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>499</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023.  
<http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

## 16. Trade: Interconnectivity of Supply Chains

“We encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average		0.00 (50%)	

### Background

Trade, including the promotion of intra-BRICS cooperation, was on the agenda since the first 2009 summit in Russia and has been discussed frequently since then. BRICS members endorsed the fight against trade protectionism, recognized “the important role played by international trade and foreign direct investments in the world economic recovery,” urged all parties to “work together to improve the international trade and investment environment,” and encouraged the international community “to keep the multilateral trading system stable, curb trade protectionism, and push for comprehensive and balanced results of the World Trade Organization’s (WTO) Doha Development Agenda.”<sup>500</sup>

In 2011, the BRICS trade ministers agreed that the BRICS should enhance their intra-group trade, including trade of higher value-added manufactured products, in order to support industrialization and employment in their respective countries. With the joint efforts of all BRICS members, intra-group economic and trade cooperation mechanisms have improved, and pragmatic cooperation has deepened.<sup>501</sup>

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS members emphasized that they operate on the basis of an inclusive multilateral trading system. The members aimed to expand trade and they suggested that economic expansion can be achieved by enhancing trade and investment relations. They acknowledged the importance of the first BRICS Trade Fair in New Delhi, as an important step in strengthening trade among BRICS countries. Members also acknowledged the success of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora, held in Johannesburg, South Africa, which was important in facilitating the regulation of international trade in endangered species. The BRICS members emphasized their support for the multilateral trading system and the WTO, as being an inclusive trading system. They encourage members to abide by the multilateral trading system under the WTO and in compatibility with the rules of the WTO. Also, members stressed the importance of bilateral and regional trade agreements as enhancing the multilateral trading system. In addition, they pledged to work with G20 members to strengthen trade and improve global governance.<sup>502</sup>

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS members emphasized the importance of committing to trade and pledged to enhance trade by expanding trade and investment. Members also pledged to cooperate, to assist the integration of financial markets in order to create financial integration. They acknowledged

<sup>500</sup> Joint Communique of the BRIC Countries Leaders, RANEPa (Moscow) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency1/First%20Summit.pdf>

<sup>501</sup> Ministerial Declaration of the BRICS Trade Ministers, RANEPa (Moscow) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/chpresidency1/trade%202011%201.pdf>

<sup>502</sup> BRICS Goa declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 16 October 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

the success of the Customs Administration in helping to facilitate trade and encouraged the BRICS Interbank Cooperation Mechanism to continue supporting trade cooperation. In addition, members agreed to enhance cooperation of agricultural trade and pledged to strengthen cooperation with Africa to address the issue of illegal wildlife trade. BRICS members emphasized the importance of the World Trade Organization. They want members to continue to follow the framework of the WTO and the obligations that it outlines to foster more cooperation and to strengthen the WTO. Overall, BRICS members emphasized an “inclusive multilateral trading system as embodied in the WTO.”<sup>503</sup>

In 2022, the BRICS leaders once again stressed the importance of developing the trade and investment ties between the five nations and committed to “enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.”

### **Commitment Features**

The commitment requires the BRICS countries to promote mutual trade and investment within the group. The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, adopted in November 2020, stipulates 18 actions, pertaining specifically to enhancing the interconnectivity of supply chains, promoting trade and investment flows between the BRICS countries:

1. enhance trade and economic cooperation, including with respect to reducing barriers in mutual trade in goods and services;
2. continue to explore opportunities for intra-BRICS trade and economic cooperation in the areas where BRICS members have already reached joint arrangements and results;
3. work towards reduction of barriers in mutual trade in goods and services;
4. diversify trade cooperation of the BRICS members to develop new models of production, re-orient markets and increase trade turnover within BRICS;
5. promote cooperation on technical regulation, standards, metrology, conformity assessment and accreditation;
6. exchange experience and good practices on various approaches to regulation of e-commerce;
7. develop and strengthen customs cooperation including on the authorized economic operators, unveil the potential and explore functional compatibility of national “single window” mechanisms and strive to combat underinvoicing;
8. encourage direct contacts between enterprises, associations and other business entities of BRICS with the use of the BRICS Business Council instruments;
9. enhance cooperation in competition law enforcement and policies to foster a fair market environment for efficient and sustainable trade development;
10. strengthen investment cooperation with the aim to increase the share of value added goods and services in intra-BRICS trade;
11. improve transparency for the development of mutual trade and foreign direct investment cooperation between the BRICS members in order to diversify production and exports;
12. enhance investment links between the BRICS countries to support and strengthen industrial development complementarities, sustainable development and inclusive growth;

---

<sup>503</sup> BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

13. stimulate interaction and cooperation between BRICS national investment agencies, to promote, attract and facilitate investment;
14. promote favorable financial instruments as well as instruments for public-private partnership in order to attract investment in development projects of the BRICS countries;
15. raise awareness about existing intra-BRICS investment opportunities;
16. enhance knowledge sharing among the BRICS members on improving business environment, including through the development of instruments aimed at facilitation of investments on a voluntary basis in order to improve their positions in international ease of doing business rankings;
17. encourage cooperation of BRICS on technical assistance and capacity building provided to developing countries and especially least-developed countries among them on investment promotion and facilitation;
18. attract investment in infrastructure development projects leveraging the various instruments of the New Development Bank.<sup>504</sup>

Full compliance with the commitment requires the BRICS countries to take actions on at least 12 of the 18 points stated above. Partial compliance is awarded for at least one point covered by the country's actions during the monitoring period. No actions taken implies a failure to comply with the commitment.

#### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS country does not take actions on any of the 18 Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities, relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.
0	The BRICS country takes actions on up to 11 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities, relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.
+1	The BRICS country takes actions on 12 or more of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities, relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

#### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment to encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.

On 13 July 2022, the 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel was officially launched. The 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel contains a series of training lessons jointly hosted by the Foreign Affairs Office of Fujian Provincial People's Government, Secretariat of Science, Technology And Innovation of Mato Grosso State/Brazil, Foreign Affairs Office of Xiamen Municipal People's Government and BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center in response to the request of the Brazilian party.<sup>505</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 2, 4, 5, 6, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

<sup>504</sup> Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, RANEP (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsedatelstva/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/STRATEGY%20FOR%20BRICS%20ECONOMIC%20PARTNERSHIP%202025.pdf>

<sup>505</sup> 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel Successfully Started, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <http://www.bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=381>.

On 3 August 2022, the 2nd Brazil-China Dialogue on Sustainable Agriculture was held. Brazil-China Business Council and the Chinese think tank Institute of Finance and Sustainability organized the event. The event brought together representatives of governments, financial institutions and environmental entities from both countries and Europe, as well as an executive from the New Development Bank. During the discussion it was mentioned that Brazil and China should adopt common criteria for classifying low-carbon agricultural projects that can receive financing linked to combating the effects of climate change.<sup>506</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, and 5 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 October 2022, the 8th Brazil-India Joint Commission Meeting was held in Brasilia. The discussions covered trade and investments, petroleum, biofuels, edible oils and minerals, health, pharma, traditional medicine, science and technology, agriculture and livestock, space, defense, counter-terrorism, and consular domains. After the meeting, agreements were signed in the fields of broadcasting and taxation.<sup>507</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, and 3 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 15 November 2022, a Meeting of the BRICS Coordination Committee on Antimonopoly Policy was held in video format under the Chinese chairmanship. The meeting was attended by Victor Fernandes, Commissioner of the Administrative Council for Economic Defense of Brazil. Mr. Fernandes highlighted the amendments to Brazil's Competition Act approved this year concerning private lawsuits for anticompetitive actions: they are expected to increase the intensity of private competition lawsuits. It was also announced that Brazil is working on a new BRICS Report on Digital Competition, which will be published soon.<sup>508</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, 6, and 9 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>509</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

Brazil has taken actions in 9 areas of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities, relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

### **Russia: 0**

Russia has partially complied with the commitment to encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.

---

<sup>506</sup> Brazil and China should develop common standards to finance sustainable agriculture, Brazil-China Business Council (Rio de Janeiro) 29 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst.

<https://www.cebc.org.br/2022/07/29/proximo-evento-03-08-2022-as-8h-20-dialogo-brasil-china-sobre-agricultura-sustentavel/>.

<sup>507</sup> Dr. S. Jaishankar co-chaired 8th India-Brazil Joint Commission Meeting with his Brazilian counterpart, All India Radio (New Delhi) 25 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://newsonair.gov.in/News?title=Dr.-S.-Jaishankar-co-chaired-8th-India-Brazil-Joint-Commission-Meeting-with-his-Brazilian-counterpart&id=446568>.

<sup>508</sup> Meeting Of The BRICS Coordination Committee On Antimonopoly Policy, BRICS Competition (Moscow) 14 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <https://bricscompetition.org/news/meeting-of-the-brics-coordination-committee-on-antimonopoly-policy>.

<sup>509</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

On 13 July 2022, the 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel was officially launched with participation of representatives of all five BRICS countries. The 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel contains a series of training lessons jointly hosted by the Foreign Affairs Office of Fujian Provincial People's Government, Secretariat of Science, Foreign Affairs Office of Xiamen Municipal People's Government and BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center.<sup>510</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 2, 4, 5, 6, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 15 September 2022, Chinese President Xi Jinping held a bilateral meeting with President Vladimir Putin in Samarkand to exchange views on China-Russia relations and international and regional issues of shared interest. President Xi noted that since the beginning of 2022, China and Russia had maintained effective strategic communication, and emphasized that China would work with Russia to extend strong mutual support on issues concerning each other's core interests, and deepen practical cooperation in trade, agriculture, connectivity and other areas.<sup>511</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, and 3 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 19 October 2022, the Russia-China Task Force on Civil Aircraft held its 12th meeting. The Federal Agency on Technical Regulating and Metrology of Russia and the Standardization Administration for Market Regulation of China and released a new national standard of the two countries, the Requirements for cabin acoustic design of transport aircraft. The standard will be included in the list of mutually recognized standards on civil aircraft in Russia and China and available for use in the projects on civil aircraft in the two countries.<sup>512</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>513</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 5 December 2022, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin held talks with his Chinese counterpart Li Keqiang via video link. Prime Minister Li called on the two sides to optimize the customs clearance process, jointly maintain a stable and smooth industrial and supply chain, and deepen cultural, people-to-people and local exchanges.<sup>514</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 3, 5, and 15 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 16 December 2022, President Vladimir Putin held a telephone conversation with Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi. The two leaders discussed in detail the prospects for practical interaction in

---

<sup>510</sup> 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel Successfully Started, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 13 July 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://www.bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=381>.

<sup>511</sup> President Xi Jinping Meets with Russian President Vladimir Putin, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 15 September 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202209/t20220915\\_10766678.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202209/t20220915_10766678.html).

<sup>512</sup> China and Russia Jointly Release a National Standard on Aircraft, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 28 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228\\_350355.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228_350355.htm).

<sup>513</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>514</sup> Chinese premier meets Russian counterpart on cooperation, State Council of China (Beijing) 7 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://english.www.gov.cn/premier/news/202212/07/content\\_WS63903fa7c6d0a757729e4078.html](https://english.www.gov.cn/premier/news/202212/07/content_WS63903fa7c6d0a757729e4078.html).



areas such as mutual investment, energy, agriculture, transport and logistic, trade and investment.<sup>515</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 13 and 14 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

Russia has taken action on at least 11 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **India: 0**

India has partially complied with the commitment to encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.

On 27 June 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with the President of South Africa Cyril Ramaphosa on the sidelines of the G7 Summit in Schloss Elmau, Germany. The leaders reviewed the progress made in bilateral relations between the two countries, particularly following the signing of the Strategic Programme of Cooperation in 2019. They reiterated the need for further deepening bilateral cooperation in areas like trade and investment, food security, defense, pharmaceuticals, digital financial inclusion, skill development, and insurance. Discussions were also held on continued coordination in multilateral bodies, including the BRICS.<sup>516</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, and 3 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 13 July 2022, the 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel was officially launched with participation of representatives of all five BRICS countries. The 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel contains a series of training lessons jointly hosted by the Foreign Affairs Office of Fujian Provincial People's Government, Secretariat of Science, Foreign Affairs Office of Xiamen Municipal People's Government and BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center.<sup>517</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 2, 4, 5, 6, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 October 2022, External Affairs Minister S. Jaishankar co-chaired the 8th India-Brazil Joint Commission Meeting with his Brazilian counterpart Carlos França in Brasilia. The discussions covered trade and investments, petroleum, biofuels, edible oils and minerals, health, pharma, traditional medicine, science and technology, agriculture and livestock, space, defense, counter-terrorism, and consular domains. After the meeting, agreements were signed in the fields of broadcasting and taxation.<sup>518</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate

---

<sup>515</sup> PM Modi and Russian President Vladimir Putin discuss cooperation in several areas including, energy and trade, All India Radio (New Delhi) 16 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://newsonair.gov.in/News?title=PM-Modi-holds-telephonic-conversation-with-Russian-President-Putin&id=452463>.

<sup>516</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1837378>.

<sup>517</sup> 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel Successfully Started, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <http://www.bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=381>.

<sup>518</sup> Dr. S. Jaishankar co-chaired 8th India-Brazil Joint Commission Meeting with his Brazilian counterpart, All India Radio (New Delhi) 25 October 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://newsonair.gov.in/News?title=Dr.-S.-Jaishankar-co-chaired-8th-India-Brazil-Joint-Commission-Meeting-with-his-Brazilian-counterpart&id=446568>.

on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>519</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 16 December 2022, Prime Minister Modi held a telephone conversation with the President of Russia Vladimir Putin. The two leaders discussed in detail the prospects for practical interaction in areas such as mutual investment, energy, agriculture, transport and logistic, trade and investment.<sup>520</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 13 and 14 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

India has taken action on at least 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

### **China: 0**

China has partially complied with the commitment to encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.

On 13 July 2022, the 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel was officially launched with participation of representatives of all five BRICS countries. The 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel contains a series of training lessons jointly hosted by the Foreign Affairs Office of Fujian Provincial People's Government, Secretariat of Science, Foreign Affairs Office of Xiamen Municipal People's Government and BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center.<sup>521</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 2, 4, 5, 6, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 3 August 2022, the 2nd Brazil-China Dialogue on Sustainable Agriculture was held. Brazil-China Business Council and the Chinese think tank Institute of Finance and Sustainability organized the event. The event brought together representatives of governments, financial institutions and environmental entities from both countries and Europe, as well as an executive from the New Development Bank. During the discussion it was mentioned that Brazil and China should adopt common criteria for classifying low-carbon agricultural projects that can receive financing linked to combating the effects of climate change.<sup>522</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, and 5 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 15 September 2022, President Xi Jinping held a bilateral meeting with Russian President Vladimir Putin in Samarkand to exchange views on China-Russia relations and international and regional issues of shared interest. President Xi noted that since the beginning of 2022, China and Russia had maintained effective strategic communication, and emphasized that China would work with Russia to extend strong mutual support on issues concerning each other's core interests, and deepen practical

---

<sup>519</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>520</sup> PM Modi and Russian President Vladimir Putin discuss cooperation in several areas including, energy and trade, All India Radio (New Delhi) 16 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://newsonair.gov.in/News?title=PM-Modi-holds-telephonic-conversation-with-Russian-President-Putin&id=452463>.

<sup>521</sup> 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel Successfully Started, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 13 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <http://www.bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=381>.

<sup>522</sup> Brazil and China should develop common standards to finance sustainable agriculture, Brazil-China Business Council (Rio de Janeiro) 29 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.cebc.org.br/2022/07/29/proximo-evento-03-08-2022-as-8h-2o-dialogo-brasil-china-sobre-agricultura-sustentavel/>.

cooperation in trade, agriculture, connectivity and other areas.<sup>523</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, and 3 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 19 October 2022, the China-Russia Task Force on Civil Aircraft held its 12th meeting. The Standardization Administration for Market Regulation of China and the Federal Agency on Technical Regulating and Metrology of Russia released a new national standard of the two countries, the Requirements for cabin acoustic design of transport aircraft. The standard will be included in the list of mutually recognized standards on civil aircraft in China and Russia and available for use in the projects on civil aircraft in the two countries.<sup>524</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 15 November 2022, President Xi met with South African President Cyril Ramaphosa in Bali. President Xi noted that China is ready to strengthen the synergy between the Belt and Road Initiative and the South African Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, cooperate more closely on trade, investment and energy, advance the implementation of outcomes of the Forum on China–Africa Cooperation in South Africa, support Chinese companies in investing and doing business there, and expand China’s import of quality products from South Africa.<sup>525</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, 4, 10, 13, 14 and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>526</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 5 December 2022, Prime Minister Li Keqiang held talks with his Russian counterpart Mikhail Mishustin via video link. Prime Minister Li called on the two sides to optimize the customs clearance process, jointly maintain a stable and smooth industrial and supply chain, and deepen cultural, people-to-people and local exchanges.<sup>527</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 3, 5, and 15 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

China has taken action on at least 11 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

---

<sup>523</sup> President Xi Jinping Meets with Russian President Vladimir Putin, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 15 September 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\\_eng/zxxx\\_662805/202209/t20220915\\_10766678.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202209/t20220915_10766678.html).

<sup>524</sup> China and Russia Jointly Release a National Standard on Aircraft, Standardization Administration of China (Beijing) 28 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228\\_350355.htm](http://www.sac.gov.cn/sacen/events/202212/t20221228_350355.htm).

<sup>525</sup> President Xi Jinping Meets with South African President Cyril Ramaphosa, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 15 November 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx\\_662805/202211/t20221115\\_10975688.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx_662805/202211/t20221115_10975688.html).

<sup>526</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

<sup>527</sup> Chinese premier meets Russian counterpart on cooperation, State Council of China (Beijing) 7 December 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://english.www.gov.cn/premier/news/202212/07/content\\_WS63903fa7c6d0a757729e4078.html](https://english.www.gov.cn/premier/news/202212/07/content_WS63903fa7c6d0a757729e4078.html).

### South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment to encourage cooperation among BRICS countries to enhance the interconnectivity of supply chains and promote trade and investment flows.

On 27 June 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa met with Prime Minister of India Narendra Modi on the sidelines of the G7 Summit in Schloss Elmau, Germany. The leaders reviewed the progress made in bilateral relations between the two countries, particularly following the signing of the Strategic Programme of Cooperation in 2019. They reiterated the need for further deepening bilateral cooperation in areas like trade and investment, food security, defense, pharmaceuticals, digital financial inclusion, skill development, and insurance. Discussions were also held on continued coordination in multilateral bodies, including the BRICS.<sup>528</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, and 3 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 13 July 2022, the 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel was officially launched with participation of representatives of all five BRICS countries. The 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel contains a series of training lessons jointly hosted by the Foreign Affairs Office of Fujian Provincial People's Government, Secretariat of Science, Foreign Affairs Office of Xiamen Municipal People's Government and BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center.<sup>529</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 2, 4, 5, 6, and 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 15 November 2022, President Ramaphosa met with China's President Xi Jinping in Bali. President Xi noted that China is ready to strengthen the synergy between the Belt and Road Initiative and the South African Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, cooperate more closely on trade, investment and energy, advance the implementation of FOCAC outcomes in South Africa, support Chinese companies in investing and doing business there, and expand China's import of quality products from South Africa.<sup>530</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 1, 2, 3, 4, 10, 13, 14 and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

On 24 November 2022, the Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies was held. BRICS countries agreed that, against the backdrop of unprecedented challenges, as important representatives of emerging market and developing countries, the BRICS should continue to cooperate on standardization, maintain the smooth flow of global supply chains, and boost green and low-carbon development, delivering global recovery.<sup>531</sup> This action corresponds to priorities 5, and 17 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.

South Africa has taken action on at least 10 of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 priorities relating to intra-BRICS trade and investment promotion.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

---

<sup>528</sup> Meeting of Prime Minister with President of South Africa on the sidelines of G-7 Summit, Press Information Bureau of the Government of India (New Delhi) 27 June 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1837378>.

<sup>529</sup> 2022 BRICS Online Training for Global Cross-border E-commerce Personnel Successfully Started, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 13 July 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://www.bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=381>.

<sup>530</sup> President Xi Jinping Meets with South African President Cyril Ramaphosa, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of China (Beijing) 15 November 2022. Access Date: 23 January 2023. [https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx\\_662805/202211/t20221115\\_10975688.html](https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx_662805/202211/t20221115_10975688.html).

<sup>531</sup> 2022 Meeting of Heads of BRICS National Standardization Bodies kicked off, BRICS PartNIR Innovation Center (Xiamen) 24 November 2022. Access date: 25 January 2023. <http://bricspic.org/En/Pages/Home/NewsDetail.aspx?rowId=469>.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

## 17. Labour and Employment: Development and Recovery

“We reiterate the commitments to promote employment for sustainable development, including to develop skills to ensure resilient recovery.”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

### Background

Labour and employment issues have always attracted attention of BRICS leaders. At the 2016 Goa Summit, the declaration stressed that “quality employment, including a Decent Work Agenda, sustaining social protection and enhancing rights at work, are core to inclusive and sustainable development”<sup>532</sup> and took note “of the possibility of bilateral Social Security Agreements between BRICS countries, and of the commitment to take steps to establish a network of lead labour research and training institutes, so as to encourage capacity building, information exchange and sharing of best practices amongst BRICS countries.”

In 2017 in Xiamen leaders recognized the importance of transformation that is taking place in the labor market and the opportunities and challenges it brings, welcomed the achievement of a BRICS common position on governance in the future of work and agreed to further strengthen exchanges and cooperation in ensuring full employment, promoting decent work, advancing poverty alleviation and reduction through skills development and achieving universal and sustainable social security systems.<sup>533</sup>

In 2018 in Johannesburg BRICS leaders again committed to the continued implementation of the Agenda for BRICS cooperation on population matters 2015-2020, which includes employment and the future of work.

In 2021 New Delhi Declaration they welcomed the BRICS Labour and Employment Ministers' commitment to a human-centered recovery with inclusive labour markets and social protection system. We look forward to the outcome of the research of E-formality practices in BRICS countries by the BRICS Network of Labour Research Institutes.<sup>534</sup>

In 2022 Beijing Declaration the leaders reiterated the commitments to promote employment for sustainable development, including to develop skills to ensure resilient recovery, gender-responsive employment and social protection policies including workers' rights.<sup>535</sup>

<sup>532</sup> Goa Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>533</sup> Xiamen Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

<sup>534</sup> New Delhi Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/briks/predsdatelstva/briks-indiyskoe-predsdatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

<sup>535</sup> Beijing Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 23 June 2022. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2022/XIV-BRICS-Summit-Beijing-Declaration-ENG.pdf>

### **Commitment Features**

The commitment requires taking actions to promote employment for sustainable development, including to develop skills to ensure resilient recovery. It has two major components: promoting employment in general and specifically target skills.

#### **Part One: Employment Promotion**

Sustainable Development Goal 8 (SGD 8) is dedicated to providing decent work and economic growth. It has 12 targets, which describe areas for action in the field of labour and employment for sustainable development.

- 8.1 Sustain per capita economic growth in accordance with national circumstances
- 8.2 Achieve higher levels of economic productivity through diversification, technological upgrading and innovation, including through a focus on high-value added and labour-intensive sectors
- 8.3 Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services
- 8.4 Improve global resource efficiency in consumption and production and endeavour to decouple economic growth from environmental degradation
- 8.5 Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value
- 8.6 Reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training
- 8.7 Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour
- 8.8 Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment
- 8.9 Devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products
- 8.10 Strengthen the capacity of domestic financial institutions to encourage and expand access to banking, insurance and financial services for all
- 8.a Increase Aid for Trade support for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, including through the Enhanced Integrated Framework for Trade-Related Technical Assistance to Least Developed Countries
- 8.b Develop and operationalize a global strategy for youth employment and implement the Global Jobs Pact of the International Labour Organization

Taking actions in these areas will count toward compliance with the commitment. Actions can include but are not limited to: allocating financial resources, adopting legislative acts, developing programmes, cooperation with private sector.

#### **Part Two: Taking Actions to Promote Skills Development**

The second part of the commitment requires taking actions specifically aimed at skills development to bridge the gap between the demand in supply on the labour market.

BRICS member can take actions in the following areas (the list is not exhaustive):

- Strengthen access to quality education, including schools
- Actively promote quality work-based learning
- Encourage investment in skills through shared public-private financing, especially for low-skilled workers
- Improve training opportunities for informal workers
- Activate skills by improving work incentives and job-search help, and by removing employment barriers
- Systematically anticipate, assess and respond to changing skill needs.

To achieve full compliance BRICS member should take actions to promote employment in general and specifically target skills development.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member has failed to take actions to promote employment for sustainable development.
0	The BRICS member has taken actions to promote employment for sustainable development but failed to address the issue of skills development for a resilient recovery.
+1	The BRICS member has taken actions to promote employment for sustainable development AND addressed the issue of skills development for a resilient recovery.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Irina Popova*

### Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to promote employment for sustainable development, including skills development.

On 7 July 2022, the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation launched the Digital Literacy project started in the city of Londrina. The project provides training for students and teachers to work with the technologies required by industry 4.0.<sup>536</sup>

On 14 October 2022, the government announced the launch of digital skills open for enrollment at Escola do Trabalhador 4.0 (Schools for Workers 4.0). “Escola do Trabalhador 4.0” platform offers enrollment for 5.5 million people and is organized into 134 free online courses in the areas of information technology, productivity and finance. The initiative was developed by the Ministry of Labor and Social Security (MTP) in partnership with the Ministry of Women, Family and Human Rights.<sup>537</sup>

On 17 November 2022, MTP and the French Development Agency (AFD) signed an agreement to strengthen public employment services in Brazil. AFD is responsible for financing the project in the amount of EUR1.2 million, which will be allocated according to the needs of the MTP, over a period of 30 months. In addition to the allowance, AFD will share with the ministry the experience of the

<sup>536</sup> MCTI starts Digital Literacy project in Londrina (PR), Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 7 July 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/mcti/pt-br/acompanhe-o-mcti/noticias/2022/07/mcti-inicia-projeto-letramento-digital-em-londrina-pr>.

<sup>537</sup> Courses focusing on digital skills are open for enrollment at Escola do Trabalhador 4.0, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 14 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/mdh/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/eleicoes-2022-periodo-eleitoral/cursos-com-foco-em-habilidades-digitais-estao-com-inscricoes-abertas-na-escola-do-trabalhador-4.0>.



French intermediation agency, Pôle Emploi, which is an international reference in public employment services.<sup>538</sup>

On 16 December 2022, Minister of Labor and Social Security José Carlos Oliveira signed Regulatory Norm 38, which provides for health and safety in Urban Cleaning Activities and Solid Waste Management. The regulation benefits more than 5 million sector workers across the country, exposed to various factors and difficulties in carrying out urban cleaning activities and solid waste management.<sup>539</sup>

On 18 January 2023, Minister of Labor and Employment Luiz Marinho and President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva met with the representatives of local trade unions to announce the creation of a working group to define, within 90 days, the new minimum wage valuation policy. It was also announced that within a period of up to 30 days, working groups will be created to discuss the regulation of work through applications and to create new rules for collective bargaining between workers and companies.<sup>540</sup>

Brazil has taken actions to promote employment for sustainable development and specifically targeted skills development.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Irina Popova*

#### **Russia: +1**

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to promote employment for sustainable development, including skills development.

On 18 July 2023, the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection presented a program aimed at the promotion of labour mobility among the country's younger generation. Every citizen under 35 would be allowed to apply for a subsidy of RUB116,800 to cover relocation associated expenses including housing renting in some of the country's selected regions.<sup>541</sup>

On 1 January 2023, the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection prolonged a set of employment-supporting measures, adopted in 2022, until the end of 2023. These measures include the subsidization of recruitment and promotion of in-demand skills among the unemployed population. The

---

<sup>538</sup> Ministry of Labor and Social Security and the French Development Agency sign an agreement to strengthen public employment services in Brazil, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/trabalho-e-previdencia/pt-br/noticias-e-conteudo/trabalho/2022/novembro/ministerio-do-trabalho-e-previdencia-e-agencia-francesa-de-desenvolvimento-assinam-acordo-para-fortalecer-os-servicos-publicos-de-emprego-no-brasil>.

<sup>539</sup> Ministry of Labor and Social Security signs NR on safety and health in Urban Cleaning and Solid Waste Management Activities, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 16 December 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/trabalho-e-previdencia/pt-br/noticias-e-conteudo/trabalho/2022/dezembro/ministerio-do-trabalho-e-previdencia-assina-nr-sobre-seguranca-e-saude-nas-atividades-de-limpeza-urbana-e-manejo-de-residuos-solidos>.

<sup>540</sup> Ministry of Labor and Employment announces group to define new minimum wage appreciation policy, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 18 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/trabalho-e-previdencia/pt-br/noticias-e-conteudo/trabalho/ministerio-do-trabalho-e-emprego-anuncia-grupo-para-definir-nova-politica-de-valorizacao-do-salario-minimo>.

<sup>541</sup> Ministry Developed a Program Supporting Labour Mobility among Youngsters, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection (Moscow) 18 July 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://mintrud.gov.ru/employment/115>

government plans to finance temporary jobs for 123,300 job seekers, 13,000 thousand re-education programs and attract 40,000 unemployed to paid public works.<sup>542</sup>

Russia has taken actions to promote employment for sustainable development and specifically targeted skills development.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

### **India: +1**

India has fully complied with the commitment to promote employment for sustainable development, including skills development.

On 18 July 2022, the Ministry of Labour and Employment presented its National Career Service (NCS) project implemented to provide a variety of employment-related services like job search and matching, career counselling, vocational guidance, information on skills development courses, etc. through a digital platform. The NCS project aims to provide seamless access to jobseekers and employers, decent employment opportunities to the aspiring youth of the country, and to facilitate career development assistance.<sup>543</sup>

On 25-26 August 2022, a two-day National Labour Conference of Labour Ministers and Labour Secretaries of States was held by the Government in Tirupati, Andhra Pradesh. One of the major goals of the conference was to discuss possible ways to universalize social protection to workers and to improve employment opportunities for all.<sup>544</sup>

On 22 December 2022, the Aatma Nirbhar Bharat financial package (Self-Reliant India, financial stimulus package aimed to counter the pandemic consequences) was provided specifically to create employment opportunities for migrant workers and workers of unorganized sectors, strengthen the MSME sector, and promote the rural economy (estimated at INR27 trillion).<sup>545</sup>

On 5 January 2023, Dharmendra Pradhan, Minister of Education chaired the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the steering committee of National Skill Development Mission, which was focused on the issues of skills development schemes, skills gap analysis and skills mapping. The meeting reiterated India's commitment to train one million youth per annum through various apprenticeship training programs.<sup>546</sup>

On 13 January 2023, speaking at the Global South Summit, Minister Pradhan noted that in 2023 the G20 Education Working Group under India's G20 Presidency would be discussing the issues related to Foundational Literacy and Numeracy, making tech-enabled learning more inclusive, life-long

---

<sup>542</sup> Employment Promotion Programs to be Prolonged in 2023, Ministry of Labor and Social Protection (Moscow) 1 January 2023. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 23 January 2023. <https://mintrud.gov.ru/employment/135>

<sup>543</sup> Assistance to Job Seekers, India's Ministry of Labour and Employment (New Delhi) 18 July 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://labour.gov.in/sites/default/files/PIB1842609.pdf>

<sup>544</sup> Year End Review 2022: Ministry of Labour and Employment, India's Ministry of Labour and Employment (New Delhi) 29 December 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://labour.gov.in/sites/default/files/PIB1887384.pdf>

<sup>545</sup> Twenty-seven lakh crore Aatmanirbhar financial package allotted to create employment opportunities for unorganised sector and migrant workers, India's Ministry of Labour and Employment (New Delhi) 22 December 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://labour.gov.in/sites/default/files/PIB1885767.pdf>

<sup>546</sup> Skill India: Connecting Indian youth to global opportunities, News on Air (New Delhi) 5 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://newsonair.com/2023/01/05/skill-india-connecting-indian-youth-to-global-opportunities/>

learning in context of future of work, as well as ways to strengthen research and innovation in higher education institutions.<sup>547</sup>

On 16 January 2023, Rajeev Chandrasekhar, Minister of State for Skill Development and Entrepreneurship, Electronics and IT, announced that India will launch a revised version of the Skill India initiative with an aim to train young Indian people with “future ready skills.” Under the new scheme, the government will be focusing on strengthening the digital skills ecosystem and technical skills, such as augmented and virtual reality, machine learning, and the ability to work with data, including automated systems.<sup>548</sup>

On 18 January 2023, the government announced that it will allocate additional budgetary resources for the Production-Linked Initiative (PLI) of the Invest India program. The PLI provides, among others, aims to promote job generation and employment in the domestic manufacturing sector.<sup>549</sup>

On 20 January 2023, Prime Minister Narendra Modi announced that the country would distribute around 71,000 appointment letters to newly inducted recruits in various government departments and organizations. Appointments were made as a result of the Rozgar Mela program to generate employment initiatives in the country implemented by India’s National Skill Development Corporation.<sup>550</sup> It was also mentioned that in order to enhance the self-employment opportunities the government had also established a dedicated Ministry for Skills Development.<sup>551</sup>

India has taken a number of significant steps both on employment and on skills development.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Pavel Doronin*

### **China: +1**

China has fully complied with the commitment to promote employment for sustainable development, including skills development.

On 7 July 2022, the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security issued the Notice on Carrying out Human Resource Service Organizations to Stabilize Employment and Promote Employment Actions, which instructed local authorities to give full play to the advantages of human resource service organizations in matching labour supply and demand, enhancing professional efficiency, and contributing to overall employment stability and economic and social development. The Notice highlighted seven focus areas, including deployment of large-scale job search and recruitment services, promotion of employment of college graduates, stabilization of employment of migrant workers,

---

<sup>547</sup> Text of opening remarks of Union Minister of Education and Minister of Skill Development & Entrepreneurship during Education Ministers’ Session of Voice of Global South Summit, India’s Ministry of Education (New Delhi) 13 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseSelfframePage.aspx?PRID=1891121>

<sup>548</sup> Govt to soon launch revamped Skill India initiative: Minister Rajeev Chandrasekhar, The Indian Express (New Delhi) 16 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://indianexpress.com/article/business/govt-to-soon-launch-revamped-skill-india-initiative-minister-rajeev-chandrasekhar-8380710/>

<sup>549</sup> Budget 2023: PLI Schemes May Get BIG Boost! Increased Allocation & More Sectors Likely, India.com (New Delhi) 18 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://www.india.com/business/budget-2023-pli-schemes-may-get-big-boost-increased-allocation-more-sectors-likely-5858915/>

<sup>550</sup> Rozgar Mela 2023: PM Modi to distribute about 71,000 appointment letters today - details of the employment programme, Times Now (New Delhi) 20 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://www.timesnownews.com/india/rozgar-mela-2023-pm-modi-to-distribute-about-71000-appointment-letters-today-details-of-the-employment-programme-article-97156331>

<sup>551</sup> Govt has launched number of programmes and initiatives to fulfill PM Modi’s comment to give 10 lakh jobs: MoS Ajay Kumar, News on Air (New Delhi) 20 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://newsonair.com/2023/01/20/govt-has-launched-number-of-programmes-and-initiatives-to-fulfill-pm-modis-comment-to-give-10-lakh-jobs-mos-ajay-kumar/>

ensuring employments in key sectors, innovation to promote flexible employment services, development of human resource services agencies, and strengthening the monitoring of labour supply and demand information.<sup>552</sup>

On 12 August 2022, the government ratified two instruments of the International Labour Organization's (ILO) Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29) and the ILO Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105), which reinforced China's commitment to respect, promote and realize the ILO Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work.<sup>553</sup>

On 25 August 2022, Li Zhong, Vice Minister of the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security, noted at a news conference that China will focus on creating jobs and promote fiscal, monetary and industrial policies to stabilize its labour market, which was yet to fully recover from the pandemic consequences.<sup>554</sup>

On 5 September 2022, Liu Guoqiang, deputy governor of the People's Bank of China, said at a news conference that China's Central Bank was capable of keeping the renminbi generally stable and vowed to make good use of policy tools to stabilize growth and employment while keeping a lid on inflation.<sup>555</sup>

On 16 September 2022, the government reported that it had spent CNY2.53 trillion (USD365.05 billion) on social security and employment in the first eight months of 2022, up 6.6 percent compared to 2021.<sup>556</sup>

On 16 October 2022, speaking at 20th National Congress of the Communist Party of China, President Xi Jinping emphasized the significance of a people-centered development strategy, focusing on practical issues of public concern, such as employment, education, and social security, among others.<sup>557</sup> Furthermore, President Xi stressed that the "employment-first strategy" should be one of the major drivers of China's modernization.<sup>558</sup>

---

<sup>552</sup> The Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security issued a notice to deploy human resources service agencies to stabilize employment and promote employment, Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 July 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[https://www.mohrss.gov.cn/SYrlzyhshbzb/dongtaixinwen/buneyiaowen/rsxw/202207/t20220707\\_456699.html](https://www.mohrss.gov.cn/SYrlzyhshbzb/dongtaixinwen/buneyiaowen/rsxw/202207/t20220707_456699.html)

<sup>553</sup> China ratifies the two ILO Fundamental Conventions on forced labour, ILO (Geneva) 12 August 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. [https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS\\_853575/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_853575/lang--en/index.htm)

<sup>554</sup> China to promote fiscal, monetary policies to support job stabilisation, Reuters (Beijing) 25 August 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://www.reuters.com/markets/asia/china-promote-fiscal-monetary-policies-support-job-stabilisation-2022-08-25/>

<sup>555</sup> Govt unveils measures to bolster economic recovery, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 6 September 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202209/06/content\\_WS631689cdc6d0a757729dfa4c.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202209/06/content_WS631689cdc6d0a757729dfa4c.html)

<sup>556</sup> China spends more on social security, employment in first 8 months, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 16 September 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202209/16/content\\_WS63246ecbc6d0a757729e01af.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202209/16/content_WS63246ecbc6d0a757729e01af.html)

<sup>557</sup> Milestone CPC congress spells out China's unwavering development goals, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202210/17/content\\_WS634d3ec6c6d0a757729e159a.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202210/17/content_WS634d3ec6c6d0a757729e159a.html)

<sup>558</sup> CPC charts course for Chinese modernization as key congress opens, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 17 October 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202210/17/content\\_WS634c9cebc6d0a757729e151c.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202210/17/content_WS634c9cebc6d0a757729e151c.html)

On 1 November 2022, the government announced that it will provide more support for the self-employed businesses, including improvement of business environment, lowering burdens on them, assistance with financing, and stimulation of consumer demand.<sup>559</sup>

On 18 November 2022, the government released a guideline (issued by five state organs including the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security and the National Development and Reform Commission) to bolster employment and entrepreneurship prospects of rural migrant workers, as well as rural residents. The guideline provides for supportive measures in this regard, such as deferring social insurance premium payments, social insurance subsidies for migrant workers, work-relief programs for rural areas, and employment monitoring of rural residents.<sup>560</sup>

On 29 November 2022, the government launched a campaign to offer employment services to college graduates seeking jobs, including online and offline recruitment and assessment activities.<sup>561</sup>

On 20 December 2022, the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security issued the circular aimed to support the growth of market entities in the human resources services sector during the 2023-2025 period, including the growth of about 50 leading enterprises and approximately 100 smaller firms that are innovative and distinctive in providing specialized human resources services by 2025.<sup>562</sup>

On 1 January 2023, the amended Law on the Protection of Rights and Interests of Women came into force. The government promulgated amendments on 30 October 2022. The revised law stipulates that the State shall take necessary measures to promote gender equality, eliminate discrimination of all forms against women and prohibit exclusion or restriction of women's legitimate rights and interests. It further emphasizes that governments at all levels should optimize employment security measures for women, prevent and remedy gender discrimination, and create an impartial employment and entrepreneurial environment.<sup>563</sup>

On 11 January 2023, the government announced that it will maintain a stable employment landscape in 2023 by continuing to implement the employment-first policy and energizing people's passion for entrepreneurship in order to develop new growth points in the job market.<sup>564</sup>

China has taken a number of significant steps both on employment and on skills development.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Pavel Doronin*

---

<sup>559</sup> China pledges further efforts to support self-employed businesses, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 1 November 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/pressbriefings/202211/01/content\\_WS6361bc09c6d0a757729e229b.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/pressbriefings/202211/01/content_WS6361bc09c6d0a757729e229b.html)

<sup>560</sup> China steps up rural employment support policy, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 18 November 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202211/18/content\\_WS637775b3c6d0a757729e35d3.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202211/18/content_WS637775b3c6d0a757729e35d3.html)

<sup>561</sup> China launches campaign to boost employment for college graduates, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 29 November 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202211/29/content\\_WS6385fad9c6d0a757729e3cf8.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202211/29/content_WS6385fad9c6d0a757729e3cf8.html)

<sup>562</sup> China to ramp up development of human resources services providers, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 December 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202212/20/content\\_WS63a1ab07c6d0a757729e49e7.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202212/20/content_WS63a1ab07c6d0a757729e49e7.html)

<sup>563</sup> China's revised law on women protection to take effect on Jan 1, China Daily (Beijing) 31 December 2022. Access Date: 22 January 2023. <https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202212/31/WS63b01c85a31057c47eba721d.html>

<sup>564</sup> New areas for growth to keep employment stable, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 11 January 2023. Access Date: 22 January 2023.

[http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202301/11/content\\_WS63be0931c6d0a757729e5522.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202301/11/content_WS63be0931c6d0a757729e5522.html)

### South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to promote employment for sustainable development, including skills development.

On 20 June 2022, the Road and Freight Inter-Ministerial Committee presented the 11-point plan to deal with problems in logistics including the recruitment of foreign nationals. The Plan consists of the following actions: 1) Facilitate the appointment of the task team; 2) Enforcement of the visa requirements; 3) Need for consideration of all foreign driving licenses; 4) Registration and compliance with labour laws; 5) Registration of operators in term of Section 45 of the National Road Traffic Act; 6) Review of the Traffic Register Number; 7) Review of the Cross-Border Road Transport Legislation; 8) Amendment of the National Road Traffic Regulation; 9) Integrated joint multi-disciplinary law enforcement operations; 10) Implement Driver Training Programme; 11) Consideration of the introduction of Operating Licenses for the industry.<sup>565</sup>

On 18 July 2022, the government introduced new regulations to provide clear distinctions between recreational and commercial diving activities. New regulations are intended to advance occupational health and safety and include important industry-related definitions such as “commercial divers,” “plant and machinery,” “designated medical practitioners,” etc.<sup>566</sup>

On 23 September 2022, the Public Employment Service held a career exhibition in Bapo Ba Mogale to support the unemployed among youths and work-seekers. The responsible department takes steps to create favorable platforms for unemployed allowing them to meet with potential employers.<sup>567</sup>

On 22 - 23 November 2022, the Department of Communications and Digital Technologies held the National Digital and Future Skills Conference in cooperation with the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit. The conference’s objectives were presented as follows: establish, galvanize as well as strengthen partnerships in the area of digital and future skills in South Africa; create and stimulate interest in Digital and Future Skills; highlight the concerns and challenges brought by the digital skills gap; provide insights on available digital skills training opportunities for youth; highlight the “fourth industrial revolution” as an enabler to critical skills sets required for the future; and share and discuss approaches to deliver digital and future skills to vulnerable groups, especially young women, and girls.<sup>568</sup>

On 30 November 2022, Deputy Minister of Employment and Labour Boitumelo Moloi presented a set of workshops aimed at promoting employment opportunities in innovative and creative sectors

---

<sup>565</sup> Road and Freight Inter-Ministerial Committee signs and unveil 11-point action plan to deal with blockages and recruitment, Department of Employment and Labour (Pretoria) 20 June 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.labour.gov.za/road-and-freight-inter-ministerial-committee-signs-and-unveil-11-point-action-plan-to-deal-with-blockages-and-recruitment>

<sup>566</sup> New commercial diving regulations intended to advance occupational health and safety, Department of Employment and Labour (Pretoria) 18 July 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.labour.gov.za/new-commercial-diving-regulations-intended-to-advance-occupational-health-and-safety>

<sup>567</sup> A career exhibition hosted by Brits Labour Centre in partnership with Bapo Ba Mogale Administration in the North West attract scores of youth and work-seekers, Department of Employment and Labour (Pretoria) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.labour.gov.za/a-career-exhibition-hosted-by-brits-labour-centre-in-partnership-with-bapo-ba-mogale-administration-in-the-north-west-attra>

<sup>568</sup> Communications and Digital Technologies hosts National Digital and Future Skills Conference, 22 to 23 Nov, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 17 November 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/communications-and-digital-technologies-hosts-national-digital-and-future-skills-conference>

among persons with disabilities. Nine workshops are scheduled for 2022–2025. Under the scheme, participating workers would also receive a subsidy ZAR1800 per month.<sup>569</sup>

On 12 December 2022, the government hosted the Youth Tech Expo in Gauteng. The Expo was organized to contribute towards youth employment and entrepreneurship in information and communications technologies. Several private companies and non-governmental organizations took part in the event, providing the attendants with information on employment opportunities and career planning.<sup>570</sup>

South Africa has taken a number of significant steps both on employment and on skills development. Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Alexander Ignatov*

---

<sup>569</sup> Department of Employment and Labour Subsidy Scheme set to create employment opportunities for persons with disabilities, Department of Employment and Labour (Pretoria) 30 November 2022. Access Date: 24 January 2023. <https://www.labour.gov.za/department-of-employment-and-labour-subsidy-scheme-set-to-create-employment-opportunities-for-persons-with-disabilities>

<sup>570</sup> Gauteng e-Government hosts Youth Tech Expo to bring ICT opportunities to youth in Ekurhuleni, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 14 December 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2023. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/gauteng-e-government-hosts-youth-tech-expo-bring-ict-opportunities-youth-ekurhuleni%C2%A0-14-dec>

## 18. Climate Change: Supporting Implementation

“[We express our support to] ... promote COP27 [27th Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change] to prioritize implementation and highlight the reinforcement of adaptation and delivery and enhancement of developed countries’ commitments to provide financial support and technology transfer to developing countries.”

*BRICS Beijing Leaders Declaration*

### Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia	-1		
India	-1		
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Average		-0.60 (20%)	

### Background

The BRICS first committed to fight climate change at the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, where the leaders pledged to “support international cooperation in the field of energy efficiency” and expressed readiness to engage in “a constructive dialogue on how to deal with climate change based on the principle of common but differentiated responsibility, given the need to combine measures to protect the climate with steps to fulfill our socio-economic development tasks.” Since then, the BRICS members have maintained climate change as an integral agenda item, committing to support international efforts to combat its effects and immediate causes.<sup>571</sup>

Within the context of supporting the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, the BRICS expressed their commitment to the implementation of the Paris Agreement, signed in 2015. The Agreement stipulated three major goals:

1. holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursuing efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels, recognizing that this would significantly reduce the risks and impacts of climate change;
2. increasing the ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change and foster climate resilience and low greenhouse gas emissions development, in a manner that does not threaten food production;
3. making finance flows consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate resilient development.

### Commitment Features

The commitment is aimed at providing support to developing countries in implementing the three goals of the Paris Agreement. Full compliance implies that the BRICS members provide concrete support to other developing nation in moving towards the implementation of the Paris Agreement on all three priority areas - holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C; increasing the ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change; and making finance flows consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate resilient development. Partial compliance is awarded if the BRICS members provide such support on at least one of the

<sup>571</sup> First Summit: Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries Leaders, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 18 October 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency1/First%20Summit.pdf>



specified areas. Failure to take any action to support developing countries' implementation of the Paris Agreement entails non-compliance.

### Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not take action to provide support to other developing countries in implementing any of the Paris Agreement goals.
0	The BRICS member takes action to provide support to other developing countries in implementing at least one of the Paris Agreement goals.
+1	The BRICS member takes action to provide support to other developing countries in implementing all three of the Paris Agreement goals.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov  
Lead Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment to promote the implementation of the Paris Agreement in other developing countries.

Between 19 and 23 September, the representatives of the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC), the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and the governments of Guatemala, Honduras and El Salvador took part in a technical mission to Guatemala, to discuss the new trilateral technical cooperation project to contribute to the mitigation of the harmful effects of drought in Guatemala, Honduras and El Salvador. The Brazilian experts had the opportunity to learn how climate events affect small rural producers in Guatemala, and gathered relevant information for the preparation of the project document of the future cooperation initiative. Still under construction, the project will be integrated to the “Initiative Latin America and the Caribbean without Hunger 2025” of the International Cooperation Program Brazil-FAO, and will seek to address the common challenges of these three nations of the Central American dry corridor.<sup>572</sup>

On 28 September 2022, the first session of the “II Cycle of exchanges of experiences: technological solutions for land administration,” organized in the scope of the International Cooperation Program Brazil-FAO, through the project “Support for the strengthening of responsible governance of land tenure in Latin America and the Caribbean,” was held. The project, which involves the modernization of regularization processes and rural and agricultural land allocation in the region, is jointly executed by the ABC, the National Institute for Colonization and Agrarian Reform, and the FAO. The objective of the trilateral technical cooperation project is to improve land governance in the countries of the region through the adoption of innovative mechanisms in land administration systems.<sup>573</sup>

Brazil took actions to assist other developing countries in adapting to the the adverse impacts of climate change. However, no actions on contributing to holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C, or providing open and transparent information on the financial flows and making them consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate resilient development were registered.

Thus, Brazil is awarded a score of 0.

<sup>572</sup> Mitigating the effects of drought in the Central American dry corridor is the subject of a new cooperation project, Brazilian Cooperation Agency (Brasilia) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mitigar-os-efeitos-da-seca-no-corredor-seco-da-america-central-e-tema-de-novo-projeto-de-cooperacao>.

<sup>573</sup> Technology to modernize land regularization and administration processes, Agência Brasileira de Cooperação (Brasilia) 15 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. <https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/tecnologia-para-modernizar-processos-de-regularizacao-e-administracao-de-terras>

*Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov*

**Russia: -1**

Russia has failed to comply with the commitment to promote the implementation of the Paris Agreement in other developing countries.

No actions on providing support to countries in the implementation any of the Paris Agreement goals were registered during the monitoring period.

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1.<sup>574</sup>

*Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov*

**India: -1**

India has failed to comply with the commitment to promote the implementation of the Paris Agreement in other developing countries.

No actions on providing support to countries in the implementation any of the Paris Agreement goals were registered during the monitoring period.

Thus, India receives a score of -1.<sup>575</sup>

*Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov*

**China: 0**

China has partially complied with the commitment to promote the implementation of the Paris Agreement in other developing countries.

On 4 October 2022, the Science Museum, a part of the China-aided Addis Ababa Riverside Green Development Project, was unveiled in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. According to the statement by the China International Development Cooperation Agency (CIDCA), “the attending Ethiopian representative agreed that the project is a pilot of Ethiopia’s green development and construction, as well as a token of cooperation and friendship between China and Ethiopia.”<sup>576</sup>

On 9 January 2023, at the International Conference on Climate Resilient Pakistan, CIDCA chairman Luo Zhaohui, announced that China will grant USD100 million for reconstruction programs through bilateral channels to support the Resilient Recovery, Rehabilitation and Reconstruction Framework, train 1,000 Pakistani technical staff and officials focusing on disaster prevention and management, and is willing to join the International Partners’ Support Group.<sup>577</sup>

China took actions to assist other developing countries in promoting green development, contributing to holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C and provided aid in

---

<sup>574</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: Federal Agency for the Commonwealth of Independent States Affairs, Compatriots Living Abroad, and International Humanitarian Cooperation <https://rs.gov.ru/deyatelnost/>; Government of Russia <http://government.ru/rugovclassifier/>; Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia [https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign\\_policy/news/](https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/); Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of Russia <https://www.mnr.gov.ru/>; Ministry of Economic Development of Russia <https://www.economy.gov.ru>

<sup>575</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: Government of India <https://www.india.gov.in>; Ministry of External Affairs <https://www.mea.gov.in/>; Public Information Bureau <https://www.pib.gov.in/allRel.aspx>; Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change <https://moef.gov.in/en/>; NITI Aayog <https://niti.gov.in>

<sup>576</sup> Ethiopian PM: China-aided project boosts sci-tech development in Ethiopia, CIDCA (Beijing) 9 October 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2023. [http://en.cidca.gov.cn/2022-10/09/c\\_818942.htm](http://en.cidca.gov.cn/2022-10/09/c_818942.htm).

<sup>577</sup> CIDCA chairman attends International Conference on Climate Resilient Pakistan, CIDCA (Beijing) 9 January 2023. Access Date: 25 January 2023. [http://subsites.chinadaily.com.cn/cidca/2023-01/11/c\\_847174.htm](http://subsites.chinadaily.com.cn/cidca/2023-01/11/c_847174.htm).

adaptation to the adverse impacts of climate change. However, no actions on providing open and transparent information on financial flows and making them consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate resilient development were registered.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

**South Africa: -1**

South Africa has failed to comply with the commitment to promote the implementation of the Paris Agreement in other developing countries.

No actions on providing support to countries in the implementation any of the Paris Agreement goals were registered during the monitoring period.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.<sup>578</sup>

*Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

---

<sup>578</sup> This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: South African Government <https://www.gov.za>; Department of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation <http://www.dirco.gov.za> ; Parliament of South Africa ; Department of Forestry, Fishery and the Environment <https://www.dffe.gov.za> ; Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development <https://www.dalrrd.gov.za/>